Journal of LANGUAGE & COMMUNICATION

VOL. 6(1) March 2019

A social science journal published by the
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication
Universiti Putra Malaysia
EDITORIAL BOARD

Editor-In-Chief : Rosli Talif
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Managing Editor : Vahid Nimehchisalem
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Co-Managing Editor : Ida Baizura Bahar
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Associate Editors :

Ain Nadzimah Abdullah
Universiti Putra Malaysia

Carol Elizabeth A/P Leon
Universiti Malaya

Jariah Mohd Jan
University of Malaya

Kiranjit Kaur
Universiti Teknologi MARA

Ting Su Hie
Universiti Malaysia Sarawak
INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY BOARD

Antony John Kunnan  
*University of Macau, China*

Cynthia White  
*Massey University, New Zealand*

Glen T. Cameron  
*University of Missouri, USA*

James Dean Brown  
*University of Hawaii at Manoa, USA*

Martin Cortazzi  
*University of Leicester, UK*

Scott Slovic  
*University of Idaho, Moscow*

Thomas Ricento  
*University of Calgary, Canada*

______________________________________________

Editorial Office

Journal Publication Office  
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication  
Universiti Putra Malaysia, 43400 Serdang, Selangor, Malaysia  
Tel: +603-9769 3714  
jlc@upm.edu.my

Publisher

The UPM Press  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
43400 UPM Serdang, Selangor, Malaysia  
Tel: +603 8946 8855, 8946 8854  
Fax: +603 8941 6172  
penerbit@putra.upm.edu.my  
URL: http://penerbit.upm.edu.my

The publisher of Journal of Language and Communication will not be responsible for the statement made by the authors in any articles published in the journal. Under no circumstances will the publisher of this publication be liable for any loss or damage caused by reliance on the advice, opinion or information obtained either explicitly or implied through the contents of this publication.

All rights of reproduction are reserved in respect of all papers, articles, illustrations, etc., published in the Journal of Language and Communication. All materials published in this journal are protected by copyright, which covers exclusive rights to reproduce and distribute the materials. Materials published in the Journal
Journal of Language and Communication
Vol. 6(1) MARCH 2019

Contents

Editorial Board i

International Advisory Board ii

CROSS-LANGUAGE PERCEPTION OF NON-NATIVE STOPS AND FRICATIVES AMONG MALAY AND HAUSA NATIVE SPEAKERS 1
Jamilu Abdullahi, Yap Ngee Thai, Sabariah Md Rashid, and Vahid Nimehchisalem

EXPLORING THE ADOPTION AND PRACTICE OF CITIZEN JOURNALISM IN RURAL COMMUNITIES IN NIGERIA 17
Oberiri Destiny Apuke and Livinus Jesse Ayih

MOTHER-CHILD ATTACHMENT: EXPLORING FREUDIAN DENIAL AND AGGRESSION IN NEIL GAIMAN’S CORALINE 35
Nur Syafiqah Aqilah Ahmad Sabri

POLITENESS IN LIBYAN POSTGRADUATE STUDENTS’ E-MAIL REQUESTS TOWARDS LECTURERS 47
Ergaya Alsout and Mohsen Khedri

RHETORICAL MOVE ANALYSIS IN POLITICAL SCIENCE RESEARCH ARTICLE ABSTRACTS IN ENGLISH IN IRANIAN JOURNALS 65
Sara Seyed Paydari and Shamala Paramasivam

THE EFFECTS OF CHINESE ON ENGLISH ARTICLE USE BY CANTONESE ESL LEARNERS 81
Alice Yin Wa Chan

THE IMPACT OF LISTENING AND SPEAKING ANXIETIES ON THE FOURTH INDUSTRIAL REVOLUTION: WHAT CAN EDUCATORS DO? 93
Siti Faridah Kamaruddin, Imelia Laura Danel, Jacqueline Susan Rijeng, Mohamad Musa Bohari, Tang Howe Eng

THE ROLE OF INSTRUCTIONAL STRATEGIES IN VOCABULARY TEACHING: A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF THREE STRATEGIES 109
Arjumand Ara and Sadia Afrin Shorna
CROSS-LANGUAGE PERCEPTION OF NON-NATIVE STOPS AND FRICATIVES AMONG MALAY AND HAUSA NATIVE SPEAKERS

Jamilu Abdullahi1,2, Yap Ngee Thai1*, Sabariah Md Rashid1, and Vahid Nimechisalem1

1Department of English, Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication, Universiti Putra Malaysia
2Department of Nigerian Languages and Linguistics, Bauchi State University, Nigeria
E-mail: jamilu2011@gmail.com2; ntyap@upm.edu.my1; smrashid@upm.edu.my1; vahid@upm.edu.my1

ABSTRACT
This study examines the effect of native language on listeners’ perception of native and non-native consonants. The study focuses on cross-language perception of selected stops and fricatives among Hausa speakers who have little exposure to Malay, and Malay speakers who have no exposure to Hausa. The primary goal of this study is to examine how Hausa and Malay speakers perceived non-native stops and fricatives that are absent in their native language. Hausa language has a combination of plosives and implosives which involves the use of different airstream mechanisms in their production. Malay speakers who do not have any experience of implosives may find it difficult to discriminate between implosives and plosives, and to produce implosives accurately. In contrast, Hausa speakers may have difficulty discriminating between labial stops and fricatives in Malay as this distinction is not present in Hausa. Forty-five Hausa native speakers and forty-five Malay native speakers were recruited for the study. Audio-recording of minimal pairs of Malay and Hausa words were used as stimuli in an AX discrimination task. Subjects had to indicate whether they heard two different words, or the same words presented twice by two different speakers. The results of the study show that the Malay and Hausa native speakers faced considerable difficulties and problems in perceiving most non-native sound contrasts. Native language influence was found to be a major factor influencing the perception of non-native sound contrasts. This study concluded that the Perception Assimilation Model was successful in the prediction and interpretation of most of the perceptual difficulties encountered by the Malay and Hausa native speakers in the perception of stops and fricatives.

Keywords: speech perception, non-native, fricatives, plosives, implosives

INTRODUCTION
A number of studies of cross-language or second language (L2) speech perception have focused on the identification and/or discrimination of non-native contrasts that are absent in listeners’ first language (L1) such as English /l/ and /r/ for native Japanese listeners (e.g., MacKain, Best & Strange, 1981; Oh, Guion-Anderson, Aoyama, Flege, Guion, Akahane-Yamada & Yamada, 2011), and these studies have identified several factors influencing L2 learners’ success in identifying or discriminating English approximants. These factors include the location of the segment in a word, type of speech stimuli (natural vs. synthetic), lexical familiarity, previous linguistic experience and degree of perceived dissimilarity, among others. For instance, in a study on perception of approximants, Best and Strange...

Thus far, there is ample evidence that native and L2 speakers of English differ in their perception of the voicing and/or place contrast in word-final consonants (e.g., Flege & Wang, 1989; Flege & Liu, 2001; Aoyama, 2003). In a recent study, Aoyama (2003) examined the perception of syllable-initial and syllable final English nasals by Korean and Japanese L2 learners. The Japanese listeners found it difficult to discriminate the /n/–/ŋ/ contrast in word-final position, but not the /m/–/n/ or /m/–/ŋ/ contrast although none of these nasal contrasts occur word-finally in their L1. It was observed that the English /m/ was assimilated to a single Japanese category, but the English /n/ and /ŋ/ were assimilated to multiple Japanese categories; hence resulting in perceptual difficulties for the learners. Similarly, Tsukada (2006) reported the perceptual ability of Australian English and Thai English bilingual listeners in the perception of word-final stops in English and Thai. The two groups discriminated the Thai contrast for /p/-/t/ best, particularly among the Australian English listeners. The listeners’ accuracy of discrimination was influenced by the type of stops they heard. The findings also show that first language transfer alone is not sufficient to account for learners’ patterns of response in cross-language speech perception since in the above study, the performance of the Australian English listeners was more accurate.

In another study, Tsukada (2007) examined the discrimination of word-final stop contrasts (/p/-/t/, /p/-/k/, /t/-/k/) in English and Thai by L2 listeners from diverse Asian language backgrounds (e.g., Cantonese, Korean, Indonesian, Vietnamese). The findings suggest that familiarity with specific phonetic realization of sounds (i.e., unreleased final stops) may play a facilitative role in perceptual flexibility. However, without exposure to native phonetic contrasts that include these detailed acoustic characteristics, it may be difficult to develop the capacity to discriminate subtle phonetic differences to the level of native listeners. In the same context, Holliday (2014) conducted a study on native Mandarin listeners’ perceptual assimilation of Korean obstruents. Different combinations of stops, affricates, and fricatives were used for the experiments with 20 native Mandarin speakers. The results revealed that affricates were perceived as post alveolar and alveo-palatal more frequently than as alveolar affricates. The finding also shows that vowel context influenced the perception of fricatives and affricates.

These results appear to be consistent with predictions generated by models of cross-language speech perception such as the Perceptual Assimilation Model (PAM) (Best, 1993; 1995). According to the PAM, instances of contrastive L2 categories that are identified as instances of a single L1 category (Single Category Assimilation) as found in the perception of English /l/–/ɾ/ for Japanese learners, will be relatively difficult to discriminate. However, instances of contrastive L2 sounds that are mapped onto two different L1 sounds (Two-Category Assimilation) as found in the mapping of /w/–/j/ in English and Japanese will be discriminated more accurately.

The findings and recommendations of the previous studies concerning the perception of fricative sounds and important acoustic cues that are associated with the perception of fricatives, however, indicated some limitations. Specifically, it is observed that most of the studies carried out were on the perception of English fricatives by English as second language (ESL) learners. None was found on cross-language perception of fricatives among native speakers of two different languages. A recent study by Lago, Scharinger, Kronrod and Idsardi (2015) examined the relative acoustic contribution and information of phonology in
terms of perceiving fricative sounds. Two fricatives, /ʃ/ and /s/, presented at word initial position were used as stimuli. The results show that the fricatives were discriminated more accurately when they crossed a categorical boundary. Focusing on sounds with different manner of articulation, Alwan, Jiang and Chen (2011) studied the relevant perceptual acoustic cues for the place of articulation of plosives /b d p t/ and fricatives /f s v z/ at word initial positions in a noise condition. Relative spectral amplitude and frequency formants were examined for these segments. The study showed that vowel context, manner of articulation and voicing determined the perception of labial/alveolar distinctions in noise. Alwan, Jiang, and Chen (2011) also examined the relevant acoustic cues in the perception of syllable initial plosives /b p d t/ and fricatives /f v s z/. The findings revealed that the perception of alveolar/labial differences in noise was determined by the manner of articulation, voicing interaction as well as vowel context. The acoustic measurement and signal-to-noise-ratio (SNRs) indicated that the formant frequency measurements increased for the perception of alveolar/labial distinctions as the signal to noise ratio degrades. In another study, Stevens et al. (1992) examined the factors that differentiate voiced and unvoiced fricatives. The result shows that listeners based their intervocalic fricative voicing judgments on the interval duration for which there was no vibration on the glottis. The findings revealed that fricatives could be judged as voiceless if the time interval was above 60 milliseconds (ms).

An important discovery in this review is that even when native and non-native languages share a phonetic contrast at the abstract phonological level, listeners may fail to show accurate perception in the non-native stimuli. In other words, positive transfer from L1 may not be reflected in listeners’ performance. An example of this was demonstrated by Hallé, Best and Levitt (1999) for native French listeners’ perception of American English approximants /w j r l/. These phonemes occur in French with varying degrees of similarity to the target sounds. If L1-to-L2 mappings at the traditional phonological level predict cross-linguistic perception patterns, it is predicted that French listeners would not have difficulties with these English sounds. However, it was found that the French listeners had some perceptual difficulties with the English /r/. This finding was attributed to marked articulatory-phonetic differences between the English and French /r/ (i.e. phonetically realized as a central approximant in English and a uvular fricative in French). Of the three contrasts tested (/w/--/ʃ/, /r/--/l/, /w/--/r/), the French listeners had most difficulty with /w/--/r/ and tended to hear the English /r/ as /w/-like.

Since only limited counter examples of expected L1 positive transfer have been reported in the literature, it may be necessary to examine different non-native language comparisons before any generalization can be made. The present study sought to verify if positive transfer at the phonological level might be observed in word-initial position. The word initial context was chosen since phonetically, it is a more salient position. The word final context is also influenced by other phonological constraints such as English word final voice neutralization and phonotactic constraints against voicing contrast in Malay (Yap, 2013) and may be more difficult for perception because of these other confounding reasons. Hence, this study focused on the perception of native and non-native stops and fricatives in the word-initial position which are functional (i.e. phonemic) in both Malay and Hausa.
Phonemic inventories of Hausa and Malay

The Hausa language has a combination of plosives and implosives. However, in human languages, implosives are rare; linguists have encountered many problems in their descriptions, as most of the world’s languages sounds are produced with the egressive pulmonic airstream mechanism (Ladefoged & Maddieson, 1996:77). In addition, to our knowledge, there is also hardly any study done on the discrimination between plosives and implosives. The lack of published work on implosives motivated this study as anyone who wishes to learn and speak Hausa has to be able to learn the contrast between plosives and implosives as these stops are phonemic in Hausa.

The Hausa language, which belongs to the Afro-Asiatic language family (Greenberg 1966), also stands as the most powerful language in terms of speakers and prestige among the Westerly sub-group of the Chadic language. It has considerable literature in the forms of poetry, prose and Islamic writings, written in a modified Arabic script (Ajami). In West African sub region, the Hausa language has the highest number of speakers. In Nigeria alone, the Hausa language has about thirty-three (33) million native speakers. It is a second language of about 15 million people and taken together, an approximate total of forty eight (48) million people in Nigeria (Eberhard, Simons & Fennig, 2019). The Hausas have dominated more than half of the demographic map of Nigeria. In the Republic of Benin, it has about 900,000 speakers; in Burkina Faso about 500,000 speakers; in Cameroon about 2,300,000; in Togo about 900,029 speakers; in Sudan about nine 918,000 speakers; and in Niger about 12,000,000 speakers are said to have been in existence (Eberhard, Simons & Fennig, 2019). The Hausa language is spoken across the West African sub-region, and it is also spoken in Central Africa, Chad, Congo, Eritrea, Saudi Arabia and North Western Sudan.

In standard Hausa, there are thirty-four (34) consonant sounds (Sani, 2005). Table 1 presents the Hausa consonantal chart.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Bilabial</th>
<th>Alveolar</th>
<th>Post-alveolar</th>
<th>Palatal</th>
<th>Palatalized velar</th>
<th>Velar</th>
<th>Labialized Velar</th>
<th>Glottal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Plosive &amp; Affricate</td>
<td>b</td>
<td>t</td>
<td>d</td>
<td>tʃ</td>
<td>dʒ</td>
<td>kʰ</td>
<td>gʰ</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implosive &amp; Ejective Stop &amp; Affricate</td>
<td>b</td>
<td>ts’</td>
<td>d’</td>
<td>(ts’*)</td>
<td>j’</td>
<td>k*</td>
<td>g*</td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nasal</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>n</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fricative</td>
<td>Φ</td>
<td>s</td>
<td>z</td>
<td></td>
<td>h</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tap/Trill</td>
<td>r</td>
<td></td>
<td>t</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approximant</td>
<td>w</td>
<td></td>
<td>l</td>
<td></td>
<td>j</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In contrast to Hausa, the Malay language is one of the members of the Malayic subgroup in the Austronesian family of languages. The Malayic subgroup has languages such as Gayo in Sumatra, Iban in Borneo, and Minangkabau in Sumatra (Eades & Hajek, 2006). Adelaar (2005) reported that many local Malay dialects are found in Sumatra, Borneo, Malaysian Peninsular, and parts of Eastern Indonesia. Different varieties of Malay are spoken
in Malaysia, Brunei, Singapore and Indonesia; however, these varieties have mutual intelligibility as reported in Steinhauer (2013). With the influence of Javanese and Dutch, it was reported that Indonesia is the most divergent, but the other varieties spoken in the Malayan Peninsular differed mainly phonetically and phonologically.

In the Malay language, there are twenty-four (24) native speech segments (18 consonants and 6 vowels) and nine (8) loan consonants which occur in loan words in Malay according to Nik Safiah Karim et al. (2008). Table 2 presents the consonants of the Malay language with some of the loan consonants presented in parentheses. However, the loan consonants that are less frequent and those that are usually assimilated into other existing phonemic categories have been excluded from the Table (see Nik Safiah Karim et al., 2009: 299).

Table 2: Malay consonantal chart (Source: Nik Safiah Karim et al., 1994)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Labial</th>
<th>Alveolar</th>
<th>Post-alveolar</th>
<th>Palatal</th>
<th>Velar</th>
<th>Glottal</th>
<th>Labial-velar</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Plosives/Affricates</td>
<td>p</td>
<td>b</td>
<td>t</td>
<td>c</td>
<td>j</td>
<td>k</td>
<td>g</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fricatives</td>
<td>(f)</td>
<td>(v)</td>
<td>s</td>
<td>(z)</td>
<td>(j)</td>
<td>h</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nasal</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>η</td>
<td>η</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trill</td>
<td>r</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approximant</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>j</td>
<td></td>
<td>w</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lateral</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>l</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Specific stops and fricatives were chosen from Malay and Hausa to be included in the design of the study and to enable comparisons to be made in the interpretation of the analysis. In this regard, implosives are found in Hausa but not in Malay, and likewise the voiceless bilabial plosive and the voiceless labio-dental fricative are found in Malay but not in Hausa. However, both languages have the same set of alveolar plosives and fricatives. The properties of the phonemic inventory of the two languages allow the researcher to examine the perception of the novel and familiar phonetic categories by naïve language learners.

Models of Speech Perception

As the present study investigated how Hausa and Malay native speakers perceived non-native stops and fricatives, the Perceptual Assimilation Model (PAM) (Best, 1993, 1994a, 1994b, 1995) and Speech Learning Model (SLM) (Flege, 1995) were adopted as the framework for the study. Similarities and differences between native language and non-native phonological systems may pose some difficulties in the perception and production of non-native contrasts (Flege, 1995). Research have shown that adult listeners of non-native language have significant difficulties in the perception of most, but not all, phonetic dissimilarity that are not functional in their native languages (Best & Tyler, 2007; Best et al, 1988; Flege, 1995; Kochetov, 2004). In this light, the present study aims to provide an account for the perception of non-native naïve listeners based on the current non-native models.

Specifically, the study examined how Malay native speakers discriminate between word-initial plosive and implosives in Hausa, and how Hausa native speakers discriminate word-initial plosive and fricatives in Malay. Implosives are found in Hausa but not in Malay, and likewise the voiceless bilabial stop /p/ and labio-dental fricatives, /f/ and /v/ are found in Malay but not in Hausa. However since the alveolar stops, /t/ and /d/ and the alveolar
fricatives, /s/ and /z/ are found in both languages, these segments were included in the study as they provided a comparison for interpretation of the analysis.

METHODOLOGY

Participants
Ninety adults volunteered to participate in this study. The participants comprised Malay native speakers (29 females and 16 males) who were born and brought up in Malaysia, and Hausa native speakers (7 females and 38 males) who were born and brought up in Nigeria. They were recruited based on their native language backgrounds. The Malay listeners’ (n = 45) age range was between 23 and 42 years (M = 27.40), while the Hausa native speakers’ (n = 45) age range was between 27 and 52 (M = 34.50). All the Malay native speakers were born and brought up in Malaysia, while the Hausa native speakers were born and raised in Nigeria, but since they were also postgraduate students in Malaysia, they were not completely naïve to Malay. However, most of them did not indicate that Malay and the other local languages such as Chinese and Tamil as a foreign language (see Table 3) that they were fluent or proficient in although they could possible use some rudimentary words and phrases in these local languages when communicating with the locals in Malaysia. The Malay participants as well as the Hausa participants also have knowledge of another language, namely, English. Both groups of participants (Malay and Hausa) use English language to communicate with non-native speakers of their languages.

Table 3: Demographic Information of Malay and Hausa Subjects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Native Groups</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Knowledge of Foreign Language</th>
<th>Language Often Used</th>
<th>Language Used with Non-native Speakers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Malay</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>(36%)</td>
<td>English (83%)</td>
<td>English (68%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>(84%)</td>
<td>Arabic (9%)</td>
<td>Arabic (19%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>23-42</td>
<td>German (2%)</td>
<td>Hausa (62%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mean 27.40</td>
<td>English (22%)</td>
<td>English (72%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>French (6%)</td>
<td>Arabic (21%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Malay (72%)</td>
<td>Malay (7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Arabic (7%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hausa</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>(64%)</td>
<td>English (89%)</td>
<td>English (72%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>(16%)</td>
<td>Arabic (7%)</td>
<td>Arabic (21%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>27-52</td>
<td>Hausa (62%)</td>
<td>Malay (7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mean 36.50</td>
<td>English (36%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Fulfulde (2%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A purposive sampling based on the results of a demographic questionnaire was first employed to recruit the participants. The demographic questionnaire, which was adapted from the questionnaire of Montrul (2012) was used to filter the population so that the samples would comprise native speakers of Malay and Hausa. Apart from gender and name, pertinent information on the participants’ language of instruction, native language background, knowledge of foreign languages, linguistic history, and linguistic background, and so forth were also elicited. All questions in the questionnaire were designed to elicit essential information to ensure homogeneity of the respondents within each language group and to prevent cases where the participants are not Malay or Hausa native speakers. Table 3 summarizes the results of the demographic questionnaire.
**Instruments**

The study used a questionnaire to elicit background information of the respondents as described in the earlier section. To ascertain the performance of the respondents for cross-language perception of specific segments in Hausa and Malay, PRAAT (Boersma and Weenink, 2018), a computer programme which can analyse and run speech perception experiments, was used to collect the data for the study.

Audio-recordings of Hausa and Malay minimal pairs with the target speech segments were used as stimuli. The target sounds (stops and fricatives) were presented at word initial position. The stimuli were recorded by two male native Hausa speakers and two male native Malay speakers in order to ensure a standard and accurate pronunciation of the target segments. The two Hausa speakers were graduate students at a public university in Malaysia, one at the master level, the other at the doctoral level and both were conducting research on English and Hausa phonetics. The two Malay speakers were also graduate students of at a public university in Malaysia at the master level conducting research on the Malay language. The Malay speakers age ranges between 22 and 24, while the Hausa speakers age ranges from 27 to 33. The use of multiple speakers (2 Malay and 2 Hausa) was essential for the discrimination task as it ensured that the decisions were not made based on acoustic peculiarities from one speaker, such as pitch, intonation, or any other voice specification. All the stimuli were recorded with a Logitech Wireless Headset h600 microphone and PRAAT, the software program for speech analysis (Boersma & Weenink, 2001). The sampling rate used in the recording was 44100 Hz. The recordings were done in a quiet room, and each sentence was recorded once from the four speakers. The words for the discrimination task were extracted from the sentences using PRAAT and the discrimination experiment was also designed using PRAAT.

Each stimulus from the two languages (Malay and Hausa) was recorded in the carrier phrases shown below.

1. Malay carrier phrase: *Baca ... sekarang* ‘read ... again’
2. Hausa carrier phrase: *Ya....sam* ‘3sg pronoun ... again’

The use of the carrier phrase was important to determine the onset of the stops (Kang, 2014; Ogut, et al., 2006). The carrier phrase also helped to maintain the important acoustic cues which can be deleted if the recordings were done in isolation. In particular, it would be difficult to determine the closure duration which could be an important acoustic cue for the distinction of plosives and implosives. The carrier phrases were chosen to ensure that the target phonemes were all presented following a vowel to enable the closure phase and the release phases of the stops to be captured more accurately.

The Hausa and Malay minimal pairs that were recorded and used for the perceptual discrimination task are shown in Table 4. The researchers have chosen disyllabic words to ensure that both words are minimal pairs as Malay and Hausa words are usually disyllabic (Abubakar, 2001; Newman, 2000; Sani, 2000).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4: Stimulus items for the discrimination task</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hausa words</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>daba - taba</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘horse riding – cigarette’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The phoneme /f/ was paired with /p/ while /v/ was paired with /b/ as the phoneme /f/ and /v/ are absent in Hausa phoneme inventory (Sani, 2015). Also, /f/ and /p/ were paired with one another as they both share the labial and voiceless feature and it has been recorded in the literature that Hausa speakers often confuse these two segments by producing [f] when [p] is expected (Maiunguwa, 2015). As for the Malay words, loan words such as visa and fasa are usually pronounced with the final [a:] and not with the schwa as noted in Asmah (2008:164) for loan words ending with the letter <a> in Malay. However the word bisa can be pronounced with a schwa or with the final [a: ]. Care was taken during recording to ensure that the words bisa and pasar were pronounced as intended to ensure that the words presented in the task were minimal pairs. The final /r/ is pasar is not realized resulting in lengthening of the preceeding vowel (Yunus Maris, 1980; Asmah, 2008). The word bisa is therefore ambiguous in meaning as it could refer to ‘poison’ pronounced with the standard pronunciation or it could refer to ‘possible’ in Indonesian Malay.

The perception task employed in this study is a discrimination task, whereby discrimination is “the act of differentiating two or more stimuli presented in some predefined format” (Logan & Pruitt, 1995). As Pisoni and Liverly (1995) explain, a discrimination exercise promotes “acquired distinctiveness”. In the AX categorical (same-different) discrimination task, the subjects’ task was to specify whether or not two stimuli in randomized word pairs were exemplars of the same phonetic category. In this study, the discrimination task was chosen as it taps phonological knowledge directly without mediation of lexical knowledge. Also, the stimuli used were non-native to listeners, it is appropriate to use a discrimination task, and not the identification task which taps into lexical knowledge (Tsukada, 2006; Tsukada, 2008). Therefore, listeners had to form some kind of mental representation of the phonetic categories under comparison instead of directly comparing stimuli on the basis of physical identity or mediate it via their lexical knowledge. Stimuli in the same pairs were physically different tokens drawn from the same phonetic category, while stimuli in different pairs were drawn from distinct categories. This type of discrimination task was used widely in cross-language studies (e.g. Strange & Dittmann, 1984; Ratos, 2014; Tsukada, 2006; Tsukada, 2008).

**Experimental Procedures**

The participants were seated comfortably, almost 40 cm away from a laptop computer in front of them, wearing a microphone headset. In the discrimination task, the participants listened to two words presented through the headphone sets and had to decide whether they represented the same or different words. The subjects were presented with a total of 120 trials each. There were six sets of minimal pairs as shown in table 4. For each set of minimal pairs, two same pairs and two different pairs were constructed. For example for /v/-/b/, the same pairs were visa-visa and bisa-bisa, while the different pairs were visa-bisa and bisa-visa. These four stimuli pairs were presented five times resulting in twenty tokens for each set of contrasts. The task took every participant about 10 to 15 minutes to complete, depending on

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>zara - sara</th>
<th>/zà:rà:/ vs /sà:rà:/</th>
<th>visa - bisa</th>
<th>/visa/ vs /bisa/</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>‘pull out something – cut’</td>
<td></td>
<td>‘visa– possible/poison’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bata - bata</td>
<td>/bà:tà:/ vs /bà:tà:/</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘spoil – bottle’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dara - dara</td>
<td>/dà:rà:/ vs /dà:rà:/</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>‘exceed – draft’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
the participant’s response pace. Results for each participant were registered by the computer and transferred to an Excel Spreadsheet for processing and scoring. One (1) mark was assigned to each correct attempt and zero (0) mark for each incorrect response. The scores of each participant were then transferred to the Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS, version 22) for statistical analysis.

RESULTS

Descriptive Results
The descriptive results show that the Malay native speakers discriminated the Hausa implosives-plosives contrasts poorly with lower correct percentages obtained [/ɓ-b/: $M = 36$] compared to the performance of native Hausa speakers who had high correct percentages [/ɓ-b/: $M = 80$; /ɗ-ɗ/: $M = 93$]. In contrast, the correct percentages obtained for the discrimination of Malay fricative-stop contrasts for /f-/p/ and /v-/b/ by Malay native speakers was higher [/f-p/: $M = 87$; /v-b/: $M = 76$] compared to the Hausa group [/f-p/: $M = 54$; /v-b/: $M = 51$]. Both groups performed relatively well with the alveolar segments as shown by the high correct percentages for both pairs of control segments [Malay: /s-z/, $M = 84$, /t-/d/: $M = 83$; Hausa: /z-s/, $M = 85$, /t-/d/: $M = 86$]. See Figure 1.

The results obtained from the discrimination of Malay fricative-stop contrast show that the Hausa native speakers were unable to discriminate the following pairs of contrasts: /f-/p/ and /v-/b/ with the correct percentage of only 54% and 51%, respectively. Since there were only two options available for their response, the results seem to be hovering around the guessing rate of 50%. This shows that the Hausa native speakers were less accurate than Malay native speakers when they heard the Malay fricative-stop contrasts. However, their discrimination accuracy depended on the type of contrasts they heard. Some contrast such as /f-/f/ and /v-/v/ were easier to discriminate with 66% and 64%, respectively. Contrasts such as /f-/p/ and /v-/b/ were more difficult to discriminate with only correct scores of 42% and 37%, respectively. Moreover, the results supported the claim made by the current research on non-native speech perception, as not all non-native segmental contrasts are equally difficult. Some are discriminated moderately well, and others at near native-like levels (Best, McRoberts & Sithole 1988; Best, McRoberts & Goodel, 2001; Best & Strange, 1992; Kochetov, 2004).

Figure 1: Correct discrimination percentages for Malay and Hausa native speakers
Table 5: Descriptive and inferential statistics for correct discrimination

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pairs</th>
<th>Malay Mean (SD)</th>
<th>Hausa Mean (SD)</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>/ɓ-ɓ/ and /b-b/</td>
<td>5.04 (1.73)</td>
<td>8.98 (9.7)</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>2.80</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/ɓ-ɓ/ and /b-b/</td>
<td>2.11 (0.86)</td>
<td>9.02 (0.84)</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>38.61</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/ɗ-ɗ/ and /d-d/</td>
<td>5.49 (1.74)</td>
<td>9.04 (0.85)</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>12.31</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/ɗ-ɗ/ and /d-d/</td>
<td>4.18 (2.62)</td>
<td>9.49 (0.63)</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>13.21</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/f-f/ and /p-p/</td>
<td>9.07 (0.780)</td>
<td>6.56 (1.16)</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>-12.06</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/f-p/ and /p-f/</td>
<td>8.27 (1.41)</td>
<td>4.16 (1.41)</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>-13.53</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/v-v/ and /b-b/</td>
<td>8.71 (0.458)</td>
<td>6.49 (1.41)</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>-11.78</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/v-b/ and /b-v/</td>
<td>8.91 (0.900)</td>
<td>3.67 (1.18)</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>-20.19</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/z-z/ and /s-s/</td>
<td>8.22 (1.28)</td>
<td>8.58 (1.18)</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>1.38</td>
<td>.106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/s-z/ and /z-s/</td>
<td>8.49 (1.10)</td>
<td>8.29 (1.31)</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>-.79</td>
<td>.434</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/t-t/ and /d-d/</td>
<td>8.40 (1.44)</td>
<td>9.24 (0.79)</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>-1.16</td>
<td>.873</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>/t-d/ and /d-t/</td>
<td>81.1 (1.21)</td>
<td>8.64 (1.21)</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>1.64</td>
<td>.173</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The independent sample $t$-test was conducted to identify any significant differences between the results of the two groups of participants. The results of all the 12 different pairs are summarized and presented in Table 5. As shown in the table, a significant difference is found for all consonant pairs except for the contrasts between /s-z/ and /t-d/ for both Hausa and Malay. The results show that the difference between the Malay and Hausa subjects are statistically significant for the plosive-implosive pairs as well as for the fricative-plosive pairs. The Malay subjects were unable to discriminate between plosives and implosives while the Hausa subjects were unable to discriminate between the fricatives and the plosives for /f-p/ and /v-b/. However, the difference between the two groups was not statistically significant for /s-z/ and /t-d/ as these contrasts were found in both Malay and Hausa; hence the speakers are sensitive to these contrasts.

**DISCUSSION**

This section discusses the results and major findings of the task for both Malay and Hausa native speakers, which include the level of difficulty encountered by the two groups of speakers in the discrimination of the various sounds contrasts discussed earlier. The results of the study were examined find out whether the perception of the contrasts was accounted for by existing models of speech perception.

**Sound Contrasts Found in both Malay and Hausa Languages**

The results obtained for the perception of fricatives and plosives /z-s/, /d-t/ supported the predictions postulated in the Perceptual Assimilation Model (PAM), where a two-Category
(TC) assimilation involving the mapping of the L2 contrasts to two categories in the L1 may result in ease of discrimination for the target L2 contrasts. The contrasts for /z-s/ and /d-t/ are found in both Malay and Hausa (Sani, 2005; Nik Safiah Karim et al., 2008). The phonetic experience of this contrast in the speakers’ L1 appears to be sufficient and results in positive transfer from the L1 to the L2 which facilitated performance in the discrimination task.

**Sound Contrasts Present in Malay Language and Absent in the Hausa Language**

The phonemes of these contrasts are sounds phonologically found in Malay phonemic inventory and phonologically absent in Hausa phoneme inventory. The sounds are the voiceless labio-dental fricative /f/ and the voiced labio-dental fricative /v/, and they are in contrast with /p/ and /b/, respectively. These pairs of contrast were predicted by PAM to be difficult for Hausa speakers as a Single Category Assimilation may result in the collapse of the L2 contrast into a single L1 category. Hausa has the voiceless bilabial fricative /φ/ but not the voiceless labio-dental fricative, /f/ nor the bilabial plosive /p/. When presented with two words from the latter categories, Hausa speakers may assimilate both of these segments to the only voiceless labial segment it has, the voiceless bilabial fricative /φ/. When presented with two words that represent the voiced labial segments /b/ and /v/, Hausa speakers may assimilate the voiced labio-dental fricative to the only voiced labial segment it has, the voiced bilabial stop /b/.

The results obtained from the discrimination of Malay fricative-stop contrast show that the Hausa native speakers were indeed unable to discriminate the following pairs of contrasts: /f-p/ and /v-b/. The performance of Hausa subjects hovered around the guessing threshold of 50% although the /f-p/ was slightly higher (M= 54%) compared to the mean correct percentage for /v-b/ which was only 51%. The results support the claim made by the current literature on non-native speech perception, as not all non-native segmental contrasts are equally difficult. Some are discriminated moderately well, and others at near native-like levels (Best, McRoberts & Sithole 1988; Best, McRoberts & Goodel, 2001; Best & Strange, 1992; Kochetov, 2004). In the context of this study, the performance of the discrimination task was native like for the alveolar stops and fricatives as discussed in the earlier section, but the performance for labial stops and fricatives are poor as predicted by the Perceptual Assimilation Model (PAM) proposed by Best (1994).

**Sound Contrasts Present in Hausa Language and Absent in Malay Language**

The phonemes of these contrasts are sounds phonologically found in Hausa phonemic inventory and phonologically absent in Malay phoneme inventory. These sounds are voiced bilabial implosive /ɓ/ and voiced alveolar implosive /ɗ/. The results obtained show that the Malay native speakers, having no linguistic experience of Hausa implosives, failed to discriminate between the plosives and the implosives. This suggests that the acoustic differences may not be audible to the Malay native speakers. The results supported the predictions made by PAM Single-Category (SC), as the Hausa sounds contrasts are judged by the Malay native speakers as equally good or poor tokens of the only bilabial or alveolar stop category found in Malay. The two Hausa implosive sounds are assimilated to the Malay voiced plosives, which resulted in poor discriminations. The same instances were reported by Schmidt (1996), as Korean native speakers found it very difficult to discriminate /θ-ð/, /ʃ-ʒ/, /p-b/, and /f-v/ contrasts in English as a result of single-category assimilation to Korean phonemes.
CONCLUSION
The analysis of the discrimination of the stops revealed that the Malay native speakers were able to discriminate most of the sounds contrasts but faced substantial problems in the perception of plosives-implosives. The Hausa native speakers, on the other hand, successfully discriminated all the implosives-plosives contrasts but they could not distinguish the labial fricatives and stops in Malay. The alternating pattern in the result of the two respondent groups indicated that the /ɓ-b/ contrast was difficult for the naïve Malay group while the bilabial stop and labio-dental fricative was difficult for the Hausa group despite not being completely naïve to these pairs of contrasts as the Hausa group has some exposure to Malay and are also second language learners of English where these segments are quite frequently encountered. Although the study did not examine the effect of proficiency in English on the performance of the subjects in the discrimination task, the contribution from proficiency in English seems to be minimal as the performance of the Hausa group was hovering slightly above the chance level.

This study also showed that the non-native perception model was successful in the prediction and interpretation of most of the perceptual difficulties encountered by the Malay and Hausa native speakers in the perception of stops and fricatives. The Perceptual Assimilation Model (PAM) predicts the success of adults’ monolinguals ability to discriminate unfamiliar foreign contrasts with little or no experience to the target language. The results of the analysis of the perception task pointed out that both the native speakers have problems in perceiving non-native contrasts as the non-native segment is often assimilated to the nearest native category that exist. In the case of implosives, Malay subjects considered them as members of the plosive stops found in Malay. As for the Hausa subjects, the voiced labio-dental fricative, /v/ was probably assimilated to the voiced bilabial stop, /b/ in Hausa.

However, it is not clear what happens with /p/ and /f/ as both phonemes are absent in Hausa. Although it was not tested directly in this study, it is possible that both segments were considered as members of the bilabial fricative /φ/ which exists in Hausa. Future studies can test this directly to examine the extent to which instances of /p/ and /f/ are considered good examplers of /φ/ in Hausa. Future studies should also explore whether performance in the task can be improved with directed attention to the plosive-implosive contrast in Hausa as well as the dental-bilabial contrast in Malay and English. These future directions of studies will provide important suggestions on how to ensure successful learning of these contrasts by second language learners.

REFERENCES


EXPLORING THE ADOPTION AND PRACTICE OF CITIZEN JOURNALISM IN RURAL COMMUNITIES IN NIGERIA

Oberiri Destiny Apuke* and Livinus Jesse Ayih2

Department of Communication, Taraba State University, Nigeria
E-mail: apukedestiny@gmail.com

ABSTRACT
Despite the numerous advantages reported as regards citizen journalism in developing countries, little has been documented on its adoption and practice in rural developing communities. This study, is anchored on democratic participant media theory. A qualitative research design was adopted and interviews were conducted among 40 participants within three large rural developing communities in the north-eastern region of Nigeria. The findings confirmed that a large proportion of the rural dwellers were not aware of the term citizen journalism, and only a few of them participated fully in the practice of citizen journalism. The results establish that citizen journalism practice is still very minimal in the rural areas of Nigeria, due to poverty, power failure, their attitude, religious upbringing, customs, high level of illiteracy, high internet subscription and slow speed. Nonetheless, it was found that citizen journalism provides an avenue for community dwellers to gather and disseminate messages with immediacy, assists in exposing the excesses of government officials, and promotes a healthy lifestyle in community settings. It is relevant to encourage citizen journalism practice in rural areas, and further studies could continue to explore the issues affecting the adoption and practice of citizen journalism in developing countries.

Keywords: Citizen journalism, community, Nigeria, democratic participant media theory, rural dwellers.

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND
The development of the Internet and other new technology devices has resulted in a new course where people cover events and distribute content easily and directly. Therefore, the advent of the new media has introduced the concept of citizen journalism, which is the act of allowing ordinary individuals to play an active role in the process of collecting, reporting, analysing and disseminating news and information to the public. By implication, a common citizen is involved in citizen journalism when he takes the task of gathering news and spreading it using the new media (Salawu, 2011). Atton (2009) provides a nuanced definition of citizen journalism, describing it as a journalism that is produced not by professionals but by those outside mainstream media organizations; that is, amateur media producers who typically have little or no training or professional qualifications as journalists; they write and report from their position as citizens, as members of communities, as activists, or as fans. Therefore, the development of blogs, mobile devices, social networks, micro-blogging and other digital tools has permitted people to publish their own stories and cover their own communities, in turn reducing the monopoly of information gathering and dispersal from the conventional media to a more interactive media environment (Tseguy, 2016).

Globally, research has confirmed the effectiveness of citizen journalism since through the availability of technology, citizens often can report breaking news more quickly than traditional media reporters. Notable examples of citizen journalism reporting of major world
Apuke, O. D and Ayih, L. J.

events are, the 2010 Haiti earthquake, the Arab Spring, the Occupy Wall Street movement, the 2013 protests in Turkey, the Euromaidan events in Ukraine, and Syrian Civil War and the 2014 Ferguson unrest (Gilardi, 2016). Specifically, in Nigeria, citizen journalism played a substantial role in the nationwide protest against fuel subsidy removal in 2012 (Odii, 2013). This indicates the relevance of citizen journalism in our contemporary times (Noor, 2017). Despite the numerous advantages reported as regards citizen journalism in developing countries, little has been documented on its adoption and practice in rural developing communities. It has been observed that the media in developing countries do not give adequate coverage to the rural areas, and the manner the media perceive rural news shows that the rural areas are alarmingly neglected (Ate and Ikerodah, 2012). For example, Ocheni and Nwankwo (2012) stated that in Nigeria the mass media has over the years, solely neglected the rural areas and writes from the standpoint of an urban dweller's world. This suggests that the ills of the rural areas, the difficulties of life there, and their burning sense of grievance are seldom seriously conveyed. How then do the rural dwellers find ways to disseminate and get information since the Nigerian press seems to neglect them?

No doubt, the role of citizen journalism cannot be ruled out in the case of the rural dwellers since citizen journalism is based upon public citizens playing an active role in the process of collecting, reporting, analysing, and disseminating news and information. There is therefore a need for a study that demonstrates how these neglected rural citizens adopt citizen journalism to foster information dissemination which is the objective of the current study. The outcomes of this study are beneficial to the eclectic growing body of studies on alternative, participatory, community and citizen journalism, and have a wider significance not only in Nigeria but across the continent of Africa.

Aim and objectives
The main thrust of this study is to ascertain the prospects and constraints of citizen journalism practice in rural communities in Nigeria. To accomplish this purpose, this paper is guided by the following objectives:

- To confirm whether rural dwellers entirely accept and participate in the exercise of citizen journalism.
- To determine the prospects of citizen journalism in rural communities.
- To find out the constraints of adopting citizen journalism in rural communities.
- To outline the forms of citizen journalism that manifest in rural communities.
- To highlight ways in which citizen journalism practice could be better encouraged in rural communities.

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK
The adoption and practice of citizen journalism have been felt both in the western part of the world and in Africa. In the western context, Rodriguez (2000) argues that independent media enable “ordinary” citizens to become politically empowered. This means that when people create their own media, they are better able to represent themselves and their communities. She sees these “citizens’ media” as projects of self-education. The author described “citizens” as those members of society who “actively participate in actions that reshape their own identities, the identities of others, and their social environment, [through which] they produce power” (Rodriguez, 2000, p. 19). For example, Rodriguez (2000) reports that the
production of a video by striking women workers in a Colombian maternity clinic demonstrates how citizen journalism helps in the shifting power roles that facilitate a creative collective dynamic that challenges institutionalized leadership roles (Rodriguez, 2001). According to Atton (2009), an alternative or citizen journalism may serve specific communities and enable participation by those communities in media production. The same author highlighted the different manifestations of citizen journalism in different contexts from natural disasters, political violence or organised armature and community practices which is the case in the current study. Similar research conducted in the western region of the world demonstrates that since its advent the citizen journalism brand has been tested in several places and situation; for example, the 2004 Indonesian Boxing Day Tsunami, bombing that took place in London, Virginia Tech disasters where citizens massively engaged in journalistic work of snapping photographs, text and voice messages which were used to report such events to them. Further examples are the Arab Spring, the 2013 military takeover of power in Egypt and its protest, and the Occupy Wall Street movement (Carr, Barnidge, Lee, and Tsang, 2014). In this entire scenario, the ordinary citizens collected information, which included on-the-spot action pictures and uploaded to the internet for the world’s consumption.

In the African context, most especially Nigeria, studies on citizen journalism have been predominantly carried out on urban dwellers. For instance, Salawu (2011:194) observed that citizen journalism has profound implications for the blossoming of democracy. This supports Bowman and Willis (2003) that listed the benefits of citizen journalism to include an increased trust in media, shared responsibility in informing democracy, and a better journalism, etc. Also, Apeverga (2010) in Idoko (2012) carried out a study on the impact of citizen journalism in Nigeria. The study revealed that citizen journalism has impacted a lot on the lives of Nigerians, and that everyone is now a reporter and has the right to air out his view without running to a media house. However, the findings of the same study establish that people most times do not get the true picture of a story before posting it on the internet just because they want to be the first to post about a particular happening. Furthermore, Okoro et al. (2013) discovered that citizen journalism is emerging as a powerful phenomenon across Nigeria. This view is concretized by Dare (2011) who found that Sahara Reporters, a citizen journalists’ website was rated by 86 of the 120 respondents as a serious source of breaking news. This proposes that due to its interactivity and ability to present news in split seconds, citizen journalism has presented a severe challenge to the mainstream media in Nigeria; it has broadened people’s access to a variety of news, during emergencies.

Consequently, some scholars maintained that citizen journalism is a serious sort of journalism that eradicates the top-down monopolistic communication. Annotating on the benefits of citizen journalism, Alemoh (2013) observed that most of the issues the mainstream media leave out, the citizen journalist easily captures. Events that occur in distant places are now published directly by citizen journalists, making the public mindful of certain matters that happen around them. For example, the plane crash of the former and the late Governor of Taraba state of Nigeria Governor Danbaba Danfulani Suntai that occurred on 25 October 2012 was reported instantly by citizen journalists/eyewitnesses; however, it took about 24 hours for the mainstream media houses in Nigeria to report the same story. Furthermore, most of the events of the Boko Haram bomb blast are reported instantly by citizen journalists accompanied by photographs of the incident even before the mainstream media stations arrive at the bomb attack scenes. This suggests that citizen journalism
provides an avenue for both pros and novices in the origination and airing of news content to the receiving public/audience. It has made journalism more democratic and participatory as opposed to the mainstream monopolistic media production. Some other interesting aspect of citizen journalism is its speed in delivery of the message. It delivers messages in a flash like the focal ratio of light and this is possible due to its lack of gatekeeping. It, therefore, has immediate feedback from the audience as in the case of Facebook comments and liking. That is the reason why many people call citizen journalism “we media” because of the content made by the people, and for the people.

However, some other authors claim that due to its lack of credibility and authenticity of its content it is endangering the societal information cycle. In respect of this, Maher (2005) observed that the effectiveness of citizen journalism has been debunked by the mainstream media due to its lack of objectivity. Consequently, some journalists and media houses view citizen journalism with doubt and uncertainty, believing that journalism practice is intended for trained journalists who understand the objectivity and balance as well as the whole canons of journalism. Supporting this view, Mgbejume (2008) asserts that a journalist has to undergo training before he is equipped to publish effectively; he likened an untrained journalist to a madman left with a gun who can shoot at will without control which leads to disaster. As far as this writer is concerned, before one publishes news online, he ought to receive journalistic training in order to become familiarized with the moral philosophy of the profession. In addition, Educause Learning Initiative (2007) postulates that by permitting anyone to collect and broadcast the message to the public, citizen journalism practice will be more of personal interest, myopic view and as well cultivate new media community of similar interests. However, via Blogs, Facebook, and Twitter citizen journalists have disseminated breakthrough information on political oppression, corruption and economic theft in the society and the world at large.

Substantiating the criticism on citizen journalism, Dare (2011) reported that only 33 respondents of the 120 surveyed trusted Sahara reporters. This suggests that some Nigerians do not believe stories from citizen journalists because they spread falsehood. In the same manner, Apuke (2016) commented that the issue affecting citizen journalism in Nigeria is its lack of gatekeepers or editors to filter the information before it gets to the public. This suggests that citizen journalism in Nigeria might be full of duplication, malpractices, and wrong misleading information. Most of the news and information passed using citizen journalism might not be genuine; they could be propaganda that is aimed at either annoying or causing anger, promoting injustice or even creating enmity among the targeted audience. This view is consistent with Okoro et al. (2013) who argue that citizen journalism fuels civil unrest, political instability, and ethnoreligious crisis. In this regard, Aligwe and Nwafor (2017) in an empirical study that focused on Citizen Journalism and the coverage of the 2015 General Elections in South-East Nigeria identified a lack of professionalism, credibility question, over-sensationalism, the anonymity of sources and difficulty in regulation as some of the major weaknesses of the practice.

The problem affecting the effectiveness of citizen journalism in Nigeria has also been outlined by some authors. For example, Idoko (2012) discovered the challenges of citizen journalism in Nigeria to include; computer illiteracy, difficulty in accessing the internet and high price of ‘surfing’ the net. This means that the high cost of internet subscription impedes the effectiveness of citizen journalism in Nigeria. Due to the lack of free internet service, anyone who desires to post any event online must buy “data” which is expensive to some due
Exploring The Adoption and Practice of Citizen Journalism in Rural Communities in Nigeria
to the economic situation. Even so, the author found out the benefits of citizen journalism cannot be cast out. These include wider coverage of events, urgency in media reports and encouragement of information and communication technology (ICT) in the country. Another impediment to citizen journalism in Nigeria is the high level of illiteracy in the country. According to the World Development Indicators (2010) reports, the adult literacy level in Nigeria is 60%. This means that 40% of the population (about 60 million people in Nigeria) is excluded from citizen journalism and all other opportunities for audience participation that may require basic literacy (UNDP, 2010). This is clearly dangerous to the health of the nation’s democracy and a strong bane to citizen journalism in Nigeria. Aligwe and Nwafor (2017) found uneven penetration, illiteracy, constant power failure, endemic poverty and systemic corruption as the major threats affecting the effectiveness of citizen journalism in Nigeria. They recommended more efforts to enhance even penetration of ICTs in the country and address the issue of systemic corruption and endemic poverty, as these have continually constituted a major setback to every aspect of her development.

Theoretical framework
This paper, which is anchored on the democratic participant media theory examines the role citizens play in gathering and disseminating information in a society.

Democratic participant media theory
The democratic participant media theory was developed by Dennis McQuail during the 80’s. According to Folarin (1998), the theory discards the top-down communication system that involves professionals and commercially driven operators who hijack the media for their selfish interest, but agitate for pluralizing and democratize form of access and production of media contents. The theory advocates that media content generation, production, and dissemination should be done by one person to another instead of concentrating on particular top groups. It calls for the media to be a medium of the people, for the people and by the people rather than a medium in the hands of a few monopolistic groups. Ojobor (2002) states that this theory advocates for more horizontal rather than vertical (top-down) communication due to the continued commercialization and monopolization of the media stations as well as centralism of public broadcast stations. Corroborating this view, McQuail (1987) noted that one of the basic principles of the theory is that “individual citizens and minority groups have rights to access the media (rights to communicate) and rights to be served by the media according to their own determination of need. Therefore, this theory advocates for the liberalization of the media for the common good of the people it is meant to serve. It suggests that the people should have free access to the means of communication as against the monopolistic and rigid structure of traditional mass media. This theory is applicable to this current research because it focuses on the citizens’ participation in information gathering and dissemination. Thus, the theory supports participatory, citizen and alternative journalism, which this present work attempts to investigate in the Nigerian context.

From the literature reviewed, it could be deduced that the issue of citizen journalism in Nigeria has been little studied. Even though the knowledge of its practice seems to be prevalent among some citizens, the literature is growing. It was also observed that most of the reviewed papers are still far from adequate due to their surface technique of examining the subject matter. Most of the studies depended on a survey questionnaire method with a strong focus on understanding the phenomenon of citizen journalism from mostly the
professional media personnel, and urban dwellers with little emphasis on the rural public/dwellers (Odii, 2013). It is, therefore, worthwhile to study the phenomenon of citizen journalism through the rural dwellers’ lens since it is mostly referred to a journalism for the common man/citizen or community. This current study will, therefore, contribute to the body of knowledge by researching (using an interview method) citizen journalism practice among the rural dwellers and community. It will attempt to understand the prospects and constraints of citizen journalism practice in rural communities of a developing country such as Nigeria. To the best of the researchers’ knowledge, this paper is one of the first to make such an attempt. Therefore, the qualitative rich data derived from the interview will increase and contribute to the growing literature on the citizen or participatory journalism.

**METHODS**

**Study design**

This study made use of the qualitative research design following the phenomenological approach described by Braun and Clarke (2013). Interviews were conducted among 40 conveniently selected participants. The interview technique was used because few studies exist that explicate the phenomenon of citizen journalism in Nigeria. Thus, a method allowing for sufficient freedom and depth of probing was needed. This method has been shown to permit participants to describe their feelings in their own words and new themes could be followed up as they emerged (Dogari, Apuke, & Shadrach, 2018). It was also felt necessary to develop a context-based understanding as regards citizen journalism practice in the rural areas of Nigeria. In keeping with the general practice of qualitative research, the participants were promised and given anonymity in order to encourage them to discuss pertinent issues in depth and detail (Kontagora, Watts, & Allsop, 2018). For example, the participants were coded as participant 1, 2 3…40.

**Participants and sampling**

The study took place in three communities in the north-eastern region of Nigeria (i.e. Ardo Kola in Taraba state, Maiha in Adamawa state and Kaltungo in Gombe state). For clarification, a community in this study refers to either a small or large group of people that has something in common, such as norms, religion, values, and identity, and as well share a sense of place that is situated in a given geographical area such as a town. Therefore, the communities used in this study were selected based on convenience and proximity to the researchers. Additionally, it has been observed that technological development within this region is growing but very little research in the implementation of (ICT) has been undertaken (Apuke and Apollos, 2017; Poushter, 2016). Since the main aim of this study was to explore citizen journalism practice in rural communities, the authors made sure selected participants understood what citizen or participatory journalism is, because it was observed that most of the rural dwellers do not understand the term citizen or participatory journalism, so the authors had to explain what it meant in their local dialect through an interpreter. After the explanation, the authors asked if they practice what has been explained, those who then acknowledge that they practice citizen journalism were selected for this study and this amounted to about 40 participants across the three communities. So basically, those who use various forms of new media and acknowledge its usage for participatory journalism were selected. Of the 40 participants, (n=22) were male and (n=18) were female. In terms of age range, (n=23) were between the ages of 18-29 and (n=16) were 30 and above. With respect to
educational background, (n=18) had a formal education while (n=22) had no formal education but could still communicate in English.

![Figure 1: North East Nigeria](image)

**Data collection procedure**

Data were collected through face-to-face semi-structured interviews, and all interviews were recorded. The interviews were conducted in the early months of 2017 and lasted for approximately 8 weeks. The questions in the interview script were adapted from established research (i.e., Alemoh, 2013; Aligwe and Nwafor, 2017; Okoro et al., 2013; Salawu, 2011) with appropriate revisions and modifications to suit into the context of this study. Each interview lasted for about 20-60 minutes to complete and was recorded and transcribed verbatim.

**Data analysis**

To examine the qualitative data received from the interview sessions. The six thematic data analysis steps identified by Braun and Clarke (2013) were employed. These entail the researchers transcribing the recorded interviews; rereading the transcriptions to identify emerging themes from the recorded data; reviewing the themes; defining the themes; naming the themes, and lastly writing the outcomes. The purpose of using thematic analysis is to identify patterns of meaning across a dataset that provide an answer to the research question being addressed.

**Results and discussion**

The results section has been organised into five themes. The first demonstrates the acceptance and participation in the practice of citizen journalism among rural dwellers. The second highlights the prospects of citizen journalism in rural communities of Nigeria. The third demonstrates the constraints of adopting citizen journalism in rural communities of Nigeria. The fourth establishes the forms of citizen journalism that manifest among the rural
community dwellers, and finally, the fifth highlights the ways in which citizen journalism practice could be better encouraged among rural community dwellers in Nigeria.

**The reception and participation in citizen journalism among rural dwellers**

In response to the first question about the participants’ acceptance and participation in the exercise of citizen journalism, it was found a large proportion of the rural dwellers were not aware of the term citizen journalism even though they adopted and practiced it. In this regard, the entire participants support citizen journalism practice, but only a few of them participated fully in the practice of citizen journalism. This indicates a minimum full participation of citizen journalism practice in the sampled areas. In this respect, one of the interviewees remarked:

> Although we have a slower technological advancement, the advancement of citizen journalism has been felt in our area. But, many of us do not practice citizen journalism and prefer to use our devices to communicate with friends than post breaking news and events [Participant_1].

Another participant stated that:

> At some time, I do engage in citizen journalism practice. I recall a time when a woman gave birth in the street due to lack of adequate medical facility in my community. I immediately captured the event and posted it online so as to draw humanitarian responses. Nevertheless, I do not frequently partake in citizen journalism [Participant_6].

Supporting this view, a participant claimed that:

> I am fully cognizant of how citizen journalism works and I completely accept its practice, but this is not fully encouraged and acknowledged in my community. We have this culture of people minding their business which in turn discourages me sometimes from posting certain issues that happen in my community [Participant_18].

Only a few participants mentioned that they fully partake in the practice of citizen journalism. In this respect, a participant acknowledging to be a citizen journalist affirmed that:

> Citizen journalism or participatory journalism is indeed a blessing to us because it has permitted me to share my viewpoint with heterogeneous people in my community and beyond. I will boldly say that I frequently engage in citizen journalism and this has been helpful to my audience. For example, there was a period where rape cases in my community were the order of the day. I took it upon myself to research into the issues, got live photos and footages of those caught in the act and posted them so as to create more awareness [Participant_15].

In line with this notion, one of the interviewees commented that:
I have been practicing citizen journalism for about 5 years now and I don’t regret this practice or its notion. The practice has enabled me to inform a couple of people on the dangers of certain issues in our community and beyond [Participant_22].

Additionally, it was found that the few participants who fully practice citizen journalism do so predominantly through their mobile devices using social media such as Facebook, WhatsApp, and Twitter. Overall, the findings suggest that a large proportion of the rural dwellers were not aware of the term citizen journalism, yet they adopt and practice it, but the practice is low. These results contrast studies which revealed that citizen journalism has impacted a lot on the lives of Nigerian people and that everyone is now a reporter and has the right to air out his view without running to a media house (Apeverga, 2010; Idoko, 2012). The implication of this current study is that although citizen journalism has permitted an easy dissemination of stories in split seconds, its full practice has not yet been acknowledged in the grassroots areas of Nigeria and only a few people are willing to partake in the practice of citizen journalism. This outcome reflects the findings of a research which reported that in Nigeria, citizen journalism is gradually developing (Dare, 2011). The factors discouraging these participants as regards the full practice of citizen journalism will be outlined in the subsequent themes.

The prospects of citizen journalism in rural communities of Nigeria
The entire interviewed participants acknowledged that the prospects of citizen journalism in their community are inevitable. They believed that citizen journalism has provided an avenue for anyone willing to gather and disseminate messages to the rural dwellers and beyond. It has democratised the distribution of information as anyone could instantly report events in their community. The participants generally held the view that the fastness in the dissemination of messages also makes citizen journalism an interesting one. It delivers messages in a flash like the speed of light which in turn attracts an instant reply from the community dwellers. This notion supports the theoretical framework (Democratic participant media theory) of this study which advocates that people should have free access to the means of communication as against the monopolistic and rigid structure of traditional mass media (McQuail, 1987; Ojobor, 2002). In this regard, one of the rural community dwellers commented that:

The use of citizen journalism has helped some of us expose the ills of government in our community. The issues of lack of basic amenities have been constantly reported by some in our community and neighbouring villages. There are a lot of issues being neglected by the mainstream media that volunteered community citizen journalist report and this has made some government officials come to our aid [Participant_20].

In line with these, a considerable amount (n=31) of the interviewed rural dwellers held the notion that citizen journalism and the advent of the new media has assisted them to expose the excesses of government officials in their rural communities. They stated instances whereby government approved projects in the communities and the rural district head embezzled such money. When such cases are reported to the mainstream media, they are rarely aired. However, with the help of information communication gadgets community
dwellers have been able to post such issues on Facebook, Twitter, and WhatsApp, which in turn have attracted the attention of the government to act and remedy the situation. This has brought about developments in their community. One of the interviewed community dwellers reports:

I recall a time when the government approved the renovation of our community high school. The top officials in our community neglected the project and embezzled the money. This situation attracted the community’s attention and some of us posted the pictures of the debilitated school, which in turn made the government arrest the officials that embezzled our community allocation. Within two months the government was able to look for capable hands that renovated our high school [Participant_40].

The participants also held the notion that their community which is situated in the north-eastern part of Nigeria has witnessed some attacks from Boko Haram, which is not immediately reported by the mainstream media. However, some of them have been able to report instantly the occurrence of a bomb blast and attacks before any media organizations arrive at the scene. This has enabled them to report first-hand information that could attract a humanitarian response. They believed that the mainstream media could alter the reports to favour the government in power. In line with this notion, one of the participants alleges that:

There was a time when our community was attacked and I was an eyewitness. The mainstream media reported that the attack was not a serious one and there should not be much panicking, however, the incident was a serious one that took the lives of many of our community dwellers. Some of us were able to capture the accurate event and post via various social media platforms which in turn attracted the attention of the United States government. As I speak, we now have a barracks in our community and this has reduced the constant attack on us [Participant_38].

Most of the interviewed rural dwellers perceived that the advent of citizen journalism has enhanced their choice of political candidates. Through the posting of a candidate’s achievement and lapses by some of the community dwellers, they have been sensitized to the appropriate candidates that could move their community to greater heights. This suggests that citizen journalism promotes grassroots mobilization. In this respect, a community interviewed participant commented that:

Some of our politicians who are representing us in the National Assembly have been exposed through the help of some willing citizen journalist in our community. For example, in many occasions I have posted the underachievement of some of our so-called political leaders. As far as I am concerned, citizen journalism has assisted us to expose some of these politicians and sensitised us on an appropriate candidate to select [Participant_20].

Another benefit of citizen journalism highlighted by the interviewed rural community dwellers is in the aspect of health and hygiene promotion. Most of them pointed out that citizen journalism has helped them to keep hygiene and avoid certain practices. For example,
during the outbreak of the Ebola and Bird flu virus, the efforts of some of the community dwellers assisted most of them to stay on guard so as to prevent the spread of the virus. In addition, they also claimed that through various posts online they have been able to grasp the dangers of HIV and AIDS and have attempted to visit the community health care centre which in turn has reduced the rate of its spread among some of the rural dwellers. Although some of them are not learned, the pictures and videos posted by some learned ones have assisted them to understand the dangers of HIV, Bird Flu, and Ebola. This suggests that citizen journalism’s impact could also be felt by both educated and non-educated. Therefore, it should highly be recommended among rural dwellers as they are more prone and vulnerable to diseases. In addition, it was found that in contrast to research finding which claims that lack of credibility and authenticity of citizen journalism content is endangering the societal information cycle (Maher 2005), the participants believe that the content of citizen journalists is credible as it reports first-hand information, unlike the filtered mainstream media information.

The authors also asked the few rural dwellers that fully engage in citizen journalism to state the ways in which they involve other members of the community, particularly those who do not engage with the new media. In response to this, the participants claim they regularly attempt to engage other rural dwellers who do not have the means of sharing information online by getting vital information from them and requesting them to be a source of information. They expressed that although these ones do not have the means to share information, the word of mouth (WOM) has been essential in assisting and informing them on messages they should disseminate through their technological devices. Some of the participants stated that they normally go to market places where many rural dwellers who do not engage with technological gadgets are found and from there, they get vital information on situations happening in their community.

Generally, the implication of the above comments suggests that citizen journalism has provided an avenue for community dwellers to gather and disseminate messages to their fellow rural dwellers and beyond. This implies that instead of them waiting for the mainstream media, some of them have been able to inform the public of their aspirations and yearning which in turn has brought some development in the community as well as attracted humanitarian response. The outcome of the above comments also suggests that citizen journalism has assisted rural community dwellers to expose the excesses of government officials in their communities, which in turn has enhanced their choice of political candidates. With respect to the promotion of a healthy lifestyle in the community settings, it could be deduced that citizen journalism has helped some of the community members to keep hygiene and avoid certain practices. For instance, during outbreaks such as Ebola and Bird flu virus, community dwellers have been sensitised appropriately. Additionally, their knowledge of HIV and AIDS has also been improved due to their exposure to the videos and photos that demonstrate the dangers of HIV and AIDS, suggesting that videos and photo features of citizen journalism is very helpful to rural dwellers as most of them seem not to be learned. The outcome of this study is consistent with Alemoh’s (2013) observation which advocates that most of the issues the mainstream media leave out, the citizen journalist easily captures. Events that occur in distant places are now published directly by citizen journalists, making the public mindful of certain matters that happen around them. In addition, Educause Learning Initiative (2007) postulates that through Blogs, Facebook, and Twitter citizen
journalists have disseminated breakthrough information on political oppression, corruption and economic theft in the society and the world at large.

**The constraints of adopting and practicing citizen journalism in rural communities**

The interviewees were asked to outline some of the issues confronting the actualization of citizen journalism practice in their community. A large proportion of the participants reported poverty and power failure as one of the major constraints to the effectiveness of citizen journalism. This notion was also shared by Aligwe and Nwafor (2017) who found that uneven penetration, illiteracy, constant power failure, endemic poverty and systemic corruption as the major threats affecting the effectiveness of citizen journalism in Nigeria. In addition, the participants in this current study also pointed out to the attitude, religious upbringing and customs of some of the community dwellers. For example, most of the married women in the community are confined to their homes due to the religious rules and this affects them from covering events that could assist the public. Furthermore, the custom of not allowing certain events (such as accident scene, rape cases, murder cases, etc.) to the snapped affects the effectiveness of citizen journalism in rural areas. In respect to this view, one of the interviewed participants stated that:

Poverty and power failure affect most of us from getting good information communication gadgets and even if we do, there is no constant electricity to keep them charged. For the past six weeks a rainstorm dropped some electric pole wires in our community, resulting in the shutting down of our cell phones and other technological gadgets [Participant_25].

Other challenges that discourage the adoption and practice of citizen journalism was the high level of illiteracy among the rural dwellers. Although some of them engage in citizen journalism, most of them are discouraged due to lack of adequate knowledge to operate modern technological devices. In line with this, one of the participants commented that:

The level of illiteracy in our community is so much that most people don’t even wish to own a technological device; they’d rather talk about practicing citizen journalism. Although some of the community dwellers might be willing to partake in citizen journalism, they are highly discouraged because they cannot read nor write, neither are they acquainted with modern technological devices [Participant_6].

Supporting this point of view, another rural dweller stated that:

I own a smartphone and sometimes chat with it, but I lack adequate knowledge that will enable me to construct better sentences that I could use along the pictures I wish to upload to the public and this sometimes discourages me from frequent reporting of events that could assist my community [Participant_12].

The participants also pointed out to the issue of high internet subscription and slow speed in the rural areas as a factor discouraging them to fully harness the effectiveness of citizen journalism. Most of the participants claimed that they run out of data subscription and have only access to 2G networks. These findings seem to be a problem that also extends to
the urban areas of Nigeria; however, it is most glaring in the rural areas because the rural dwellers report to have slower internet services compared to urban cities. In a related study carried out in an urban centre in Nigeria, Idoko (2012) discovered the challenges of citizen journalism include; computer illiteracy, difficulty in accessing the internet and high price of ‘surfing’ the net. This suggests that the high cost of internet subscription impedes the effectiveness of citizen journalism in both rural and urban areas of Nigeria. Therefore, due to the lack of free internet service, anyone who desires to post any event online must buy “data” which is expensive to some due to the economic situation.

Generally, it could be inferred from the above comments that poverty and power failure, the attitude, religious upbringing and customs, high level of illiteracy, high internet subscription and slow speed in the rural areas are factors discouraging the adoption and practice of citizen journalism in rural areas of Nigeria. In line with this, the participants were asked for comments on the ways in which citizen journalism could be promoted and encouraged in their community and beyond.

The forms of citizen journalism that manifest among the rural community dwellers

The participants were asked how they manage to practice citizen journalism, even though they are faced with challenges due to material deprivation which has been defined as the inability to afford basic resources and services. A large proportion of the respondents remarked that when they are out of internet subscription, they make efforts to reach other community members who have technological gadgets and inform them of certain information so they could post on their behalf. As regards slow internet access, the participants mentioned that they sometimes wait to post information at night when the network is better. They acknowledge this could affect the immediacy of citizen journalism; nevertheless, this technique has been helpful to them. In addition, the participants who do not have adequate knowledge on the usage of technological devices admitted that they meet other people to assist them operate their phones so they could post vital information. They reported that besides using social networking sites, they also use SMS to disseminate vital information among their community members because it is cheaper. The participants mentioned two types of citizen journalism they engaged in; the opportunistic and planned types. The opportunistic type happens when a bystander or citizen happens to be in the right place at the right time; for example, at the site of a tragedy that has just happened and they witness the incident unfolding before them and capture it through film, photos or write about the event. Whilst the other type of citizen journalist is somebody who has purposely placed themselves at the scene in order to capture an event as it unfolds to communicate this to the rest of the world. In this regard, the participants remarked that the opportunistic type is the more common form of citizen journalism among them.

Ways in which citizen journalism practice could be better encouraged among rural community dwellers

The majority of the interviewed rural dwellers suggest that government agencies make development a priority. They believe doing so will improve the living condition of those in the rural areas, which in turn, encourages the use of technological devices that foster citizen journalism. The participants also called on the government to improve power supply in their community. It was observed that most transformers are no longer functioning and some areas have not seen electricity for a long while, thereby deterring the effectiveness of community
and citizen journalism. Most of the participants also reported that more orientation as regards the essence of citizen journalism is needed in the rural areas as some of the rural dwellers might not be even conversant with its practices. One of the participants remarked that:

I believe if the government provides gadgets and improves our skills; it will encourage us to buy gadgets that will enable us to effectively carry out citizen journalism. Citizen journalism is only effective when you have the technological tool to broadcast breaking news and events [Participant_28].

Another participant commented that:

In my ward, there are only few people that are aware of citizen journalism or even have a gadget that could facilitate its practice. Thus, I strongly recommend orientation [Participant_21].

The participants also recommended that good schools be set up in rural areas just like urban areas, as most of the learned people in their community were opportune to school outside. Due to the lack of good education, many people are not encouraged to study, thereby resulting in a high rate of illiteracy which in turn discourages the adoption and practice of citizen journalism. So, they believe when the level of illiteracy among the rural dwellers is reduced to the barest minimum, it will encourage citizen journalism as many will have the knowledge to operate modern technological devices. The participants also recommended that the issue of high internet subscription and slow speed be tackled with urgency so as to encourage rural dwellers to partake in effective community and citizen journalism. Internet service providers should reduce the cost of their subscription and extend a 4G network to rural areas so as to improve the internet speed, which in turn might encourage citizen journalism.

**CONCLUSION AND IMPLICATION**

This study, which is anchored on democratic participant theory, aimed at increasing our understanding of citizen journalism practice, with a focus on rural dwellers, which has been little studied. The findings of this study suggest that a large proportion of the rural community dwellers in Nigeria are not aware of the term citizen journalism, but few participated fully in the practice of citizen journalism, and many of them support citizen journalism practice. The few participants who fully practice citizen journalism do so predominantly through their mobile devices using social media such as Facebook, WhatsApp, and Twitter. The possible issues that discourage the full adoption and practice of citizen journalism in rural areas are poverty, power failure, their attitude, religious upbringing and customs, high level of illiteracy, high internet subscription and slow speed. These issues could be reduced if the government makes efforts to improve power supply in their community. Orientation as regards the essence of citizen journalism is also required to improve the understanding of rural dwellers. Service providers should reduce the cost of their subscription and improve their network speed to 4G as obtainable in developed areas so as to encourage citizen journalism among rural dwellers.

Although these rural dwellers face some challenges, they still strive to practice citizen journalism. For example, when they are out of internet subscription, they make efforts to
reach other community members who have technological gadgets and share certain information with them, so they could post on their behalf. In respect to slow internet access, some of them wait to post information at night when the network is better. This could affect the immediacy of citizen journalism, nevertheless, this technique has been helpful to them. As regards inadequate knowledge among rural community dwellers who practice citizen journalism, it has been shown that those who do not have adequate knowledge on the usage of technological devices could meet other people to assist them operate their phone so they could post vital information. This suggests that a person must not be learned before he or she could partake in citizen journalism. Besides using social networking sites, rural citizen journalism could also be achieved through the use of SMS because it is cheaper to disseminate vital information among community members. The two predominant types of citizen journalism as demonstrated in this study are the opportunistic and planned types. Of the two, opportunistic or impromptu citizen journalism is more common in the North eastern part of Nigeria. These points to fresh ways of conceptualising citizen journalism.

Conclusively, it could be seen that although the acceptance of citizen journalism is still minimal in rural areas of Nigeria, its prospect is inevitable. This implies that citizen journalism provides an avenue for community dwellers to gather and disseminate messages to their fellow rural dwellers with immediacy, and this notion supports the democratic participant media theory which advocates that people should have free access to the means of communication as against the monopolies and rigid structure of traditional mass media (McQuail, 1987; Ojobor, 2002). Citizen journalism encourages grassroots mobilization. It also assists in exposing the excesses of government officials in rural communities, which in turn enhances their choice of political candidates. It promotes a healthy lifestyle in the community settings, most especially during outbreaks of viruses. Therefore, it is pertinent to encourage citizen journalism practice in rural areas, and further studies could explore more issues confronting rural dwellers as regards the adoption and practice of citizen journalism in developing countries.

REFERENCES


Maher, V. (2005). Citizen journalism is dead. New media lab, School of Journalism and Media Studies, Rhodes University, South Africa.


POLITENESS IN LIBYAN POSTGRADUATE STUDENTS’ E-MAIL REQUESTS TOWARDS LECTURERS

Ergaya Alsout1 and Mohsen Khedri2*

1Department of English Language & Translation Studies, Sebha University, Libya
2Faculty of Language Studies, Sohar University, Sohar, Oman
E-mail: rogyalibya@gmail.com1; mkhedri@su.edu.om2

ABSTRACT
This study aimed to explore the politeness phenomenon in Libyan postgraduate students’ e-mail requests to their lecturers based at four top-ranked Malaysian universities: University of Malaya, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, Universiti Putra Malaysia, and Universiti Utara Malaysia. The data consisted of 109 e-mail requests to faculty written by 20 Libyan postgraduate students who were studying in Malaysia. The data was analyzed by adopting Brown and Levinson (1987) politeness theory which is considered as a plausible analytical framework to identify politeness strategies. The research method and design used in this study was essentially qualitative approach. The findings of the current study revealed that the Libyan postgraduate students applied mostly negative politeness strategies more than the other politeness strategies. This study argues that these e-mails which featuring a high level of directness, displayed a fundamental inadequacy in the use of politeness strategies, thus creating potentially a higher chance of pragmatic failure.

Keywords: E-mails, lecturers, Libyan postgraduate students, politeness strategies, requests

INTRODUCTION
In this study, the construct investigated is the e-mail of request. Requesting speech acts are one of the students’ main communicative purposes for using e-mail as they go about their academic business, to obtain feedback, to make appointments, to ask for extensions of time for assignment submission, etc. A request can be defined as a direct speech act in which the speaker asks the hearer to perform an action or provide information that is for the limited interest of the speaker (Trosborg, 1995). According to Brown and Levinson (1987), a request is one of the most face-threatening forms of speech act, especially in a student-lecturer context. This is because students who are in a low-power position are forced to make impositions on lecturers who have the power of control (Brown & Gilman, 1960). An ill-formed request can threaten and impose more heavily on a lecturer’s face. If the speech is produced with inappropriate linguistic structures and modifications, it might cause pragmatic failure between students and lecturers. As a result, there is usually a need for requesters to mitigate their message. To mitigate successfully, students have to use different politeness strategies types (positive, negative, bald on-record, and off-record) to reach their communicative goal.

Politeness plays an important role in interactions between interlocutors from different cultural backgrounds. However, misunderstanding and deviation from social conventions in its use can be expected. In student-lecturer communication, politeness is an important issue, particularly in the context in which the current research is framed, because the interlocutors come from different cultures in situations where the English language is used as the lingua franca. For this reason, students need to be aware of politeness norms so that they can
compose appropriate e-mails. Students should know how to compose an appropriate e-mail in order to accomplish their goals and also to be aware of the impact of their e-mails upon their lecturers. To gain a better understanding of potential issues and the possibility of pragmatic failure in the student-lecturer exchanges, the current study set to identify Libyan students’ politeness strategies used in their e-mail requests to faculty. In addition, the participants of this study are students who can be expected to perform a high frequency of requests than other speech acts such as thanking, complaining, or apologizing. This frequency of use warrants a study of such discourse as it impinges on communication efficacy.

Lecturers have been known to complain about students, both native speakers (NS) and non-native speakers (NNS) of English, sending inconsiderate requests, using impolite style, inappropriate salutations, unsuitable level of formality, misspelt words, inaccurate grammar and insufficient explanations on the use of abbreviations (Biesenbach-Lucas, 2007). As such, students have to know the appropriate way to compose e-mail requests to their lecturers and be mindful of how they affect the lecturers’ impression of them (Bolkan & Holmgren, 2012; Danielewicz, 2013; Jessmer & Anderson, 2001). Foreign students need to adjust to their new social and cultural surroundings, and effective communication entails pragmatic awareness of appropriate speech practices, especially when interacting with lecturers, who are important gatekeepers of the students’ request for academic success. Thus, it is imperative for students to show deference and respect towards lecturers through appropriate linguistic behavior, because of their dependent status in an academic setting.

An extensive search of the literature reveals that some gaps still persist regarding the speech act of requesting. Firstly, studies on how NNS students express their requests using e-mails as a medium of communication from a pragmatic perspective are scarce. Secondly, despite a rich literature on politeness, research on student-lecturer communication is still in its infancy (Al-Shalawi, 2001; Najeeb et al., 2012; Chejnova, 2014; Eshghinejad & Moini, 2016). Finally, while there are some studies studied on e-mail and the politeness of NNS students in academic settings, it needs to be reiterated that there have been no studies on the politeness of English e-mail requests from Libyan postgraduate students. This suggests a research gap which obviously needs to be bridged and obtained results will have implications for other cultural groups.

Thus, the current study sought to fill in a gap in literature regarding the study of speech acts of politeness. The study adopted a predominantly pragmatic perspective drawing upon Brown and Levinson’s (1987) politeness theory as the underlying framework to identify politeness strategies used in e-mail requests of Libyan postgraduate students studying in Malaysian universities. To be specific, this study endeavored to answer the following main research question:

1. How do Libyan postgraduate students deploy politeness strategies in their e-mail requests to faculty?

LITERATURE REVIEW

Investigators understand that politeness strategies are used differently by people from different cultures (Al-Shalawi, 2001; Chejnova, 2014; Najeeb, et al., 2012). Linguistic realizations differ from culture to culture and are used differently in different societies (Sifianou, 1992). For example, cultures such as that of Arabs, whose politeness structured by two concepts: religious faith and social conventions (Samarah, 2015), operate using negative
and positive politeness strategies as a continuum rather than a dichotomous concept (Al-Shalawi, 2001; Najeeb et al., 2012). Similarly, Greek students preferred a range of negative and positive politeness strategies (Chejnova, 2014).

Al-Shalawi (2001) conducted a study attempted to explore the politeness strategies utilized to reduce the Saudi ESL students’ English disagreements within e-mails. The study also aimed to assess the usefulness of the framework by Brown and Levinson (1987). The data were natural e-mails collected for a period of three months. The findings revealed that strategies of positive and negative politeness were both used. The research proposed that these two strategies should be treated not as dichotomous concepts, but as a continuum between positive and negative strategies.

A study conducted by Bulut and Rababah (2007) investigated authentic e-mails written in English by Saudi females to their male professors. A total of 99 e-mails with different speech act performances were sent by 9 female Arab Saudi students to their NS speaker teachers. The results revealed that positive politeness was the preferred strategy, which was not suitable in the status-unequal context and could lead to pragmatic failure.

Another study by Najeeb et al. (2012) analyzed Arab postgraduate students’ politeness strategies in their e-mails while they were pursuing higher education in Malaysia. The study revealed that direct strategies were preferred. Eighteen e-mails were sent by six Arab student participants from three different universities. The results showed that Arab students used various politeness strategies, including both negative and positive strategies. In particular, they tended to be more direct in making requests.

In Chejnova’s (2014) study of e-mails written by Czech students, the researcher explored verbal politeness makers in the forms of address and the frequency of internal or external modifications. Choice of politeness behaviors, following Brown and Levinson (1987), was the primary concern. The data (e-mail messages sent to the author) were collected from students who were majoring in the Czech language or teaching at primary level schools. A total of 260 e-mails was analyzed. Regarding the dimension of directness level, the CCSARP framework was adapted from the works of Blum-Kulka and Olshtain (1984), Blum-Kulka et al. (1989), and Biesenbach-Lucas (2007). Blum-Kulka et al.’s (1989) categorization of internal and external mitigations was used to analyze the data. In addition, the researcher drew upon the work of Economidou-Kogetsidis (2011) and Schauer (2009). Similar to findings from previous studies, Chejnova found that lexical modifiers were used less frequently. Moreover, syntactic modification was employed as a negative strategy to minimize the imposition of the request.

A recent study on politeness SMS messages is Eshghinejad and Moini’s (2016) study. They studied the politeness strategies employed by female and male message senders to determine if any difference exists between these two groups of English as a Foreign Language (EFL) learners when transmitting SMS messages to their superiors, considering that the social distance and the asymmetric power relationship existed among interlocutors. A dataset of 300 L2 (i.e. English) and L1 (i.e. Persian) letters was gathered. From data analysis, the study showed that there was no significant difference between male and female groups in the use of positive and negative politeness.

These studies have revealed similarities in using negative and positive politeness strategies with the implication that culture-specific differences might present challenges for students faced with interacting in cross-cultural communications. Among the different politeness strategies, only on-record politeness (positive and negative strategies) was studied.
Thus, the present study extended the analysis to incorporate four strategies of politeness (negative, positive, bald on-record, and off-record) based on Brown and Levinson’s (1987) framework. Additionally, most of the studies were conducted in the context of NS and NNS speakers of English. However, this study investigated politeness strategies where both students and lecturers were NNS speakers of English.

METHODS

Subjects and E-mail Data
The participants in this study were 20 Libyan postgraduate students (9 males and 11 females), who were studying in the four internationally recognized universities in Malaysia, which are Universiti Malaya (UM), Universiti Kembangsaan Malaysia (UKM), Universiti Putra Malaysia (UPM), and Universiti Utara Malaysia (UUM); 5 students per university. The participants pursued various fields of studies other than linguistics and the reason for selecting these students was due to the fact that linguistic students ought to have pragmatic awareness regarding politeness. The participants were self-selected samples; that is, they volunteered to take part in this research.

The e-mail corpus consisted of 109 English e-mails addressed to lecturers during the years 2015 to 2016. Typo errors, grammatical mistakes, contracted forms, misspelling, and alike found in the e-mails were not changed and the focus of analysis was on original message contents.

Data Collection
The procedure used for collecting the data for analysis is similar to that used by Chen (2001). Libyan postgraduate students attending courses in the four selected Malaysian universities were requested to forward up to 10 of their e-mail requests that they had previously written and sent to their lecturers. In the early stages of the study, the researchers relied on a Facebook group called ‘Academic Affairs of the Libyan Students’ to communicate with the students. Then, students who were willing to participate contacted the researchers and signed a consent form assuring them that all identifying features and particulars would be kept strictly confidential. Prior to forwarding their e-mails, the students were instructed to send the researchers only English e-mails in which they requested their lectures either for an action, or information, or the like. Upon receiving e-mails, they were thoroughly checked to determine whether the content has at least one request head act and contains no confidential information. Head act is “the minimal unit which can realize a request” (Blum-Kulka et al., 1989, p. 275). Overall, a total of 160 e-mails contributed by 20 Libyan postgraduate students (4 to 12 emails per student) were shortlisted and out of which 109, who met the needs of the study, were finally considered for analysis. As for data coding, all selected e-mails were anonymized, and a generic code such as, S1 UKM e-mail 1, S2 UUM e-mail 6, was assigned to identify the writer and the university where it originated.

Analytical Framework
This study adopted Brown and Levinson’s (1987) politeness theory to analyze pragmatic choices and how deference and solidarity are expressed. The theory emphasizes the concepts of face, face-threatening act, and modifications. According to the theory, politeness strategies are performed on-record with redressive action (i.e. positive and negative politeness) and
without redressive action (i.e. bald on-record politeness). What follows presents a detailed description of each politeness strategy.

To go on-record without redressive action is a bald-on-record strategy that is used to perform a very direct speech act performance; it does not give much attention to social niceties and it is often realized through the use of imperatives. It is used often in emergencies or when there is a small threat to the hearer’s face (Brown & Levinson, 1987). It can also be used when the speaker has control over the hearer, for example in a message from lecturer to student not from student to lecturer.

Redressive action using either a positive or a negative strategy are the second and third types of politeness strategy that can be used, respectively. Positive politeness strategies are utilized between interlocutors to minimize distance, and this can be done by being friendly or by maintaining a good relationship. There are fifteen sub-strategies listed under this strategy, which are: “notice, attend to hearer (H) (his interests, wants, needs, goods), exaggerate (interest, approval, sympathy with H), intensify interest in H, use in-group identity markers, seek agreement, avoid disagreement, presuppose/raise/ assert common ground, joke, assert or presuppose S’s knowledge of and concern for H’s wants, offer, promise, be optimistic, include both S and H in the activity, give (or ask for) reasons, assume or assert reciprocity (goods, sympathy, understanding, cooperation) and give gifts to H” (Brown & Levinson, 1987, p. 102).

Negative politeness strategies are used to preserve the face of the hearers. This is the most elaborated and conventionalized form of strategy use (Brown & Levinson, 1987). Indirectness is mainly associated with negative politeness strategies. Brown and Levinson list ten sub-strategies of negative strategy: “be conventionally indirect, question, hedge, be pessimistic, minimize the imposition, give deference, apologize, impersonalize S and H, state the FTA as a general rule, nominalize, and go on-record as incurring a debt, or as not indebted H” (1987, p. 131).

The off-record strategy involves the indirect use of language to remove the speaker from the possibility that the hearer will feel imposed upon. Brown and Levinson (1987) express fifteen off-record politeness strategies: “give hints, give association clues, presuppose, understate, overstate, use tautologies, use contradictions, be ironic, use metaphor, use rhetorical questions, be ambiguous, be vague, overgeneralize, displace and be incomplete by use ellipsis.” (p. 214).

**E-mail Analysis Procedure**

This study took mixed methods approach to explore the politeness phenomenon in the context of e-mail requests. To analyze the data qualitatively, content analysis (Carley, 1993) was run on the data to identify politeness strategies appeared in the e-mail requests of the selected Libyan postgraduate students. For example, in light of the positive politeness strategy, any feature that signalled the reason for sending the e-mail (i.e. because, since, as) was considered as ‘giving reason’ sub-strategy. ‘Being optimistic’ is another positive politeness sub-strategy that was identified when, for instance, the verb ‘hope’ was used in the students’ e-mail messages with the aim of getting help from their lecturer. Another illustration, which relates to negative politeness strategy, is ‘if-clauses’, which acted as hedges to minimize the imposition of the act. As for the quantitative phase of the study, frequencies of occurrence of the identified strategies were counted and tabulated in an Excel sheet.
To identify the politeness strategies, the head act of requests performed by the students was considered. As mentioned earlier, head act is the nucleus of the speech act, usually the most explicit utterance in the email, based on which the addressee understands the meaning of a message. Each head act was analyzed on a directness level to find out the request strategies based on the CCSARP framework (Economou-Kogetsidis, 2011). The head act can be performed alone or with supportive elements called modifications to mitigate it. Modifications are various linguistic elements (i.e., syntactic, lexical and phrasal devices), which play a role to soften the head act or the context where the head act is embedded (Blum-Kulka & Olshtain, 1984). These head acts and modifications were then identified for the different politeness strategies. It should be noted that request strategies and modifications were beyond the scope of the present study and left for further studies.

In this study, to reduce the risk of randomness and demarcate the precision of the analytical approaches taken at an adequately high level of consensus, a consistent method was very central to data analysis. Therefore, analysis was improved through a channel of inter-coder agreement albeit the data was mainly analyzed by the researchers themselves. The emails were first coded sentence by sentence based on directness level and the politeness strategies and a sheet of analysis was appended to each one for systematic analysis. Two experts in the field were then recruited to act as coders: one was an applied linguist at Kafkas University, Turkey, and the other was a Ph.D. graduate, who had done her dissertation on politeness in academic lectures. They received a small sub-set of the data (20 emails; 10 per each) with a coding manual containing descriptions and instances. Once the corpus was analyzed quantitatively and qualitatively, the coders were contacted and together with the researchers went through the texts to identify any conflicting results. Despite minor inconsistencies, which were only in relation to the identification of politeness strategies and were even ironed out in discussion, the inter-coder agreement measured by Cohen’s kappa obtained value signalled a high reliability index of .87.

**FINDINGS**

**Politeness Strategies Used in the E-mail Requests**

The analysis and findings presented here was guided primarily by politeness strategy model of Brown and Levinson (1987) to give insights into the occurrence of the different types of strategy used in the e-mail requests. It is noteworthy that analysis of the 109 e-mails identified a total of 137 politeness strategies (Table 1).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occurrence per e-mail</th>
<th>Number of e-mails</th>
<th>Politeness strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the analysis of on-record politeness strategies (bald on-record without redressive action, and positive and negative on-record with redressive action) and off-record strategies, the data showed that 113 number of on-record politeness strategies performed the request in a direct and unambiguous way either with or without redressive action. This gives (82.48%) of occurrence in the data. However, only 24 requests were made least indirectly (off-record strategy). This represents (17.52%) of the occurrence in the data. The next sub-
sections report on the use analysis of sub-strategies for each of the four politeness strategies (Table 2).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Politeness strategies</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>On-record</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>82.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Off-record</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>17.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Negative Politeness Sub-strategies**
The total number of negative politeness appeared in the dataset was 70 cases. This strategy, representing the most prevalent politeness strategies, used to express requests made by the Libyan postgraduate students. Negative politeness was to be expected in e-mails from students to lecturers because these negative politeness sub-strategies were concerned with minimizing the particular force of the FTA. Table 3 below illustrates the negative politeness sub-strategies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-strategies</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Question and hedge</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Be conventionally indirect</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Go on-record as incurring a debt, or as not indebting the Hearer</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimize imposition</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total number of negative politeness strategy</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The analysis showed that 4 negative politeness sub-strategies were used repeatedly in the e-mails of the Libyan postgraduate students: that is, they were conventionally indirect, used questions and hedges, go on-record as incurring a debt, or as not indebting the Hearer, and minimizing the imposition (Brown & Levinson, 1987). What follows presents a detailed description of the negative politeness sub-strategies that appeared in e-mail requests in the present data.

*Question and hedge*
This sub-strategy was used to convey uncertainty as to whether the hearer was able to perform the action requested (Brown & Levinson, 1987, p. 136). In this sub-strategy, the students used mitigating expressions within the students-lecturers interactional constraints to lessen the impact of the request. The questions and hedges accounted for the highest use of on-record politeness strategies (46 occurrences), which represented questions (30 cases) and hedges (16 cases) of all requests identified in the data. Questions which asserted an assumption that the lecturer was unlikely to perform the act or to show uncertainty on the part of the student about the lecturer’s ability to perform the act, made up this category of negative politeness sub-strategies. Such questions appeared to be mitigated internally with modals like (have, can). The example below illustrates this sub-strategy:

Good evening Prof. (name)
It's (student’s name)
This is a new topic (project title)
Is it good enough to be a topic for proposal. If not, can I meet you tomorrow in your office? What time?
Thank you

(S17, UUM, e-mail 90)

The student, in the example provided above, used the model can to carry additional connotation regarding his request for appointment because it is the lecturer that can decide on his request and set the appointment time.

Hedges were used in the form of modals, if clauses, and performatives in phrases like if you don’t mind. Below is a text example:

Dear: Dr
My name is (student’s name), and I am a student in faculty of science, UM, in department of chemistry. I am interested to do my project in Environment area. I hope you don’t mind my getting in touch and would very much appreciate it if I could meet you in person, or if convenient talk on the phone. I understand you are a very busy person so I’d appreciate any time you could give me.
With many thanks

(S15, UM, e-mail 78)

In the above sample, the student hedged the illocutionary force using expressions like I hope you don’t mind and if I could meet you. By doing so, the student presupposed that she had the permission of the lecturer to do the act (i.e., to register her project with this lecturer). These two sub-strategies were the standard way to perform an on-record polite request (Brown & Levinson, 1987). Brown and Levinson (1987) argue that hedges and questions can enable “cooperation, informativeness, truthfulness, relevance and clarity which on many occasions need to be softened for reason of face” (p. 146).

Be conventionally indirect
The speaker is faced with an opposing tension between “the desire to give H an ‘out’ by being indirect, and the desire to go on-record” (Brown & Levinson, 1987, p. 132). This means that the student performed the request by using certain conventional linguistic expressions that are unambiguous even if they are not be based on the literal meaning of the expression (Ruzickova, 2007).

Being conventionally indirect is an expected sub-strategy in student-lecturer communication since it acknowledges the imposition of the request (Brown & Levinson, 1987). This sub-strategy registered 20 times of occurrence of on-record politeness strategies total number employed by the Libyan postgraduate students. Being conventionally indirect inquired on the lecturer’s possibility or ability to comply with the request by using the phrase could you, or I would. The following is an illustration of this sub-strategy.

Salam.
Dear Dr. (name)
We apologizes from you, because we did not come at an appointment time. My friend (Student’s name) came late, because the bus came late.
Could you please fix another appointment for us?
thank you
Yours faithfully,
(student’s name)

(S2, UUM, e-mail 9)

In the above examples, the student used indirect speech with a degree of politeness to express the conventional indirect strategy *could you* and politeness marker *please* to make a request for an appointment and for feedback. The use of this sub-strategy would presumably minimize the imposition and encourage cooperation between student and lecturer.

*Go on-record as incurring a debt or as not indebting H*

By employing this sub-strategy, the S can take care of any FTAs in a way that claims his indebtedness explicitly to the hearer (Brown & Levinson, 1987). The speaker could also disclaim any indebtedness as a way of going on-record. This sub-strategy appeared three times of the total number of on-record politeness strategies found. The example below illustrates this sub-strategy.

Dear
I am planning to submit the attached paper to Q1/Q2 journals.
I’d be very grateful for your comments and advice before I send it.
Thanks

(S10, UKM, e-mail 53)

The example provided above indicated that the students expressed their gratitude in anticipation of the request. The analysis showed that the expressions like *I’d appreciate* or *I’d be grateful* used by the Libyan postgraduate students to show their appreciation in the event that the lecturer did comply with the request.

*Minimize the imposition*

This is a way to defuse the strength of the FTA by indicating that the imposition of the request is not great in itself, so this might pay deference to the H, indirectly (Brown & Levinson, 1987). This negative politeness sub-strategy accounted for only one case of the total number of on-record politeness strategies used in the dataset. See the text example provided below.

Assalamualikum Dr
Thank you Dr for your reply. Actually i have not discussed chapter five with the other supervisors. Any time you are free i will come to discuss about it together, just let me know the suitable time for you.
Thank you

(S8, UM, e-mail 40)

Minimizing imposition can be realized using certain words like *just* to minimize the imposition, as illustrated in the example (S8, UM, e-mail 40), where the student did to
arrange an appointment. Positive sub-strategies minimize the negative impact on the hearer’s positive face (Brown & Levinson, 1987). The next section presents data on the occurrence of the positive politeness sub-strategies.

**Positive Politeness Sub-strategies**
The analysis revealed that the second most prevalent strategy used was positive politeness. It constituted 26 times of the total number of on-record politeness strategies. It was also found that only 4 of 15 positive sub-strategies were positive politeness strategies. Table 4 summarizes the results of these sub-strategies occurred in the analyzed e-mail requests.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-strategies</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Give (or ask for) reasons</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Be optimistic</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promise</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Include both Speaker and Hearer in the activity</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total number of Positive Politeness strategy</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Give (or ask for) reasons**
By employing this sub-strategy, Speaker and Hearer are cooperatively involved in the activity by giving reasons as to why the request is made (Brown & Levinson, 1987). Thus, giving a lecturer (in the present context) a reason to form a request was seen as a positive move. The findings showed that the giving (or asking for) reasons sub-strategy was the most often positive sub-strategy used by the Libyan postgraduate students. It was used 14 times of the total number of on-record politeness. The request was based on the notion that the lecturer would cooperate once he or she understood why the request was made. This sub-strategy is illustrated in the example below.

Hi Dr. (name),
How are you? I hope you are very fine.
Sorry if I bother you but I have a question and I want to know from you if you don’t mind. I decided to travel to my country on June and I want to book a ticket from now so **I wish to know the date of the final exam for (course code) because I want to travel after the date of the exam immediately.**
Thanks to you and I am so happy to be one of your students.

(S5, UPM, e-mail 26)

In the data, the students used *want* and *wish* to show the reason for issuing their requests. Further, words like *because* and the preposition *for* showed what help is needed from the lecturers. Brown and Levinson (1987) state that speakers can assume cooperation by giving reasons because this implies “you can help me” (p. 128). The lecturer would be implicated as he processed the reason.

**Be optimistic**
Being optimistic is a way to make “S to assume that H wants S’s wants for S (or for S and H) and will help to obtain them.” (Brown & Levinson, 1987, p. 126). By applying this strategy, a student assumed that the lecturer was likely to have the desire to satisfy the student’s wants. In other words, the lecturer’s wants and the student’s wants were assumed to be shared as
they had mutual interest. The prime function of this cooperative strategy was to maintain a friendly stance. This politeness sub-strategy was used 8 times of the total number of on-record politeness strategies. Examples are provided below:

Dear sir,
good day, I am (student’s name), I hope take with you my project next semester, if you can. I prefer meet you, but someone tell me, you are not here. so, could you tell me, When I can meet with you?
thank you
yours sincerely,
(students name)

(S18, UM, e-mail 95)

In the example (S18UM 95), the participant of this e-mail expressed their requests using the optimistic expression I hope. This expression worked by reducing the force of their request, which implied cooperation between students and lecturers and that the request can be taken for granted. Thus, the principal function of ‘be optimistic’ sub-strategy was to capitalize on the perceived advantage that would be experienced by the lecturer and in the event would fulfill the student’s request.

Promise
A promise can also be used to redress the potential threat of request as the speaker shows his good intention in satisfying the hearer’s positive face wants (Brown & Levinson, 1987, p. 125). This sub-strategy was utilized two times of the total number of on-record politeness sub-strategies. An example of this sub-strategy is presented below.

Alsalamualicom
I apologize. This form has given me Dr. (name).
I will come to you on Tuesday morning to the application form Cartridge
Thank you very much
(Students’ name)

(S13, UM, e-mail 69)

In the example (S13, UM, e-mail 69), the student tried to show good intention in satisfying the lecturer’s positive face want by intensifying what kind of form (the application form Cartridge) his lecturer needed to look at.

Include both speaker and hearer in the activity

This sub-strategy is utilized while a speaker means either you or me when using the we form. It calls upon the activation of cooperative assumptions so that an FTA will be redressed (Brown & Levinson, 1987). The occurrence of this sub-strategy use was used in only twice of the total number of positive politeness sub-strategies. The following example represents the use of this sub-strategy in the e-mail data.
Salam,
Dear Dr. (name),
Firstly, I told you about my case “maybe I'll give birth during the final exam”, and you said that is better if I'll do the exam earlier, so I asked Dr. (FN) to know what will happen, she said if Dr. (FN) agree no problem but I have to get letter from you.
Secondly, We need outline or template to complete project report, please upload it.
Thank you very much
Respectfully yours,
(S3, UUM, e-mail 15)

The above example illustrated clearly how the student had included the lecturer in the action with the inclusive we, which actually meant I in reference. This sub-strategy was evident when the request incorporated the student and the lecturer together.

Bald-on-record strategies, however, serve to meet any FTAs head on so that the student’s intentions are very clear. The following section discusses the occurrences of bald on-record politeness sub-strategies in the e-mail requests made by the Libyan postgraduate students.

**Bald On-record Politeness Sub-strategies**
The last on-record politeness strategy used by the Libyan postgraduate students was bald on-record politeness sub-strategies. This politeness strategy relied on the use of imperatives (Brown & Levinson, 1987). The strategy was used to alleviate the lecturer’s anxiety by preemptively inviting him or her to impinge on the student’s request. The imperative strategy was used 17 times out of the total on-record politeness strategies found in the e-mail requests.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-strategies</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Imperative</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This strategy seemed to threaten the lecturer’s dignity and, as such, it was not expected at all to appear in student-lecturer communication (Chejnova, 2014). It was considered to be inappropriate for use in an interaction in an academic context. Nonetheless, this strategy could be softened with the use of hedges or the politeness marker ‘please’. The presence of this strategy in the e-mails might indicate that the Libyan postgraduate students were not aware of the force of their impositions on the lecturers. The way how they used bald on-record slightly different in their e-mails is illustrated in the two examples below.

How are you?
**Give me your comments about power point.**
I think this is better
Thanks.
(S13, UM, e-mail 68)

Salam Dr.
Dr (name) ask me to send the abstract to you. **Please help me to submit to Symposium Organizing Committee.**
Attached file.
Thank you.

(S19, UKM, e-mail 103)

As can be seen in the above first example (S19, UKM, e-mail 103), imperative form was used baldly to explicitly express the request. This request was made without any redress. In the other example (S19, UKM, e-mail 103), the student used an imperative clause, help me, when asking for feedback. However, the student used the politeness marker please to reduce negative impact. Brown and Levinson (1987) believe that request with imperative can be mitigated by a ‘please’ marker. Although these imperative constructions appeared with the conventional politeness marker ‘please’, they can still be regarded as inappropriate constructions in student-lecturers’ interaction (Economidou-Kogetsidis, 2011; Hartford & Bardovi-Harlig, 1996).

The following section describes the occurrence of off-record politeness strategies in the Libyan postgraduate students’ e-mail requests to their lecturers.

**Off-record Politeness Sub-strategies**
Off-record politeness sub-strategies appeared to be the third most frequently used strategy. This strategy occurred only a total of 24 times of the total number of politeness strategies. Of the sub-strategies used, hints were used 10 times of the total number of off-record politeness sub-strategies, while giving clues of association was appeared 14 times of the total number of off politeness sub-strategies. The frequency of each sub-strategy of off-record politeness is reported in Table 6.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-strategies</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hint</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Give clues of association</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The non-conventional politeness strategy, which violated the norms of conversation because the maxim of manner was violated, was nevertheless able to imply a particular recommended course of action (Brown & Levinson, 1987). In this case, the student left himself out by allowing for plausible deniability, so that he was not held responsible for the negative interpretation of the act. In the present data, off-record politeness strategy was accomplished by two sub-strategies: giving hints and clues of association. Below are examples to illustrate these two sub-strategies.

Hi doctor
good evening
first thing first, for course notes I do not find it in the spectrum.
secondly, i cannot understand what we have to write about documentation in presentation project because every one of my group understand it by different way. for me i understand that documentation is talking about how we will save the document of our company
I am waiting your answer
In the example (S16, UM, e-mail 86), the hint sub-strategy illustrated, which consisted of an attempt to highlight the act in association with reasons for wanting to pursue the act. In this example, the student stated her request indirectly by commenting that she did not understand what was required to complete the project set by the lecturer. This implied that the lecturer should explain the requirement for the presentation project. As can be seen from example (S11, UM, e-mail 60) below, the purpose was to ask the lecturer indirectly for feedback about the student’s work. However, the student had merely mentioned that he/she had attached the copy (of the assignment). The student also used the phrase for your kind consideration as a hint to motivate a positive action from the lecturer.

Dear Dr. (name)
It's me (student’s name). (matric number)

Here I attached the copy for your kind consideration.
Best regards

(S11, UM, e-mail 60)

In brief, giving hints and clues of association were the two sub-strategies that occurred in the data under study.

DISCUSSION

The detailed analysis of authentic data produced interesting findings. The most frequently used on-record politeness strategy were negative politeness strategies. In order to safeguard the students’ own positive face and their lecturers’ negative face, the participants resorted to a variety of negative sub-strategies, which included “question and hedges, be conventionally indirect, go on-record as incurring a debt or as not indebting H, and minimize the imposition” (Brown & Levinson, 1987, p. 131). Social distance between interlocutors appeared to be emphasized by means of the negative politeness strategy and sub-strategies. However, the integration of hedges, conventionally indirect strategies and questions could increase the politeness of such requests (Brown & Levinson, 1987). The most prevalent negative politeness sub-strategies were the use of hedges and questions. A possible explanation for the presence of such a high frequency of hedges could be that hedges used for this purpose are very much a part of the writers’ schema for mitigating and reducing loss of face. This claim can be justified by Jensen’s (2009) argument that hedges are rhetorical devices of modification. The use of hedges also expressed politeness and respect towards lecturers because they weaken the illocutionary force of an utterance (Brown & Levinson, 1987).

By performing requests with negative politeness sub-strategies, the students hoped that their requests would be fulfilled without the lecturer feeling that they were obliged to do so. In the context of interaction between students and lecturers, students were expected to perform requests politely and possibly this led them to soften the tone of their e-mails.

The positive sub-strategies recorded were ‘be optimistic’, ‘include both S and H in the activity’, ‘give (or ask for) reasons’ and ‘promise’ (Brown & Levinson, 1987). Among the positive politeness sub-strategies; ‘give reasons’ strategy was the most used positive sub-
strategy. This high level of preference indicates that the Libyan postgraduate students believed that giving reasons had a logical appeal that would motivate the lecturer’s cooperation. As Economidou-Kogetsidis (2011) acknowledges, giving reasons was indeed a polite way to underlie a request. However, unless the reasons or explanations for the necessity of granting the requestee’s request was clear, the lecturer may not wish to comply. Giving clear reasons encourages cooperation between interlocutors and increases the likelihood of the lecturer acting in a positive fashion. It is worth noting that giving reasons entailed an explicit explanation especially when the conjunction ‘because’ was used. E-mails that were based on positive politeness strategies thus enhances solidarity between interlocutors.

Off-record sub-strategies can be used as a request for action, such as giving feedback and fixing an appointment. This is in line with Krish and Salman’s (2016) study which reported that Arab students use the indirect strategy specifically for feedback. The Libyan postgraduate students probably opted for the indirect strategy considering the level of imposition that would be actualized by a direct request, which could threaten the lecturer’s negative face. Krish and Salman (2016) revealed that female students used hints which might refer to their attention to avoid direct confrontation with the recipients (i.e., teachers in their study). A student may even select to or not to make the request speech act in order to prevent face loss. However, this opaque strategy might require more effort in interpretation on the lecturer’s part to understand the illocutionary force of the request act. Brown and Levinson (1987) stated that it is common among high social distance relationships; however, it is not a preferred strategy in some cultures like Malaysia, who do not use hints in their communication. This is supported by Khalib and Tayeh’s (2014) study when Malaysian students avoided using hints either with their lecturers or their peers.

CONCLUSION
This study aimed to investigate politeness strategies used in e-mail requests written by Libyan postgraduate students to lecturers in four selected Malaysian universities. In order to identify which politeness strategies were used in the students’ e-mail requests, Brown and Levinson’s (1987) framework was adopted to answer the research question. The findings revealed that negative politeness strategies were the most frequently used (identified 70 times) in the request head act of the present study. The second most commonly used strategy identified from the analysis was positive politeness, followed by the off-record, while the least occurrence in the data was the bald on-record politeness strategy.

The present work contributed to the growing body of politeness research in e-mail requests in academic settings, especially in the area of Arab pragmatic linguistics. It dealt with Libyan postgraduate students in Malaysia, who encountered a different culture, language and communication challenges, especially in terms of e-mail writing, during their studies at Malaysian universities.

This study has implications for the students, lecturers, decision makers, and educational syllabus designers to avoid pragmatic failure from occurring, and to facilitate effective communication across cultures. As Libyan students step into a new context to pursue their higher education, they might benefit from learning how to interact with people from different cultures and with higher power and status.

Research on pedagogical intervention has concentrated on the significance of instruction to students, essentially English NNS students, across different domains. In
conjunction with different studies (Economidou-Kogetsidis, 2011; Felix-Brasdefe’s 2011, 2015, Lazarescu, 2013), the current study places emphasis on the need for increasing awareness among language learners about the appropriate use of politeness strategies when they compose e-mail requests to their lecturers.

This study recommended a cross-cultural comparison between local Malaysian postgraduate students and the international postgraduate students could be carried out to determine how politeness strategies vary between the two groups. This contrastive work allows for more precise findings on cross-cultural and inter-language pragmatic features of these e-mails.

Ultimately, this study concentrated on the politeness strategies used within request events and excluded the opening and closing moves of the e-mails. However, further studies are needed to also consider politeness in the opening and closing, as well as forms of address used by Libyan students, for the purpose of achieving a complete picture of the politeness phenomenon.

REFERENCES
Bolkan, S., & Holmgren, J. L. (2012). “You are such a great teacher and I hate to bother you but…”: Instructors' perceptions of students and their use of e-mail messages with varying politeness strategies. Communication Education Journal, 61(3), 253-270.


RHETORICAL MOVE ANALYSIS IN POLITICAL SCIENCE RESEARCH ARTICLE ABSTRACTS IN ENGLISH IN IRANIAN JOURNALS

Sara Seyed Paydari¹ and Shamala Paramasivam²*

Department of English, Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication, Universiti Putra Malaysia

E-mail: Sara.paidary@yahoo.com¹; shamala@upm.edu.my²

ABSTRACT
Writing an abstract in English is a challenging task. This corpus-based study aims to identify the move structures of empirical Political Science research article abstracts written in English in Iranian journals and to examine if the writing complies with Hyland’s (2000) model as an accepted model for abstract writing. A corpus of 120 abstracts was randomly collected and analysed employing Hyland’s (2000) five-move model for abstract writing. Findings revealed that the moves of Political Science research article abstracts in Iranian journals differ from Hyland’s model. Political Science writers of Iranian journals used 3-move and 2-move patterns in their abstracts. These patterns show that the abstracts lack Move 1 (Introduction), Move 4 (Product) and Move 5 (Conclusion). These moves were low in frequency of use and were treated as optional. Only Move 2 (Purpose) and Move 3 (Method) were used with high frequency. The move analysis showed that Iranian journals lack a display of genre competence in abstract writing with regard to the rhetorical structure of an abstract mainly in the use of moves that explain the introduction, outcomes and conclusions of research (i.e. Moves 1, 4 and 5 respectively). Recommendations are made to investigate reasons for the difference in move patterns through comparative and contrastive research between native writers (both in English and Persian languages) and non-native writers (Iranians writing in English), so as to address languages and discipline specific conventions in abstract writing in political science.

Keywords: genre, move analysis, research article abstracts, political science, Iranian journals

INTRODUCTION
It is significant to be able to write scientific research articles in English because most journals are written in English as a medium for academic language all over the world. An important requirement in the process of publication of a research article is to submit an abstract. Among all academic genres, abstract is considered one of the key genre that conveys new knowledge and findings in academic discourse communities. It condenses the core idea of a research article and is essential for the article’s publication and citation. Swales (1990) points that abstracts are independent, as not everyone who reads the abstract will necessarily read the article itself. Bhatia (1993) also states that an abstract as a description or factual summary of the much longer report is meant to give the reader an exact and concise knowledge of the full article. It is, therefore, deemed as “an important area of investigation” (Chan & Seyed, 2012, p. 1147).

Postgraduate students are required to follow latest research in English as well as to have their own research published in English. Nunan (1999, p.271) believes that producing a coherent, fluent, extended piece of writing is probably the most difficult thing there is to do in language and he notes it is something even most native writers never master. Hyland
(2000) believes that learning to write academic genres involves students being familiar with the issues of form and structure and with public contexts for writing. In the academic world, the strategic use of rhetorical and linguistic features that fit to the standards of the specific discipline can increase chances for successful publication. This means that if students become familiar with the form and structure of a target genre they can produce texts with the form and structure required to take part in the genre.

Studies in the field of academic writing, particularly the research article abstract, has attracted the attention of Iranian researchers, both at the micro level of linguistic features and at the macro level of move analysis. For example Jalilifar (2007) investigated hedges in English academic research article abstracts. His study revealed that the primary types of hedges used in the abstracts were conventional hedges that are hedges by passive voice and hedges by putting the writer at a distance from the data. Khedri (2013), who studied metadiscourse markers in research article abstracts between two disciplines, Applied Linguistics and Economics, found that each disciplinary community within the broad domain of soft sciences have social agreement and contextual restriction in metadiscourse use.

Nasseri and Nematollahi (2014) compared the generic structure of abstracts of master thesis in Applied Linguistics written by native English and Iranian students using move-step analysis to find possible variations between the writing of these two groups. They focused on analysing lexi-co-grammatical patterns, use of personal pronouns, verb tenses, voice and hedges in abstracts. They found that the generic structure of the abstracts in the field of Applied Linguistics for both groups were very similar.

Ghasempour and Farnia (2017) performed a contrastive move analysis of Persian and English research article abstracts in the field of law to examine move structures and verb tenses used. The results showed that all moves were considered obligatory in English law abstracts while only move 1 (Introduction) and move 2 (Purpose) were obligatory in Persian abstracts. Contrasting findings were made in Chalak and Norouzi (2013) who compared the rhetorical moves in abstracts of Language Studies written by American and Iranian academic writers. They found that move 1 (Introduction) along with move 5 (Conclusion) were optional in Iranian abstracts while the moves for Purpose, Method, and Result were obligatory. However, Farzannia and Farnia (2017), who compared moves in research article abstracts in mining engineering journals between English and Persian native writers, found that all the five conventional moves were obligatory in Persian abstracts and were statistically different from the English group with regard to the Purpose move. In Noorizadeh-Honami and Chalak (2018), who did a comparative analysis of architecture research article abstracts written by native and non-native writers of English and Persian authors, found that both groups used the IMRD (Introduction, Method, Results and Discussion moves) and IMR (Introduction, Method, Results) patterns with high frequency.

Although much research has been conducted on the abstract genre among Iranian writers, there is still abundant room to investigate this genre in the Iranian context. In most of the previous studies regarding research article abstract in Iran (for instance Jalilifar, 2007; Khedri, 2013; Chalak and Norouzi, 2013; Nasseri &Nematollahi, 2014; Ghasempour and Farnia, 2017, Farzannia and Farnia, 2017; Noorizadeh-Honami and Chalak, 2018) there are contrasting findings across different disciplines such as language studies, applied linguistics, law, engineering, and architecture. Furthermore, most of these previous studies have investigated native writing (English and Iranian writers writing in their native languages) and have not examined Iranians as non-native writers writing in English as a foreign language.
The literature review also shows that analysis of research article abstracts in political science has not been studied although the field is not new in Iranian academia. The present study is conducted to address these gaps. The study conducts a move analysis of abstracts written in English to highlight Iranian academics conventional rhetorical styles of writing in the political science discipline. This study contributes to the knowledge of appropriate use of conventional pattern and forms in academic writing amongst Iranians.

This paper aims to answer the following questions:

1. What are the rhetorical moves found in Political Science research article abstracts (PSRAA) written in English in Iranian journals?
2. How are these moves patterned in the abstracts?

**RELATED LITERATURE**

The present study employs genre analysis as the approach to discourse analysis as this approach allows for identifying moves and reporting the patterning of moves in text. Genre analysis has its roots in Swales’s (1981, 1990) work on the discourse structure and linguistic features of academic research articles. The description of move in genre analysis was first proposed by Swales (2004, p. 228-9). He defined move as a “discoursal or rhetorical unit that performs a coherent communicative function in a written or spoken discourse”. Moves can be recognized in many ways, each of which is called a “strategy” (Henry, 2007, p. 3) or a “tactic” (Henry, 2007, p.7). Bhatia (1993) defines strategies as the tactical choices made by the writer to achieve his or her purpose.

Swales’ influential works and his CARS model is widely employed among scholars who studied rhetorical moves in research article introductions (Fakhri, 2004; Samraj, 2005; Ozturk, 2007 and Hirano, 2009). Swales’ CARS model was used to analyse abstracts of research articles and the model was found not suitable since the aim of an Introduction in research articles is different from the abstract. The abstract is a summary of the main points of the whole research article. Thus, to analyse the abstract, different frameworks were established.

Bhatia (1993) proposed a four–move structure; (1) introducing purpose (2) describing methodology, (3) summarizing results, (4) presenting conclusion. This I-M-R-C structure of the research article has been used by some researchers such as Salager-Meyer (1990, 1992) and Ventola (1997). Santos’ (1996) five-move model is another framework for abstract analysis; move 1 entails situating the research, move 2 involves presenting the research, move 3 describing the methodology, move 4 summarising the results, and move 5 discussing the results. In an important study of disciplinary differences in abstracts, Hyland (2000) studied 800 abstracts from 8 disciplines. From his study, it became clear that the rhetorical structure of abstracts varies considerably according to discipline. Hyland’s framework in abstract move analysis is presented in Table 1. It has 5 moves with move 1 on introduction about the research, move 2 on research purpose, move 3 on methodology, move 4 on results of the research, and move 5 on conclusion.
Table 1: Hyland’s (2000) Model of Abstract Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Introduction</th>
<th>Establishes context of the paper and motivates the research</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Purpose</td>
<td>Indicates purpose, outlines the aim of the research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methods</td>
<td>Provides information on design, procedures, assumptions, approach, data, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product</td>
<td>States main findings or results, the argument, or what was accomplished.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>Interprets or extends results beyond the scope of the paper, draws inferences, points to applications, or wider applications.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Since Hyland’s (2000) model was successfully applied across 8 disciplines, the model can be said to have wide applicability and validity across disciplines. It was thus deemed suitable to be used to analyse the abstracts in the present study.

**METHODOLOGY**

The corpus-based design was used to analyze the pattern of the moves in PSRAA. The corpus-based approach allows “analyzing the actual patterns of use in natural texts, and relies on quantitative as well as qualitative analytical techniques” (Biber et al., 1998, p. 4).

A sample of 120 empirical Political Science research article abstracts from three Iranian journals were randomly collected using simple random sampling. Forty research article abstracts were randomly selected to represent each journal. The choice of the journals was based on 3 criteria. Firstly, the language of use had to be English. Secondly, the study focused on Political Science journals published in Iran and thirdly, the journals had to be free access for ease of accessibility. The chosen journals are in Table 2. Articles published in the span of 5 years at the time of the research (2016) were selected. This involved articles published from 2010-2015.

Table 2: Iranian Journals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Number of Abstracts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Political Sciences Research Review</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iranian Review of Foreign Affairs</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discourse</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Justification of the sample size was based on Krejcie and Morgan (1970). According to them, a population which is equal to or greater than 180, the required sample size is 118. Thus 120 PSRAA in the corpus of this study was considered large enough to enable the purpose of the study to be achieved with a reasonable degree of reliability. All 120 research article abstracts were downloaded in original PDF format. This format, however, does not allow additional annotation. For this reason, the research article abstract format was changed from PDF to XML. Additional parts of the abstracts such as article title, writer’s name and keywords were removed. The length of each abstract was between 150-250 words.
The unit of analysis was moves; they were identified based on Hyland’s (2000) analytical model. Top-down and bottom-up approaches were used to identify a move. Biber et al. (2007) state that in the top-down approach, the researcher recognizes a move based on its rhetorical function. Therefore the communicative purpose of each move was established based on the analytical framework used.

To support the top-down approach, the bottom-up approach was employed. This approach requires the researcher to identify a move based on specific linguistic features (Biber et al., 2007). For this purpose, Hancioglu’s (2009) academic abstract corpus bank was used to identify a move. This corpus offers alternative lexico-grammatical patterns for fulfilling the required rhetorical moves in abstract. For example, for Move 2 (Purpose), reporting verbs that reflect the communicative purpose of this move like look into, proposes, investigates, analyses etc were identified, in order to confirm the move established from the top-down analysis. In other words, the top-down and bottom-up approaches were used collaboratively to conduct the move analysis. After identification of the moves, each move was coded. For example, S1M1 signals Sentence 1 Move 1. Table 3 shows a sample of an abstract with 5 moves illustrating the coding for each move and the reporting verbs that help identify the moves in a bottom-up analysis.

In this study, obligatory and optional moves were determined using Pho’s (2009) proposition that an obligatory or prototypical move occurs when the frequency of the move is more than 80%. An optional move is when a move is found in less than 80% of the data. For frequency calculation, whenever a move repeated more than one time it is counted as one time only since it does not show additional function. Microsoft Excel frequency calculation was used to quantify distribution of each move in the corpus.

Table 3: Sample of Abstract with five moves

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S1 M1 Introduction</th>
<th>The election of Mahmood Ahmadinejad in Iran in June 2005 came to have an enormous impact on Iran’s foreign relations including Iran’s relations with the Arab states of the Persian Gulf.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>S2 S3 M2 Purpose</td>
<td><strong>The present article looks into</strong> the state and dynamism of bilateral relations between Iran and the GCC during the 2005-09 period. Placed in the context of the background of relations between the two sides since the 1979 Islamic Revolution in Iran and specifically the 8 years of confidence-building and détente under Khatami, <strong>the article discusses</strong> the factors that affected these bilateral relations during the period under review.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S4 M3 Methodology</td>
<td><strong>The research method involved</strong> certain assumptions. It was assumed that such factors as Ahmadinejad’s peculiar foreign policy outlook and discourse relations with the U.S., diverging postures towards Israel’s threat perceptions, Iran’s rising regional stature and influence in the post-2001 period and also dispute on the three Iranian islands in the Persian Gulf and the name of the waterway have each affected the state of relations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S5 M4 Product</td>
<td><strong>The review shows</strong> the resilience of economic and trade ties between the two sides beyond the mere political realm and the outstanding issues and disagreements.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Considering the inevitable negative impact of the continuing tension and conflict between Iran and the U.S. on the state of relations between Iran and the GCC, the paper emphasizes the imperative of confidence-building measures and policies by all the parties concerned – within the region and beyond.

It concludes that any meaningful improvement – and ultimate rapprochement – in the U.S.- Iran relations even though far-fetched or illusive at the time would help these relations and the mutually-beneficial establishment of regional security arrangements in the Persian Gulf.

RESULTS

Figure 1 represents the percentage of each rhetorical move in Political Science research article abstracts. As it is seen, Move 2 (Purpose) shows the highest percentage of moves which is 100%. Following that, Move 3 (Method) shows 85% and Move 1 (Introduction) 73%. In contrast to Moves 2, 3 and 1, Move 5 (Conclusion) contains the lowest percentage, which is 7%. Move 4 (Product) demonstrates 52%.

Based on Hyland’s (2000) analytical model of move analysis the first move in abstract writing is Introduction where the author generates background of the study and motivates the research. This move also shows the scope of the research and tells the reader what the area of focus is and the perceptions that are going to be considered. This move was identified in 73% of abstracts in the data. Examples 1-3 display Move 1.

Example 1 Arms control and the designing of global and regional security regimes is important issues in the field of strategic studies. (A.1)
Example 2 *Wall Street Movement* represents the people's protest about the function of capitalist system, and can be considered as one of the most important events and changes of American society in 2011. It is important because unlike other movements, it is not limited to a certain area and could gradually travel to other parts of the world. (B. 35)

Example 3 *Iran's revolution* was a prelude to the rise of a modern system in the world's contemporary political history. This newly-emerged system was born without a prefabricated copy and model. (B. 31)

The second move is the most vital move where the writer indicates the main purpose of the study and summarises the objective behind the paper. This move is undoubtedly the most significant one in an abstract since all other moves in the abstract are dependent on the main aim of the study. In this study, the writers may indicate their main purpose(s), or describe what they regard as the main aspects of their research (Swales, 1990, p. 159). This move is realized by using specific academic research words for example, *the aim of this paper* and *the purpose of this article*. The findings showed 100% distribution of this move in the data. Examples 4-6 illustrate Move 2.

Example 4 *The present paper aims to study the Iranshari ('Iranian') politics in Sassani era.* (C.1)

Example 5 *The goal of this paper is to study the impact of underdevelopment and inefficiency of political parties in assisting to the formation of political underdevelopment in Pahlavi era.* (C.7)

Example 6 *The paper aims to critically consider the proposition maintaining that the contemporary state of affairs between Iran and the Arab world results from an endemic, deep-rooted enmity between these two peoples with roots in the annals of history.* (A. 26)

Methodology is the third move in the abstract which covers information about the approach, methods used, the rationale, the research context, the participants or subjects of the study, and the data collection and analysis tools. The main purpose of this move is to inform the reader about how the research was done, and why it was done that way. The findings displayed 85% realization of Move 3. See Examples 7-9.

Example 7 *A historical review of the evolution of transitional trends in Iran and India's foreign policy approach especially during the Post-Cold War era with an emphasis on the role of different internal regional and international elements in shaping these approaches would bring new light on the study of relations between these two countries.* (A.28)

Example 8 *The authors of the present paper with applying the comparison method analysis of the geopolitical themes of Iran and Russia, has tried to find the contrasting model and the format of the confronting codes and genomes of Iran and Russia.* (B.5)
Example 9 The theoretical framework of this research is based on constructivist theory it holds that becoming a regional superpower is dependent on a developmentalist foreign policy. (A.36)

In the Product move, which is the fourth move in an abstract, the writer reports about the data examined, highlights and summarizes the noteworthy findings. The result shows 52% distribution of this important move through the data. Examples 10-11 illustrate Move 4.

Example 10 The Results of this paper shows that Vietnam obtained the ground for economic reformations which named Doi Moi by political changes. (B.10)

Example 11 Research results indicate that the axis as the only serious opposition to America’s presence in the region to adopt policies and measures such as anti-Israel, oppose to Arabic conservative and the rotten governance, oppose America’s presence in the region, reliance on oil means to pressure the West, supporting the Palestinian cause, forgotten roles of self-determination for peoples, Shia minorities in democracies alternative power and a revival of faith-based thinking and the growth of Islamist movements in the spread of Islamic Awakening in the area of public opinion have effected in increasing costs for America and reduced its interests in the region. (B. 6)

The last move in abstract writing is Conclusion which explains findings beyond the scope of the paper, shows implications, and points to applications. The data analysis in this study shows that this rhetorical move is often absent in the political science research article abstracts with only 7% of the abstracts displaying the move. The examples below show the Conclusion move. See Examples 12-13.

Example 12 Thus, in light of these arguments the research concludes that the main obstacles to the formation and sustainability of arms control regimes consist of: structural disequilibrium, imbalance of power interventions of intrusive powers, global cycles of power and its linkage to this region, as well as strategic instability caused by these variables. (B.4)

Example 13 The paper concludes that the uneasiness in Iran-Arab relations during the past five to six decades has been situational and a modern phenomenon chiefly stemming from specific political circumstances with certain roots in nation-building activities in the concerned countries. Hence, historical and ethno-religious or civilizational roots of this strained relationship are either non-existent or insignificant. (A.26)

Obligatory and Optional Moves
Based on the Hyland’s (2000) analytical framework a well formed abstract must present all five moves. However Pho (2009) believe that some moves are obligatory while others are optional. They note that 80% occurrence of a move determines the move as an obligatory move. Moves which occur below 80% are optional.

Figure 2 shows obligatory and optional moves in the data of the study. Move 2 (Purpose) with 100% and Move 3 (Method) with 85% occurrence seem to be viewed as an obligatory move in Iranian journals since they are frequently used by the writers. Move 1
(Introduction) with 73%, Move 4 (Product) with 52% and Move 5 (Conclusion) with 7% seem to be considered as optional moves in Political Science research article abstracts.

![Obligatory and Optional Moves](image)

**Obligatory and Optional Moves**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Move</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Move 2</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Move 3</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Move 1</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Move 4</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Move 5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Move Patterns in PSRAA**

Figure 3 displays the move patterns in the data of the study. As it can be seen 60% of abstracts contain 3 moves, 18% of abstracts show 4 moves and 15% have 2 moves. Only 7% of the abstracts contain 5 moves. In sum, more than 50% of abstracts have only three moves and a large majority, i.e. 93%, do not have the 5 moves needed for an abstract.

![Move Patterns of PSRAA](image)

**Move Patterns of PSRAA**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total number of the RAA</th>
<th>2 Moves</th>
<th>3 Moves</th>
<th>4 Moves</th>
<th>5 Moves</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Series2</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
We can see that the Iranian journals in Political Science mostly have three moves in abstract writing. This can be better understood by a closer look into the data as shown in Figure 4.

It can be observed from Figure 4 that 33% of abstracts include the 3-move pattern, Move 1+Move 2+Move 3 (Introduction+Purpose+Method), and 27% of the abstracts represent the 3-move pattern, Move 2+Move 3+Move 4 (Purpose+Method+Product). Examples 14-18 illustrate the two types of 3-move pattern.

Example 14 Abstract with 3-move Pattern (M1+M2+M3)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S1M1</th>
<th>Introduction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Relations between Iran and India two ancient civilizations go far back in history. However, the contemporary politico-economic relations between these two major Asian powers, especially after the Islamic revolution in Iran in 1979, are affected by various different domestic, regional and international elements.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S2M2</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The main objective of this research is to analyse the dominant foreign policy trends in Iran-India relations during the last three decades.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S3M3</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A historical review of the evolution of transitional trends in Iran and India's foreign policy approaches, especially during the Post-Cold War era -with an emphasis on the role of different internal regional and international elements in shaping these approaches would bring new light on the study of relations between these two countries.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

S=Sentence/M=Move
Example 15 Abstract with 3-move Pattern (M1+M2+M3)

| S1M1 | The present discourse is a preparation and introduction to explain Ikhwān al-Safā’ś ethical and political teachings and beliefs with the view to providing accurate understanding of relation between ethics and politics in their thoughts which is inspired by Islamic and mystical education |
| S2M3 | In this research the analysis of such teachings is methodologically normative. |
| S3S4M2 | In this concise paper, attempt has been made to briefly introduce this personable and enigmatic group. Besides, it was tried to address the question of “what explainable relation there is between Ikhwān’s ethical and religious teachings with politics and governing in human community”. |

Example 16 Abstract with 3-move Pattern (M1+M2+M3)

| S1 S2 S3 M1 | After the occurrence of the Islamic Revolution in 1979, the long-term vital interests of America faced with a serious challenge in the Middle East. At the same time, the Iranophobia project was on the agenda of western countries and America in military, political, economic and especially advertising and media aspects that which ultimately led to the phobia of the Islamic Republic of Iran among the neighbouring countries of the Persian Gulf border. One of the most important and influential effects of this phobia was establishing the Persian Gulf cooperation council that consisted of the six countries of Saudi Arabia, Kuwait, Bahrain, Qatar, the United Arabic Emirates, and Oman. |
| S4 M2 | The main research question is: what is the relationship between the development of arms purchases of the Persian Gulf cooperation council members and the Iranophobia project? |
| S5 S6 M3 | The hypothesis of this paper is that the induction of Iranophobia is due to obtaining greater economic benefits for Western countries and America through arms purchases to the Persian Gulf countries. The present article attempts to use the descriptive - analytical method and the neorealist approach as the conceptual framework to evaluate the effect of Iranophobia on the ascending trend of arms purchases among the Persian Gulf cooperation council members. |

Example 17 Abstract with 3-move Pattern (M2+M3+M4)

| S1M2 | This survey examines the content and purpose of the political science discipline in respect to seven prominent universities in Iran and its significance for the Iranian society. |
It is based on quantitative and qualitative data including personal interviews and survey results, as well as theses conducted by political science students, academic articles written by scholars in the field, and university curricula.

The survey suggests that Iranian political science after the 1979 revolution addresses contemporary political problems and challenges related to Iran only to a limited extent, and is predominantly theoretical and “borrowed” in nature, despite the goal during the Cultural Revolution to indigenize and Islamicize the social sciences.

Example 18 Abstract with 3-move Pattern (M2+M3+M4)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S1M2 Purpose</th>
<th>The paper aims to critically consider the proposition maintaining that the contemporary state of affairs between Iran and the Arab world results from an endemic -deep-rooted enmity between these two peoples with roots in the annals of history.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>S2S3M3 Method</td>
<td>To elucidate its argument -the paper offers a brief review of the major ups and downs in the historical relationship between Iranians and Arabs to see whether animosity or good-neighborliness has mainly prevailed. Then -seeking to pinpoint the causes of uneasiness in the Iranian-Arab relationship since the 1950s -the focus of the paper turns to the formation of pan-Arab ideology and its strong anti-Iranian elements.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S4S5S6M4 Product</td>
<td>The review showed that major differences in outlooks -coupled with territorial and diplomatic disagreements -had Nasserite Egypt and especially Ba’athist Iraq embrace these elements and begin implementing them to their full and extreme extent at a time when a monarchical West-leaning regime was in power in Iran. Uneasiness in Iran-Arab relations during the past five to six decades has been situational and a modern phenomenon -chiefly stemming from specific political circumstances with certain roots in nation-building activities in the concerned countries. Hence -historical and ethno-religious or civilizational roots of this strained relationship are either non-existent or insignificant.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Example 19 and 20 display the 2-move structure of M1+M2 (Introduction + Purpose).15% of abstracts had this structure.

Example 19 Abstract with 2-move Pattern (M1+M2)

| S1M1 Introduction | Since the Islamic Revolution in Iran -the state of interaction between Tehran and Washington has seen considerable ups and downs. Conflict between the Islamic of Iran's national interests and those of the United States gave rise to the dominance of strategic confrontation between the two states -though some cooperative actions have been witnessed between the two sides. |
Rhetorical Move Analysis in Political Science Research Article Abstracts in English in Iranian Journals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S2M1 Introduction</th>
<th>The last example refers to some collaboration between Iran and the United States concerning the question of Republic Afghanistan.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>S3M2 Purpose</td>
<td>In this article, we seek to analyze the trend governing the two actors’ behavior in the region between 2001 and 2009, using a historical approach and considering the Taliban's agency.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$=$sentence/$M=$ move

**DISCUSSION**

Results of the present study reveal that there are obvious differences in the structure of Political Science research article abstracts in Iranian journals. The most frequently used moves based on the findings are Move 2 (Purpose) and Move 3 (Method) and this indicates that the main issues addressed in abstracts by Iranian Political Science writers are stating the aim of the study (Purpose move) and the methods for investigating the study (Method move).

Taking into consideration that the main purpose of abstracts is to summarize the knowledge of the whole research article, the use of the 3-move structure shows that Political Science writers of Iranian journals do not summarize their research according to academic conventions. The first combination of moves (M1+M2+M3) indicates that the writers do not summarize the results of their research (M4) and do not close their study with a conclusion (M5). The second combination of moves (M2+M3+M4) shows that they do not make a research space (M1) and do not draw a conclusion (M5). In addition to the 3-move structure, writers of the Iranian journals were also found to use the 2-move structure of M1+M2. This also shows that they do not note the Method (M3), the results of the research (M4) and the conclusion (M5) in abstract writing. The complete conventional norm of 5-move structure in abstract writing was used minimally (7% of the time).

The findings of the present study show similarities as well as differences with findings in the literature about academic writing styles of Iranian writers. For instance, the findings of the present study are similar to Chalak and Norouzi (2013) who found that Iranian writers of English Studies use move 2 (Purpose) and move 3 (Method) as obligatory moves when writing abstracts. However, unlike the present study, while Chalak and Norouzi (2013) found that Iranian writers use move 4 (Results) as an obligatory move, the present study showed that move 4 was optional. Chalak and Norouzi (2013) also found that move 1 and move 5 were used by Iranian writers as optional moves supporting the findings of the present study. The findings of the present study also support Ghasempour and Farnia (2017) who found that move 4 and move 5 were optional moves of native Iranian writers in Law. However, Ghasempour and Farnia (2017) reported move 3 as an optional move while the present study found it to be used as an obligatory move. They reported move 1 and move 2 as obligatory moves while the present study found move 1 as optional and move 2 as obligatory. The findings of the present study differ from Farzannia and Farnia (2017) and Noorizadeh-Honami and Chalak (2018) who found that native Iranian writers of Mining Engineering and Agriculture respectively used all 5 moves as obligatory moves in their abstracts.

The move patterns of Iranian writers of English in Political Science research abstracts cannot be conclusively determined from the present study. The difference in the move patterns of this particular group of writers from Hyland’s (2000) model as an accepted model for abstract writing could stem as a result of languages or discipline specific conventions. Different languages and different disciplines are known to have different linguistic and writing conventions (Sanz & Bondi, 2014). Comparative and contrastive research is needed.
to examine how Political Science research article abstracts are written in native speaker journals, both in English and in Persian languages, in order to find out if native speaker groups and non-native speaker groups share common features so as to ascertain if languages and discipline specific conventions could be potential reasons to explain the move patterns found in the data of the present study.

CONCLUSION

According to international conventions in academia, an abstract should include a five-move pattern. However, the moves of Political Science research article abstracts written in English in Iranian journals did not display this convention. As a result, the abstracts can be said to be less rhetorically structured in terms of international norms. Majority of the abstracts had 3-move and 2-move patterns. These patterns show high use of Move 2 (Purpose) and Move 3 (Method); these moves were considered as obligatory by Iranian political science writers. Move 1 (Introduction), Move 4 (Product) and Move 5 (Conclusion) had low frequency of use in the abstracts and were employed as optional moves by the writers. The Political Science journals published in English in Iran show a difference in move patterns from Hyland’s (2000) model for rhetorical structure of an abstract. The Iranian journals lack a display of genre competence in abstract writing with regard to the rhetorical structure of an abstract mainly in the use of moves that explain the introduction, outcomes and conclusions of research (i.e. Moves 1, 4 and 5 respectively). Further research is needed to investigate reasons for the difference from international conventions through comparative research that examines languages and discipline specific conventions in political science abstract writing between native writers of English and Persian, and non-native writers, i.e. Iranians writing in English, so that features between the three groups (native writers of English, native writers of Persian, and Iranian writers of English) may be captured to better understand the academic writing practices and rhetorical organisation structures used by Iranian political science writers when they write their research article abstracts in English.

REFERENCES


THE EFFECTS OF CHINESE ON ENGLISH ARTICLE USE BY CANTONESE ESL LEARNERS

Alice Yin Wa Chan  
Department of English  
City University of Hong Kong  
E-mail: enalice@cityu.edu.hk

ABSTRACT
This paper discusses the effects of Chinese on the use of English articles by Hong Kong Cantonese ESL learners. A total of 63 Cantonese ESL learners participated in two language tasks about the use of English articles, including a cloze passage task and a noun countability task. In the cloze passage task, participants completed two cloze passages by providing a suitable article for each of 50 blanks and explained, immediately after the completion of each passage, the reason for each article choice. In the noun countability task, participants used a bilingualized dictionary to determine the countability and associated article use of seven nouns in different contexts and explained, in an introspective questionnaire, how their judgements were made. Results of the tasks showed that despite the absence of structural equivalents of English articles in Chinese, Cantonese ESL learners occasionally resorted to their mother tongue in their article selection processes. A translation and comparison strategy was often employed to validate an article choice by comparing a given English sentence with its seemingly equivalent Chinese version. In teaching the use of English articles, ESL teachers are suggested to alert learners to the differences and similarities between English and their mother tongue and to help learners tackle possible adverse L1 influence.

Keywords: English article system, Cantonese ESL learners, language acquisition, L1 influence, article selection

INTRODUCTION
Negative L1 transfer has well been documented in the literature as one source of learner errors. Many errors have been argued to be the result of negative L1 transfer, such as the topic-comment structure (Kwan, Chan & Li, 2003) and “the independent clause as subject” structure (Chan, Kwan & Li, 2003) commonly used by Chinese ESL learners. There are, however, target language items where no structural parallels exist in the native language. For these areas of L2 learning difficulties, arguments about the effects of L1 are diverse. While it has been argued that the difficulties can be seen as the results of an absence of a comparable system in the native language (Chan, 2010), L1 effects for such language items cannot be easily attested.

The English article system is an area which has been seen as controversial. There are languages which have structural equivalents of English articles, such as French, but there are also article-less languages, such as Chinese, Korean and Thai. Although empirical evidence for L1 transfer has been observed for article-less languages, and the poor acquisition of English articles by Chinese ESL learners has been argued to be related to the first language, especially at the early stages of language learning (Master, 1997), the effects of L1 on article acquisition by speakers of article-less languages are often countered (e.g. Serratrice, Sorace,
acquisition by speakers of article-less languages are often countered (e.g. Serratrice, Sorace, Filiaci & Baldo, 2009).

For example, Mede and Gurel (2010), who studied the acquisition of English articles by a bilingual child and two monolingual English speaking children, noticed cross-linguistic transfer for the bilingual child whose native language, Serbo-Croatian, did not have articles. These ascertained the effects of article-less L1 on the acquisition of English articles. On the other hand, Zdorenko and Paradis (2008, 2012) found counter-evidence for L1 influence, that the overuse of the for a in indefinite specific contexts was observed in children whose native languages had articles as well as in those whose native languages did not have articles. This disconfirmed the influence of the L1. Ionin et al., (2004) also found that ESL learners whose native language lacked articles (e.g. Korean, Russian) showed fluctuations between the definiteness and specificity settings in the article choice parameter, yet access to the specificity feature cannot be explained by L1 transfer or L2 input. Although different theoretical perspectives have been adopted in these previous studies, (e.g., Ionin et al., 2004) adopted an article semantics perspective and used a strategy based explanation to account for the findings, whereas Master (1997) focused more on actual usage), it can be seen that the effects of L1 on L2 learners’ use of English articles have been under debate in the literature irrespective of the theoretical orientations.

Not only have there been conflicting findings about the influence of article-less L1 on L2 article acquisition, but there also exists a gap in the nature of the investigations: previous research into the effects of L1 transfer on the acquisition of English articles focused mostly on learner performance with particular reference to learner errors or difficulties (e.g. Ionin & Montrul, 2010; Liu, Dai & Li, 2013; Serratrice, Sorace, Filiaci & Baldo, 2009; Zdorenko & Paradis, 2008, 2012). Learners’ knowledge of the English article system, as well as their thinking processes, has not been the focus of extensive investigation. Although it is true that learners’ performance may be indicative of the extent of L1 influence, our understanding of L1 effects can be enhanced if we probe into learners’ knowledge of the English article system and the reasons underlying their selection of a certain article. The focus of the present paper is on learners’ thinking processes during article selection.

GOAL AND METHODOLOGY
The present paper aims to uncover how L1 influence works in Hong Kong Cantonese ESL learners’ acquisition of English articles by putting together relevant results and insights obtained from two sub-studies (tasks) of a larger study, including a cloze passage task (Chan, 2017a) and a noun countability judgment task (Chan, 2017b). These two tasks were not specifically designed to investigate the effects of Chinese on the acquisition of English articles, yet the effects of L1 were revealed during the course of the investigations.

Participants
A total of 33 Hong Kong Cantonese ESL learners participated in the cloze passage task whereas another group of 30 learners participated in the noun countability task. They were all English majors at a local university, including a total of 12 males and 51 females. They had all studied English for 14 years or more. Among them 49 learners had received a C or above in the Hong Kong Advanced Level Use of English (UE) Examination1 or General Certificate of Education (GCE) A-level Examination, 7.5 or above in the International English Language Testing System (IELTS) test, or 5 or above in the Hong Kong Diploma of Secondary
Education (HKDSE)ii. The rest had received a D in HKALE, 6.5-7 in IELTS, 4 in HKDSE, or C in the Hong Kong Certificate of Education Examination (HKCEE). They could all be regarded as advanced learners of English.

**Objectives and Procedures of Tasks**

**CLOZE PASSAGE TASK:** The objective of the cloze passage task was to investigate the reasons behind learners’ article selection and the hypotheses they made in their selection processes. Whether a certain correct article choice could be the result of an inappropriate learner hypothesis was also investigated. Participants completed a cloze passage task by providing the most suitable articles (a/an, the, /) for a total of 50 blanks in two short passages of about 200 words each. Immediately after the completion of each passage, participants were asked to explain verbally why they had chosen a certain article for each blank. In the explanation of article choices, participants were allowed to use whatever language(s) they were comfortable with. As a result, 94% of them used a mixed-code of Cantonese and English, and the rest used English throughout the whole processiii (For other details, see Chan, 2017a).

**NOUN COUNTABILITY TASK:** The objective of the noun countability judgement task was to investigate the effectiveness of a bilingualized dictionaryiv in helping learners determine the countability of English nouns and associated article use. Participants were required to consult the Oxford Advanced Learner’s English-Chinese Dictionary (8th Edition) (Hornby, 2013) to help them make decisions about the countability (i.e., deciding whether the noun was countable or uncountable) and related article use for three sentence contexts for a total of seven nouns (e.g., feeling, reason, understanding, etc.), all of which had different countability when used in different contexts. They had to show their decisions on article use by choosing the most appropriate option from three choices (singular form without an article (e.g., basic understanding), plural form without an article (e.g., basic understandings), and singular form with a/an (e.g., a basic understanding)). All the sentence contexts for all the target nouns were chosen from popular dictionaries available on the market, including Cambridge dictionaries Online (http://dictionary.cambridge.org/), Collins COBUILD Advanced Learners’ English Dictionaries 4th edition (Sinclair, 2003), etc. After completing all three sentence contexts for a noun, participants had to complete an introspective questionnaire to report on the feelings about their decisions on ending a search (whether they were sure that their decisions were correct, and why), to write out the definitions, examples etc. which led them to their decisions, to describe how such definitions, examples, etc. showed them that their decisions should be correct, to explain why they were doubtful about a certain decision and to spell out the difficulties they encountered. All the participants used English in their completion of the introspective questionnaire, as the questions were all given in English (For other details, see Chan, 2017b).

**RESULTS**

As noted earlier, the two tasks did not specifically aim to investigate the effects of L1 transfer on learners’ article use, yet a few phenomena related to L1 influence could be observed from the results of the tasks. Because both tasks involved some form of self-reports (verbal explanations of article choices for the Cloze Passage task and answering of questions in the introspective questionnaire for the Noun Countability task), relevant self-reports will be included in this paper to illustrate participants’ thinking processes during article selection.
and/or countability determination. Numerical results on participants’ performance in the two tasks and other data not relevant to the goal of this paper will not be presented.

**Influence of Similar but Distinct Structural Items in the Native Language**

Despite the non-existence of structural equivalents in Chinese, learners were prone to formulate their thoughts in Chinese and model their article selection on the “corresponding” Chinese structures. This was manifested in a “translation and comparison” strategy, in that an article choice was validated by comparing a given English sentence or phrase with its seemingly equivalent Chinese version, notably those with Cantonese determiners showing definite reference, such as demonstratives.

In the Cloze Passage task, where participants were asked to insert the most appropriate article in two passage contexts, some participants made their article selection based on translations from Chinese, especially when the article selected was ZERO. For example, for the clause handle your lenses with / damp hands, a participant said that she chose ZERO for damp hands because of direct translation of the clause from Chinese.

(Do not use “hands that are damp”. Not “do not use those hands which are damp”, so I just translated. I used Cantonese. I think we should not use ‘those’, so I chose nothing (no articles)).

When the chosen article was other articles, such as the, similar contention about Chinese translations was given in participants’ descriptions of their article choices. An example was the selection of the in the clause If the following simple rules are followed, as illustrated in the self-report from another participant:

(Those procedures like this. I like to use Chinese to translate like this: ‘those’, so I chose ‘the’.)
It can be seen that the acceptable presence of a determiner (a demonstrative in the above examples) in Cantonese was taken as confirmation for learners’ choice of the, whereas the absence of such was taken as confirmation for the choice of ZERO. Although the articles selected were correct, the participants’ selection was based on inappropriate comparisons of target language structures with native language structures.

Influence of Native Language Translations of Head Nouns in the Same Noun Phrase

The translation and comparison strategy discussed in the previous section was manifested in another form in the Noun Countability Task, where participants were asked to use a bilingualized dictionary to help them determine the countability of an English noun and associated article use. Because the task involved the use of a bilingualized dictionary which included Chinese definitions and examples, the influence of the native language became more apparent, in that participants determined the countability of an English lexical item (e.g., feeling) based on the countability of the “thought-to-be” best Chinese translation (e.g., 情感) as used in the given sentence contexts. The associated article use for the target English noun was modelled on the structures of the English examples and/or English definitions for that chosen “best Chinese translation”. The majority of the nouns under investigation showed instances of such inappropriate modelling, which sometimes resulted in correct article choices but sometimes incorrect choices.

In determining whether to choose feeling, feelings or a feeling for the sentence

It’s incredible that Peter can behave with such stupid lack of feeling (Sinclair, 2003, p. 526),

Participant 40 found the Chinese meaning 情感 for the target noun feeling and was puzzled whether the word feeling meant 情感 in the given target sentence. Irrespective of her puzzle, the Chinese meaning 情感 and the corresponding structure feelings in the example sentence He hates talking about his feelings and I didn’t mean to hurt your feelings (Hornby, 2013, p. 761) led her to use feelings instead of the target answer feeling. Her introspective report shows her thinking process:

I am struggling what is the feeling means here. I don’t know whether it means 情感,情感 and ‘feelings’ led to my decision. (Participant 40)

Reliance on Chinese translations sometimes resulted in correct article choices. In determining whether to choose was understanding, were understandings, or was an understanding for the sentence

We had not set a date for marriage but there was an understanding between us (Sinclair, 2003, p. 1579),

Participant 38 chose the correct answer based on the English example shown for the “thought to be” best Chinese translation of the target English word understanding (協議):

協議 + the example ‘We finally came to an understanding led me to my decision.'
The definition 協議 fits perfectly and ‘came to an understanding’ shows me an article should precede ‘understanding’. (Participant 38)

When explaining whether they were sure about their decision for choosing a certain option for a certain sentence and/or whether their determination of the countability of a target noun as used in a certain sentence context was correct or not, some participants explicitly mentioned their reliance on Chinese translations during the decision process:

I was not sure whether my decision was correct because the Chinese translations are similar (Participant 61; target word reason)

The Chinese translations of definitions helped me a lot in making my decisions. (Participant 56; target word reason)

The Chinese definition really stands out and eye catching and it fits with the situation the question is positioned in. (Participant 39; target word understanding)

The translation and comparison strategy as discussed in the previous section was, thus, manifested in learners’ search for a Chinese translation which was thought to be the best fit for the meaning of a target English noun in a certain context and their modelling their article selection on the syntactic structure of an English definition/example for that selected Chinese translation.

DISCUSSIONS

It can be seen from the above results that, in their selection of English articles, Cantonese ESL learners tend to formulate their thoughts in their native language, translate their thoughts to the target language and compare the structures of the two languages in their minds. This kind of translation and comparison strategy clearly reveals the effects of L1. That a translation and comparison strategy was employed in article selection in the Cloze Passage task can be understood by learners’ confusion between English articles (e.g. a/an, the, ZERO) and demonstratives (e.g. these), as the latter are sometimes regarded as examples of articles by Cantonese ESL learners. In Chan (2016), which reports on the result of another sub-study of the same study about the inventory of English articles, it has been shown that demonstratives such as this, that, these, those, and their were listed by some Cantonese ESL learners as members of the English article system. It has also been argued in the literature that Cantonese demonstratives, such as 嘢個 (that) or 嘢啲 (those), being the most commonly used determiners in Cantonese and often used for deictic functions pointing or referring back to noun phrases mentioned in the same context, are quite like English the in terms of functions (Chan, 2004). Learners’ modelling their article selection on the use of Chinese demonstratives in their decision of whether to use English the or not may have been a result of this similarity. Such reliance may not result in wrong article choices, but it reveals learners’ misconceptions about the English article system and their unawareness of the subtle differences between articles and demonstratives.

Learners’ modelling their sentence construction for a target English lexical item on the syntactic structure of an English definition/example based on the Chinese translations of that English definition/example, on the other hand, shows their insensitivity to the differences
in the syntactic requirements of the different senses of a lexical item. As documented in Chan (2012), some lexical items have different senses which are dependent on the grammatical contexts the items are in (e.g. the verb boast has different meanings when used transitively (boast something) and intransitively (boast about something)), so the usage of these words is governed by the syntactic requirements of a particular sense in a particular context. What is more, lexical items in two languages seldom have precisely the same meaning. Different languages may also have different syntactic requirements (e.g. verb transitivity) for corresponding vocabulary items (e.g. While listen is intransitive in English, its corresponding Chinese 聽 is transitive) (Chan, 2017b). The syntactic context of a Chinese word is, thus, not necessarily an appropriate model for the corresponding English word. Choosing a certain sense of an English lexical item based on its translations in another language (e.g. Chinese) and then modelling corresponding sentence construction on the English syntactic requirements of that chosen sense is not a desirable strategy and may result in errors not noticeable to learners. However, such a strategy shows learners’ tendency to resort to their native language when encountering difficulties in making a judgment, revealing that the extent of L1 influence is not restricted to a target structure (e.g. articles) but also to the surrounding syntactic environments (e.g. head noun of a noun phrase) which trigger the use of the target structure.

**IMPLICATIONS**

The findings of the study have both theoretical and pedagogical significance. They confirm that L1 influence operates not just when the target language items have functional equivalents in the native language but also when the target language structures do not have functional equivalents in the native language. In learners’ production of these target language structures, they may rely on native translations of distinct language items (e.g. demonstratives instead of articles) or even native translations of other (key) lexical items in the syntactic environments (e.g. head noun of a noun phrase) and be (mis)led by the structural requirements and/or usages of those items. While inappropriate reliance on the L1 may not necessarily lead to learner errors, the potential problems brought by the shadowy effects of correct language use as a result of L1 influence are clearly revealed and merit attention. Learner performance can be deceptive, as learners’ correct language use may be grounded on inaccurate hypotheses (Chan, 2017b). Our findings support this contention, disclose the inadequacy of empirical evidence which is restricted to performance data, and expose the need for more in-depth qualitative research probing into learners’ thinking processes. To bridge the gap of previous research which focused mostly on learner performance (see Introduction), future research into the acquisition of English articles should not just analyze learner errors and/or compare and contrast the L1 and the L2. A qualitative component, such as introspective think-aloud protocols or post-task interviews requiring learners to articulate the reasons for their article choices, should be incorporated alongside language tasks.

Pedagogically, our findings suggest that a contrastive analysis approach can be employed, irrespective of whether the native language is article-less or has articles, to discuss the functional and semantic similarities and differences between similar items in the two languages, such as English the and Chinese determiners (嘅個 (that) or 嘅啲 (those)), possessives or numerals. Though the differences between, say, demonstratives and articles might look indispensable in certain cases, such as when the target noun phrase has definite
reference and the language items are substitutable without affecting grammaticality, ESL learners, especially advanced learners, should be made aware of the very subtle functional and meaning differences between these seemingly equivalent items. For example, English the does not have a demonstrative function whereas Chinese demonstratives are not articles in the language, and, unlike English the, they cannot be used in non-definite contexts. These are subtle differences which ESL teachers should highlight in their classrooms. Teachers could design awareness-raising exercises which compare these similar but distinct items in the native and target languages and guide students to discover their similarities and differences. Language tasks which encourage learners to verbalize their knowledge of the use of such language items in the target and native languages could also be introduced, so learners’ misconceptions could be eradicated.

LIMITATIONS

Some limitations inherent to the present study may be of concern. No attempt was made to systematically investigate L1 transfer. The instruments used in the two language tasks were not specifically designed to probe into the influence of L1 on L2 article acquisition, so no comprehensive data from a sizable group of participants about the extent of L1 influence could be collected. The use of a bilingualized dictionary consisting of translations in the L1 in the Noun Countability task may also be argued to have aggravated or even triggered unintended L1 reliance\(^\text{v}\). However, despite the diverse objectives and nature of the two tasks, unconstrained data about learners’ thinking processes were obtained from the self-reporting protocols (verbal explanations immediately after completion of the Cloze Passage task and introspective questionnaires for the Noun Countability task). The patterns of L1 influence observed from such elicitation protocols reflected learners’ conscious and subconscious reliance on the L1 and demonstrated the genuine presence of possible L1 effects. The insights obtained are, thus, worth attending to. Future research may include language tasks as well as self-reporting protocols which specifically probe into the effects of L1 transfer for comprehensive understanding and triangulation.

It may also be argued that language use is largely an unconscious process and therefore the self-reporting protocols used in the two tasks may not be authentic or natural enough in providing data for real language use. This may be true, but the diverse nature of the self-reporting protocols used in the two tasks, as well as the implementation times of the protocols, makes them reliable tools for understanding learners’ underlying cognitive processes during their language use: The two self-reporting protocols were both self-reports with no intervention from the researcher, and they were implemented either immediately after the completion of the language task (for the cloze passage task) or during the language task (for the noun countability task), so the protocols could relate clearly to learners’ learning behavior. The reasons reporting protocol for the cloze passage task has been used in other similar studies, such as Butler (2002), and the introspective questionnaire for the noun countability task has also been adopted in several similar studies, such as Chan (2012). Both of these protocols are useful in providing the data required.

CONCLUSION

The results of a study uncovering the effects of L1 on Cantonese ESL learners’ acquisition of English articles have been reported in this paper. While previous research has mainly focused on performance, the present study probes into learners’ thinking processes during article
The Effects of Chinese on English Article Use by Cantonese ESL Learners

selection. It reveals the effects of L1 which are shadowed by correct language use and provides insights into the importance of tackling L1 effects on the use of target language items which do not have native language equivalents. Teachers are advised not just to tackle errors which are clearly the result of L1 transfer but also to diagnose learners’ knowledge and hypotheses and eradicate their misconceptions so as to ensure that their language use reflects not just their performance but also their competence.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS
The work described in this article was supported by the Hong Kong Research Grants Council (Project Number: CityU 11400614). The support of the council is acknowledged. I would also like to thank all the participants for their participation and my research assistants for their administrative help.

REFERENCES
http://dictionary.cambridge.org/ (retrieved on 17/6/2018)

1 The Hong Kong Advanced Level Use of English (UE) examination aimed to test students’ ability to understand and use English at a level that was required for tertiary education and/or for future employment. (http://www.hkeaa.edu.hk/DocLibrary/HKALE/Subject_and_Syllabuses/2013/2013as-ue.pdf). It was normally taken by F.7 students in Hong Kong who had completed their two-year matriculation studies. UE Grade E was regarded as equivalent to Grade E in the GCE A level examinations (http://www.hkeaa.edu.hk/en/recognition/ce_al_recognition/).

2 The Hong Kong Diploma of Secondary Education examination aims to measure the attainment of students upon their completion of six years of secondary education and has been the only public examination in the new 3-3-4 education system in Hong Kong since 2012. 5** is the highest grade that students can attain for a certain subject, followed by 5* and 5.

3 The use of a mixed-code of Cantonese and English in participants’ explanation of their article choices should not have any impact on the reliability of the data about the effects of Chinese, as only explanations which made explicit reference to the influence of Chinese were focused on in this paper.

4 A bilingualized dictionary (e.g. *Oxford Advanced Learners’ English-Chinese Dictionary*) is a dictionary with definitions and examples which have been translated in full or in part into the target language (e.g. Chinese), but there are also definitions and examples in the source language (e.g. English) (see Hartmann 1994; James 1994; Marello 1998).
The reasons for choosing a bilingualized dictionary instead of a monolingual dictionary are detailed in Chan (2017b): Because Chinese does not have structural equivalents of English articles and the countability of corresponding English and Chinese nouns is often different, the use of a bilingualized dictionary instead of a monolingual dictionary may yield more interesting results about learners’ judgements of English noun countability.
ABSTRACT
The future of language education is experiencing pedagogical shift due to the new expectation centering on the Fourth Industrial Revolution (4IR). The communication skill is one of the significant 4IR technical skills apart from 21st century skills and digital skills which are highly sought after by Human Resource Departments in future employment (Jeshcke, 2015). However, in order to produce future workforce who are not restricted by communicative barriers, learners may be affected by the threat of listening and speaking anxieties. Hence, in an attempt to understand how severe the impacts of listening and speaking anxieties are on university learners, which is the main source of human capital required for the protraction of 4IR, the research objectives of this study are to investigate the impact of language anxiety on listening and speaking skills and discover the causal factors that could contribute to language anxiety in relation to listening and speaking skills. By employing a survey design with a mixed method approach, the Factors of Language Anxiety Questionnaire (FLAQ) was distributed to 125 university learners from non-English programmes. Based on the analysis, it was discovered that learners experienced a severe impact of language anxiety in listening skills in comparison to speaking skills. However, using paired sample t-test, it is discovered that there is no significant difference between the mean scores of listening and speaking anxieties. The impact of language anxiety in both listening and speaking skills was profoundly affected by causal factors such as self-esteem and social anxiety. Therefore, by understanding the impact of listening and speaking anxieties from the learners’ perspective, several strategies are recommended which highly emphasise how educators can eliminate the existence of listening and speaking anxieties in language classroom environment.

Keywords: Fourth Industrial Revolution, Communication Skills, Listening Anxiety, Speaking Anxiety, Causal Factors, Language Anxiety Alleviation

INTRODUCTION
The Fourth Industrial Revolution (4IR) is a new era that forms and expands the power of digitisation in fresh and unforeseen ways due to the emergence of technologies which are affecting society vastly. The 4IR is driven by technologies such as automation, additive manufacturing and Industrial Internet (Schwab, 2016). Hence, it is vital to investigate the shifts that the future of education will experience in ensuring that the 4IR can create many benefits for the mass public, especially to those who are directly linked to the education field, such as educators, learners and stakeholders.
The concept of the 4IR is exemplified in an array of technologies which function in an integrated manner, connecting virtual space with the physical world that involves a process of profound transformation of how an individual will think, learn, conceive, produce, distribute and use products and services, powered by the development and availability of a new generation of digital technologies with increasingly competitive prices (South Med Social Dialogue, n.d.). The linking of virtual space such as the internet and other data, with the physical world has profound implications for the society and the economy.

From the historical perspective of the Industrial Revolution (IR), the first IR was based upon water and steam power to mechanise production. Next, the second IR was based upon electric power to create mass production where electronics and information technology (IT) became the core business for third IR to automate production. Lastly, the 4IR continues as per its predecessor, where this digital revolution has been occurring since the middle of the last century. It is characterised by a fusion of technologies that has created grey areas between the physical, digital and biological elements (Schwab, 2016). This leads to the urgency of universities to improvise their roles in shaping the educational framework for innovating and educating future generations. The upcoming trends of education and learning are more technology intensive and learner-oriented, thus educators will have to meet new expectations. The permanent and proactive adjustment between the needs of the economy and the society, together with the new skills and competencies need to be integrated into the generated ecosystems particularly in the employment and business systems.

The 4IR requires certain skills that are not exactly the same as the skills that were required in the 3IR where information technology is the key driver. For the 4IR, future employees or current learners are required to arm themselves with skills such as critical thinking, people management, emotional intelligence, judgement, negotiation, cognitive flexibility as well as knowledge production and management (Xing and Marwala, 2017). In addition, educational institutions are also expected to impart the complex and problem solving skills such as creative skills and social skills, which includes management, leadership, collaboration, critical thinking, curiosity and risk taking, communication, marketing and sales, which are highly required for entrepreneurship (Naude, 2017).

Lifelong comprehensive and reasonable quality education, whether it is formal and informal or physical and digital, will be important in preparing future workforce to prosper in this ambiguous future. The 20th century model of education that instils standardised facts and procedures deliberated to yield a human resource for jobs that no longer exists will be inadequate to meet future challenges. How the future will define the term “work” is where machines will be unable to perform as the “work” will rely on creative expressions, social interactions, physical dexterities, empathy, ingenuity and collaboration. This is where future graduates will fit in (Brown-Martin, 2017).

One of the challenges for the Higher Education (HE) is to provide broader skill sets as cross-functional exchange is often hindered by different languages (Walsh and Donaldson, 2017). Future graduates have to possess a few capabilities such as 21st century skills and digital skills. However, this study will specifically highlight another capability which is the technical skills of the 4IR focussing on the communication centred ability, either between human to human or human to machine. The employee of the 4IR is expected to have no language and time barriers because everybody and everything are networked globally (Jeshcke, 2015). Communication is the analytical and interpersonal skills which need to be combined with critical thinking to operate effectively (Abersek, 2017).
In relating listening anxiety and speaking anxiety with regards to the 4IR, the deprivation of these two skills have brought some fears, for example, unemployment, poor communication skills and incompetent knowledge dispersion to future workforce as studied in past research. Studies have shown that higher education graduates lack second language communication skills and this has led to high unemployment rates among Malaysian graduates (Hanapi and Nordin, 2014). A study conducted by Kassim and Ali (2010) indicates the importance of acquiring communication skills in the English language in the engineering field as a platform for them to be more global friendly in order to be at a par with the demands of the 4IR. In addition, the process of communicating knowledge has been challenged with the emergence of the 4IR, which intensifies language anxiety among university learners specifically from the spectrum of listening and speaking skills as learners are expected to deliver information effectively and precisely (Smithers and Gray, 2017). These issues reveal the call for immediate action for educators from every level to improve the situation. Hence in this study, the researchers investigate the phenomenon of the English language listening anxiety and speaking anxiety which university learners experience as well as the causal factors that could contribute to them. To accomplish these objectives, two research questions have been formulated as guidelines for this study which are as follows:

**Research Question 1:** Is there a significant difference between the mean score of listening anxiety and speaking anxiety?

**Research Question 2:** What are the causal factors that contribute to the formation of listening anxiety and speaking anxiety among university learners?

### LISTENING ANXIETY

According to Krashen (1985; as cited in Zhang, 2013), listening anxiety is closely related to situations where learners are required to listen in the language where they are targeted to learn. Anxiety in listening occurs when educators have difficulties to teach listening skills as this skill itself is deemed as challenging (Christenberry, 2003). Based on a study conducted by Riasati (2011), listening is considered as anxiety provoking due to three reasons, namely the speed of speaking, different intonation patterns, and unfamiliar words and expressions. Furthermore, listening anxiety causes negative impacts on listening comprehension (Kim, 2000) and learners’ achievement (Elkhafaifi, 2005). It effectuates the language learners to feel worried and tensed as well as make them have doubts whether they are listening correctly. As a result, having constant self-doubts over what they have hear in the target language tasks will implicate badly on their achievements based on their listening assessments and final examination grades.

As stated by Bloomfield et. al (2010), there are several factors that can cause listening anxiety, namely listeners characteristics, such as their working memory capacity, metacognitive strategies, proficiency and experience with L2 and their anxiousness; listening passage characteristics which involves length (overall length and density along with redundancy of information), complexity (syntactic features, directness, concreteness and pragmatic information), organisation (orality, coherence, discourse markers, position of relevant information) and auditory features (accent, hesitation, pauses, noise, distortion, speech rate); and testing conditions which are time allocation, multiple hearings and the process of jotting down notes.
SPEAKING ANXIETY
When a learner is feeling a state of fear or anxiety as he or she is communicating orally, the individual is known to have speaking anxiety (Daly, 1991; as cited in Elkhafaifi, 2005). Fear of communication is relevant with the concept of foreign language anxiety due to the prominence of interpersonal interactions (McCroskey, 1977; as cited in Oxford, 1999). The symptoms for fear of communication can be identified as feeling shy when communicating with people, struggling with oral communication either in pairs or groups, having stage fright and reacting negatively (namely listening to or learning) to a spoken message. According to MacIntyre (1994), how an individual reacts during language learning or communication can be influenced by the significant role of language anxiety as he or she has minimal control over their communicative situation.

There are several factors that can influence the decisions made by learners to speak English in the classroom which include, linguistic difficulties such as limited vocabulary, poor command of grammar rules, pronunciation impediments (Ozturk and Gurbuz, 2014); low self-esteem, minimal L1 information, educators’ intervention and competitiveness (Kayaoglu and Saglamel, 2013); the realisation of undertaking a speech communication course (Yahya, 2013); uncomfortable classroom environment (Zgutowicz, 2009); humiliation by peers, talking in front of native speakers and concerned with social image (Tsipplakides and Keramida, 2009).

In relation to achievement and performance, speaking anxiety is known to produce negative influence such as lower quality of oral performance (Azarfam and Baki, 2012) especially when the learners’ oral ability is tested (Stephenson Wilkinson, 2006). Hence, speaking anxiety can be a significant predictor to oral achievement where anxious language learners can be categorised as those who have retrieval interference while others can also have deficit in their speaking skills (Woodrow, 2006). Conversely, the intensity of anxiety is weak for language learners at freshman or juniors level (Cheng, 2009) and sophomores level (Cheng, 2005) where learners at these levels are not highly concerned with anxiety influence in their language studies.

CAUSAL FACTORS OF LISTENING ANXIETY AND SPEAKING ANXIETY
There are ten factors that can trigger language anxiety which are (1) self-esteem, (2) ambiguity tolerance, (3) resilience to risk, (4) competitiveness, (5) anxiety in social setting, (6) fear of test, (7) inability to adapt to identity and culture, (8) self-philosophy in language learning, (9) activities and teaching strategies conducted in classroom and (10) interactions between educator and their learners (Oxford, 1999). To address the research objectives for this study, only four contributing factors are selected and will be examined comprehensively.

Self-Esteem
Oxford (1999) defines self-esteem as the perceived efficacy in judging their self-worth or value. This definition can be illustrated clearly such as communicating effectively in an environment that requires sufficient speaking skills. How an individual controls himself or herself would determine the desired efficacy. According to Price (1991; as cited in Oxford, 1999), successful language learners possess higher self-esteem compared to unsuccessful ones. Self-esteem is related to the success in language learning when the individuals have the perception of how important language learning is to them. Price (1991; as cited in Oxford, 1999) states that when learners find themselves incompetent in the target language but
The Impact of Listening and Speaking Anxieties on The Fourth Industrial Revolution: What Can Educators Do?

Journa] of Language and Communication, 6(1), March 2019

resourceful in the native language, this is the condition where self-esteem is endangered. The deteriorating performance in language learning can be related to self-esteem when those with lower self-esteem will be unable to handle their anxiousness. Self-esteem can be an inherent personality or a reaction resulting from a particular situation. The tension on one’s self-esteem is normally heightened when an individual is being put in a situation where they are required to speak with native speakers regardless whether they possess higher educational level or not (Qaddomi, 2013). Additionally, Scarcella and Oxford (1992; as cited in Legac, 2007) state that low self-esteem in a particular situation or environment co-exists despite the positive feelings that a person can have on himself or herself. However, self-esteem cannot be entirely blamed in regards to the success of language learning because the nature of language learning itself is threatening which leads learners to deprived normal communication means, restricted space for error-making and inability to function normally (Horwitz et.al, 1986).

Competitiveness
Language anxiety can also be triggered by competitiveness when language learners compare themselves to others or unrealistic self-image that they could not achieve. This view is produced by Bailey (1983; as cited in Oxford, 1999) through studying diaries of several language learners. However, this account is not applicable to all language learners as competitiveness is inevitable when they live in a culture that thrives on competition (Scarcella and Oxford, 1992; as cited in Oxford, 1999). An individual can be affected differently by competitiveness based on the preference of learning style, the particular nature of competition, and the rewards or demands of the learning environment.

Social Anxiety
According to Leary (1983; as cited in Oxford, 1999), social anxiety can be related to speech anxiety, introversion, stage fright, awkwardness, social-evaluative anxiety and fear of communication. As stated earlier by McCroskey (1977; as cited in Oxford, 1999), with the presence of interpersonal evaluation in interaction, this is where social anxiety will transpire. As a result, those who are too conscious about other’s evaluations of them will tend to behave in a manner that attempts to avoid negative assessments towards them when they display their performance in regards to language, especially speaking skills (Oxford, 1999). Therefore, when the learners receive negative assessment, they will completely opt for withdrawal in social situations. Aida (1994; as cited in Oxford, 1999) highlights examples of the withdrawal indicators such as learners will lack initiative or minimally take part in conversations with their peers.

Educator – Learners’ Interactions
Many studies have been conducted on relating educator-learners’ interaction with language anxiety (Horwitz, Horwitz & Cope, 1986; Koch & Terrell, 1991; Price, 1991; Scarcella & Oxford, 1992; Young, 1990, Oxford, 1999), where the issues related to educator – learners’ interaction have been identified as strict error correction, agonising mistakes managing especially in front of a class, and conflict management in classroom. As stated by Oxford et. al (1991), these issues will later affect the learner by lowering their grades and contributing to stress in the classroom. Educator – learners’ interaction is said to be a factor that can activate language anxiety due to educator’s personalities (Al-Saraj, 2011), methods applied
by educators when correcting errors (Toth, 2009), fear to communicate with educators especially during question and answer sessions (Mesri, 2012) and unsuitable teaching method and unwillingness to cultivate bonding with their learners (Worde, 1998; as cited in Marwan, 2007).

METHODOLOGY

Research Design
This study employed a mixed method design using questionnaires and interview protocol to collect quantitative and qualitative data in order to answer the research questions. This two-phase design entails the collection of quantitative data in its first phase, followed by the collection of qualitative data in the second phase. The second phase was conducted with the purpose of explaining or elaborating the results from the quantitative data (Creswell, 2014).

Participants
The quantitative data for the study were obtained from 125 learners from higher education institution majoring in non-English programmes namely Science and Physical Health, Music, and Architecture, Planning and Surveying in a public university through the use of the Factors of Language Anxiety Questionnaire or also known as FLAQ (Kamaruddin, et. al, 2017). Meanwhile, the qualitative data was acquired through in-depth email interviews. These eight participants interviewed were selected based on their high score on the FLAQ. The highest score on the FLAQ indicated that they are highly anxious while accomplishing listening or speaking tasks.

Instruments
Items for this self-developed questionnaire were adopted and adapted from reputable questionnaires related to language anxiety. Specific items related to listening anxiety and speaking anxiety were based on the Foreign Language Listening Anxiety Scale (FLLAS) by Elkhafaifi (2005) and the Foreign Language Classroom Speaking Anxiety Scale (FLCSAS) by Apple (2013), respectively. On the other hand, the questions for the interview protocol were derived based on the relevance to the research questions. The six open-ended interview questions used in this study are as follows:

1. Do you feel nervous studying in the English language classroom?
2. Which types of language activities will make you nervous in the language classroom? Is it listening activity or speaking activity?
3. In your opinion, what are the reasons that make you feel anxious or nervous while doing listening or speaking task?
4. What are the signs or indicators that inform you are anxious or nervous when you are doing listening or speaking task?
5. How do you normally react to the anxiety induced situation?

Data Collection Procedure
This study was conducted in one of the higher learning institutions in Shah Alam, Selangor. The FLAQ questionnaires were distributed to learners who are studying at the Faculty of Education and the Faculty of Architecture, Planning and Surveying. After the questionnaires were collected, their scores on the FLAQ were counted and those who scored within the
range of 147 to 200 were considered as learners with high level of listening anxiety and speaking anxiety. This range was obtained by dividing the highest score on the FLAQ, namely 200, with three levels of anxiety namely high, moderate and low. Eight learners who acquired high scores on the FLAQ were identified as highly anxious learners and they were contacted using emails procured from their demographic profiles. The eight participants gave their consents to be interviewed and six open-ended interview questions were emailed to them. The participants were allowed to be bilingual while responding to the interview questions. Responses from the email interviews were received within two weeks. The responses were then extracted from the email interviews and categorised based on themes to answer the research questions pertaining to listening anxiety and speaking anxiety.

**Data Analysis Procedure**
The analysis to identify which of the two language skills are severely affected by anxiety was conducted by computing the following numbered items of the FLAQ.

Table 1: The FLAQ Items Group According To Two Language Skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language Skills</th>
<th>Items</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Listening</td>
<td>1, 5, 9, 13, 17, 21, 25, 29, 33 and 37.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaking</td>
<td>2, 6, 10, 14, 18, 22, 26, 30, 34 and 38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The quantitative data was analysed by using descriptive statistics such as mean, standard deviation and sum. Inferential statistics involving Paired Samples t-test was also analysed to discover if there was any significance differences between learners’ listening and speaking skills.

Meanwhile, the qualitative data was acquired through in-depth email interviews. The eight interview participants were learners with high anxiety scores based on the FLAQ who agreed to be interviewed. The interview data served to triangulate and further validate the quantitative findings.

**FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

a. **Listening Anxiety**
Table 2 below shows the mean and standard deviation of language anxiety experienced by university learners with regards to their listening skills. This table shows also that the highest item of the abovementioned dimension is “I get upset when I am not sure whether I understand what I am hearing in English,” which has a mean of 3.4160 (SD = 1.02536). The lowest item of the aforementioned dimension is “I usually find it difficult to understand English related materials that I listen to,” which has a mean of 2.7920 (SD = .83566).

Table 2: Means and Standard Deviations of Language Anxiety in Learning Listening Skills
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Qu1</td>
<td>3.4160</td>
<td>1.02536</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qu13</td>
<td>3.2240</td>
<td>.99890</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qu17</td>
<td>3.1440</td>
<td>.92199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qu29</td>
<td>3.1200</td>
<td>.98045</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qu33</td>
<td>3.1040</td>
<td>.95735</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qu37</td>
<td>3.0480</td>
<td>.82164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qu5</td>
<td>2.9920</td>
<td>.99593</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qu21</td>
<td>2.9760</td>
<td>1.08853</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qu25</td>
<td>2.8960</td>
<td>.89644</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qu9</td>
<td>2.7920</td>
<td>.83566</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>3.0712</td>
<td>.51491</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the email interview, Miss K stated that she is not comfortable during the listening activities because she cannot grasp the words that she hears and sometimes due to the interlocutor who speaks in a fast pace.
The top three relevant aspects that relate to their anxiety when it comes to listening are based on their self-esteem (item 1), competitiveness (item 13) and social anxiety (item 17). When the learners were unsuccessful in understanding the information in their listening activity task, it lowers their self-esteem thus building the feeling of anxiousness due to their ineffectiveness in listening. Their self-esteem is also closely related to competitiveness as the learners not only wanted to be a successful listener in English, but they also wanted to be better than their other friends. This implies that learners in this current study are competitive in listening. Furthermore, in the social context namely English language classroom, the learners felt anxious to participate in listening activities as, when the learners felt that they could not perform well in listening activities, it would affect the production of the language as well since listening is equally important as speaking in communication. In agreement with Aida (1994; as cited in Oxford, 1999), learners will not be motivated to initiate or participate in conversations when they do not comprehend completely what they hear from the interlocutor.

b. Speaking Anxiety

Table 3 below shows the mean and standard deviation of language anxiety experienced by university learners with regards to speaking skills. This table also shows that the highest item of the above mentioned dimension is “I am worried about making mistakes when I use English to converse.” which has a mean of 3.2720 (SD = .92785). The lowest item of the aforementioned dimension is “I am afraid by the number of rules I have to learn to speak in English.” which has a mean of 2.6880 (SD = .98714).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I am worried about making mistakes when I use English to converse.</td>
<td>3.2720</td>
<td>.92785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel nervous speaking in front of the entire class.</td>
<td>3.2480</td>
<td>.87672</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I get nervous when I have to speak up in my English language class.</td>
<td>3.2320</td>
<td>1.01708</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am worried that other learners in class speak better English than I do.</td>
<td>3.2240</td>
<td>1.07661</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I start to panic when I have to speak without preparation in English language class.</td>
<td>3.2000</td>
<td>1.03954</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
You have to know so much about English history and culture in order to speak in English.

I often feel panic when I have to prepare and speak English under time constraint.

I feel confident when I speak in English.

Answering a teacher’s question in English is embarrassing.

I am afraid by the number of rules I have to learn to speak in English.

The result from the email interviews supported the questionnaire. Seven out of eight participants unanimously stated that the type of classroom activities which makes them feel anxious is speaking. For Miss N, she felt nervous when she has to speak English in the class. Mr. K stated that he is comfortable with other language activities, but not with speaking skills. Miss K felt inferior with her speaking skill as she is not confident to produce an output as expected by her educator. Miss F and Miss R similarly responded that they felt nervous with speaking skills especially during public speaking and when it has to be done individually. On the other hand, Miss H specifically mentioned that she felt anxious with speaking activities when she is not given an ample time to make preparations. As for Miss L, who studied Academic Skill subject in that particular semester, she has been encouraged by her educator to converse in English but she did not do so even with her friends due to her shyness.

Referring to the quantitative data, it was actually surprising that speaking is not the main language skill that caused learners’ anxiousness as demonstrated by numerous studies in the past. Most of the extensive studies conducted on speaking anxiety signify that language anxiety is greatly impacted by speaking skill, but it does not seem to be the case for the participants in this study. However, the qualitative findings seem to contradict the quantitative findings by supporting the findings from past studies.

In the analysis of mean score for the speaking items, the learners illustrated that speaking influenced their anxiety from the aspects of educator-learner interaction (item 34), social anxiety (item 18) and self-esteem (item 2). The learners stated through the quantitative findings that they were worried of making mistakes when they use English to converse with their educator. This finding then fits into previous views by Hoang (2011) and Mak (2011) who explain that educators’ inadequate feedback, encouragements and mistake correcting manners have caused speaking difficulties for learners. From the perspective of social anxiety, learners also stated that they are nervous when asked to speak in front of the entire class. This finding corresponds to an earlier view by Hadziosmanovic (2012) who also suggests that there are significant relationship between speaking English, speaking anxiety
The Impact of Listening and Speaking Anxieties on The Fourth Industrial Revolution: What Can Educators Do?

and classroom environment. When learners perceive themselves as incompetent in speaking and become too concerned with how their peers would think of them, they will breed the fear of speaking in them (Tsiplakides and Keramida, 2009). This will later develop the idealistic beliefs that they should produce sentence with none grammatical errors, active participations in classroom, confidence in experimenting the language with their language educator and become competitive with their peers. As a result, these idealistic language beliefs will affect their self-esteem and nervousness with the idea of speaking up in front of the English language class.

c. The Significant Difference between Listening Anxiety and Speaking Anxiety

Table 5: Paired Sample T-test Table for the Mean Scores of Listening and Speaking Skills

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paired Differences</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Sig. (2-tailed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Listening</td>
<td>.004</td>
<td>.34731</td>
<td>.03106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaking</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>.06628</td>
<td>.155</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A paired sample t-test revealed that there is no significant difference in language anxiety for listening and speaking skills, t (125) = .155, p >.05. Although the mean score for listening anxiety is higher than the mean score for speaking anxiety, the significant difference indicates that language anxiety has its debilitating influence for both of the language skills. Hence, this finding is in line with what has been stated by Horwitz et. al (1986) on the general conceptualisation of language anxiety whereby the unique nature of language learning process has triggered distinguishable complexity of how learners will react in language learning based on their self-perceptions, beliefs, feelings and behaviours in language classrooms.

CONCLUSION
The finding from this study has revealed that learners are more triggered with anxiety when they are placed in language learning situations that involve listening compared to speaking based on the mean and standard deviation for both questionnaire prompts on listening anxiety and speaking anxiety. The quantitative findings have contradicted findings from past studies as most researchers found that learners possess higher anxiety in speaking situations rather
than other language skills such as listening. In addition, the contributing factors to listening anxiety and speaking anxiety stem from learners’ self-esteem and social anxiety or in other words, anxiety coming from self-judgment and others’ evaluations. Hence, in catering to the need of providing skilful workers with excellent communication skills as part of the 4IR skills requirements, language learning fears such as listening anxiety and speaking anxiety, should not be a major issue that hinders this aspiration.

In the retrospective of overcoming language learners’ anxiousness in listening, there are some listening strategies that can be employed by learners who experience anxiety attack. However, there is a negative association between foreign language listening anxiety and listening strategy used as learners are aware of listening strategies but they did not employ effective listening strategies and, in the worst case, some of these anxious learners do not know what the listening strategies are that they can use especially when learners feel anxious while sitting for listening test (Gonen, 2009; Chang, 2008). Hence, educators can teach and guide their learners regarding some listening strategies based on their level of anxiety. According to Yang (2012), language learners with low anxiety utilised listening strategies while learners with higher level of anxiety employed compensation and memory strategies. Chang (2008) further suggests educators to apply these four forms of listening support, namely previewing questions, repeated input, background information preparation, and vocabulary instruction, for assisting their learners during listening tests or assessments. Additionally, there are three classroom pedagogies that may minimise listening anxiety, namely the use of authentic listening tasks (Melanlioglu, 2013), bilingual communicative classroom (Legac, 2007) and the integration of computer based listening tasks (Ko, 2010).

As for speaking anxiety, there is a need for educators to understand their learners’ restrained reactions to speaking activities based on several contributing factors which originate from the language classroom that they conduct. It is important for educators to allocate mutually agreed preparation time (between educator and learners) for presentation rehearsal or mock presentation to build their readiness before they are able to speak in front of the classroom (Mak, 2011). Learners’ oral presentation is profoundly affected by their low language proficiency and will affect their confidence as well (Hoang, 2011; Subasi, 2010). To reduce anxiousness among language learners, educators should also provide sufficient feedback and encouragement and, at the same time practise positive and acceptable mistake correcting manners. In the situation of group oral presentations, their presentation dynamics should not be affected by rigid applications of target language and this can be done by allowing them to use their first language when they are communicating with other group members (Mak, 2011). Conclusively, there are two aspects where educators must reflect in order to cultivate an anxiety-alleviating classroom for language learners, which are their own characteristics and classroom planned activities. According to Cheng (2005), distributing uninformed assessments, impulsive teaching, being too firm and lacking in communication skills are the common anxiety provoking habits commonly found in educators. Cheng adds that the main in-class activities regarded as anxiety provoking are the ones that involve making speeches in front of a large group. Educators must also realise that their learners’ voice is crucial in order for them to receive feedback on their professionalism, and teaching and learning activities in classroom so that they can reflect whether educators themselves or their teaching practices have been contributing to language anxiety especially when dealing with speaking skills.
Taking everything into account, this study attempts to remind educators that, in the race to prepare learners with various skills such as 21st century skills, digital skills and technical skills, psychological factors that can cause some anomaly in learners’ language learning, such as listening anxiety and speaking anxiety, should not be entirely forgotten. Educators can help learners with any learning problems that come from the outside such as physical learning environment and psychosocial learning environment (Gardiner, 1989; Zandvliet, 1999; as cited in Amirul, Che Ahmad et. al, 2013), but what goes on the inside or the affective side of learners’ learning? Through this study, educators can get some insight on how to reduce listening anxiety and speaking anxiety based on the recommendations suggested in this paper which has tapped into educators’ personality and activities in classrooms.

REFERENCES


THE ROLE OF INSTRUCTIONAL STRATEGIES IN VOCABULARY TEACHING:
A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF THREE STRATEGIES

Arjumand Ara1* and Sadia Afrin Shorna2
Department of English, University of Asia Pacific
E-mail: arjumand@uap-bd.edu1; sadia@uap-bd.edu2

ABSTRACT
Vocabulary knowledge is very complex and learning vocabulary often requires the application of various vocabulary learning strategies (VLS). These strategies recommended by educators and researchers are based on some theoretical principles and are considered as effective in varying degrees in different contexts. It is important to find out the comparative effectiveness of these strategies in case of the tertiary level students of Bangladesh who are not found to be very good at using VLSs. This study, thus, investigates the comparative effectiveness of three different strategies by randomly assigning 90 tertiary level students into three groups. These three groups received different treatments and were given tests to find out both the short term and long term retention rates of 16 vocabulary items. The findings show that both the short and long term retention rates were the highest when learners were taught vocabulary using the visual aids.

Keywords: VLS, visual strategies, rote learning, guessing meaning from context, long-term retention, short-term retention

INTRODUCTION
Vocabulary is considered as one of the most important components of language and normally through words the main message in any communication is conveyed. However, teaching vocabulary throughout the history of English language teaching has received comparatively less attention in the curriculum design or classroom practice, so much so that Carter and McCarthy (1988) described vocabulary as “the neglected Cinderella” of this field. Recently, the field of vocabulary teaching has received considerable significance and many (e.g. Nation, 2001, 2005; Marion, 2008; Susanto, 2016) deem vocabulary learning necessary for the acquisition of the second language. In classroom context, vocabulary teaching includes giving instructions about the form of the lexical item, its pronunciation and the meaning it conveys. This particular task can be carried out by using various strategies, which are commonly called the vocabulary learning strategies (VLS).

These strategies recommended by educators and researchers are based on some theoretical principles and are considered as effective in varying degrees in different contexts. It is imperative for a language instructor to understand which strategies work best for a particular group of learners in a unique situation. It is also imperative for language instructors to become familiar with the various vocabulary learning strategies learners can use to cope with new words, to motivate them to use the strategies they find effective and through their teaching introduce some of these (Hedge, 2000). Vocabulary learning, particularly in case of Bangladesh, usually involves rote learning; that is, merely memorizing lists of words without associating them with any context. While this traditional way of acquiring word meaning is sometimes workable, it normally results in poor retention rate. It is important to find out the comparative effectiveness of these strategies in case of the tertiary level students of...
Bangladesh who are not found to be very good at using VLSs. These students, who are not usually proficient in English because of their Bengali medium background, are required to carry on their higher studies in English. Particularly, reading a text becomes quite challenging for them as they have to encounter unknown lexical items quite often. It is important to investigate what vocabulary learning strategies work for these tertiary level learners and to equip them with effective strategies for both classroom and outside the class vocabulary learning. This paper, therefore, investigates the comparative effectiveness of three of the most widely known strategies: rote learning, use of visual images, and guessing meaning from context and thereby considers the classroom implications of using them.

**Vocabulary learning strategies**

Vocabulary learning strategies (VLS) are usually considered an integral part of language learning strategies which Chamot and Kuppers (1989) define as the techniques that learners employ to understand and retain skills and information. Rubin (1987:23-27), in the same vein, defines learning strategies as “the process of obtaining, storing, retrieving, and using new information”. Language learning strategies are sub-categories of general learning strategies and language learning strategies (Abadi, Baradaran, 2013). They are defined by Gu (1994, as cited in Harvey and Goudvis, 2000) as particular strategies used by second language learners when they want to acquire new words. Ellis (1994) suggested that VLSs set off a number of actions including trying to find new words deliberately, organizing lexical items carefully, guessing meaning from context and retaining word knowledge in the long term memory. Nation (2013) mentioned the following characteristics of the VLSs:

- There are a number of strategies available from which learners can select;
- These strategies are learnt in several stages;
- Training and adequate knowledge about these strategies are required in order to use them successfully;
- These strategies need to improve learners’ ability to learn new vocabulary.

In other words, VLSs are supposed to help learners acquire information on the grammatical meanings of new words, their pronunciation, spelling and also usage in varied contexts.

**Types of VLSs**

VLSs are classified based on different criteria. Schmitt (2000), for example, makes a distinction based on learners’ receptive and productive knowledge. Schmitt (1997) earlier made the following division according to the strategy inventory of language learning (SILL) proposed by Oxford (1990):

- Discovery strategies: these strategies are related to the ones language learners apply to find out the meaning of unknown vocabulary.
- Consolidation strategies: this refers to the process in which meanings of new words are consolidated once they are encountered.

Oxford’s (1990) main categories of memory strategies that Schmitt (1997) used include-

- Rote learning (RL)
The Role of Instructional Strategies in Vocabulary Teaching: A Comparative Study of Three Strategies

- Creating mental linkage (CML)
- Applications of visuals and sounds
- Structured reviewing.

The following table which is based on Sinhaneti and Kyaw’s (2012) diagram shows the strategies and their features.

Table 1: Classification of memory strategies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Memory strategies</th>
<th>Rote memorization</th>
<th>Creating mental connections</th>
<th>Using visuals and sounds</th>
<th>Reviewing appropriately</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reading aloud</td>
<td>● Writing down vocabulary items</td>
<td>● Grouping words according to their grammatical categories</td>
<td>● Using images</td>
<td>Doing structured reviewing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing down</td>
<td>● Learning new words from a list</td>
<td>● Creating a link between lexical items and the context in which they are presented</td>
<td>● Using semantic mapping</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vocabulary items</td>
<td>● Finding out translated equivalents</td>
<td></td>
<td>● Using sounds</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning new words</td>
<td>● Finding definitions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>from a list</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finding out</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>translated equivalents</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finding definitions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Three of these strategies are discussed in detail in the following segments.

**Rote memorization**

Li (2005) defined rote learning (RL) as repetition, memorization and practicing. In this strategy generally words are repeatedly uttered aloud, sometimes with little or no comprehension of the meaning or the context. Although memorization of vocabulary lists is quite popular with some students, this traditional practice is both recommended and criticized by different practitioners. There are several studies (e.g., Barcroft, 2009; Hummel, 2010; as cited in Sinhaneti and Kyaw, 2012; Li 2008) that indicate learners not only hold positive views on rote learning strategy but also still use them. Sinhaneti and Kyaw (2012) in their study on 100 Burmese EFL students concluded that this strategy was used more than other memory strategies. These learners also gave opinions that rote learning works effectively both in the preliminary and further stages of vocabulary acquisition.

However, RL is vehemently criticized by many linguists including Schouten-van Parreren (1989) whose arguments have four strands. Firstly, learners are likely to forget even after giving considerable efforts in memorizing words in a list -as they are presented as isolated elements without any ‘cognitive hold’ in their memory. Secondly, if the word lists are arranged alphabetically or thematically, learners usually suffer from interference. This can have potentially harmful effects on learners as not only these hamper their learning of new words but also make them learn wrong meanings which later can be difficult to get rid of. Thirdly, Parreren (1989) cites Beheydt (1987) who argued that isolated words are devoid of linguistic reality since meaning of a new word is sometimes partly defined by its context.
Finally, isolated words also do not present a psychological reality as they are not capable of carrying a message. They cannot evoke an emotional involvement in learner which is considered as an important factor for long term retention (Lontjew, 1979, as cited in Hedge, 2000).

There are several factors, as mentioned by Sinhaneti and Kyaw (2012) behind these differing views on rote learning such as educational background, cultural norms, language learning environment, examination system or just the lack of proper knowledge of different vocabulary learning strategies and how they are used effectively. Learners in many Asian countries including Bangladesh still utilize rote learning, especially in case of vocabulary learning as part of their traditional teaching system. Although in Bangladesh communication has been emphasized now in case of English language learning, students are found to hold on to the traditional practices.

**Visual strategies**

Among the multitude of vocabulary learning strategies, visual strategy is quite popular for their effectiveness and simplicity in implementation. One visual strategy is the addition of images or diagrams while another is using strategies such as mapping. In the former simply an image or diagram is used alongside a vocabulary item to be learnt. The use of such images and especially diagram, according to some linguists (e.g. Kim and Gilman, 2008) can be effective in explaining the meaning of a new lexical item. The latter may involve the visual representation of the relationship between known and unknown words, synonyms and antonyms. This strategy is also known as semantic mapping.

Visual strategy holds importance as a necessary step in the meaning retention process. Brown and Payne (1994, as cited in Hatch and Brown, 1995) talked about five necessary steps that are involved in learning new vocabulary and the second one emphasizes on the visual image:

1. the presence of sources for encountering new lexical forms;
2. obtaining a clear picture of the forms of the new vocabulary; this image may be auditory or visual or both;
3. learning the meaning of the unknown vocabulary;
4. being able to make a strong link between the form and the meaning of the new vocabulary; and
5. using the new vocabulary item.

Different researchers have pointed out different ways in which the visual strategies can be beneficial. One reason for using such strategies is the increase of motivation of the students as this strategy allows more interaction among the learners and the teacher (Danan, 1992). Another reason pointed out by some (e.g. Mayer, 1993) is that the use of visual aids helps students concentrate better.

Different studies also indicate that teaching vocabulary with visual images is quite effective. Carpenter and Olson (2012), for example, in their study found that students remembered the meaning of words better when they learnt them with pictures rather than using them as independent words. Mayer and Sims (1994) also found that students’ learning was better when teachers used visual and verbal aids simultaneously. According to Richards, Platt and Webber (1985), learners could retain the meaning of words taught by using visual
strategies both for a short and long time. Stokes (2002) in her study investigated the effectiveness of using images to teach lexical items. She came to the conclusion that images helped learners to learn better as they could associate the unknown words with the images. Rokni and Karimi (2013) in their study with two groups of students also came to the similar conclusion. They divided 46 female intermediate students into a control group and an experimental group. The control group was asked to memorize 56 lexical items traditionally while the same number of items was taught to the learners of the experimental group by using visual elements such as images, real things and flash cards. The findings showed that learning of lexical items in the experimental group increased significantly. In addition, the members of the group also perceived the visual strategy to be an effective way of learning vocabulary.

*Guessing meaning from context*

Guessing meaning from context is one of the cognitive strategies that involve “direct mental operations” to work out the meaning of the new lexical items and retaining them in the “mental lexicon” after categorizing them (Hedge, 2000). Harvey and Goudvis (2000) claim cognitive strategies include moves that include:

- connecting existing knowledge and new information found in the text;
- raising questions during reading;
- inferring the writer’s ideas which s/he may not state directly;
- summarizing information; and
- monitoring understanding particularly when ideas are not clear.

There are many ways in which cognitive strategies can be used such as making associations, learning words in clusters, exploring range of meanings, and using key words in which a keyword is selected from the learners’ L1 which is pronounced in the same way as the unknown word in the target language. Lexical inferring or guessing lexical meaning form context is another important strategy that learners use in their attempt to find the meaning when they encounter a word for the first time. This context, in case of vocabulary learning, is defined in a number of ways. Context can be the sentence in which the new word is found or the way in which the vocabulary is presented. Others (e.g. Reed, 2000) define context in terms of the linguistic and the nonlinguistic information that learners get that is linked to the meaning of it when the new word is presented in a particular setting. When the new lexical items are presented in the context, learners can use the linguistic or nonlinguistic cues to decode or predict meaning without having to use any dictionaries (Rogers, 1996).

Guessing meaning form context is generally considered a very useful strategy especially in case of incidental vocabulary learning. Prince (1996) pointed out three major advantages of the guessing lexical meaning from context strategy. First of all, when learners have to guess meaning from context, it makes it imperative for them to develop strategies such as making inferences or anticipations which in turn slowly help them to gain self-reliance that is deemed as necessary for the development of proficiency. Secondly, when students come across new lexical items in context, it is in fact an indication that these are the words really used in a discourse for carrying out communication. Finally, when lexical items are used in context, they give an indication of how the words are used.
Inferring the meaning of a lexical item from its context can aid the retention of meaning, especially when learners decide on the meaning after more careful analysis and the length of retention will depend on the amount of emotional and mental energy invested in the process of working out the meaning (Haastrup, 1989; as cited in Hedge 2000). A number of studies have indicated its value such as the one by Cody and Nation (1988). Fan (2003), in his study on the effectiveness of 58 vocabulary learning strategies, found guessing meaning from context as one of the most widely used and useful strategies.

However, there are also other studies that indicate quite the contrary outcomes. Back, McKeown and McCaslin (1983) pointed out that certain contexts might be deceptive, compelling learners to guess wrong meanings. Mokhtar and Rawian (2012) in their study found out that guessing strategy was preferred by students but it did not help to improve the learners’ English vocabulary knowledge. Folse (2004) in his empirical study came to the conclusion that guessing meaning form context hardly contributed to the learners’ vocabulary learning as it required learners to have the knowledge of a large vocabulary size to help them guess accurately, although this strategy did not interrupt the flow of reading.

RESEARCH QUESTIONS
The objective of this study is to investigate whether the three strategies discussed above are effective for the ESL language learners of the university where the authors teach. In Bangladesh, learners are usually found to be relying heavily on rote memorization. In schools, the Bengali medium students study two subjects in English. In the first subject a book named “English for Today” is used. The book is designed based on the principles of communicative language teaching approach with the main focus in communication practice. While in the second subject, they study grammar books written by local authors. In both the secondary and higher secondary levels, little focus is given to vocabulary instruction. The books do not contain long texts with a range of vocabulary items, nor do they include various strategies for learning vocabulary.

In the tertiary level, these students have to study in the English medium as in most universities at present English is the medium of instruction. These students with poor vocabulary knowledge have to struggle with the numerous new words they encounter everyday while they pursue their higher studies. Their lack of skills in vocabulary learning makes it imperative for them to get acquainted with the vocabulary learning strategies to find out the meaning of the new vocabulary items that they often encounter while reading texts and also to retain their meanings for a long time.

Thus the research questions of this study are:

1. How effective are the visual, rote learning and guessing meaning from context strategies for the short and long term retention of the learnt vocabulary items?
2. Which among these strategies is more effective in case of the tertiary level students of Bangladesh?

METHODOLOGY

Subjects
The subjects of this study were 90 Bangladeshi first year first semester tertiary level students of the university where the authors currently teach. These students who are majoring in
different disciplines including civil engineering, pharmacy, computer science and business administration, were selected by Simple Random Sampling (SRS) method. All these students had passed their higher secondary school certificate examination from different boards of Bangladesh before they were enrolled in the university. The students were both males and females and their age ranged from 17 to 19 years. Although the students were majoring in different subjects, they attended the same placement test for an English Language Proficiency Course (ELPC) and attained the same range of marks. This four-week course is offered to the students as a remedial course and students who achieve less than 50% marks in the placement test need to take a remedial course before they begin their first semester.

These students were further divided into three groups of each consisting of 30 students. These three groups were given three different kinds of treatments explained in the next segment of this paper. One of the researchers carried out the study during the ELPC class hours.

The study instrument
A passage named “A Ship in a Strom” was selected for the study and initially 20 words were selected to prepare a list for the treatment. Before the treatment began, the reliability of the test was checked by giving all the three groups of students the list to find out whether they already knew the words or not. Out of the 20 words, 4 were deleted from the list after the students admitted that they knew the words and the final list contained 16 words.

First experiment for short-term retention
For finding out the comparative effectiveness of the three different vocabulary learning strategies, Group A was given a reading comprehension test entitled “A Ship in a Strom”. They were instructed to read the passage and guess the meaning of the highlighted lexical items. Their answers were discussed later in the classroom and the teacher discussed the meaning of the words they found difficult to guess. An hour later they were instructed to answer 16 multiple choice questions on those words and to tick the correct answers. Their answers were checked and the number of correct answers was calculated. Based on the calculation, the students could remember 46% of the words they guessed from the context.

In Group B, the subjects were presented through multimedia projector the words and their meanings pairing them with images that relate with the meanings of those words (Appendix A). One hour after the presentation their retention of the meanings was tested by giving the subjects 16 multiple choice questions on those words and asking them to tick the correct answers. Their answers were checked and the number of correct answers was calculated. The short term retention rate was found to be 64% in this strategy.

The students of Group C were given the words meaning as a list (Appendix B) and asked to memorize the words without any kind of discussion. Sixteen multiple choice questions on those words were also given to them one hour later and they were asked to tick the correct answers. Their answers were checked and the number of correct answers was calculated. In this experiment, students could remember 51% of the meanings of the words they memorized. Figure 1 shows the results of the short-term retention experiment.
Second experiment for long-term retention

In the second phase of the experiment that took place after one week, the three groups were asked separately to answer the 16 MCQs on the words they had previously learned by using those strategies. In this long term retention experiment, it was revealed that the first group remembered 25% of the vocabulary, second group remembered 53% and the third group remembered 41% of the vocabulary respectively. The data is presented in Figure 2.

It is clearly seen that students’ retention is higher in visual representation of words. In case of short-term retention experiment Group B’s retention rate was 18% higher than that of Group A and 13% higher than that of Group C. Similarly, in the long-term retention experiment, the retention rate of Group B was 28% higher than Group A and 12% higher than Group C.
DISCUSSION
This study provides further strength to the claim that different strategies differ in their effectiveness in different contexts. In line with the outcomes of the previous literature (Richards et al. 1985), the study puts further claims to the fact that learners are able to retain the meaning of new vocabulary items learnt with the help of visual aids both after short and long time intervals. When learners associated meaning with a visual image, the memory traces became more permanent. When learners engaged in rote memorization, on the other hand, they performed moderately well. Several reasons may have contributed to this result. First of all, these students are used to an education system (i.e. the Bangladeshi education system) that makes learners rely heavily on memorization. Students are quite adaptive to this “traditional” way of learning vocabulary. As mentioned by Barcroft (2009), Hummel (2010), and Li (2005) in their studies, learners might still hold very positive views on the rote learning strategy. Their positive attitude towards this strategy might have helped them to use it effectively.

In case of guessing meaning form contexts, however, it was found to be of little effect both in the case of short term and long term retention of meaning. There are several possible reasons why guessing meaning of unknown words form context had such a poor outcome. It is an undeniable fact that this is one of the most widely used strategies for the L1 learners for learning vocabulary incidentally. Native speakers not only possess quite impressive vocabulary knowledge but also get repeated encounters to those words as they are always exposed to the language input in natural settings. Second language learners, in contrast, are denied these repeated exposures to new lexical items over time and in a wide variety of contexts (Martin, 1984). Thus, this study, in line with Folse’s (2004) claim, reveals that merely depending on context clues may not turn to be an effective vocabulary learning strategy particularly in case of learners with low proficiency level.

IMPLICATIONS FOR THE CLASSROOM
Although the study was applied to a limited number of students all belonging to the same university, it nonetheless has strong implications for the language classrooms including the following:

- In cases when learners depend on memorizing words from a list, teachers need to introduce and use vocabulary learning strategies to motivate learners to work with word meanings and to retain the knowledge for a long time.
- Teachers can develop materials by using visual images with the help of the internet. Although it is difficult to find images of abstract concept, there are thousands of websites that contain a wide variety of usable images.
- Teachers also need to train the learners the skills required to guess meanings from context as this strategy is important to develop the fluency of reading.

CONCLUSION
Vocabulary is a key factor when learning a second or a foreign language and it is important for classroom instructors to understand which vocabulary strategies will work best for the particular group of learners they are teaching. Language instructors undoubtedly need various VLSs as arsenals to enhance the reading, writing, listening and speaking skills of the learners and also to equip them with the means to learn independently out of the classroom.
comparative study on the effectiveness of the three vocabulary learning strategies can be promising for second language instructors, especially in the context of Bangladesh to decide on which VLS to select when teaching a particular group of learners. Despite its limitations, the study can pave the way for new research in different contexts.

REFERENCES


Bird, P. Falvey, A. Tsui, D. Allison, & A. McNeill (Eds.), *Language and learning* (pp. 376-401). Hong Kong: The Education Department.


The Editorial Board of the Journal of Language and Communication wishes to thank the following:

Lee, Jackie Fung King  
*University of Hong Kong*

Jariah Mohd Jan  
*University of Malaya*

Kiranjit Kaur  
*Universiti Teknologi Mara*

Mohd Hilmi Hamzah  
*Universiti Utara Malaysia*

Chiew Poh Shin  
*University of Malaya*

Ting Su Hie  
*University Malaya Sarawak*

Vahid Nimechisalem  
*Universiti Putra Malaysia*

Helen Tan  
*Universiti Putra Malaysia*

Hardev Kaur  
*Universiti Putra Malaysia*

Chan Mei Yuit  
*Universiti Putra Malaysia*

Siti Nurbaya Mohd Nor  
*University of Malaya*

Shadrach Idi  
*Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka, Anambra State Nigeria.*

Ang Lay Hoon  
*Universiti Putra Malaysia*

Pramela Krish  
*Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia*

Hazita Azman  
*Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia*

Mohammed Nasser  
*Wasit University, Iraq*

Manjet Kaur Mehar Singh  
*Universiti Sains Malaysia*

Mohd Muzhafar Idrus  
*Islamic Science University of Malaysia*