EDITORIAL BOARD

Chief Editor : Rosli Talif

Universiti Putra Malaysia

Editors : Ain Nadzimah Abdullah

Universiti Putra Malaysia

Jariah Mohd Jan

Universiti Malaya

Kiranjit Kaur

Universiti Teknologi Mara

Rohimmi Noor

Universiti Putra Malaysia

SaharjiaMd Rashid

Universiti Putra Malaysia

Shamala Paramasivam

Universiti Putra Malaysia

Ting Su Hie

Universiti Malaysia Sarawak

Zalina Mohd Kasim

Universiti Putra Malaysia

Associate Editors :

Arbaayah Ali Termizi

Universiti Putra Malaysia

Lin Siew Eng

Universiti Sains Malaysia

Carol Leon

Universiti Malaya

Mohd Nizam Osman

Universiti Putra Malaysia

Chan Mei Yuit

Universiti Putra Malaysia

Shakila Abdul Manan

G. Samigorganroodi

Universiti Sains Malaysia

Fanshawe College, London

Vahid Nimehchisalem

Hamisah Hassan

Universiti Putra Malaysia

Universiti Putra Malaysia

Yong Mei Fung

Universiti Putra Malaysia

Ida Baizura Bahar

Universiti Putra Malaysia

Universiti Putra Malaysia
INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY BOARD

Alireza Jalilifar  
_Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz, Iran_

Cynthia White  
_Massey University, New Zealand_

Glen Cameron  
_University of Missouri, USA_

James Dean Brown  
_University of Hawaii at Manoa, USA_

Martin Cortazzi  
_University of Leicester, UK_

Thomas Ricento  
_University of Calgary, Canada_

Editorial Office

Journal Publication Office  
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication  
Universiti Putra Malaysia, 43400 Serdang, Selangor, Malaysia  
Tel: +603-8946 8809  
jlc@upm.edu.my

Publisher

The UPM Press  
Universiti Putra Malaysia  
43400 UPM Serdang, Selangor, Malaysia  
Tel: +603 8946 8855, 8946 8854  
Fax: +603 8941 6172  
penerbit@putra.upm.edu.my  
URL: http://penerbit.upm.edu.my

The publisher of Journal of Language and Communication will not be responsible for the statement made by the authors in any articles published in the journal. Under no circumstances will the publisher of this publication be liable for any loss or damage caused by reliance on the advice, opinion or information obtained either explicitly or implied through the contents of this publication.

All rights of reproduction are reserved in respect of all papers, articles, illustrations, etc., published in the Journal of Language and Communication. All materials published in this journal are protected by copyright, which covers exclusive rights to reproduce and distribute the materials. Materials published in the Journal of Language and Communication cannot be reproduced or stored in electronic, optical or magnetic form without the written consent of the publisher.

Copyright © 2018 Universiti Putra Malaysia Press. All rights reserved
Contents

THE FUNCTIONS OF COMMUNICATION STRATEGIES: AN ANALYSIS OF CHINESE EFL LEARNERS’ TRANSACTIONAL PRACTICE
Isai Amutan Krishnan, Selva Jothi Ramalingam, Hee Sio Ching and Elanttamil Maruthai
151

AN INTERTEXTUAL ANALYSIS OF SEX-TRAFFICKING VICTIMS’ REPRESENTATION IN MALAYSIAN NEWS MEDIA
Puspalata Suppiah and Surinderpal Kaur
161

THE ‘MEANING MAKING’ OF PROBLEM-BASED LEARNING (PBL): THE LEARNERS’ PERSPECTIVE
Suraini Mohd Ali
173

PYRAMID OF ARGUMENTATION: TOWARDS AN INTEGRATED MODEL FOR TEACHING AND ASSESSING ESL WRITING
Vahid Nimehchisalem
185

ARCHETYPAL MYTH: GODDESS DURGA AND THE RESILIENT MATRIARCH IN RANI MANICKA’S THE RICE MOTHER
Muhamad Lothfi Zamri and Zainor Izat Zainal
201

REPAIR INITIATION STRATEGIES IN EVERYDAY INTERACTION BY SPEAKERS OF MALAY LANGUAGE
Jariah Mohd Jan and Mohammad Azannee Saad
211

THE ROLE OF SOCIAL MEDIA AND COMPUTATIONAL PROPAGANDA IN POLITICAL CAMPAIGN COMMUNICATION
Oberiri Destiny Apuke
225

Nuurzahirah Ali and Aimillia Mohd Ramli
251

REPRESENTATION OF MEANING INIDIOMS IN SAN GUA YAN YI AND THEIR TRANSLATION IN THREE KINGDOMS
Yap Ngee Thai and Khoo Yen Loo
263

AT ODDS WITH EACH OTHER: DEVELOPMENT AND ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY IN CECIL RAJENDRA’S SELECTED POEMS
Suhada Fadzil and Zainor Izat Zainal
283
THE FUNCTIONS OF COMMUNICATION STRATEGIES: AN ANALYSIS OF CHINESE EFL LEARNERS’ TRANSACTIONAL PRACTICE

Isai Amuthan Krishnan¹, Selva Jothi Ramalingam², Hee Sio Ching³ and Elanttamil Maruthai⁴

Faculty of Languages and Linguistics, University of Malaya, 50603 Kuala Lumpur
e-mail: amuthan.isai@gmail.com ; selvajothi29@gmail.com ; ansiehee@hotmail.com ; elanttamil@um.edu.my

ABSTRACT
Since speaking is one of the most difficult skills for Chinese EFL learners to manage, mastering the skills to communicate effectively in a L2 context has attracted the attention of many researchers. There were number of studies conducted on communicative strategies, however less attention was given in analysing EFL learners on transactional practice on communicative strategies. Therefore, this study aims to analyse upper-intermediate Chinese EFL learners’ communication strategies in a transactional context so as to investigate the appropriate functions of communication strategies, utilising the qualitative method (Jackson, 2011 & Creswell, 2014). Data was collected from a pair of Chinese master students in one the higher learning institutions through audio-recording, pair discussion and stimulated recall interview. It was found that the participants appeared to be lack of sufficient knowledge about communication strategies prior to the study. The findings also reveal there was an improvement in the participants’ communication strategies; conveying meaning, ensure language accuracy (self-repair and others repair), and to keep conversation going. Since oral communication is the most commonly used means of communication, ‘to convey meaning’ is the most effective and quickest method of sending and receiving messages.

Keywords: communication strategy; functions; pair discussion; oral communication; recall; interview.

INTRODUCTION
For most English language learners, the primary reason for learning English is to communicate effectively, and consequently improve their chances in further education and employment. There are two main types of communication: verbal and non-verbal (Ross & Arthur, 2002), with oral communication being the most effective communicator. Numerous studies have been undertaken to improve communication effectiveness among English learners. Cohen, Weaver and Li (1998) and Dornyei (1995) believe that communication strategies can strengthen learners’ communicative competence through frequent practice. Thus, from early 1970s, researchers, like Selinker (1972) first put forward the concept “strategies of second-language communication” (p. 229) for the purpose of dealing with speaking errors caused by language learners’ inter-language in L2 context. Therefore, when interlocutors try to use a target language to convey their meaning, there exists a gap between L1 and L2, and one method to overcome this weakness is by employing communication strategies. Similarly, Canale and Swain (1980) coined the term ‘communication competence’ to define language learners’ strategies in choosing appropriate utterances grammatically and socially. One of the definitions of Communication strategies accepted widely is attributed to
Faerch and Kasper (1983). “Communication strategies are possibly deliberate approaches for overcoming issues an individual considers to be an obstacle in arriving at a precise target” (Faerch and Kasper, 1983, p. 36). Tarone (1980, p. 420) and Dornyei and Scott, (1997, p. 179), have also stated that communication strategies work as meaning negotiation mechanisms, “communication strategies relate to a mutual attempt of interlocutors to agree on a meaning in situations where requisite meaning structures do not seem to be shared and general problem-solving mechanisms in L2 communication, “every potentially intentional attempt to cope with any language related problems of which the speaker is aware during the course of communication”.

Evidently, different researchers may view the same phenomenon in a different perspective as this is the nature of research work (Otha, 2005). Previous studies focused mainly on identifying and classifying communication strategies. However, subsequent researches have broadened the range of communication strategies into a specific context that investigated communication strategies employed by Chinese EFL learners, such as Chen (1990) and Huang and Naerssen (1987). Moreover, Teng’s (2012) study successfully combined communication strategies with pedagogical perspective in the EFL classroom context. Nevertheless, a gap has been found in the functions of different communication strategies employed by Chinese EFL learners. Hence, this study aims to investigate further the possible communication strategies employed by Chinese EFL learners in a transactional practice as well as the functions of communication strategies employed by Chinese EFL learners in a transactional practice.

LITERATURE REVIEW
Communication strategies’ functions have not been given sufficient emphasis or attention among language researchers for the past forty years until Ellis (2008) elicited one function of communication strategies to improve learners’ lexical defect. However, adequate knowledge of the functions of communication strategies can provide ample insights into learners’ ability regarding how to overcome their communicative deficiencies in L2 oral communication. This was a suggestion stated by Tarone (1979) implying that communication strategies can be split into two aspects which are; learning strategies, “an attempt to develop linguistic and sociolinguistic competence in the target language’, and production strategies, “an attempt to use one’s linguistic system efficiently and clearly, with a minimum of effort”. There are three types of speech: interactions, transactions and performances (2008). Interaction speech focuses on interlocutors’ social needs, while transaction speech looks for information provided by the interlocutors. Likewise, Brown & Yule (1983) defined interactional and transactional as the two main functions in oral communication. In an interactional discourse, interlocutors attempt to follow a line of speech to create social relationship while transactional discourse obtains messages. This interactional perspective would permit the addition of various repair mechanisms, which Tarone considered as communication strategies if their purpose was “to clarify intended meaning rather than simply correct linguistic form” (1980, p. 424). There are a number of research approaches to communication strategies, for instance, House (2003) and Kasper & Kellerman (1997) considered two main strategies: psycholinguistic and interactional. Nevertheless, their strategies were viewed negatively for excluding the other interlocutors’ performances in the oral communication. Tarone’s (1980) approach, on the other hand, focused on ‘both areas of interaction’: “Link to a reciprocal effort of two speakers to concur on a definition in instances where required
denotation frameworks do not appear to be shared” (p. 420). Overall, nearly every approach of communication strategies is more inclined to transactional function rather than interactional in L2 oral communication (Aston, 1993) resulting in few academic papers available for research purposes. Since scant research has been done on functional approaches to communication strategies, this study focuses on the functions of communication strategies conducted by Chinese EFL learners in a transactional practice.

**METHODOLOGY**

A qualitative method (Jackson, 2012 & Creswell, 2014) was utilized in this study. Communication strategies are seen as a ‘tool’ to fix the ‘interruptions’ in the process of transactional practice. As a consequence of the participants having had little knowledge about communication strategies before commencement of the study, the results appear more authentic and reliable. One of the limitations of this pilot study was small sample size and the application of Opportunism (Holliday, 2007) Strategy became necessary in selecting the participants because of time constraints and difficulty in collecting data from Chinese learners abroad.

**Participants**

In order to avoid unnecessary problems caused by interlocutors’ inadequate English proficiency, five master’s students who are both majored in English were selected from the University of Malaya. These Chinese international students needed to achieve at least band 6 in IELTS (International English Language Testing System) in order pursue their master’s degree in the UM.

Students aged between 23-30 were selected and respectively with the former males achieving band 6.5 while the latter females attained band 7 in IELTS. The male students were in their second semester, and the female students were still in their first semester. They expressed their interest and consented to be part of the study, after the author provided them with a comprehensive explanation regarding the study.

**Instruments**

Pair discussion and stimulated recall interviews were both employed as the main instruments in data collection (see Table 1). However, a greater reliability can be attached to the latter because of the one-to-one nature of examining the participants’ perspectives based on their performances.

Data obtained was based on topics selected by the interlocutors themselves depending on their interests. However, since it was going to be a transactional practice focused on conveying message (Jack, 2008), the social context is secondary to this study. Data was collected through audio-recording their pair discussion and also recall interviews. In a stimulated recall interview, researchers recorded participants’ responses to questions about their recently completed tasks by playing back the tape and interrupting it when the participants wished to comment or provide additional data. In general, the researchers required them to describe problems and difficulties they encountered in the oral communication process and how they addressed them. Lam (2006) applied this method in her study and considered that the recall interview ‘effective’ as it went beyond just a cursory examination into an in-depth study of the oral communication process.
RESULTS AND DISCUSSION
The difficulties encountered by the participants’ during oral communication were transcribed by the researcher. In order to access the communication strategies of participants, the researcher employed the inventory of strategic language (Dornyei, Zoltan, Scott, Mary &2007). Table 2 shows Communication strategies used by the participants.

Table 2: Communication strategies used by the participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Clarification request</td>
<td>Requesting for more explanation, clarification or repetition to solve a comprehension problems.</td>
<td><em>What do you mean by...? What?</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Confirmation request</td>
<td>Asking the speaker to confirm whether the heard or understood utterance is correct or not</td>
<td>Using ‘question repeat’ or questions like ‘You mean...?’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Interpretive summary</td>
<td>Paraphrasing the interlocutor’s message to check if they understood it correctly or not</td>
<td><em>Yan: so, after graduation, they got married and then had a baby a year after...</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Expressing non-understanding</td>
<td>Expressing that the interlocutor does not understand properly what was going on in the communication</td>
<td><em>I didn’t get that.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Requesting help</td>
<td>Requesting assistance from other partners when they are faced with a deficiency in self-expression</td>
<td><em>How to say that...</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Repairing</td>
<td>Repairing self or other errors in oral performance</td>
<td><em>At that time, he is about ... She is about 27 years old...</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Use of fillers</td>
<td>Using gambits words and phrases to fill pauses and to gain time in order to keep the conversation open</td>
<td><em>You know, see, ok, well, um</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Communicative Strategies (Dornyei & Scott’s inventory, 1997)

As for ascertaining the functions of Communication strategies that participants used in this study, Ohta’s (2005) methods of ‘turn’ analysis was employed in the recall interview with questions focused on the following three turns in their conversation:

“(1) the initial turn which contains the utterance creating the problem in communication; (2) the turn containing the signal of strategy usage; (3) the turn containing the response to overcome the problem” (p.388)

Language is basically sounds or utterances that convey meaning. It is a means or tool for communicating thoughts or messages from one person to another. Various types of conversations are used in different ways for different purposes such as conversation between individuals and groups, sending message to a large group (audience), instructing, and conveying of knowledge (teaching). Without verbal communication that convey precise meaning that is understood by the receiver (listener), civilization as we know it and advances
in science, technology, commerce and education could not have been achieved. Therefore, the application of communication in strategic ways is vital to convey the intended message and avoid miscommunication. The use of communication strategy is explained further in selected extracts 1 through 7.

**To convey meanings**
The clarification request strategy is used when users want to get more information and explanation about an ambiguous utterance as shown in extract 1 below:

**Extract 1:**

David: Let’s choose some aspects of marriage.

Anne: What?

David: I want to talk about responsibilities in the marriage.

(* David and Anne are nicknames of the two participants)

In the above example, Anne seeks further clarification from the interlocutor regarding the topic for discussion. In the initial turn (*some aspects of marriage*), the listener’s reply indicates lack of comprehension of the utterance, and thus can be regarded as problematic utterance in oral communication. In the third turn, therefore, David explains his intention and is more specific about the topic to be discussed. In their recall interview, Anne explained why she raised the question: Sophie *: So why did you raise the question? Anne: Because I didn’t fully understand his suggestion. I wanted to know more (information) about it. (* Sophie is the nickname of the researcher). The findings from extract 1 echoes with Tarone’s (1980) statement that phrases are considered Communication strategies once their intention was “to clarify intended meaning” as was the case in Anne’s speech act of asking a question. Furthermore, the interpretative summary strategy was occasionally employed to facilitate interlocutor’s understanding as shown in extract 2 below:

**Extract 2:**

David: I would like to take an example of a friend of mine.

Anne: Yes?

David: When graduation, when (she) graduated in 2006, she, she married quickly, and a year after, 2007, baby’s coming...

Anne: oh, really, you mean that after graduation, she got married and then she got a baby a year after, right?

David: yeah!

Extract 2 indicates that this strategy is employed to ascertain that listeners grasped the correct meanings. Also, this strategy facilitates transfer of meaning in L2 communication. Occasionally, the requesting help strategy can assist users to convey their meanings successfully so as to ensure messages given and received are clearly understood by both
interlocutors.

**Extract 3:**

Anne: At that time, I mean when they get older enough, and they get financially, um, **how to say that? Oh, they got enough money**...

Extract 3 indicates, Anne’s attempt to describe a situation. However, because of inadequate vocabulary, she struggles to find the appropriate words, and expressions to convey her message. Ultimately, she directs a question seeking help to complete her utterance. In this example, she partly answers the question herself. Sometimes, confirmation request is used where users will repeat words, phrases or ask questions to confirm meaning. Extract 4 below is a sample of confirmation request. The data in Extract 3 rings with Tarone’s (1979) study that speakers make use of production strategies, attempts at using one’s current linguistic system as efficiently as possible as Anne demonstrates in explaining her idea through lexical items and phrases that she understands.

**Extract 4:**

David: she thinks it’s enough, because she has finished the **core responsibility**.

Anne: so **you mean that** for your friend, the mean responsibility is to give birth to baby, and raise the baby...

In David’s first turn (**core responsibility**), Anne is rather unsure of the meaning of his statement. As a result, Anne attempts to clarify and assure herself the meaning of ‘core responsibility’ in this instance.

**To ensure language accuracy**

Repairing strategy is often used by interlocutors to make the utterance accurate when transferring meanings. However, there is a difference between repaired by speakers themselves and repaired by other interlocutors, as shown in extract 5 below:

**Extract 5:**

David: My friend found a job, at that time, he is about...

Anne: She is about...

David: twenty-seven years old.

Extract 5, one participant initiates the conversation while the other repairs errors in the communication. There is also an element of self-repairing going on (twenty-seven years old). However, these repair strategies are more focused on language accuracy rather than conveying meaning.

**To keep conversation going**

The use of fillers to avoid long pauses and keep momentum in conversations, speeches, announcements and other oral events is a common strategy adopted by interlocutors. Fillers
come about when speakers need time to figure out correct grammar, recall words or subject matter, and the common utterances used as fillers are well; see; you know; and I mean... Extract 6 below is an example of a filler:

Extract 6:

Anne: you see… when two lovers are in a relationship...

There are multiple examples similar to the one described above in oral communication in extract 6. Nevertheless, there are instances in a conversation where meaning is not grasped fully by one or both interlocutors. The party concerned expressed immediately express this difficulty to avoid confusion as the example below shows:

Extract 7:

David: it sounds discriminative? for the women’s rights.

Anne: dis.. discri ? What do you mean? I didn’t get it.

David: For woman, they have a lot more restrictions than men...

In extract 7, because of the word ‘discriminative’ is mispronounced, Anne appears to have not understood and appears confused. She indicates this problem to David, who then provides a clear explanation of his earlier statement, so as to keep the conversation on course.

IMPLICATION OF THE STUDY

As the participants, whom comprise of Chinese EFL learners, have successfully improved in both their understanding as well as proficiency in using communication strategies, this study may aid in teaching communication strategies in language, particularly English, as a foreign language. The participants partook in this study being informed and given a chance to reflect on their own proficiency in communication strategies, allowing them to improve as well as continue their conversations with ease. Therefore, EFL learners may benefit well from the outcome of this study as it shows that the participants have shared meaning of lexical items and overcome issues of expressing ideas as interlocutors through interacting with each other and the interviewer.

CONCLUSION

For Chinese EFL learners, one of the deficiencies in learning English is speaking effectively. Although there could be many factors which may be causing the deficiencies, the lack of communication strategies could be a very important one. This study provides a brief but important insight about issues regarding Chinese upper-intermediate EFL learners’ communication strategies usage and their problems when conducting an oral communication. It may provide teachers with some pedagogical input on teaching spoken English. The study also indicates that learning English by practicing oral communication could lead to effective communication by students. A suggestion for further studies is to create and include a larger pool of data through mixing together weaker EFL learners with more proficient EFL learners within a conversation, then creating another conversation with all weak EFL learners and all more proficient EFL learners in separate conversations. Through this method, the improvement and usage of communication strategies will be even more apparent in the data.
REFERENCES


AN INTERTEXTUAL ANALYSIS OF SEX-TRAFFICKING VICTIMS’ REPRESENTATION IN MALAYSIAN NEWS MEDIA

Puspalata C. Suppiah,* and Surinderpal Kaur
Faculty of Languages and Linguistic
University of Malaya, 50603 Kuala Lumpur
e-mail: puspa_ts@yahoo.com; surinder@um.edu.my

ABSTRACT
The objective of this study was to conduct an intertextual analysis of sex-trafficking victims’ representation in Malaysian news media. More specifically, the study applies critical discourse analysis as a tool to explore the different social actors’ voices and analyse how they are woven together textually or recontextualised to reproduce the underlying power and ideologies of the media on this social group. This study is based on media texts and the data is obtained from mainstream English-language newspapers, The Star and New Straits Times. Grounded in CDA, the selected articles are examined using Reisigl and Wodak’s (2009) discourse-historical approach and van Leeuwen’s (1996, 2008) socio-semantic categories of social actors to investigate how discursive strategies and other features of texts are employed intertextually to construct particular meaning about victims of sex trafficking. The analysis of newspaper excerpts have led to the representation of sex-trafficking victims as threats, sex offenders, and foreign invaders. Additionally, findings from the intertextual analysis reveal that certain voices have been given more emphasis by the news media while some voices are markedly silenced in order to privilege others.

Keywords: sex trafficking, intertextuality, critical discourse analysis, discourse-historical approach, socio-semantic categories of social actors

INTRODUCTION
Trafficking of people for sexual exploitation is a serious issue and a violation of human rights, and the increase of slavery in the past decades has raised major concerns among policymakers and legislators around the globe. Although the number of sex-trafficking cases in Malaysia is comparatively smaller than in bordering countries, the impact on victims and the country’s state defence is inconceivable. Exact statistics concerning the crime are difficult to obtain largely because of its surreptitious nature and few trafficked victims being willing to step forward to report their cases. As a result of its complexity, sex trafficking continues to profusely operate underground resulting in more and more women being forced into sexual slavery.

Interchangeable use of the terms sex trafficking and prostitution has significant concern for victims of trafficking. When a woman is recognised as a trafficked victim, more resources will be available for helping her, but when the victim is labelled a prostitute, she loses access to justice and is therefore subject to discrimination and criminalisation. This may lead to victim blaming, assigning them derogatory labels and classifying them as criminals. At present, Malaysia does not have any specific law that addresses sex trafficking or that recognizes trafficked men or women as victims despite the prohibition of sexual slavery stated in Malaysian Constitution. The international human trafficking law is used as the
primary guiding framework by most countries across the world. Because of its inclusive doctrines and guidelines, the Malaysian government has implemented most of the guidelines delineated in the international law in their Anti-Trafficking in Persons and Smuggling of Migrants Act 2007 (ATIPSOM). Therefore, this law is referred to as the main guiding policy for all legislative offences related to sex trafficking.

**LITERATURE REVIEW**

Although modern-day slavery has gained intense publicity over the years, the Malaysian community understands little about the lives of the thousands of innocent women deceived into this hidden trade. As an essential platform for the construction of ideology, the Malaysian government uses the media to inform the public about sex trafficking since the media is able to reach a large audience. Pang (2006, p. 72) noted that the Malaysian media follows the “development journalism” model (Taylor & Kent, 1999, p. 138), a system where the media openly practice pro-government policy to help build the nation. The Malaysian government controls all information circulated by the media through its media laws and concentrated media ownership (Wok & Mohamed, 2017, p. 46). Any disparaging news or political discussions that are critical of the Malaysian government are restricted by media laws, for example, the Printing Presses and Publications Act (1948), Official Secrets Act (1972), Broadcasting Act (1987), and Internal Security Act (1960). With different media laws that impede the public’s freedom of speech, there are possibilities of only one-sided news being presented to readers because the Malaysian newspapers are politicised and overshadowed by “dominant” parties. When the reported story is biased, readers are likely to formulate their own interpretation according to what is written because readers are unaware of the reality that the content of the news had been manipulated. Although just small segments of sex-trafficking occurrences are depicted in the Malaysian media, the media’s capability to influence readers’ beliefs and policies is indisputable. Boots and Heide (2006, p. 435) have argued that “the public draws conclusions from cases about which they become familiar [and] legislators, similar to their constituents, often formulate policy on what they know about a phenomenon, particularly when it is one that inflames passion”. This is likely to be particularly true with regard to sex-trafficking news.

While it is not possible to ensure the veracity of media coverage at all times, the fact that newspaper reporting is often inclined toward horrendous and sensational crime stories (Ericson, 1995; Jewkes, 2004) is fundamental to this research. Given the ability of media texts to shape public debate on sex trafficking, a critical investigation of texts is necessary to unpack deeply embedded ideologies that are often taken to be part of the collective psyche of a community. Research about sex trafficking has been carried out extensively at the global level (Doezema, 2010; Hughes, 2000; Jyrkinen, 2009; Malarek, 2011; Weitzer, 2007; Zimmerman et.al, 2006). Most of the studies have examined the root causes of the crime, legal frameworks and vulnerability of the victims. Within the Malaysian context, literature on sex trafficking is remarkably absent. Nur Ibtisam (2014) and Othman (2006) for instance, have conducted research about human trafficking in the country, while Leng, Khan, and Rahim (2014) investigated the danger of using Information Communication Technology (ICT) as a tool in the trafficking of women for sexual exploitation. However, thorough CDA research examining the representation of sex-trafficking victims in the media particularly from a linguistic perspective is lacking. Such investigation is important as it helps to reveal particular views about the social actors in the Malaysian media texts. A critical analysis of
media texts can also indicate whether the Malaysian media constructs the dominant social actors (in-groups) and sex-trafficking individuals (out-groups) either favourably or unfavourably and tease out the media’s hidden ideologies.

**CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS**

As a problem-oriented interdisciplinary research, CDA employs a variety of approaches, theoretical models and research methods (Fairclough, Mulderrig & Wodak, 2011) unlike some forms of discourse-based studies. In keeping with its interdisciplinary or eclectic nature, in this study, Reisigl and Wodak’s (2009) discourse-historical approach (DHA) is used in combination with van Leeuwen’s (1996, 2008) socio-semantic categories of social actors to address “social discrimination” (Meyer, 2001, p. 15) problems that exist among the marginalised sex-trafficking individuals.

Both van Leeuwen’s socio-semantic model of representing social actors and Wodak’s referential and predication strategies originating within the DHA, complement each other perfectly in analysing the way social actors are represented in texts hence these frameworks aptly fit into this research. The referential strategies are intended to answer Wodak and Reisigl’s (2003, p. 385) question: “How are social actors labelled and referred linguistically?” while the predication strategies answer the question: “Which traits, characteristics, qualities and features are attributed to them?”. DHA also takes into account the elements of intertextuality in discourse (Reisigl & Wodak, 2009). In this study, intertextuality is analysed to examine the different social actors’ voices in texts. Texts do not exist in isolation but in relation to previous and predicted discourses. The practice of referencing and using the resources provided by earlier writers is an essential aspect of intertextuality. Reisigl and Wodak (2009, p. 90) stated that when the decontextualised text (taking an element from one context) is discretely included in another text (recontextualisation), the inserted element can acquire new meanings. Bazerman (2004, p. 94) indicated that examining intertextuality is important because “intertextuality is not just a matter of which other texts you refer to, but how you use them, what you use them for, and ultimately how you position yourself as a writer to them to make your own statement”.

**METHODOLOGY**

Data used in this study were obtained as part of a larger project on the discursive representations of sex workers in Malaysia from selected online mainstream Malaysian English-language newspapers (The Star and New Straits Times) which include a corpus of news reports gathered within a timeframe of six and a half years (2010–mid-2016). Both are leading English-language newspapers in the country and have a huge online readership and are considered an important source of information for most Malaysian readers. For the purpose of this study, only selected news excerpts about sex-trafficking victims were chosen for the purpose of demonstrating intertextual analysis. The articles cover issues about foreign women who have been trafficked (e.g., coercion, abduction, fraud) for sexual purposes. Although the small sample size according to van Leeuwen (2009, p. 146) may “not provide enough evidence for reconstructing a discourse, [but they] can of course be used for methodological demonstration” to demonstrate how linguistic tools can be employed to analyse texts from a critical perspective as performed in this study.
Method of analysis
The selected news reports were initially studied for common themes that surfaced across the data. The themes were clustered and the very salient themes were selected for analysis. Social actors who represent the in-group (e.g. enforcement officers, political figures) and out-group (sex offenders) in each newspaper excerpt were examined to identify how DHA’s referential and predication strategies were used and how certain voices were inserted (intertextuality) to invoke some discourses and disregard others to achieve intended goals. The linguistic devices used within the referential strategy include pronouns and derogatory nouns associated with social actors. On the other hand, the predicational strategies “aim at labelling social actors either positively or negatively, deprecatorily or appreciatively” (Wodak & Reisigl, 2003, p. 386) realized generally through adjectives and adjectival phrases. According to Wodak and Reisigl, “some of the referential strategies can be considered to be specific forms of predicational strategies, because the pure referential identification very often already involves a denotatively or connotatively depreciatory or appreciative labelling of the social actors” (2003, p. 386).

Additionally, intertextual analysis is performed to find out how the recontextualised voices and authorial accounts are intertwined in texts to present a particular viewpoint through the use of quotation, explicit reference (Swales, 1990). Intertextual analysis enables readers to identify the inclusion and exclusion of certain voices directly or indirectly and why certain voices are more significant than others. The selected newspaper excerpts were analysed to find out how the dominant and powerful actors’ voices were inserted in the texts to represent the sex-trafficking victims. The views and opinions of the influential social actors not only show their status quo in society but also the ideological positioning of the mainstream media.

ANALYSIS AND RESULTS
In this section, selected excerpts from The Star and New Straits Times are discussed based on three salient themes that emerged across the data: victims as threats, sex offenders, and foreign invaders.

Victims as threats
Media reporting about sex-trafficking victims generally presents them as a social threat to the country as a result of an increased number of social issues. The narrative extracted from The Star, July 12, 2011 indicates that the impact that these women have on society is undesirable. The news article (Extract A) shows the intertextual relations between two unidentified agents’ voices, the news writer’s account and the recontextualised ascribed voice of the group spokesman whose identity is unspecified. The agents’ voices are mostly indicated in direct discourse, suggesting the presence of some level of recontextualisation. The authorial account in Sentence 1 reports that the problem with prostitution in the country is on the rise (ever increasing) and the government needs to investigate this issue on a serious note. Meanwhile, the attributed voice of the group spokesman explains that the illegal underground trade leaves a profound effect on society. This can be seen in Sentence 2 where the women were blamed and constructed in a negative light as being responsible for the “domino effect” and “economic effect”, a representation that gives them an unfavourable slant.
**Extract A**

(1) More than 50 women gathered at a closed-door meeting on Sunday night to appeal to the government to seriously look into the issue of prostitution, which they claimed was “ever increasing”. (2) “The domino effect it [prostitution] has on the society is huge – the health risk, the family well-being and economic effect it has on the society,” said a group spokesman who requested anonymity, for fear of harassment from gangsters allegedly involved in bringing in some of the foreign women for flesh trade here. (3) “We appeal to the government and leaders in Sarawak to take this matter seriously and not to close one eye to it and hope that everything is fine.” (4) “From flesh trade they can afford to buy condominium units and apartments in China. (5) See how much money they took from us? (6) Not to mention the health risks they could give to a client and his family,”

*Source: Address prostitution issue immediately, pleads group of concerned women, The Star, 12 July, 2011*

The attributed voice of the group spokesman in Sentence 2 creates a solid message to the readership indicating that those involved in prostitution are a threat to the nation in terms of health risks, family well-being, and economics. The direct quotation in Sentence 3 shows the seriousness of the issue where the group spokesman has pleaded to the Sarawak government and leaders to take immediate action to address the problem in the state. The recontextualised voice of the unknown speaker (group spokesman) in Sentences 2–6 create a deep impact as the direct quotes or actual words employed in the news article could change the way society views the women in sex work because it is through the media that readers obtain information that they believe to be truthful. Interestingly, when the focus of the news shifts toward the “client” in Sentence 6, the actor is represented in the passive voice as the recipient of the health risks.

Here, the media activates the women in sex work as perpetrators for their illicit actions. As a result, they are subject to legal penalties while the consumer of the service is portrayed as the innocent recipient of the action rather than as a villain. This dichotomy is particularly important in the representation of trafficked victims as it reveals the attitudes and ideologies of the text producers. Being a Muslim nation where prostitution is viewed illegal, prostituted women are negatively constructed and contribute to the bad reputation of the country (Nasir et al., 2010). Women involved in sex work are criminalised for prostitution, without acknowledging that these women could be victims of sex trafficking. When law considers victims of sex trafficking as being the same as prostitutes, genuine victims are at a disadvantage because they will be deprived of the resources and provisions they deserve.

In Extract B, the journalist’s voice is intertextually textured with the voice of Malacca City Councillor, Datuk K. Basil. The media gives authority to the voice of prominent social actors whose narratives are indicated in direct quote as can be seen in Sentences 2, 4, and 6. The direct quotations are taken as a source of evidence to blame the women for being responsible for smearing the image of the city as a popular tourist destination. This can be seen through wording such as “is taking place right in the heart of the city” (Sentence 3), “This is disgraceful for Malacca. We have to shoo away the prostitutes” (Sentence 6).

**Extract B**

(1) MALACCA: Let Jalan Hang Tuah be known as a popular tourism stretch, not as a hooker street, an angry Datuk K. Basil said. (2) “Prostitution has been around for sometime in the
back alleys of the street, but no measures were taken to stop it,” the city councillor told The Star after raising a storm during the Malacca Historic City Council meeting here yesterday. (3) He had raised a motion to wipe out the vice trade that “is taking place right in the heart of the city”, saying there were complaints about the authorities' inaction. (4) “Jalan Hang Tuah without the prostitutes would probably be the best New Year gift for the locals,” said Basil. (5) He said a thriving prostitute hub could smear the city's image as a popular tourist destination. (6) “This is disgraceful for Malacca. We have to shoo away the prostitutes,” he said adding that the back alley was close to a community hall where wedding receptions and concerts take place.

*Source: Clear street of prostitutes, The Star, 22 December, 2011*

Direct quotations put readers in touch with what people in the news actually said (Hall & Aimone, 2008) and therefore can be the key to a successful story. However, quotations can be ideologically laden. This is because, by framing the actual information obtained from the group spokesman, the issue is expected to garner support from the people, ministers, and government agencies and thus provide a strong reason for immediate action on this issue. Investigation of the referential strategy shows that the media had included statements from the city councillor which impersonalises foreign women through the use of derogatory labelling in his statements, for example, “hooker” (Sentence 1) and “prostitutes” (Sentence 6). These pejorative terms not only present them in an unfavourable light but reinforce the construction of “otherness”.

Additionally, pronouns (e.g. we, they, and us) employed in the news articles (Extracts A and B) to represent the out-group (sex offenders) and the in-group (Malaysians) are collectivised as a communal human agency rather than as individual groups. This collectivised human agency distinguishes between the prostitutes and the Malaysians in which all prostitutes are associated with social problems while Malaysians are portrayed as the dominant majority who hold power in maintaining the safety of the country. In other words, the pronoun employed in this news text functions to legitimise the construction of the positive-Self (the Malaysians) and de-legitimising the negative-Other (sex offenders).

**Victims as sex offenders**

The media’s attention about sexual offences committed by foreign women generally elicits anxiety among the public. Newspaper readers are made to believe that sex offenders who are thriving in the country are mainly women who come from neighbouring countries. Their involvement in prostitution is portrayed explicitly by emphasising their nationality and numbers as can be seen in Extracts C and D.

**Extract C**

(1) BUTTERWORTH: The state Immigration Department detained 44 guest relation officers at a karaoke centre during an Ops Sayang raid late Wednesday night in Seberang Jaya, near here. (2) The 16 Chinese and 28 Vietnamese nationals were caught while entertaining their clients in the centre during the 11.45pm raid. (3) None of the women, who were in their early 20s and 30s, managed to escape with Immigration officers sealing off all four exits of the centre. (4) State Immigration Department deputy director Abdul Rahman Hassan said the raid was conducted following a tip-off.

*Source: 44 foreign GROs held, New Straits Times, March 9, 2012*
Extract D
(1) State CID chief Assistant Commissioner Hamdan Majid, said 11 men, aged from 21 to 45, were detained for further investigation. (2) A total of 102 women, all foreigners, aged between 21 and 45, were detained for alleged prostitution. (3) “In the first raid, 28 women from China and four from Vietnam were detained. (4) In the second raid, 52 women from China, six from Vietnam and one from the Philippines were detained. (5) In the final raid, 11 women from China were detained,” he said.
Source: 102 foreigners caught at world’s oldest trade, New Straits Times, 10 March, 2012

The narrative extracts from New Straits Times centres on the issue that many foreign women were detained for sex work related from the perspective of people in authoritative positions for example, State Immigration Department Deputy Director Abdul Rahman Hassan (Extract C) and State CID Chief Assistant Commissioner Hamdan Majid (Extract D). The media highlights the authorial statements gained from voices that are deemed important to emphasise the gravity of the issue and as a strategy to divert public attention toward the illicit actions committed by foreign women. The attributed voices of the enforcement officers in direct quotations, according to Teo (2000, p. 18), becomes “a gate-keeping device that admits only those in positions of power and influence while shutting out the opinions and perspectives of those deemed by society to be powerless”. The officers’ high ranking positions also communicate the message that they have the power to execute actions to sustain the good name of the country that can be seen through verbs such as “arrested”, “remanded”, and “detained”. However, in doing so, the media develops a moral panic among the public primarily due to the its overt depiction of the women as sex offenders. Victims of sex trafficking are also aggregated in the media and represented as a, homogeneous group in terms of statistics.

As illustrated in Extract D, foreign women detained for sex work are portrayed via definite quantifiers as indicated in Sentences 3 and 4. Van Dijk (2000) stated that the frequent use of numbers can signify the degree of the danger, and this is particularly evident with regard to sex-trafficking victims. As a result of this kind of media coverage, the general public conceptualises what it believes to be the prototype of “evil people”: Women from foreign countries who participate in the underground sex work are problematic. Studies by Abid, Manan, and Amir (2013) further confirm that associating certain groups with numbers can present them as threat. Observation of the news articles further indicate that victims are mostly passivated and their voices are silenced throughout news reports. The media chooses to give access to the voices of selective individuals who hold special roles in society, therefore signifying the media’s hidden agenda. Meanwhile the media takes on the role of an active actor that functions as an informant, keeping readers posted on credible statistics.

Victims as foreign invaders
Within the referential strategy, foreign women in sex work have mostly been classified through generic references by using adjectival phrases (e.g. foreign prostitutes and foreign women) in Extract E. The genericisation of the foreign women is intended to “symbolically remove them from the readers’ world of immediate experience” (van Leeuwen, 2008, p. 36), perceived as distant “others” which ultimately reinforces the division of “Us” and “Other”. This kind of classification may create discomfort within the community as readers are
exposed to negative portrayals of the women and given the idea that the illicit crime is largely committed by foreigners. The constant representation of women as criminals from foreign countries further promotes the negative discourse about non-nationals: Foreign women are associated with the increase of social problems, a phenomenon that threatens the Malaysian community. Sex-trafficking victims therefore no longer fall within the category of co citizen-victim of an illicit activity, but their role is activated as an outsider who is responsible for causing disharmony in the country.

Extract E
(1) KUALA LUMPUR: Foreign prostitutes and migrant workers who claimed to be victims of human trafficking are just trying to avoid prosecution and get a free pass home, said MCA Public Service and Complaints Department chief Datuk Seri Michael Chong. (2) “They claimed to have been lured into vice or into working here but when I looked at their passports, some have overstayed for as long as two years. (3) “If these cases were real, they would have escaped earlier,” he said in an interview. (4) However, Chong said there were also genuine cases of human trafficking. (5) “I have handled cases in which foreign women forced into prostitution were actually brought to me by their customers who took pity on them,” he said.
Source: Doubts over human trafficking claims, The Star, 4 July, 2014

In Extract E, only one type of reporting was used throughout the article: direct quotations mainly from the voices of MCA Public Service and Complaints Department Chief Datuk Seri Michael Chong. The article reports that foreign women involved in sex work attempt to escape penalty by claiming to be victims of trafficking. However, the statement by Michael Chong, (Sentence 3) “If these cases were real, they would have escaped earlier,” seems to be convincing because he believes the foreign women have entered the country deliberately to operate as sex workers. Because there are no other voices in the report, either from the enforcement officers or from the affected individuals, the entire article is attributed to the perspectives of one social actor. By giving access to the dominant voice of Michael Chong whose statement is taken as a source of information, the news becomes more trustworthy.

Similarly, in Extract F, the State Immigration Enforcement Unit Deputy Chief Masri Abdul in an authorial voice asserts that foreign women abuse their tourist visas to work as guest relation officers in Malaysia. In this example, the accessed voice of the enforcement officer is nominated in the form of honorification, in that his existence in the news report is presented along with his official rank in the government office. Nomination, according to van Leeuwen (1996, p. 41), “is typically realized by proper nouns which can be formal (surname only), with or without honorifics), semiformal (given name and surname), or informal (given name only)”. So, the presence of an influential social actor in the news report is essential as the media uses the statements obtained from elite actors to convince its readers to believe the information as if it comes from a reliable source. Significantly, victims’ and perpetrators’ voices are suppressed. The absence of these actors’ voices is imperative as it highlights the media’s ideological underpinning that is, the media gives more priority to official voices but excludes voices that are deemed unimportant.
Extract F

JOHOR BARU: The Johor Immigration Department arrested 70 foreign women at an entertainment outlet in Stulang Laut on Wednesday. In the operation at 10.30pm, code-named Op Sepadu, the women who had entered the country on tourist visas were detained for violating their social visit passes by working as guest relation officers. Aged between 22 and 35, the women, mostly wearing low-cut dresses and revealing body-hugging blouses, were caught while busy entertaining their guests. State Immigration enforcement unit deputy chief Masri Abdul said the raid followed complaints by members of the public about the presence of foreign women in large numbers.

Source: 70 foreign women detained in raid, New Straits Times, 6 September, 2013

As can be seen in the above news extract, the officer’s voice (Masri Abdul), markedly crucial, is intertextually textured in the article together with the voice of the media. The media can advance its voice along with the voices of important social actors to create impact but, in doing so, legitimate sex-trafficking victims become subjects of marginalisation because the media is more interested in highlighting the immigration status of the victims rather than viewing them as a human rights issue. The State Immigration Enforcement Unit is activated as agent with regard to the women’s arrests. Further, in this news excerpt, the women were attributed (predication strategy) mainly for their provocative appearance and actions, “wearing low-cut dresses and revealing body-hugging blouses… busy entertaining their guests”. This kind of news reporting is not an exception in the mainstream newspapers as the government is always portrayed as the good Self while foreign women in sex work as the bad other.

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

Analysis of the English-language newspapers displayed a certain form of news coverage on sex trafficking that is likely to influence readers’ perceptions toward women in sex work. Generally, the Malaysian press has framed the sex-trafficking discourse as a problem associated with foreigners who make up the majority of women trafficked for sexual exploitation. Foreign women in sex work tend to be viewed through the lens of immigration and prostitution which positions them as criminals often, in inferior position with regard to the Malaysian authorities. As a result, sex-trafficking victims become subjects of marginalisation because the media is more engrossed in emphasising the women’s immigration status rather than viewing it as an issue of human rights violation.

For decades, the Malaysian press has been under the control of governments, and therefore the media is required to support the government’s policies in all matters including the problem of sex trafficking. Because the media has the power to decide what to include or to exclude and whom to use as sources (Fong & Ishak, 2010; Gamson & Modigliani, 1989) the Malaysian press is inclined to show their support through their writings by depicting the government’s positive actions in tackling sex trafficking in the country. The media’s sourcing practice indicates the media’s bias in that there is a clear absence of victims’ voices. In contrast, the media gives priority to the voices of elite social actors whose voices are intertextually textured with authorial accounts to present the government in a positive light but at the same time reinforces the negative image of the victims. The findings obtained from this study are similar to previous research by Don and Lee (2014) who examined the voices of political elites in news reports to represent refugees negatively. Teo’s (2000) study on
Vietnamese immigrants in Australia also yielded similar results in which the social actors have been depicted unconstructively in the Australian news reports.

The finding confirms that almost all news reports about sex trafficking and sex work have incorporated the voices of influential social actors such as those in high and respected positions in society such as a deputy superintendent, assistant commissioner, State Immigration Department deputy director, city councillor and Public Service and Complaints Department chief. The social actors are also nominated with honorification (e.g., Datuk Seri Michael Chong, Datuk K. Basil). The media uses these actors in its reports to prove the reliability of the news source so that readers are more convinced of the way the issue is presented. The prominent voices are included along with other voices through direct and indirect reporting in most cases because the journalists want their views to be merged with the government views.

Political actors with a voice dominate the media as they are given opportunities to put forward their aims and to address certain issues. These actors have crucial interest in gaining media attention for their own purpose and therefore use the media as a platform to strategically inform the public about various issues by incorporating their voices in news reports. Moreover, for readers who do not have access to other news source will tend to believe the information given by the elite actors as genuine news. As noted by Tresch (2009, p. 8), “having a voice in the media is a key political strategy to gain legitimacy and power in the political process.” Findings from intertextual analysis of news extracts on the whole show how media writers adeptly use certain voices and contextualise them to represent sex-trafficking victims in an unfavourable way.

REFERENCES


THE ‘MEANING MAKING’ OF PROBLEM-BASED LEARNING (PBL): THE LEARNERS’ PERSPECTIVE

Suraini Mohd Ali  
*Faculty of Major Language Studies*  
*Universiti Sains Islam Malaysia, 71800 Nilai, Negeri Sembilan*  
e-mail: suraini@usim.edu.my

**ABSTRACT**  
The relationship between feeling and understanding is vital to learning, as what we feel about concerns what we learn. Thus, understanding how learners’ make meaning of a learning experience is crucial. It needs to be uncovered specifically to assist language practitioners facilitate learning. This article discusses learners’ ‘meaning making’ of their Problem-Based Learning (PBL) experiences in a Business English Course (BEC). In this qualitative study, a phenomenographic research methodology was employed. The research participants were eight first year undergraduates from a Malaysian public university. The data was collected through interviews and observations. The interviews were recorded, transcribed and coded into categories using thematic analysis. The observation notes acted as triangulation as well as additional data in the interpretation phase. The findings demonstrated the unique experiences of the research participants in experiencing PBL for the first time and the ‘meaning making’ of what PBL is for them as learners. The learners’ PBL experience was considered essential for practitioners to establish a link between what they perceive and the actual experiences from the learners in order to aid the practitioners in developing a conducive learning environment.

Keywords: Problem-Based Learning (PBL), Meaning making of PBL

**INTRODUCTION**  
Problem-based learning (PBL) is a pedagogical strategy which employs contextualized real world situations. In this learning environment, learners are engaged in a collaborative process which starts with a problem or case that is assigned to them. The learners work collaboratively to research and reflect the information obtained before arriving at a group consensus in solving the case or problem. In other words, learners undergo a very complex and challenging learning experience contrary to the traditional classroom environment.

This paper focuses on the meaning making of Business English learners who experience Problem-Based Learning in their course. The term meaning-making has been used in constructivist educational psychology to refer to the personal epistemology that persons create to help them make sense of the influences, relationships and sources of knowledge in their world (Kegan, 1982). Thus, understanding the learners’ experiences in this learning environment is very crucial and deemed necessary for practitioners to adapt and adopt teaching and learning activities to meet the needs of the learners and classroom.

**LITERATURE REVIEW**  
As a term, meaning making in learning appears to be a way to capture the active elements of
learning as well as the uniqueness of each learner’s prior experience and knowledge. According to Vygotsky (1978), meaning has two components – meaning proper and personal sense. Meaning proper means repeatable, and “public” denotations of a word, gesture, action or event (Bakhtin, 1987). Most researchers focus their studies on this aspect when they are doing research on education. This approach to meaning inspires researchers to look into whether the learners have obtained the right concept of the content or learning and whether the meaning can be shared or testable. However, this is only one of the aspects of meaning making as defined by Vygotsky (1978).

Activity theorists, believe that a more primary aspect of meaning making is the second aspect which is the ‘personal sense’. As explicated by Shawn (2014):

> The construct of personal sense attempts to capture the very personal, biographical, embodied, situated connotations of words, gestures, actions and events. This is the realm of what those things mean for us as part of our personal narratives about ourselves, our experiences, sense of place or even sense of ourselves. It is about how they resonate (or not) with our values, beliefs, judgments and knowledge. As learning researchers, we often discount or ignore this hugely important aspect of meaning making.

He further added that these are the aspects of experiences where the researchers will have to work on to get insights from the learners. In light of that, this study explored and sieved understanding of learners’ PBL learning experience which is expected to assist language practitioners in conducting effective and affective teaching. Effective teaching (Abrami et al., 1997), takes place when students experience successful learning while affective teaching (Hesten, 1995 cited in Cooper et al., 2000) occurs when the practitioners manage to empathize with the students’ experience and use it to further enhance the learning.

Having discussed the meaning making in learning and its contribution to educational practices, another area of relevance for this paper is PBL in English Language learning. This is because the meaning making of the PBL experience was filtered from a group of Learners in a Business English Course. The area of research on PBL in English language teaching and learning is the most significant in relation to the current research. Although the lines of research presented here dwelled on English Language Proficiency, English for Occupational Purposes (EOP) and English for Specific Purposes (ESP), they can be categorized as similar, as the aim of each course is to assist learners in improving their language skills for different reasons. Furthermore, Mohd Salleh (2008, May) claimed that PBL has proven to be effective for use in the mastery of the English language among learners because he found that the approach or philosophy that underlies PBL is ‘experiential’ with greater emphasis on group dynamics, independent investigation of real world problems and high analytical thinking skills that require greater usage of communication skills. Sim (2006) studied the use of PBL in English for Occupation Purposes (EOP) classroom by determining whether the use of PBL benefited the EOP respondents’ language skills and whether there were any significant improvements in their language skills. The findings signified that the respondents had a positive impression of PBL, their oral and written language skills had improved significantly and their generic skills had also improved. Another study similar to the field of investigation in the current research was conducted by Anthony (2010, April) on English for Specific Purposes (ESP). The research reported on students’ collaborative interaction based on the
PBL approach in an undergraduate course of ESP at a higher learning institution in Malaysia. The analysis demonstrated that second language learning as a process is an aspect of learning that is often overlooked in Malaysian classrooms to meet the need of the examination-oriented education system. It was rather interesting to note that all the studies discussed above either used quantitative, qualitative or mixed method design. However, none of the studies above have gathered data through developmental phenomenographical approach (a branch of qualitative research paradigm) which aims to dissect meaning from a phenomenon.

Therefore, the current study is significant because of its focus on participants’ meaning making of their PBL journey with emphasis on personal sense (Vygotsky, 1978) through the use of phenomenographical research paradigm. This study is also relevant to the field of English Language as the experiences are a recollection of events that were shared throughout the PBL process. In other words, the meaning making process is an enriching one because the PBL learning starts with a problem and continues until they arrive at the end product/s (presentations/artefacts). To achieve the aim, this paper seeks to answer the following research question—how do ESL learners make meaning of their learning experiences in a Problem-Based Learning (PBL) Business English Course (BEC)?

**METHODOLOGY**

**Research Design**

This study adopted a phenomenographic research paradigm. Using this paradigm, the researcher studied the experiences of the learners from the lens of the participants by sieving the meanings they make from their experiences. This process of sieving meaning is authentic because the learners’ experiences are interpreted from their perspective through phenomenographic interviews and not through the researcher’s perspective (Mohd Ali & Simkin, Nov. 2011). The process of sieving meaning involves eliciting experiences related to personal sense (Vygotsky, 1978). To be more specific, developmental phenomenography is employed in this study to determine how people experience some aspects of their world, and ‘then to enable them or others to change the way their world operates’ (Bowden, 2000, p. 3). In other words, developmental phenomenography takes the understandings further in terms of using them to improve or develop the phenomenon in future. In this case, the researcher would use the understanding obtained through this research to make improvements in the teaching and learning activities in PBL.

**Research Participants**

A purposive sampling method (Patton, 2002; Lincoln & Guba, 1985) which refers to the purposeful selection of a given sample, was employed in this study. The research participants were the first-year undergraduates in a Malaysian public university. Eight learners, 4 males and 4 females, were grouped into two teams from the same tutorial group of their Business English course. They were chosen as the research participants based on their demographic differences: gender, personalities and level of classroom participation. Demographic variations in the participants are important for this study to meet the aim of a phenomenographic research which is to understand the different ways a phenomenon are experienced.
Data Collection and Analysis Procedures
Data were collected through interviews and observations. The researcher was present in the classroom as a participant observer, acting as the facilitator as well as a critical friend throughout the research. Conversational interviews were carried out with the learners after they have experienced each PBL task. The researcher’s observation notes were written throughout the research journey. These observation notes were very useful and retained as close references in writing the interpretation. The notes were written in four different aspects: Theoretical Notes (TN), Methodological Notes (MN) and Observational Notes (ON) and content analysis was done to conclude the themes. The interviews were recorded, transcribed and coded for categories using thematic analysis. The observation notes acted as triangulation as well as additional data in the interpretation phase.

This research was carried out in a Business English Course in which three PBL tasks were embedded in the existing course content. The three PBL tasks were adopted and adapted from the course workbook to ensure the coherence of the units with the tasks. The tasks were then adapted to meet the requirements of a PBL model (Savin-Baden, 2000). The selection and adaptation of the tasks were done from low difficulty to increasing difficulty in terms of the requirement to look for information and the length of processes involved. PBL 1 was conducted with a lot of scaffolding from the practitioner as the learners were not familiar with PBL processes. PBL 2 and PBL 3 reflected more of the actual PBL running. All the three PBL tasks were carried out for a duration of 8 weeks.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS
This section presents the meaning learners have associated with their PBL experience in BEC. The quotations were drawn from two separate interviews, which focused on personal sense of the PBL experience throughout the study. The similarities in their responses and stories emerged from the earlier interview data; while the later interview provided a form of validation of their experience of PBL in BEC. However, there is an added value in these final stories compared to the earlier ones because the former stories were expressed with hesitation, less reflection and with the help of prompts, while the latter were more reflective and expressive as they were related to their personal sense. The learners’ significant stories have been grouped into main themes (as in the sub-heading) and followed by the explanations and relevant quotations to give readers a better understanding of the learners’ meaning making of their experiences.

Meaningful Use of Language
The learners explained that PBL is an experience of the meaningful use of English Language. They found that it was a way of learning the language while solving problems; using language for a purpose. Moreover, it was also a new and useful method that assisted them in practising the language. It was the nature of the PBL cases that encouraged the use of the language because the learners subconsciously used the language in solving the cases/problem.

A good way to learn English while solving problem (L129) TISUMPBLiRP1
A new and good method of learning English (L4-5; L16-17) TISUMPBLiiRP1
A helpful method to learn English (L9-12) TISUMPBLiiRP2
More than solving problem; learn to use the language (L121-123) TISUMPBLiRP4
It was rather a positive experience for the learners because they knew that at the end of the learning process they have to achieve something; in this case solve or manage the problem/case given to them. However, there were also learners who experienced PBL as meaningful language use but at the same time prompted anxiety thinking about the score for their presentations (end product).

I am worried about my assignment marks but I enjoy the discussion and searching information (L124-123) TISUMPBLiRP4
I use English to say my idea but I am not sure what marks I will get for my presentation (L28-29) TISUMPBLiiRP2

They did enjoy the process, even though they struggled to talk and discuss in English but managed to come up with good solutions for the case/problem that was assigned to them.

We came up with wonderful solution ...tried our best to talk in English although we did mix with Malay a bit; But best la (L126-129; 131-132) TISUMPBLiRP6

Many Benefits and Difficulties in One Experience
Learners associated PBL in BEC experience as a series of benefits and difficulties gained in one type of learning. These were the advantages highlighted by the learners:

Many gains in one PBL task (60-63) TISUMPBLiiRP8
Solutions come together with reasons and justifications (L231-234) TISUMPBLiiRP1
A brainstorming process, which is applicable in studies and other matters (L17-18) TISUMPBLiiRP7
Help students to locate a problem and guide to solve it (L4-6) TISUMPBLiiRP7
An approach that generates mature and effective thinking (L5-7) TISUMPBLiiRP7
Broaden thinking and learning outside classroom context (L7-12; L23-24) TISUM PBliiRP1
About finding solution (L7) TISUMPBLiiRP6

The benefits range from generic skills acquisition to the general view about PBL as a way to find solutions. As the learners were able to highlight the benefits they gained, it also meant that learners who engaged in PBL can also become motivated to participate in the learning. PBL practitioners can take advantage of the learners’ increased motivation to further implement PBL with an added challenge if necessary.

However, there were learners who found it difficult to use English language for discussion purposes because of their low language proficiency, which led to difficulties in understanding each other. This seems to be one of the major issues in PBL implementation in the language classroom because the low proficiency learners tried to use minimal English language in the group discussion.

I didn’t understand much of what my friend said (L40-41) TISUMPBLiRP5
It was not easy to speak and understand each other (L12-13) TISUMPBLiRP6
I didn’t talk much coz my English is bad (L27) TISUMPBLiRP6
Fun Learning
PBL was experienced as a fun learning experience. There were many reasons why learners felt a sense of fun in the learning process. Learners felt relaxed because they were given a block of time to complete the PBL case/problem. As they proceed through their work, the sense of fun was experienced. They interpreted the learning process as a game, and the interesting educational activity occurring outside the classroom, supports the notion of fun experienced by the learners.

Relax and fun because given a block of time (L95-96) TISUMPBLiRP1 A type of game (L138-139) TISUMPBLiRP8
Interesting method of learning (L34) TISUMPBLiRP1
An interesting learning method; learning in fun context (L6-7) TISUMPBLiRP8
Because get to go out while learning (L31-32) TISUMPBLiRP1
Series of activities (L54-60) TISUMPBLiRP4

They also found the element of challenge as fun. They highlighted that meeting real people in the task completion was interesting and challenging. The task was also considered difficult and challenging, having both negative and positive aspects. They felt interested but also challenged due to the opportunity of meeting people in interviews.

Interesting and challenging because meeting real people (L80-82) TISUMPBLiRP1
The task was difficult and challenging (L8-10) TISUMP3i3RP6.
The task is interesting but challenging because we will be meeting ‘real people’ to interview and can improve communication skills (L83-86; L97) TISUMP3i1RP6

The idea of challenging-fun expressed by the learners can be further explicated as a threshold concept to understand the lived experience of learning in PBL environment. A threshold concept has been defined as:

a portal, opening up a new and previously inaccessible way of thinking about something. It represents a transformed way of understanding, or interpreting, or viewing something... (Meyer and Land, 2003 p.1).

Barret (2005) had unfolded the concept of ‘hard-fun’ from PBL participants in his study. Similar interpretations can be deduced from ‘challenging-fun’ as described by the participants in the current study. In understanding the threshold concept, it can be illustrated that ‘challenging-fun’ could open up a new perspective for further implications of teaching and learning. Threshold concepts are considered to be transformative, probably irreversible, integrative and troublesome (Meyer & Land, 2003). The transformative aspect took place when the concept of challenging-fun transformed the researcher’s understanding of this learning. Even though the researcher has been involved in PBL for a few years, it has never occurred to the researcher or the experiences from the students that PBL learning can be challenging-fun until the current research unfolded such a unique illustration. The researcher was convinced that it is ‘irreversible’ (ibid, 2003) in the sense that, this insight affects both the way the researcher/teacher thinks about PBL and the way to implement it. The concept of
challenging-fun is integrative in that, it is integrated in the analysis of how eight learners talked about their learning. Learning in PBL is about the fun of laughter, creativity and playfulness and the challenges of difficulties, demanding activity levels and transformation.

Fun without challenge is merely playfulness. Challenge without fun is hard work. Learning in PBL demands both the fun of playing with ideas and the challenges of refining and reworking them. Both complementary parts are needed for learning. It is definitely troublesome. Some people have difficulty with considering notions of fun in learning as academically rigorous, and, practically and professionally irrelevant. It is also troublesome in a sense that it is counter intuitive by juxtaposing the words ‘challenge’ and ‘fun’ together to form a concept.

According to Csikszentmihalyi (1975) cited in Sedighian (June, 1997), ‘... creating an intrinsically motivating activity is to keep the ratio between a person’s capabilities and encountered challenge within a range which results in neither boredom nor lack of fun nor worry and anxiety. When the challenge is greater than one’s capabilities, one experiences worry and frustration; when one’s skill is greater than the challenge, one experiences boredom’ ( p. 49). In the current research, the challenge level in PBL learning was rather motivating, perhaps because the difficulty level of the task and the learners’ capabilities were just right. This is in line with Krashen’s Input theory of I+1. According to this hypothesis, the learner improves and progresses along the ‘natural order’ when he/she receives ‘input’ that is one step beyond their current stage of competence. For example, if a learner is at a stage ‘i’, then acquisition takes place when he/she is exposed to ‘Comprehensible Input’ that belongs to level ‘i + 1’. In relation to PBL, Krashen’s theory can be used as a base in crafting the ‘problem’, which is at a level of I+1

Learning Starts with a Problem
Learners illustrated that PBL is a process of learning that starts off with a problem.

*The assignment starts with a problem (L57-58)* TISUMPBLiRP2 A technique of learning/solving problem (L5-7) TISUMPBLiRP2 Use problem to learn (L180) TISUMPBLiRP6
*Solving problem due to pressure (L291-293)* TISUMPBLiRP7 Assist in solving problem (L259-261) TISUMPBLiRP5 Help students to locate a problem and guide to solve it (L4-6) TISUMPBLiRP6

When learning starts with a case/problem, the reason for the learning, which is solving the problem, is established at the onset of the learning. Just like when the learners are given a jigsaw puzzle, they will have a mind-set that it has got to be sorted out. The same situation applies to a PBL task because the learners see a reason/need to complete the task. Thus, it is important to craft a suitable and motivating problem to retain the learners’ motivation and interest to solve the problem.

Discovery and an Active Learning Experience
PBL in BEC was perceived as a discovery and an active learning experience. The learners discovered their ability and potential through the learning processes. It was also a discovery in learning through sustained seeking and discipline to arrive at a viable solution, which was
considered as the impact of the learning. This authentic learning experience, which was
discovery in nature, was interpreted as a new learning experience.

\textit{Avenue for self-discovery of one’s ability through the process (L53; L54-56) TISUMPBLiRP3}
\textit{Discovery of learning through self-seeking and discipline (L211-212) TISUMPBLiRP1}
\textit{An impact in the learning (L155-156) TISUMPBLiRP5 A new experience (L58) TISUMPBLiRP6}

Active learning is experienced when there are two ways of communication in the
learning – between staff and learners and between learners and other learners. Learners also
call it student-centred learning because there are more active roles for the learners in this type
of learning. The interactive nature of the learning context encourages the generation and
exchanges of ideas through activities.

\textit{Active learning; two-way communication (L16-19) TISUMPBLiRP4}
\textit{Student-centred learning (L110-112) TISUMPBLiRP4}
\textit{A place to generate and exchange ideas (L126-129; 131-132) TISUMPBLiRP6}
\textit{Learning through activities (L198-199)}
\textit{Outside classroom (L201-202) TISUMPBLiRP7}
\textit{Interactive learning process (L6) TISUMPBLiRP3}

\textbf{IMPLICATIONS TO LANGUAGE TEACHING AND LEARNING}
Previous studies have shown that PBL is a worthwhile form of learning to be considered at
higher learning institutions (Mohd Salleh, 2008; Sim, 2006). Although the current research
did not evaluate the effectiveness of PBL to tertiary learners in the Malaysian context, it has
certainly brought to the surface the learners’ insights concerning the benefits and challenges
of such an approach. Most of the learners’ insights and illustrations of the PBL experiences
were very positive. Thus, adopting PBL in language teaching more widely, would yield more
potentially useful insights.

The concept of challenging-fun as illustrated by the learners has shown their personal
sense about the experience as well as practical implications at various levels. At the level of
the PBL classroom, understanding learning as challenging-fun in PBL not only encourages
us as PBL practitioners to be intellectually challenging and academically rigorous with our
students, but also to have space for student creativity and room enough for joy. It stimulates
us to write problems that are sufficient to challenge students. At a time when there are
difficulties with student retention, the challenging-fun of learning in PBL may be a way of
engaging students in the curriculum. The usefulness of challenging-fun as a concept for
exploring the different types of learning and varied learning spaces in higher education is
something that could be explored further. Challenging-fun is a threshold concept that gives
us a new way of thinking about and doing ‘learning’ in PBL.

For successful PBL implementation, specifically with low proficiency learners who
illustrated their experience as ‘many benefits and difficulties in one learning’, the
administration should start with a proper course structuring, in which the practitioners will
have to decide which model of PBL can be implemented. For a start, a hybrid PBL model
(model 1- Savin-Baden, 2000) can be introduced in which PBL is implemented with a combination of lectures and tutorials. This would help both the practitioners and the learners. The practitioners would benefit from trying to cover course content using other modes like lectures and tutorials while some content is covered in PBL classes. The introductory PBL would assist learners to understand and get hands on experience concerning the procedures and steps in PBL. This way, both practitioners and learners will obtain ample time gaining experience and knowledge to perform better in full-fledged PBL in upcoming programs. Exclusive PBL classes could be implemented after one semester of exposure of the students to hybrid PBL. This is because an exclusively PBL class would affect practitioners training, timetabling and logistics. Training is a crucial issue in PBL implementation because a lack of PBL knowledge and experience among the practitioners will lead to the failure of PBL lessons. The course administrators should locate potential practitioners and give them professional training in PBL before teaching PBL classes. As for the timetable, the outside classroom hours needed for PBL group discussions should be included to reduce the possibility of learners cutting short the amount of time needed to produce satisfactory outcomes. Having had the extra hours for group discussions, the discussion rooms available should be equipped with Internet facilities because the learners could discuss and search for extra materials via interwebs at the same venue. This is a way to reduce the possibility of not searching for extra materials due to limited resources.

Another important aspect that needs to be looked into is the assessment in PBL (specifically in English Language context) as many learners felt that it was a meaningful language learning experience. However, there were also a number of respondents who felt that they did well during PBL (discussions and searching for materials) and would expect more marks awarded for the process. Therefore, the assessment should focus on the process and product, which would benefit the learners in many ways.

CONCLUSION

As a researcher, it was a worthwhile experience to document accurate and sharable meaning and develop serious ways to embrace the notion of meaning making among the PBL learners. The learners’ meaning making of the Business English PBL experience has certainly provided a meaningful and essential insights for language practitioners adopting PBL. The practitioners could benefit by considering the way students perceive (in this study particularly, but also in others) the effect of the main elements of successful PBL on their learning. In this study (and the other studies on PBL referred to in this research) they see it as an opportunity to use their second language meaningfully, expand their repertoire of skills in problem solving, communicate and negotiate difficulties with their peers, enjoy their learning and feel a sense of accomplishment through hard work and shared commitment. Furthermore, they, experience the thrill of discovering new knowledge, and as an opportunity for taking responsibility of their own learning. If the language practitioners learn to build their teaching around these insights, their programmes would arguably be more effective through the expansion of affective avenues to enhance cognitive and behavioural skills in their learners.

REFERENCES


purposes classroom among final semester students of diploma in office management and technology (Masters Thesis, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Malaysia). Retrieved from: http://eprints.utm.my/6543/1/jacquelinesimphekkimmp041177d06ttt.PDF


http://blogs.oregonstate.edu/freechoicelab/2014/01/07/making-meaning-making-personal/
Making Meaning Making Personal, Posted on January 7, 2014 by Shawn
PYRAMID OF ARGUMENTATION: TOWARDS AN INTEGRATED MODEL FOR TEACHING AND ASSESSING ESL WRITING

Vahid Nimehchisalem
Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication
Universiti Putra Malaysia, 43400 Serdang, Selangor
e-mail: vahid@upm.edu.my

ABSTRACT
In an argumentative piece of writing, an issue is put forth, its pros and cons are considered, and the writer’s justification(s) for supporting one of them is presented. Although there are several models of argumentation, what is lacking in the literature is a comprehensive model for assessing writing by English as a Second Language (ESL) learners. This paper presents the Pyramid of Argumentation (PoA) that is an integrated model for assessing writing. As a three-sided pyramid standing on four columns, PoA integrates several recent and ancient theories of argumentation, linguistic competence, and language assessment. While the pyramid focuses on the components of argumentative writing, the pillars involve components of language ability and language assessment. The four sides of the pyramid, logos, ethos, rhetorical situation, as well as style and arrangement represent adapted version of the Classical Rhetoric as re-introduced by Crowley (1994) and Kinneavy (1971). The side of the pyramid that covers logos is replaced by Toulmin’s (2003) Model of Argument. The four columns, on which the pyramid is based, include the language knowledge, context of situation, world knowledge, and strategic knowledge. PoA integrates the theory of Communicative Language Ability (Bachman, 1990) with Components of Language Competence (Bachman, 1990). Writing teachers and material developers can use the PoA to make sure that they cover all the skills that learners need to develop mature pieces of argumentative writing. With the PoA as a framework, self-assessment and peer-review checklists can be developed to scaffold students’ learning of argumentative writing. Similarly, such a framework can provide the criteria based on which rubrics for evaluating argumentative essays can be designed. As a comprehensive model, PoA will help teachers improve validity of their assessment by providing a comprehensive account of argumentative writing construct.

Keywords: Argumentative writing, Classical rhetoric, assessing writing, argumentative writing instruction

BACKGROUND
In the past, teaching writing to English as a Second Language (ESL) learners was approached very differently from the way it is done today. During the dominance of Product approach, the focus was on students’ written products rather than the process they went through in writing a text (Raimes, 1991). In writing composition classes students were given some time to write about a topic. Teachers edited (if at all) and scored these compositions impressionistically based on the implicit criteria that they might have developed throughout their teaching experience. During the dominance of Audio-Lingual Method, spoken skills were considered to be superior to written skills (Larsen-Freeman, 2000). As a result, writing was merely there to reinforce the language structures that the learners had just learned.
Likewise, writing tests involved discrete-point items that focused on students’ linguistics competence and structural accuracy rather than their ability to generate ideas and organize them coherently (Weigle, 2002). With the advent of student-centered approaches, ESL writing experienced a drastic change. Writing teachers now were interested in what was literally happening in the writers’ mind throughout the ‘process’ of writing. They would teach idea generation techniques to their students, who now knew that good writing is the result of multiple-drafting, self-assessment, peer-review, revising, and editing. Their writing skill was now assessed continuously through portfolios or reflective journals using self-assessment and peer-review checklists.

The Process Approach revolutionized the way writing was taught, but as time went by, writing instructors particularly in writing for academic purposes in tertiary level settings noticed that students needed to have an understanding of specific genres to be able to create successful academic writing pieces. Different genres of writing had varying organizational structures which learners had to realize before they could write acceptable academic papers. Students would analyze and examine a number of models of the target genre before making an attempt to create their own written works. Such an analysis would teach them how members of their target discourse community wrote. By modeling the writings of those professionals, students would be able to create their own written works. This was how the Genre-based Approach to ESL writing emerged. For proponents of this approach, written language is a social practice and dialogic discourse, in which a writer responds to an active audience (Hyland, 2003). Hence, writing teachers who follow a Genre-based approach basically seek to give a conscious understanding of the target genre to their learners. This has created an interest among ELT researchers and practitioners to develop models which facilitate teaching and assessment of different genres of writing.

Argumentative genre stands out among other modes of writing, such as narration, description, and exposition. The reason could be that in writing argumentative pieces the writer needs critical thinking skills. Moreover, most of the current English proficiency testing systems test candidates’ writing skill through tasks that prompt argumentative writing. Tests like International English Language Testing System (IELTS) and Tests of English as a Foreign Language (TOEFL) include argumentative writing tasks. This may be due to the inclusive nature of the argumentative mode in which writers may need to describe, narrate, and/or explain in their attempt to accept or reject a certain position. Another reason could be the importance of students’ ability in critically analyzing the advantages and/or disadvantages of a position and providing defendable arguments in its support.

The existing models in the literature, as it will be discussed in the following section, are too general and not suitable for assessing argumentative writing. The focus of argumentation models is only on rhetorics in argumentation but not on assessing writing while the focus of models on language assessment is only on language ability and not on argumentation. Therefore, there is a need for a model that integrates argumentation and language assessment. In this conceptual paper, I present the Pyramid of Argumentation (PoA), a model which combines theories of argumentation, language ability, and language assessment. The paper presents key concepts related to argumentation and then it explains which theories were adopted or adapted in the development of PoA. The theories of language ability and language assessment adopted in PoA are also described before the new model itself is presented. The paper concludes with the potential benefits and implications of PoA.
OVERVIEW OF THEORIES OF ARGUMENTATION

Several attempts have been made to describe argumentative discourse since the ancient times. Some of the established theories of argumentation will be discussed in this section, including the classical rhetoric (Kinneavy, 1971), diagrammatic approach (Beardsley, 1950), linked argument (Thomas, 1973), tree-diagram (Scriven, 1976), and Toulmin’s model of argument. In this section, I discuss Kinneavy’s (1971) theory of classical rhetoric that was adapted and Toulmin’s (1958) model of argument that was adopted as well as the argumentation theories that were not selected in the development of PoA.

Theory of classical rhetoric (Kinneavy, 1971)
The art of argumentation was very crucial for rhetoricians in ancient Greece. In 1970s, scholars like Kinneavy (1971) revived interest in classical rhetoric by reintroducing the means of argumentation following Greek philosophers such as Aristotle. Kinneavy’s (1971) model summarizes the elements of classical rhetoric in which in order to present an effective argument, the arguer, aware of the rhetorical situation, appeals to character, reason, and emotion, using the proper style and arrangement to persuade the audience (Figure 1).

The first and the most important element in an argument is the ethical appeal, or appeal to character. Arguers need to create a positive and credited impression of themselves in the mind of their audience through good sense, goodwill, and good morals. An arguer can achieve good sense by demonstrating astuteness and resourcefulness which may take hours, months, or years of hard work. Ill-formed and irrelevant arguments should be avoided since they are deleterious to the arguer’s good sense. Arguers’ lack of information and inaccurate use of language will lead to their ethical lapse showing that they have not done their homework well (Crowley & Hawhee, 2004). Good morals can be achieved if the arguer is honest and describes things as they really are. Finally, goodwill can be established by showing the audience that one has good intentions. Therefore, lies, misleading arguments, and threats must be avoided. Logical appeal is achieved by reasoning and rational thoughts. It
is divided into three elements of example, topic, and enthymeme (Kinneavy, 1971). However, in PoA, these elements have been replaced by Toulmin’s model (to be presented in the following section) since it presents a more detailed and precise account of logical appeal. Additionally, the component of emotional appeals (pathos) was also excluded in PoA for reasons that will be explained later in this paper.

Arrangement for ancient rhetoricians often consisted of six elements, including “exordium, narration, division, proof, refutation and peroration” (Lanham, 1991, p. 171). Exordium, or introduction, is a general statement on the topic and is meant to attract the attention of audience. Narration is the thesis statement where one’s position is stated in relation to the topic. Division involves briefly listing the ideas that one intends to include in one’s arguments. Proof, or confirmation, provides support for one’s stance by presenting arguments in support of one’s case. Refutation accounts for the possible counterarguments. It involves anticipating and acknowledging the objections and providing reasons for refuting them. Finally, peroration, or conclusion, involves a recap of the mentioned arguments. In persuasive texts, this is where emotional appeals are made to stir the readers. Of course, arrangement has been considered differently by other scholars. Aristotle, for example, believed that it was comprised of prooemium (introduction), narration (thesis statement), argument, and epilogue (Crowley, 1994). An important implication of the differences between the two classifications is that an argument may still be effective even without a division and refutation. This means that these two should be regarded as optional elements of arrangement.

Style was defined very broadly by the ancient rhetoricians. Different scholars view style differently. For some style is determined by the (i) subject (more important topics requiring higher style), (ii) diction, (iii) effect on the audience, and (iv) syntax or composition (Lanham, 1991). This broad view suggests that style may influence most dimensions of writing. For Williams (1990), the elements of style include clarity, cohesion, emphasis, coherence, concision, length, elegance, and usage. Ancient rhetoricians regarded correctness, clarity, appropriateness, and ornament as the features of style (Crowley, 1994). Correctness encompasses the use of words that are consistent with the traditional grammar and usage of the language, conventions of spelling and punctuation as well as the offered standard format (Crowley, 1994). Clarity is one of the most important features of English language writing style:

*Have something to say, and say it as clearly as you can. That is the only secret of style.* (Matthew Arnold, as cited in Williams, 1990, p. xviii)

When style is clear, the intended meaning is transparently and lucidly transferred to the audience. Contrastive rhetoricians have identified English as a ‘writer-responsible’ language which is different from ‘reader-responsible’ languages such as German or Japanese (Hyland, 2002, p. 39). Writers in writer-responsible languages express their ideas as clearly as possible. In reader-responsible languages, however, the readers are responsible to make sense of the text they are reading. Greek rhetoricians believed that technical, outdated, as well as new or colloquial words could reduce clarity. However, they also believed that, depending on the rhetorical situation, using technical words could at times convey the meaning more vividly thereby adding to clarity (Crowley, 1994). What makes style appropriate is the author’s sensitivity to occasion, purpose, and audience (Crowley, 1994).
For instance, what the style that an audience in a church expects from a priest is a dignified and grand style which will be inappropriate in a personal letter. Finally, ornament is unusually extraordinary and impressive use of language (Crowley, 1994). Ancient rhetoricians created ornaments using figurative language. Typical examples of figurative language include metaphors and similes. If figurative language is exploited appropriately, it can add special effects to the argument and can engage the reader.

In addition to the four features mentioned in the preceding paragraphs, in classical rhetorics, styles were often categorized into three levels of grand, middle, or plain (Crowley, 1994). A grand style was often used for lofty issues. Highly ornate word choice, impressing and rich language, as well as use of figures feature this style. On the other hand, a middle style may be more relaxed than a grand style but does not employ ordinary language. Finally, everyday conversational language is used in a plain style. A plain style is concise and explains everything using a language that is clear but may not be impressive.

Figure 1 depicts the four inter-related components of Classical Rhetoric based on Kinneavy (1971):

![Figure 1. Classical Rhetoric (Based on Kinneavy, 1971)](image)

The figure shows the means of argumentation and the inter-relationship among them. The arguer should consider all of these components. The arguer’s failure to do so will distort the overall picture of the argument. The arguer’s ability to create a strongly logical and well-organized argument with an appropriate style will create a powerful image of him/her in the reader’s mind and will establish his/her ethos.

**Model of Argument (Toulmin, 1958, 2003)**

The second argumentation theory that was adopted in the development of PoA was Toulmin’s (1958, 2003) model of argument. Based on this model a good argument is composed of six interrelated elements: Claim, Data, Warrant, Qualifier, Backing and Rebuttal. Claim (C) is the thesis being argued which shows the arguer’s position (e.g., *Smoking is dangerous*). Data (D) is the evidence supporting the claim (e.g., *Smoking is*...
Sometimes in order to help the reader see the link between the claim and data, writers may use a Warrant (W). It functions as a bridge between C and D (e.g., *Anything that is addictive can be dangerous*). When the reader is aware of the relationship between C and D, W is left implicit. A Qualifier (Q) is commonly added to show the strength of C, D or W (e.g., *Smoking is definitely dangerous*). As another element of a good argument, Backing (B) is used for supporting W (e.g., *Addiction can disable one’s thinking*). When writers anticipate that the reader may not accept the warranting principles in an argument, they commonly use another argument (B) to support these principles (Lauer, 2004). Finally, Rebuttal (R) discusses certain situations in which C may fail to hold true (e.g., *Unless used for medical purposes, cigarettes must be avoided*). Toulmin (2003, p. 97) shows the relationship between the elements of an argument as follows:

![Argument diagram](image)

In order to clarify the elements of an argument, Toulmin (2003, p. 97) provides this example:

**D**: Harry was born in Bermuda

**Q**: presumably,

**C**: Harry is a British subject

---

In Toulmin’s example, it would be possible to limit the argument to only a C and D as a novice writer would most probably do. However, the argument sounds more effective with a Q (showing a more precise account of the relationship between the D and C), a W (explicitly linking C to D), a B (adding further support to back W), and finally, an R (showing a special condition in which the claim may not be true).

**Other argumentation theories**

Other models of argument are also available in the related literature, including Beardsley's (1950) diagrammatic approach, Thomas’s (1973) linked argument, Scriven’s (1976) tree diagram model, and Young, Becker and Pike’s (1970) Rogerian argument, each described briefly here. Focusing on the argumentative relationships, Beardsley's (1950) diagrammatic approach shows the relationship between the Data (D) and Claim (C) using arrows. Beardsley also differentiates between convergent, divergent, and serial arguments. In a convergent argument, several independent reasons are used for supporting the same claim. In a divergent argument, the same reason is used for supporting several claims. In a serial argument, a statement is used as a claim which also functions as a reason for another claim.
Thomas (1973) added the notion of linked argument to Beardsley's approach and defined it as “the logical combination of two or more reasons” (Thomas, 1973, p.58). The approaches may be suitable for analyzing the relationships between arguments, but they fail to provide an analysis of argumentative elements as accurately as Toulmin’s model. They have been particularly criticized for their impracticality since they urge the analyst to rewrite the whole data to illustrate the argumentative links, a demanding task in extended arguments (Johnson, 2000).

Scriven (1976) proposes another established model of argument, referred to as tree diagram, in which each statement, which has an argumentative role, is numbered; each number is circled, and each circle is connected to other circles to form a tree diagram. Minus signs are added next to the circles providing negative support for the argument. Scriven’s method provided for the difficult task of writing all the premises and helped indicate the rebuttals.

The theories discussed so far in this section lack the precision in Toulmin’s model, which besides showing the relationship between the statements indicates their underlying structures. Toulmin’s model is favored for its simplicity which makes it easier for novice teachers and raters to work with it (Yeh, 1998). It could be due to this simplicity that it has been used by ESL writing assessment researchers, such as Connor and Lauer (1988), Nimechisalem (2010), and Yeh (1998) to develop writing scales.

Rogerian argument is another theory based on the works of Carl Rogers, an American psychologist, who emphasized understanding the adversary's position, by openly listening to them before adopting a fixed point of view (Rogers, 1961). Rogerian rhetoric was introduced to the discipline of composition by Young et al. (1970), who identified the following stages for a rational argument (Brent, 1996):

1. The problem is introduced highlighting that the opponent's view is understood.
2. An illustration of situations in which the opponent's view may be valid is given.
3. The writer's view is presented demonstrating situations in which it is valid.
4. The writer shows how the opponent's view would benefit if elements of the writer's position were adopted. Alternatively, the writer may demonstrate that the two seemingly opposing views complement each other, each supplying what the other lacks.

These four stages may not be fixed in all versions of Rogerian rhetoric, but what is central is that the opposing viewpoint should be stated before presenting one’s own position without overt or covert evaluation (Brent, 1996). The Rogerian argument provides an invaluable model particularly for argumentative topics which are emotionally charged. However, its shortcoming is that it may not be suitable for writing tasks which prompt one-sided arguments. What is more, Toulmin’s model already offers elements like rebuttal, which covers the idea of focusing on the opposing positions in an argument. As this brief review of theories of argumentation indicates, Toulmin’s model provides the most detailed and useful framework to develop strong arguments; therefore, it was selected as the model to replace the logical appeal.
THEORIES OF LANGUAGE ABILITY AND LANGUAGE ASSESSMENT
So far I have focused on the theories of argumentation, and the components from these theories which were or were not included in PoA. As a model that deals with teaching and assessing ESL writing, PoA also needs to be informed with suitable theories of language ability and language assessment. The focus of the next section will be on the theories of language ability and language assessment which were adopted in PoA.

Theory of Communicative Language Ability (Bachman, 1990)

Bachman’s model consists of language competence, strategic competence and psychophysiological mechanisms. Language competence covers components of knowledge utilized by language users as they communicate. Strategic competence is “a set of metacognitive components or strategies” (Bachman & Palmer, 1996, p. 70) that bridges the gaps between the language knowledge, context of situation as well as world knowledge. Psychophysiological mechanisms involve the psychological and neurological processes that take place when the interlocutor actually uses the language. In PoA, psychophysiological mechanisms are excluded since individuals expected to be able to write argumentative texts are supposed to be physically able to write. Figure 2 illustrates the interaction between the components of CLA.

Bachman’s CLA has repeatedly been used for language assessment purposes and can likewise be helpful in developing rating scales to evaluate written works. Students’ topical or world knowledge should be considered in order to develop appropriate tasks for them. As a key feature of the model, strategic competence can help ESL learners manage their limited language ability to fulfill the tasks throughout writing courses or during the examination. Strategic knowledge is not merely limited to language use; rather, it can help language users in any cognitive activity. Strategic knowledge helps language users integrate their language and world knowledge in a situationally appropriate manner (Bachman & Palmer, 1996).

Bachman and Palmer (1996, pp. 71-75) mention goal setting, planning, and assessment as the three areas of metacognitive strategy use in which strategic competence
can function. First, strategic competence helps language users set goals and decide what they want to do with the language. Writers first identify tasks, select a task, and decide to complete it. Next, writers use their strategic competence for assessing their available language and world knowledge in order to identify the quality of their writing performance. Before they start writing, they predict whether they are able to complete the task. Having identified their available resources, they determine the most appropriate resource that can help them fulfill the task. As another metacognitive strategy, planning helps writers decide on how to select the suitable concepts from their available world and/or language knowledge resources. It involves designing one or more outlines in response to the task and selecting the best plan to fulfill the task. Thus, strategic knowledge helps writers integrate their available language and world knowledge, which enables them to respond to the task. Bachman’s theory sheds light on the process of ESL writing before, while, and after learners write. In addition to this theory, Bachman also presents a more detailed taxonomy of language competence components, a slightly modified version of which, will be presented in the following section.

**Components of Language Competence (Bachman, 1990)**

The taxonomy of Components of Language Competence is an attempt to break down language competence into organizational and pragmatic competencies. Organizational knowledge accounts for the way in which text or sentences are organized. On the other hand, pragmatic knowledge helps language users connect texts to their communicative goals as well as language use setting features (Bachman & Palmer, 1996). In order to imply or infer meaning, the learner can create a relationship between texts and their intended meanings, with the help of pragmatic competence. Since Bachman (1990) developed this taxonomy for both spoken and written forms of language, slight modifications have been made to make it suitable only for written language (Figure 3).

![Figure 3. Components of Language Competence (Adapted from Bachman, 1990, p. 83)](image-url)

**Key**
- V: vocabulary
- C: Cohesion
- H: Heuristic
- R: Register
- S: Syntax
- MO: Morphology
- Id: Ideational
- Ma: Manipulative
- G: Graphology
- RO: Rhetorical Organization
- Im: Imaginative
- D: Dialect
- N: Naturalness
- F: Figures of speech

According to the figure, grammatical and textual knowledge are the two components of organizational knowledge. Grammatical knowledge helps language users form and understand sentences. Vocabulary, syntax, morphology, and graphology are the subcategories of grammatical knowledge. On the other hand, textual knowledge helps language users to form and understand texts including more than two sentences. The two components of textual knowledge include cohesion, or explicit relationships among sentences, and rhetorical organization, or organizational structure of written texts.

Functional and sociolinguistic knowledge are the two components of pragmatic knowledge. Functional knowledge helps language users in interpreting the intended meaning of texts, in four different ways: (i) ideational function, which enables language users to share ideas and feelings; (ii) manipulative function, enables them to affect the world around; (iii) heuristic function, which enables them to learn and extend their knowledge; and (iv) imaginative function, which is used for aesthetic purposes, enabling them to use language imaginatively for creating a new world. Finally, sociolinguistic knowledge makes language users sensitive to the social context, helping them make appropriate use of language. It supports them in appropriately encoding or decoding dialects, registers, idioms, cultural references, as well as figures of speech.

The selected Components of Language Competence as shown in Figure 3 capture a comprehensive image of ESL writing skills. In order to be able to create cohesion, writers should have Organizational knowledge and know how to organize sentences well in a paragraph and organize paragraphs well in a passage. Writers should also have pragmatic knowledge to be able to link texts to their communicative goals (Bachman & Palmer, 1996).

**PYRAMID OF ARGUMENTATION (POA)**

The Pyramid of Argumentation (PoA, Figure 5) was created in the development process of the Analytic Scale of Argumentative Writing (ASAW) (Nimehchisalem, 2010; Nimehchisalem & Mukundan, 2013; Nimehchisalem, Mukundan, & Shameem, 2012; Nimehchisalem & Mukundan, 2011). PoA consists of a three-sided pyramid standing on four pillars. The pyramid in PoA presents a modified version of Classical Rhetoric, in which Toulmin’s model represents the logical appeal as explained by ancient rhetoricians (Figure 4).
As it can be observed in Figure 4, logical appeal, ethical appeal, rhetorical situation, as well as style and arrangement represent the four sides of the pyramid. Assembling the four major elements of argumentative writing discussed thus far creates a three-sided pyramid. In PoA, the emotional appeal (pathos) is replaced by a more important feature, rhetorical situation which is discussed later in this section. Unlike persuasion, in argumentations rarely do we appeal to emotions. In the related literature, previous researchers (for example, Connor & Lauer, 1988) have separated persuasion from argumentation and the component which differentiates them is emotional appeals. While persuasive texts may make frequent appeals to emotions, argumentative discourse typically makes appeals to logic and character (Glenn, Miller, Webb, & Gray, 2004). In advertisements, as examples of persuasive texts, writers frequently create specific emotions in the audience to stimulate them to buy products. A common example would be creating fear in the audience by telling them the items have almost sold out and if they do not hurry, they will miss a good bargain. By contrast, in an argumentative essay, writers make appeal to logic and provide reasons for taking a position rather than trying to persuade readers by creating certain feelings in them. In this line, Nimechisalem (2010) reports that in his analysis of 100 argumentative essays, while there were 144 and 112 occurrences of logical and ethical appeals, emotional appeals had a considerably negligible frequency (12), which was only 4% of the total number of appeals.
made in all the samples. These findings shed light on the distinction between argumentation and persuasion as related but not synonymous modes of writing.

Finally, a very important element in any argument is the rhetorical situation. Also known as *kairos* rhetorical situation is “the context of a rhetorical act; minimally made up of a rhetor, an issue, and an audience” (Crowley & Hawhee, 2004, p. 437). Occasion, purpose, and audience are the main elements of a rhetorical situation (Reid, 1993). To create an effective argument, it is important to take the rhetorical situation into account. What writers write and how they write it are directly influenced by their target occasion, purpose, and readers. What sounds appropriate for a particular rhetorical situation may be totally inappropriate for another.

While Figure 4 shows the theories of argumentation adapted in PoA (that is, the pyramid), Figure 5 illustrates the whole model:

![Figure 5. Pyramid of Argumentation (PoA)](image-url)
As the figure shows, PoA includes Toulmin’s elements of argument, ethical appeal, rhetorical situation, style and arrangement together. Toulmin’s model has replaced the rational appeal in classical rhetoric. Behind the pyramid, the ethical appeal can be observed with its three components. Rhetorical situation also comprises another dimension of the pyramid and emphasizes the role of purpose, occasion and audience in an argument. Style and arrangement finally form the base of the framework. They emphasize that in order to be effective arguments need be well-organized and the language used should be accurate, clear, appropriate and ornate. The interaction between the selected components of classical rhetoric and Toulmin’s model is represented in the form of a pyramid. The shape of the pyramid will reserve its shape even when any of its sides is or are larger, but it looks more balanced when its sides are of the same size.

Bachman’s model comprises four pillars that hold up the pyramid of argument. The function of these pillars is to expand the dimensions of PoA to the areas of language use. They provide a more accurate picture of what is expected from the students when they write argumentative pieces. Strategic knowledge is located in the middle of language knowledge, world knowledge and context of situation. As the arrows indicate, it helps writers select the most appropriate elements of language competence and world knowledge in order to plan and respond to the selected task in a situationally appropriate way. Writers employ strategic competence to pool and actualize all the resources that they have to fulfill the task. Therefore, it plays a central role in writers’ success.

The components of the pyramid and the pillars interact with each other. In order to create an effective and logical argument writers need to integrate their related language and topical knowledge in accordance with the context of situation. Similarly, these competencies aid writers to present a correct, clear, appropriate and ornate style. They also help writers organize their works coherently and cohesively. The rhetorical situation in the pyramid of argument overlaps with the context of situation in Bachman’s model. However, when they are joined together, they provide a useful model of assessing argumentative writing skill. In this model, individuals’ argumentative writing ability, topical knowledge and strategic knowledge are taken into consideration in the actual context of situation.

CLOSING REMARKS
This paper presented an integrated model of argumentative writing. The model is expected to be useful for material developers and language teachers who wish to present a comprehensive picture of argumentative skills to their learners. I will conclude by discussing some of the pedagogical implications of PoA.

The model provides a clear picture of argumentative discourse to language learners and teachers. To offer an example, the components of ‘appeal to character’ has direct implications for teaching and assessing ESL writing. Learners should be taught to indicate good sense by inventing relevant arguments, generating coherent and well-organized ideas, showing resourcefulness, and presenting skillful use of language. They should also know that integrity and good morals are crucial. ESL writers at tertiary level, for example, must be taught to refrain from duplicating others’ ideas without citing them. Finally, by accommodating the teacher’s demands students can show their goodwill. They should know that they will be penalized if they fail to make the expected effort.
Self-assessment checklists can be developed based on this model to allow students assess their own argumentative writing. An integrated model such as PoA will help the developer capture a comprehensive image of argumentative writing as it is informed by both theories of argumentation and theories of language ability and assessment. Indeed, previous researchers have used PoA in developing a self-assessment checklist for undergraduate students’ argumentative writing (Nimechisalem, Yoong, Jaswant Singh, Siti Zaidah, Norouzi, & Khalid, 2014). The checklist was further refined by Vasu, Nimechisalem, Fung, and Sabariah (2018).

Besides its useful implications for ESL writing instruction, the framework is also very helpful for assessing ESL writing. With an increasing emphasis on accountability, educational centers are more interested in making their evaluative criteria more explicit. When it comes to assessing writing, researchers and international testing bodies are expected to use rating scales. Notably, most of these scales are developed qualitatively usually not based on sound theoretical frameworks, and then validated using quantitative methods. Therefore, argumentative scales can be developed based on this model. In fact, a number of argumentative writing scales have been developed by researchers partially based on this model, including Connor and Lauer’s (1988) Argumentative Quality Scale using some of the argumentation theories mentioned above; however, these scales are primary trait and they focus only on a certain aspect of argumentative writing. A writing scale that was developed based on PoA is the Analytic Scale of Argumentative Writing (ASAW) (Nimechisalem, 2010). The scale captures a comprehensive view of argumentative writing skills which boosts its construct validity.

The taxonomy of Components of Language Competence in conjunction with the Theory of Communicative Language Ability provides a very useful framework based on which most language learning-teaching curricula have been developed for the past two decades. The framework explicitly shows what language skills students should master in order to be successful writers. Its strength is that it focuses both on form and on meaning. In this way, the teacher can ensure that the language learners will turn out to be accurate language users who will also be aware of the variations that different social contexts may impose on the language. That is, they will know what is appropriate for a certain context may be considered impolite or too formal for another.

To conclude, future researchers will benefit from a model like PoA and similar models which adapt and integrate several related theories. This results in highly comprehensive and practical models that can be used more conveniently and confidently for pedagogical purposes.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT
I would like to express my sincere gratitude to the anonymous reviewers whose comments helped me improve the quality of this work.

REFERENCES
The ‘Meaning Making’ of PBL: The Learners’ Perspective


ARCHETYPAL MYTH: GODDESS DURGA AND THE RESILIENT Matriarch IN RANI MANICKA’S THE RICE MOTHER

Muhamad Lothfi Zamri1 and Zainor Izat Zainal2*

1 Faculty of Languages and Communication, Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris, 35900 Tanjung Malim, Perak
2 Faculty of Modern Languages and Communication, Universiti Putra Malaysia, 43400 Serdang, Selangor
e-mail: lothfi@fbk.upsi.edu.my ; zainor@upm.edu.my

ABSTRACT
Ruthless victimization of women is often depicted in Malaysian fiction. Characterized by biasness and brutalities of a predominantly male-centred culture, this theme has been a central theme by writers coming from varied cultural and ethnic backgrounds that makeup Malaysia. Rani Manicka also incorporates such theme in her debut novel, The Rice Mother (2003). However, another theme that becomes prominent in this novel is the theme of resiliency – portrayed mainly through the matriarch figure, Lakshmi. Indeed, Lakshmi’s resilience has interesting affinity with Durga, a principal form of the Hindu goddess, and it is against this mythological archetype that we frame the reading of the novel. Ultimately, an understanding of this mythological archetype will provide a clearer lens with which to look at Manicka’s story, and thus, the reader will be able to see how she presents the greater purpose of this archetype: to promote the resilience of the human spirit.

Keywords: Archetype, The Rice Mother, Rani Manicka, Durga, Hindu mythology

INTRODUCTION
To date, the Malaysian writer Rani Manicka has published four novels: The Rice Mother (2003), Touching Earth (2005), The Japanese Lover (2009) and Black Jack (2013). The Rice Mother won the Commonwealth Writers’ Prize in 2003 for South East Asia and South Pacific region. Inspired by Manicka’s Sri Lankan Tamil family history, The Rice Mother illustrates the struggle of a woman from Sri Lanka, Lakshmi, who is conned into marrying a man twice her age in a foreign land called Malaya. She soon finds herself struggling to raise a family on her husband’s meagre earnings. Lakshmi perseveres and soon becomes a formidable matriarch, determines to secure a better life for her children. Surviving through different phases in the Malaysian history, right from the Japanese occupation during World War II to contemporary times, Lakshmi rises to face every new challenge her family has to face. Indeed, Lakshmi’s resilience is exemplary and inspiring, and a close reading reveals an interesting affinity with Durga (literally translates into “the one who eliminates suffering”), a principal form of the Hindu goddess, and it is against this mythological archetype that we frame the reading of the novel. Ultimately, an understanding of this mythological archetype will provide a clearer lens with which to look at Lakshmi the matriarchal figure in The Rice Mother, and thus, the reader will be able to see how Manicka presents the greater purpose of this archetype: to promote the resilience of the human spirit.
ARCHETYPES

The archetypes that we recognize in dreams, myths, literature, religions and folklories today such as the hero, mother, and wise man were originally a theory by Carl Jung in the field of psychology. To Jung, the collective unconscious, or archetypes, is distinct from the personal unconscious because they are not from the memory experienced by any one person (Snowden, 2010, p.42). The collective unconscious is hereditary, comprising archetypes, or universal symbols and motives shared by humanity. The archetypal mother for instance, is shared across cultures. Throughout histories, cultures have elevated exemplary mother figures to personify the moral qualities and values most desired and expected from a mother. In discussing the mother, questions like the qualities that define a mother and whether they are ‘good’ or ‘terrible’ mother are automatically asked. These may seem easy to answer. A typical image of the ‘good mother’ usually includes a female individual who is nurturing, selfless and caring, whereas a ‘terrible mother’ is the exact opposite of the ‘good mother’. Across cultures, the mother archetype comes in many forms and images such as mother, grandmother, and stepmother, mother in law, nurse, governess, queens and goddesses. The Greek goddess Gaia for instance, is believed to be the great mother who governs the universe, often depicted as a curved, voluptuous woman, sometimes shown rising directly from the earth, and other times reclining directly upon it. Hathor, in ancient Egypt, is the goddess of the sky, women, fertility, and love. As Le Grice has posited, these “goddesses of myth . . . can be seen as personifications of specific aspects of archetypes” (2016, p. 95). In contemporary times, Mother Teresa, founder of the Order of the Missionaries of Charity, a Roman Catholic congregation of women dedicated to the poor in India and recipient of the 1979 Nobel Prize for Peace, embodies the archetype of the compassionate mother. These three mother figures differ in terms of their stature and roles in the respective societies but they embody the same archetype – the mother.

Major works that applied Jung’s theory of archetypes to literature include Maud Bodkin’s Archetypal Patterns in Poetry (1934), Northrop Frye’s Anatomy of Criticism (1954), and Joseph Campbell’s Hero with a Thousand Faces (1949). Because archetypes deal with universal archetypes across genres, periods and languages, they have been criticized for “gross generalization” (Groden and Kreiswirth, 1994, p. 38), “inadequate challenge to received ideas” (Selden, et al. 1993, p.5) as well as “oversimplification of complex issues” (Stephen, 2000, p.353). However, because archetypes serve as “imprints hardwired into our psyches that influence characters we love in art, literature, great religions of the world and contemporary films” (Mark and Pearson, 2001, p.11), they are still relevant to the modern world as globalisation and integration of different cultures through mass media, on-line social interaction and the gradual dependence of people on these technological advancement show that people can recognise archetypes which serve as the bond of their humanity (Adamski, 2011).

GODDESS DURGA IN HINDU MYTHOLOGY

As one of the oldest religions, Hinduism has a myriad of unique myths. Indeed, mythology is central in Hindu culture in which stories of Gods and Goddesses are passed down in oral and written literature as a means to teach its followers about life. In Hindu mythology, figures such as Shiva and Durga are indispensable: while Shiva is worshipped as the father of the universe, Durga is his other half – the mother of the universe. In Hindu mythology, Durga embodies divine shakti, or else known as the female divine energy, that is used to protect her
devotees from negative vices or evil powers. Durga’s existence lies on a great mission – to defeat Mahisasura, the buffalo demon. She assumes the power of male gods, Brahma, Shiva and Vishnu, then rides a lion into battle. Durga slays the buffalo demon by cutting off its head thus destroying its spirit that emerges from the severed neck. It is through this gallant act that Durga establishes order in the universe.

Durga’s depiction in Hindu myth usually revolves around these attributes: She wears a red saree and jewellery; rides a lion; possesses three eyes; and has eight to ten arms which hold a trident as well as other weapons such as chakra, sword, club, trident and bow and arrow. These attributes are naturally symbolic in meaning (Kalra, 2012). The colour red symbolizes action and courage in destroying evil and protecting humanity. The jewellery that she wears not only represents eternal beauty but they also serve to assist her in battle. The lion symbolizes Durga’s unlimited power, will and determination. As Kalra (2012) posits, “The lion is a symbol of uncontrolled animalistic tendencies (such as anger, arrogance, selfishness, greed, jealousy, desire to harm others etc.) and Her sitting on it reminds us to control these qualities, so that we are not controlled by them” (“What Does Goddess Durga Symbolize?”). The three eyes that she has represent desire, action, and knowledge. Her multi arms indicate that she is capable of handling many tasks and ready to battle evil in order to protect her devotees. The trident she holds is symbolic of the three human qualities—Satwa (inactivity or the ideal state of mind characterized by awareness and purity of thought), Rajas (activity or energy associated with desires, wishes and ambitions) and Tamas (lethargy and stress). Other weapons in the hands of Durga relay the idea that one weapon cannot destroy different kinds of enemies. Depending on the circumstances, different weapons are needed to fight enemies. Likewise, human ‘enemies’ such as selfishness must be destroyed by detachment, jealousy by lack of desire, and prejudice by self-knowledge.

In The Devi Mahatmyam (literally translates into “Glory of the Goddess”), a Hindu religious text composed in Sanskrit circa 400-500 C.E., Durga manifests itself into several avatars which are Kali, Shakti, Gauri, Uma, Parvati, Chandi, Ambika, Lalita, Bhavani, Bhagvati, Java, and Rajeshwari. The ferocious Kali for instance, emerges from Durga’s forehead to vanquish evils. Durga’s power lies not only in her ruthless skills and prowess to slay Mahisasura but also other vicious demons such as Raktajiba, Dhumralocana, Chanda and Munda. Undefeated, she is also known as the fertility goddess, ruling the vegetable kingdom, as well as curing infectious diseases. In short, the projection of the strong, protective, compassionate, multitasking and resilient side of womanhood is embodied in Durga.

**LAKSHMI THE FERTILITY GODDESS**

Upon arriving in Malaya, Lakshmi discovers that her husband, Ayah, is highly indebted; leaving the bulk of his meagre wage merely for settling debts. Driven by the adversity, Lakshmi begins to “clear away the weeds, long grasses and nasty brambles” which results in hurting her horribly with back pain and her hands “bleeding” (Manicka, 2003, p.33). The pain she suffers from does not deter her in any way but in fact has motivated her in creating her own farm with vegetables and livestock:

My little plot prospered. I ran my finger down the velvety skin of a new crop okra, was surprised by the redness of my bird’s-eye chillies, and grew especially proud of my shiny purple eggplants. And my chicken coop was success even before my belly...
filled out the space in front of me. I was happy and satisfied. The debts were taken of, and I had even begun to save a modest amount inside a small tin that I hid in the rice sack (Manicka, 2003, p.36)

Lakshmi is portrayed to be resourceful, particularly in making use of the green landscape surrounding her dwelling during the toughest times, such as during the Japanese occupation in Malaya. The harsh impact of Japanese invasion in The Rice Mother is discussed by Mani and Veeraputhran. The occupation has affected people of Malaya tremendously to the extent that “people suffered from food shortage and were forced to live on boiled tapioca” (Mani and Veeraputhran, 2017, p.3). Not only food is scarce but people live in chaos, as a result of a plethora of diseases and rampant looting. Access to medicine was rare. People do not roam the street as they used to, as the Japanese enforce strict rules. In term of economy, unemployment rate is high and international trading comes to halt. This has affected Lakshmi’s family especially when Ayah is brutally beaten by the Japanese army, thus unable to go to work.

Despite this trying condition, Lakshmi proves herself to be unbeatable. The first thing she does when she realises that the British money has become useless, is to order her son, Lakshman, to hide her savings and jewelleries under the coconut tree. Next, she invests in livestock, by trading her precious jewellery with cows and goats. She asks Lakshman to bring the milk from the cows to the coffee shops in the morning and set the yoghurt during the day. She also herds chickens where she puts them into a chicken coop under her house. Lakshmi also sells off her jewellery to buy food so that her family survives. The jewellery that Lakshmi possesses alludes to one of the major attributes of the goddess Durga. Durga’s creation is so beautiful that the trinity Gods (Lord Siva, Brahma and Vishnu) are so pleased to provide her with weapons and jewelries. As mentioned earlier, Durga is created with the mission to get rid of the evil Mahisasura. Jewellery on the other hand, is presented by the trinity to assist her in the battle. Similarly, Lakshmi utilizes the jewels she has as a means to provide food for the family. The animals which Lakshmi buys from selling the jewellery, along with the garden she cultivates are their source of food during times of adversity. Lakshmi’s garden serves as a ‘collateral’ to protect the family from famine. There is a marked similarity between Lakshmi and Durga. Just like Durga who controls green fertility in order to feed her devotees, Lakshmi too works her best in providing for the family. Lakshmi’s strength does not only involve providing food but healing as well. During the Japanese invasion, Ayah comes home with a terrible condition but Lakshmi shows no fear but finds a remedy to help him recover using herbs and leaves from her garden:

She (Lakshmi) burned bits of old cloth over the stove and used the snuffed-out charred ends to rub over his entire body. Father (Ayah) groaned with reliefs as the carbon soaked into his sores. His swollen face she bathed with the liquid from boiled peanut plant leaves... came back from the market, and on the chopping block outside the kitchen she unwrapped a dark green papaya-leaf package. Inside was a garishly red piece of crocodile meat. Good for healing wounds... she cooked the meat with herbs... every day, for many days, she untied papaya-leaf packages and cooked the bright red meat inside (Manicka, 2003, p.105)
LAKSHMI THE PROTECTIVE AND COMPASSIONATE MOTHER

Although Durga is commonly known as a ferocious goddess whose existence is driven by a war to kill an evil, the defeat of the demon symbolises her role of protecting mankind, doing away with negative elements. Durga is also known as Durgatinashini, which means the one who eliminates misery. She is believed to be the one who removes the suffering of her devotees. Durga not only protects her devotees from the evils but she provides comfort as well. Lakshmi throughout the novel is the one who offers comfort to her family members in tough times. As stated earlier, when her husband is hurt by the Japanese soldiers, Lakshmi is the one who gently attends to his need that “the only person he recognized when he half opened his eyes was her” (Manicka, 2003, p.105). Ayah is illustrated to be dependent on Lakshmi during the trying times that Lakshmi’s name is the only name that comes out from his mouth. Though Lakshmi seems to be depicted as having an estranged relationship with Ayah, she tries her best to heal him. Finding remedy is not the only thing she does to help Ayah recover but she also supports him emotionally that one of the children, Anna, starts to believe that her mother, Lakshmi indeed loves her father. Anna remembers the many occasions in which her mother scolds her father severely. She never hears her mother singing to her father before but the opposite happens when Ayah is in pain.

Lakshmi’s love to her children undeniably has no boundaries. Her first child experience is described to be what she is hoping for all her life, a gift from God. The excitement to have twins is beyond her wishes. She is rather grateful and does whatever it takes to protect them. Other than her first-born, she has other children whom she loves unconditionally. When Mohini, an incredibly gorgeous fair daughter with green eyes, falls sick, Lakshmi applies all remedies available to save her. At first she opts for traditional remedies including herbs and Ayurvedic pills, hoping for a speedy recovery but to no avail. As Mohini’s condition gets worse, she takes her to the hospital but her condition remains unchanged. Her neighbour, Mui Tsai advises her to try some Chinese medicine whom her master from Shanghai recommends. Initially Lakshmi is not convinced with the idea but eventually she agrees to it. As Lakshmi wants Mohini to be cured, she decides to give it a shot. Mohini has to swallow a special breed of red-eyed rat which is newly born. To Lakshmi’s surprise, Mohini begins to recover. Besides protecting her from illness, Lakshmi does all she could to protect Mohini during the Japanese occupation.

According to Amran and Hashim (2013), “young and pretty women during the war were taken as the Japanese comfort women” (p.5). At that time, regardless of race, no one was spared from becoming a victim to Japanese atrocities. Apart from the usual target – Chinese women – Malay and Indian women were brutally forced to become military prostitutes, or comfort women. As a result, young women were often hidden and dressed like boys by their parents. Anna recalls when her mother, Lakshmi is aware of what is happening to the women hence is determined to protect her daughter, Mohini. She does not want to let Mohini roam free outside the house and therefore has Mohini’s hair cut like a boy. She is not willing to take the risk of losing her daughter to the Japanese. Eventually, she hides Mohini under the floor of the house. Unfortunately, just when she thinks it is almost over and wants to turn Mohini into a vegetarian, luck is not on her side. Mohini is taken away by the Japanese. Lakshmi begs the Japanese not to take Mohini but her plea falls on deaf ears.

Lakshmi also fits into Durga’s role as discussed by Santiko (1997) when Durga is regarded as a goddess who protects her devotees from “poverty” and “separated from their loved ones” (p.215). Mohini’s twin, Lakshman, is severely affected by the atrocious incident.
Later, he leaves for Singapore and keeps in touch with the family only at the beginning of his arrival. Soon, he rarely writes and Lakshmi is not happy at all. Being a protective mother, she even sends a friend’s son to investigate Lakshman’s whereabouts. To her horror, he has turned into a gambler who plays mah-jong. She remains calm and “settled Lakshman’s debt” and even “sent him a return ticket” (Manicka, 2003, p.215). Apart from her children, Lakshmi also protects her daughter-in-law who is chased out the house.

Soon, Ratha was pregnant. She suffered badly from morning sickness. Mother Marie biscuits, marinated ginger, and three maternity dresses. She also offered to supply the down payment on a terrace house in a newly built development outside town, but Ratha was too proud to accept and though Jeyan sent a polite refusal, I saw her once in the night market, wearing one of the maternity dresses that Mother (Lakshmi) had sent (Manicka, 2003, p.266)

Even though not all her daughters-in-law favour her, Lakshmi’s children love her dearly. Her daughter Lalita recalls when her sister-in-law, Lakshman’s wife, calls Lakshmi a female spider. Lalita is proud of her mother despite the name-calling by her sister-in-law. Lalita feels blessed to have a mother whose lives revolves around nothing but to provide food, shelter, clothes and love to her family. In contrast to what her sister-in-law regards her mother, she deems her to be someone who is beautiful inside out. She even wishes to be like her mother although physically she resembles her father more. The word ‘spider’ used by Manicka alludes to Durga in terms of her multiple arms. A spider has eight legs, which resembles Durga’s physical feature of having many arms. Spider is used as a metaphor to the various things that Lakshmi has done to her family. The multitasking diligence can also be observed in Durga.

**LAKSHMI THE FEROCIOUS AND RESILIENT Matriarch**

In *The Rice Mother*, Lakshmi has shown the other side of her, just like Durga in the battle with Raktabija. Being a particular bookkeeper of the family, Lakshmi remembers well the amount of money she has, and where she keeps it.

I had 39,346 ringgit in the bank, 100 ringgit under the mattress, 50 ringgit in an envelope tied together with mother’s letter, and 15 ringgit and perhaps 80 or 90 cents in my purse (Manicka, 2003, p.203)

She realizes that she has lost one ringgit and asks her children if they have taken it. She is supposed to buy a coconut bun but decides not to do so when one ringgit is missing. The children admit that they have not taken it except Jeyan who is not at home. Lakshmi knows that Jeyan must have taken it since he is not at home and probably must not expect his mother to notice that one ringgit is missing. The rage in Lakshmi grows. To portray Lakshmi’s anger, Manicka uses the word “monster” to describe the livid Lakshmi. This other side of Lakshmi resembles Kali, the avatar of Durga. The diction “monster” is used repeatedly to depict the wrath which leads her into torturing Jeyan for a lesson. Just like Durga who is known to be ferocious, Kali appears when the anger takes over. Lakshmi too admits that “that was me, beloved mother, but after that the monster took over, said and did the things I could never have said or done” (Manicka, 2003, p.204). Even after Jeyan admits...
he has taken the money, Lakshmi is not ready to forgive him, “The monster turned away. The confession was not enough” (Manicka, 2003, p.204). This depiction alludes to Kali, who after drinking a lot of blood, is not able to calm herself. Another resemblance can also be observed when Durga reincarnates into Kali to kill Raktabija. Durga has to turn herself into another avatar in order to accomplish the mission. Similarly, to teach Jeyan a lesson, “the monster” in Lakshmi gets Lakshman to beat up Jeyan. It will not “rest” until Jeyan is punished. Another striking resemblance to Durga’s narrative in relation to Kali is the chilli powder which is used by Lakshmi to punish Jeyan. When Raktabija drops his blood, Kali drinks all of it to defeat him. Chilli powder is symbolic in Lakshmi’s case as it is used to torment Jeyan. The monster within Lakshmi starts to recede after Jeyan hysterically screams in pain. Lakshman is shocked that the monster in Lakshmi is able to do something so ferocious. Jeyan’s constant screaming and begging indicates his defeat which eventually turns Lakshmi into herself again. Though Lakshmi shows a sign of remorse after the incident by reminding herself of her mother’s advice to be patient, she admits that the monster within her simply could not be vanished and may reappear anytime. Lakshmi may appear ferocious at times but she does that out of love as she wants the best for her family.

Being married at a young age, her life revolves around her children and husband, “And, there was so much she never had, so much she couldn’t be” (Manicka, 2003, p.79). And thereby she channels what she wants to have and be by projecting it to her children. She may not be aware of doing this but Anna, one of her children, points out that “Mother gave up her life for us, and she took that as the right to live through us” (Manicka, 2003, p.79). In order to live up her dream, Lakshmi becomes the decision maker, taking over the responsibility from Ayah. Anna also mentions that her mother, Lakshmi only wants the best for her children so she decides what is best for them. Lakshmi is depicted to be a “quick” and “clever” woman when it comes to making decisions. She may be a homemaker yet her love towards her family makes her become the one who takes control over her household. Ayah seems to be a bit laidback and calmer. His colleagues are promoted and he on the other hand, remains in the same position. He seems to be in his comfort zone and never complains about it. In fact, when he is stuck at the same position with barely enough to support his family, he is willing to help others who are in need. When his friend is having a financial crisis, Ayah is sought after for help. One day, he is at home with his friend. He has signed an agreement as a guarantor and is ready to tell Lakshmi about the repayment term. Lakshmi who is already tired with the same scenario simply takes the form from his husband and “tore the carefully signed slips of paper into tiny pieces and threw them up in the air. My husband’s money is for his children. Whatever money we have is for our children” (Manicka, 2003, p.79). She even walks to the kitchen with “beaming smile” (Manicka, 2003, p.79), which shows her pride for protecting her family. Throughout the story, Lakshmi’s relationship with her husband, Ayah, is portrayed to be steady but it is vague when it comes to whether they love one another. Without a doubt, Ayah loves Lakshmi unconditionally from the beginning, “so deeply that organs inside my body moved” (Manicka, 2003, p.193). Unfortunately Ayah himself is not sure whether Lakshmi loves him: “Dreaming in the night, I sometimes reached out for her, and even in sleep she moaned and turned away. And I knew again that I loved in vain. She would never come to love me” (Manicka, 2003, p.195).

The children observe that the father, Ayah has always had a soft spot towards their children. The children also notice how Ayah is treated by their mother. Lakshmi at times can be quite harsh not only to her husband but to her children too. She can be cold towards Ayah
at times. However, things change when Ayah falls off from his bicycle and is rushed to the hospital. Initially he is not seriously injured but his legs later become paralysed. At that time, Lakshmi visits Ayah and her routine begins to change. She skips breakfast because she needs to be at the hospital nursing her husband. She takes her asthma pills without having anything which causes her gastritis. She feeds her husband but does not feed herself. Physiotherapy at the hospital does not help much so Ayah decides to discharge himself and stay at home. Ayah’s condition gets worse and he dies slowly. He is almost completely paralysed but Lakshmi does not give up. Instead, she feeds him and sits next to him “all day” (Manicka, 2003, p.275). Ayah eventually loses the battle and dies. Lakshmi does not even cry but stands by herself during the funeral and watches the fire destroys the mattress which she and Ayah spent on for years. She stands there to witness the fire burn the mattress in which she conceives all her children on. Eventually, “tears ran down her face” (Manicka, 2003, p.277). She mourns silently and one of her children, Lalita even heard her whisper “I ask the boon that in my next life, I am given the same husband, for it seems I loved him all along”(Manicka, 2003, p.277). Lakshmi is unaware that she loves her husband more than herself when she feeds him but not herself. Her action is significant with the title of the book, The Rice Mother, the one who provides food for the family but beyond that, she provides not only food but strength to them. Rice serves as a symbol. Rice is vital for growth, and that is what Lakshmi does to her family, her husband and her children. She provides rice as a necessary element not only for her households’ physical growth but mental growth as well; the strength in the family, especially during tough times when she nurses her husband beaten by the Japanese and before he dies.

CONCLUSION
Reading The Rice Mother from the lens of mythological archetype reinstates the view that recurring patterns from myths do exist in contemporary fiction. Hindu mythology serves as a useful lens to further understand Lakshmi, the formidable matriarch who undergoes many obstacles but survives as a powerful woman, just like Durga the Goddess. Lakshmi’s characteristics as shown in this study are very much similar to Goddess Durga in terms of the struggles she has to endure. As Durga is well known for her power to vanish demons, Lakshmi on the other hand is known for her indefatigable mission to protect her family, vanishing all obstacles that come their way. Though Lakshmi does not have multiple arms like Durga, she manages various things and roles throughout her life. Just like Durga who can be incarnated into other avatars, Lakshmi also has a multidimensional personality. She can be fierce and ferocious, just like Kali (an avatar of Durga). By dissecting the essential traits of Durga and relating these to Lakshmi, and vice-versa, mythological archetypes help us to experience human’s will and determination that transcend time. By tapping into the Hindu mythological archetype of Goddess Durga, Manicka foregrounds and promotes the resiliency of the human spirit through powerful characterization of the formidable matriarch Lakshmi. Just like Durga, Lakshmi inspires us to never doubt our inner power to fight and persevere in times of adversity.

REFERENCES
Amran, N.A., & Hashim, R.S. “Reading Japanese Occupation in Malaya in The Rice Mother Through the Lens of Social Memory.” *Asian Social Science*, 9(7). 144-150. DOI: 10.5539/ass.v9n7p144


ABSTRACT
Everyday interaction is not a faultless process. It is possible for the process to experience troubles in speaking, hearing or understanding that can lead to interactional breakdowns between speakers. One available mechanism for speakers to address and resolve trouble is through other-initiated repair (OIR). Majority of OIR studies to date have used English language as data source. This may not entirely describe similar strategies employ by speakers of other languages when they participate in OIR. The present study aims to examine strategies for speakers of Malay language to initiate repair following troubles in everyday interaction. Three parent-child dyads of Malay language speakers were selected as participants. Their interaction over several homely activities (i.e. family meal time) were recorded and later transcribed following Jefferson Transcription System (2004). Analysis on strategies was quantitatively performed following Philip’s (2008) Clarification Request coding scheme. Overall result showed that parents and children employ different types of strategies when they are in position to initiate repair. Children largely depend on the use of open-class word that is known to be a weak repair initiator while parents are consistent with a more specific repair initiator. Result from this study provides novel discovery on how Malay speakers initiate repair in the context of parent-child interaction and it can serve as comparative data for future typological studies.

Key words: Other-initiated repair; strategies; parent-child interaction; Malay language

INTRODUCTION
Troubles in speaking, hearing or understanding during the process of everyday interaction can negatively affect speakers’ mutual understanding. Therefore, speakers must find their way out from such situation so interaction can progress to its possible end and be successful. To accomplish this, repair practice provides speakers with necessary mechanism to deal with troubles during the on-going process of interaction. Repair is not merely a term but rather a social action that guides them with systematic and organised technique in effort to maintain mutual understanding when troubles occurred (Schegloff, Jefferson & Sacks, 1977). There are several types of repair but this paper solely focuses on other-initiated repair (OIR) for its ability to showcase speakers’ cooperative behaviour (Dingemanse & Enfield, 2015).

OIR describes situation in interaction when one speaker initiates repair from his/her co-speaker on preceding turn that is treated to contain problem. Following this initiation, repair is given by a speaker who produced the trouble source. In doing so, speakers need to be equipped with necessary language, cognitive and social skills (Cho & Larke, 2011). According to Dingemanse and Enfield (2015), OIR connects language, mind and social life. These skills actually help speakers to organise their OIR sequence that can quickly resolve occurring troubles. Specifically, speaker needs to design initiation turn that can inform the
co-speaker on what kinds of trouble that have caused breakdown between them (Hayashi & Kim, 2015). Thus, speakers are expected to employ various resources available in language when they design the initiation turn (Dingemanse et al., 2015).

In their study on repair in American English, Schegloff et al. (1977) found five formats of design that are common to be used when speakers want to initiate repair. The identified formats are open-class word such as *ha* or *what*, question words like *when*, partial repeat of problematic speech with question word, repeat of problematic speech and finally, offering candidate understanding through *you mean* format. Svennevig (2008) listed these formats according to their strength in specifying troubles in which open-class word is perceived to be weak due to inability to inform the kind of trouble while offering candidate understanding is recognised to have higher strength.

Following Schegloff et al. (1977), studies on OIR have developed to cover many aspects of investigation such as prosodic element in initiation across several format (Dehe, 2015), initiation by language impaired speaker such as autistic children (Wiklund, 2016) or hearing loss individual (Ekberg, Hickson & Grenness, 2017) and the role of non-verbal behaviour like mutual gaze and hand gesture in repair initiation (Mortensen, 2016). These studies have helped to provide deeper understanding on how speakers design their initiation turn during spontaneous interaction, the possible link of initiation format to types of trouble and the role of language in designing initiation format.

This study is motivated due to high attention of OIR studies on English language as primary spoken data (Kendrick, 2015) and also the unavailability of systematic study that looks into the format of initiation in languages around the world (Dingemanse & Enfield, 2015). Even though studies have generally shown that OIR is organised similarly; first being the trouble turn, followed by initiation turn and then, repair turn, it however does not entirely indicate the practice of OIR to be universal.

Despite the similarity in types of repair format, how speakers carry out the initiation or the manner in which initiation is delivered can vary across languages (Sidnell, 2008) and the process may be tied to particular linguistic system (Dingemanse, Blythe & Dirksmeyer, 2014). According to Hayashi and Kim (2015), the design of initiation turn is controlled by the grammatical aspect of the language. Given the fact that languages across the world are built in different and unique linguistic features such as in the aspect of syntactic, phonetic and semantic system, this can significantly influence how OIR is designed (Sidnell, 2008; Svennevig, 2008; Hayashi & Kim, 2015). Similarly, Wierzbicka (1991) confirmed that the ways speakers resolve interactional troubles differ cross-culturally.

Overall, the practice of OIR can be said to be a language-specific interactional action (Dingemanse, Blythe & Dirksmeyer, 2014). Taking this point as departure, the present study looks into how Malay speakers design their OIR turn. Repair to interactional breakdowns in general or more specifically, OIR has not been examined quite extensively and from researchers’ own search through available database, study on OIR in Malay language is almost scarce or yet to be available. It is quite significant to look into the aspect of OIR sequence in Malay language for several reasons; first the language is spoken by almost 77 million people around the world and is currently ranked as the 6th language with total number of speakers (Summer Institute of Linguistics, 2017) and secondly, understanding on OIR sequence in Malay language is impossible to be generated from available literatures because current body of knowledge offers insight into languages that are classified in different language group than Malay language.
As a brief overview, Malay is a language that belongs to Austronesian family (Norsimah, Kesumawati, Nor Zakiah & Nor Hashimah, 2007). Structurally, morphological system in Malay is rich with derivational morpheme but inflectional morpheme is not available (Goddard, 2002; Mohd et al., 2016). While morpheme in English can denote changes in its grammatical aspect such as tense (for example present tense walks to past tense walked), the Malay morpheme can change the syntactic category of the words; for example verb to noun as in “minum” (drink) to “peminum” (drinker).

In addition to morphology, Malay language also has certain phonological characteristics that are not similar to English. Generally, Malay like other languages within the group of Austronesian has a simple phonology (Zuraidah, Yong & Knowles, 2008). For example, stress in English has variety of roles where stress patterns are commonly used to infer meanings to certain words or expressions (Thomson, 1996). But in Malay language, stress is identified to have no significant function and usually, stressed syllables are accompanied with stretching of sound or loudness in pitch (Juliah, 1993). In other words, Malay language does not associate itself to the notion of stress despite its speakers can have variety of prosodic changes in speech (Zuraidah et al., 2008).

With this in mind, this study looks into how Malay speakers initiate repair following interactional troubles that occur in the preceding turn during everyday interaction. Specifically, information on strategies that are employed by speakers to initiate repair is discussed. The discussion will draw from the context of parent-child interaction. This allows the study to further develop another objective, which is to compare strategies between parents as adult speakers and children.

Method
This study is conducted within the paradigm of Conversation Analysis (CA). CA is a methodological approach that scientifically examines everyday interaction and has been developed by Harvey Sacks, Emanuel Schegloff and Gail Jefferson in the 1960s (Sidnell, 2016). This approach provides systematic ways for researchers to understand how speakers organise their everyday interaction particularly in several key features such as turn-taking organisation and repair organisation. Thus, this study is strictly guided by CA in its data collection procedure and turn-by-turn examination.

Participants
Three families (N=3) were selected to participate in the study. The families consist of parents either both father and mother or one of them only together with their children. Specifically, family 1 is constituted of mother and daughter. The Mother is a housewife while her daughter is aged 7 years old at the time of data collection. Family 2 on the other hand includes parents and their 10-year old son. The father works as technician while his mother is a primary school teacher. Lastly, family 3 includes father, mother and their son. The father is a policeman and the mother is a housewife. Their son on the other hand is at primary school age (12 years old). Table 1 highlights the profiles of participants.
Participants for this study are selected through purposive sampling technique, whereby they must meet specific requirements for inclusion. The requirements are Malay to be their first language and have children at primary school age. All participants are able to participate in everyday interaction within home compound. All participants reside in the central west of peninsular Malaysia (i.e. Kuala Lumpur and Selangor) where the accent of Malay language is known to many. Clinical examination on the children’s psychosocial functioning to determine children’s ability to participate in interaction is not conducted. This instead is obtained through parents’ report on their children’s ability. Other variables such as socioeconomic background, gender and academic achievement of the children are not within the scope of the present study; thus are not subjected to analysis.

Source of Data
The primary data is largely drawn from a series of recording of everyday interaction between parents and their children within their home compound. To ensure natural quality of interactional data, which is key for CA data, no specific tasks or topics of interaction were given in advance. Rather, participants were made free to interact on any issues or participate in any activities of their choice. Total hour of recordings accumulated almost 7 hours (381.4 minutes) of recording. From these recordings, OIR sequence is identified through the presence of repair initiation and as a result, a total of 219 OIR sequences serve as primary data source.

Data Collection Procedure
Participants were first met with researcher to be explained on the nature of study and how its data are going to be collected. Participants were also briefed on their rights and responsibilities should they agree to participate. Agreement to participate is validated through participants’ signature on prepared consent letter.

Next step was recording of interaction. Specifically, this process includes a series of video recordings of interactions between parents and their children with inclusion of secondary participants such as other siblings. Recordings were made over several homely activities such as family’s lunch time and leisure time. Recordings were made through suitable recording tool that records both audio and visual. Once recording completes, transcription of data commenced.

Table 1: Participants’ Profile

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Age (at time of recording)</th>
<th>Number of recording</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family 1</td>
<td>Mother</td>
<td>42 years old</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lisa</td>
<td>7 years old</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family 2</td>
<td>Father</td>
<td>44 years old</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mother</td>
<td>44 years old</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Aiman</td>
<td>9 years old</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family 3</td>
<td>Father</td>
<td>47 years old</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mother</td>
<td>45 years old</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Aniq</td>
<td>12 years old</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Transcription
This study adopts Jefferson’s Transcription System (2004), which is a widely used transcription system (Hutchby & Wooffitt, 2008). This system of transcription represents various features of talk in written form that include temporal and sequential aspects such as latching, pauses and overlaps and prosodic features such as pitch, sound lengthening, and pace of talk. The system also integrates features such as aspiration and laughing. Finally, nonverbal activities such as change of eye gaze and hand gesture are transcribed as well.

As the data are in Malay, the transcription employs multi-linear transcription (Hepburn & Bolden, 2012). Through this system, the first line represents the original talk in the video, the second line represents morpheme-by-morpheme English gloss of the original that provides translation to the original word and grammatical information in abbreviated way (e.g. NOUN) and the third line represents English gloss within contextual meaning.

The transcription is presented in three columns. The first column indicates the line number for reference on where the talk occurs in data. The second column indicates the speaker through standardised letter (e.g. AMN for Aiman). Finally, the third column contains the orthographic transcription of the data.

Data Coding
OIR is operationally viewed as request made by speaker following troubles in hearing, speaking or understanding. This follows definition provided by Schegloff et al. (1977). The term OIR is consistently used in this study as it follows CA terminology even though it carries similar meaning as other terms like clarification request. OIR is identified in the data from a sequential perspective following next turn procedure. Then, Philip’s Clarification Request (2008) is adopted to code OIR strategies.

Philip’s Clarification Request (2008) lists coding categories for repair initiation strategies made by speakers following breakdowns in interaction. The coding categories are developed by Biji Alice Philip (2008) based on categories reported in previous literatures. It lists seven types of clarification request strategies (or OIR) that are used as coding scheme.

Table 2 lists the coding scheme.

Table 2: Philip’s Clarification Request (2008)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Clarification Requests</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Non-specific (NS)</td>
<td>Neutral request such as “huh”, “what”. This is similar to Drew (1997)’s open-class repair initiator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Specific request for repetition (SRR)</td>
<td>Request in which a wh-question replaces a part of the original utterance of the speaker.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Specific request for specification (SRS)</td>
<td>Listener indicates what specific additional information is required to fix the breakdown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>request for confirmation (CONFR)</td>
<td>Repetitions with rising intonation, reductions or elaboration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. Direct request (DR)  Request for the exact definition of a component in a message
6. Relevance requests (RR)  Request that questions the relevance of what the speaker says
7. Cloze requests (CR)  Request that gives two choices to choose from


Validity and Reliability
Transcription of audio recording, coding of data and analysis technique are the three main aspects of this study that require validation. Two faculty members who have experience in interactional data were appointed to examine the accuracy of transcription, assigned coding for repair sequence and data analysis. The process involved examination of the transcription while listening to the audio recording, examination of the translation and assessment of the assigned coding for repair sequence. In case of dissimilarity with researcher’s own works, discussion was made until agreement is achieved. The validation of transcriptions however did not include participants themselves for the availability of recordings to cross-check.

Data Analysis
Data were first analysed through frequency count of OIR strategies. The frequency count provides information on distribution of strategies that can act as evidence for their occurrence. In the next step, each identified strategy was examined and described in relation to its context of occurrence in term of linguistic resources being used. This follows CA’s approach of analysis which is turn-by-turn examination.

Results
Results for this study are discussed in two parts; first part aims to highlight the frequency of OIR strategies and compare their distribution between parents and children. Description of the most employed strategies by parents and children by highlighting their context of occurrence is given in the second section that follows.

Distribution of OIR strategies
The first aim of this study is to look at the distribution of OIR strategies between parents and children. Table 3 shows the distribution in its frequency of occurrence.

Table 3: Distribution of Repair Initiation Strategies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>OIR Strategies</th>
<th>Parents</th>
<th>Children</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Specific request for specification</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Request for confirmation</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Non-specific/Open-class repair initiator</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Direct request</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Specific request for repetition</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 shows the total number of OIR strategies that have been identified in the data set is 235 strategies. From the table, it indicates a clear gap in the frequency of OIR strategies between parents and children i.e. a total of 194 occurrences for parents compared to only 41 occurrences for children. This indicates that parents have to significantly initiate repair from the children that produce more troubles than the children themselves. From the table also, parents are seen to employ OIR strategy’s specific request for specification the most as compared to other strategies. Of 194 OIR strategies identified, specific request for specification is seen in 79 repair initiation turns and this is significantly higher than other strategies employed by parents. The second most employed strategy is request for confirmation where the frequency of occurrence is seen in 43 repair initiation turns. This is followed with non-specific/open-class repair initiator strategy (N=27), direct request (N=15), cloze request (N=15) and specific request for repetition (13). In addition, this study has identified the use of non-verbal as repair initiation strategy to be employed by parents in three (N=3) occurrences. The use of non-verbal includes gestures like frowning of eyes or nodding head up.

In contrast, children are recorded to employ the most strategy of non-specific or open-class repair initiator where it is identified in 19 repair initiation turns. The next OIR strategy that is found in children’s repair initiation turn is request for confirmation (N=6). Other repair initiation strategies occur at minimal level; specific request for specification (N=5), specific request for repetition (N=5) and direct request (N=3). Similar to parents, the use of non-verbal can be seen in three (N=3) repair initiation turns while cloze request strategy does not occur in children’s data set.

**Description of Repair Initiation Strategies**

The second aim of this study is to describe the OIR strategies employ by parents and children in terms of their context of occurrence in relation to type of breakdowns. This includes the linguistic resources that they use to construct the initiation turns. Randomly selected extracts from data set are used to accompany the discussion.

The most OIR strategy employ by parents is specific request for specification. Extract 1 shows an example of its occurrence.

**Extract 1 Running man (Aiman-mother)**

```plaintext
1 M ape die running man tu?
   what Ø       TOA    the
   what is the running man?
2 AMN nak masuk running man
   want join     TOA
   (I) want to join running man
3 M ye la yang running <running> man tu ape die?
   yes EMP that      TOA    the what Ø
   yes (but) that running man is what?
```
Extract 1 shows interaction between mother (M) and Aiman or AMN (family 2) that focuses on one television show that seems to be his favourite TV show (Running Man). Mother begins the interaction by asking Aiman what the show is about. However, Aiman’s answer “nak masuk” (to participate in the show) in line 2 is found to be irrelevant to mother’s initial question that seeks different type of information. This (Aiman’s line 2) becomes the trouble source where the problem is resulted from inaccurate information. Thus, mother initiates repair (OIR) in line 3 to 5 by being specific on the information she is looking for. When using this strategy, mother placed an emphasis to the key word which is the show’s name by repeating the first word twice and ended with specific question word “ape die” (what). Mother claims the next turn after a short pause in line 4 by further specifying the kind of information she is looking for by making specific reference to the show through phrase “rancangan die tu” (the show). The determiner “tu” (the) is also used. This particular phrase seems to be continuity from mother’s previous turn that ends with question word what. Aiman finally explains about the show in line 6 but rather the response is brief that can create potential trouble in the next turns.

Extract 1 exemplifies specific request for specification strategy that is employed by parents in OIR sequence. This particular strategy is found to be used when there is a trouble concerning information that might be vague or irrelevant to question. The use of this strategy is found to be effective as parents are found to place emphasis on key words within trouble source turn and accompany their initiation turn with specific question word such as “ape die” (what) to obtain the intended response.

The second frequent OIR strategy in parents’ speech is request for confirmation. Extract 2 shows the example of this particular strategy

Extract 2 Aloe Vera drink (Lisa-mother)
In extract 2, Lisa (L) is telling her mother (M) on drink that she always takes at school. However, she seems to experience difficulty in remembering the exact name of the drink as evident in line 1. Thus, she opts to describe the drink as in this case, the content. Following this, mother seeks confirmation by pointing to one drink that is available during the context of interaction (line 4). This is produced by mother through the use of interjection “o” with sound lengthening to indicate agreement and then, the phrase “yang tu” (that one) is specifically used to confirm whether that is the drink Lisa is telling her about.

This particular extract shows an example of request for confirmation strategy employed by mother in trying to resolve the trouble. It is seen here that the OIR strategy is used when the trouble is resulted from information that is not specific or lack of information in order to give immediate complete understanding to the other speaker.

Another frequent OIR strategy found in data set is the use of open-class repair word. Extract 3 shows an example of its occurrence.

**Extract 3 Information from friend (Aniq-mother)**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1 | M bile cikgu bagitahu?  
when teacher inform  
when (does) teacher inform? |
| 2 | AQ ha?: (Aniq withdraws mutual gaze) |
| 3 | tak kawan bagitahu  
no friend inform  
no, friend informs |
| 4 | M ha?: (mother gazes at Aniq) |
| 5 | AQ kawan bagitahu  
friend inform  
friend informs |
| 6 | M o ye ke:: o::: kelas amal?  
really class NOUN  
o really, class amal? |

Extract 3 showcases one example of non-specific strategy or the use of open-class repair word by parents in initiating repair from children. The extract is a continuation from previous context of interaction that discusses Aniq (AQ) recently being placed in lower ranked class. The extract begins when mother (M) asks Aniq on when the news is given by teacher (line 1). However, Aniq corrects the mother’s query in line 3 by informing the news is made known to him by his friend and not his teacher (line 3). Even though there is a presence of open-class repair word “ha” with rising intonation in line 2, this particular word seems not to function as repair initiator rather it serves as turn construction unit when Aniq claims that particular turn.

In line 4, it can be seen that mother employs similar word “ha” with rising intonation at the end. In addition, mother placed her gaze at Aniq while producing the word. This on the other hand functions as repair initiator word where Aniq appropriately repeats his previous
utterance and at the same time, establishes mutual gaze with mother. Even though this type of strategy does not specify the kind of trouble the mother is experiencing, repetition of trouble source seems to work efficiently in this particular context of occurrence. The use of gaze seems to strengthen the open-class repair word by allocating the next turn to speaker that has been initiated.

In the context of children’s OIR strategies, non-specific strategy is found to be the most frequent strategy employed by children when they perform repair initiation. The following extract 4 highlights one of the occurring situations.

**Extract 4** Class placement (Aniq-father)

<p>| | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>anik dapat nombo berape kelas?</td>
<td>TOA get number what class</td>
<td>Anik what number did you get in class</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>AQ</td>
<td>ha? ((Aniq establishes mutual gaze with father))</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>perikse</td>
<td>examination</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>ala:: tinggal [lam kerete: left in car]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>AQ</td>
<td>[tige belas thirteen]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Extract 4 shows the employment of open-class repair word “ha?” by Aniq (AQ) when he initiates repair from his father. In this particular extract, father is trying to get information from Aniq on what number did he get in his class; the overall academic placement. Father is seen to pose Aniq with a question that is specific to his intended response required from Aniq (line 1). The question word “berape” clearly requires Aniq to provide number. However, Aniq responds with “ha” with rising intonation in line 2 to indicate his trouble to the father’s preceding question. At the same time, he establishes mutual gaze with his father. Father successfully takes the repair initiation and adds information to his previous turn with word that provides contextual background (“perikse” examination). There is an interruption from mother (M) in line 4 that seems to be talking about something else, but Aniq is able to respond accurately by informing father on his class placement (line 5) with mother’s turn being ignored by both.

Even though the use of such strategy does not specify any kind of troubles, the use of open-class word by Aniq in this context seems to suggest problem in inadequacy of information experienced by him. This is evident in the next turn (repair turn) where father adds information to make his query more specific. Father also seems to be successful in locating the type of trouble source by adding information to his previous utterance instead of repeating as how it is usually performed when open-class is employed as evident in children’s repair turns.
Other repair initiation strategies occur at minimal level. One example that can be shown is request for confirmation. Extract 5 exemplifies its employment in interaction between Aiman and his mother.

**Extract 5** Nilam book (Aiman-mother)

1. M ade beli tak?  
   _did buy EMP_  
   _did (I) buy (the book)?_  

2. AMN bm dengan bi? ((Aiman gazes at mother))  
   NOUN and NOUN  
   Malay and English?  

3. M ha ade beli tak?  
   Ø have bought EMP  
   _ha have (I) bought_  

4. AMN ((Aiman moves his head signalling no))

Extract 5 is a continuation from previous turns on mother’s confirmation request from her son, Aiman (AMN) on buying one of his school’s books (Nilam book). In line 1, mother (M) asks Aiman in a slightly general request where the main point of discussion which is the book is excluded from her utterance. This general approach of asking by mother is understandable given the specific information has been given in preceding turns. However, this becomes a trouble source and invites Aiman to initiate repair. In line 2, Aiman seeks confirmation that makes his repair initiation turn to be framed within request for confirmation strategy where he adds specific information to his mother’s early query and designs it as interrogative style (rising intonation). He specifies the books that the mother is referring to (Malay and English) and maintains his gaze at mother. In the next turn, mother repairs through the first unit in her utterance that indicates confirmation and continues by repeating her original query; whether the books have been bought. Aiman in line 4 responds through non-verbal behaviour indicating no.

**Discussion**

This study describes the strategies of OIR in everyday interaction between parents and their children. Specifically, it looks at the distribution of strategies between two groups of speakers (adult and children) and examines the linguistic resources to construct the repair initiation turn.

The first finding of this study has shown differences in the distribution of frequency in OIR strategies to be employed by parents and children. With a total of 235 repair initiation turns, 194 turns across several strategies are produced by parents while the remaining 41 turns are produced by children. This first shows that children’s troubles in interaction cause breakdowns to occur more than the parents thus causing parents to initiate repair significantly higher than the children. Given language, cognitive and social competency of children is lower than parents (Forrester, 2013; Elbers, 2004), this finding seems to generate hypothesis that breakdowns in interaction between parents and children are likely to be contributed by the latter group of speaker even though the children have reached the maturation age in language development milestone.
In the aspect of strategies employed by speakers, the notable difference in several strategies use in their frequency of occurrence may be due to ability of parents and children to participate in interaction. Parent-child interaction has been described as asymmetrical interaction where both groups differ in their linguistic competency (Forrester, 2013). This may explain why strategies like specific request for specification that is known for being specific in locating trouble source is found to be employed by parents more as contrast to children who employ non-specific strategy or open-class repair initiator (Drew, 1997) which is a poor repair initiator strategy due to inability locate type of trouble source in the preceding turn.

It is worth to highlight on the high frequency of open-class repair word in the data set of this study. However, the use of these words by both speakers can be differentiate through their connection to trouble source in preceding turns. Children are found to have the tendency of employing such words when they are confronted with problem in understanding (as seen in extract 4) while parents can be seen to carefully use these words when there is problem in hearing. The use of open-class repair words is known to be high when speakers have problem to what is being said (Svennevig, 2008) which justifies the parents’ strategy but using these words can also lead to successful repair turn when there is understanding problem as evident in children’s data (Svennevig, 2008). But it can be expected for the OIR sequence to be extended as stronger repair initiation is required should open-class words fails to trigger intended repair.

The use of non-specific strategy or open-class word like “ha” that is commonly observed in the data further highlights its pragmatic function in interaction. Garvey (1977) has asserted that the primary function of such words is to indicate and signal breakdowns in preceding turn. This can primarily be identified when gaze is mutual between speaker of trouble source and the one who produces OIR. However, the function of such word may be different when the gaze is not mutual despite having similar format (with rising intonation). This is particularly evident in extract 3 when Aniq claims the next turn with open-class word “ha” but the gaze is not placed at his mother. This may direct the function of such word to be a mechanism to construct turn before actual response is given (Hua, Seedhouse, Wei & Cook, 2007).

Even though data for this study is in Malay language, the types of OIR strategies that frequently occur in everyday interaction such as specific request for specification and non-specific (i.e. open-class word) are found to be similar to types of OIR strategies in other languages (Dingemanse et al., 2014). The employment of such strategies is usually accompanied with rising intonation or within interrogative style and additionally, gaze between speakers is mutual. In addition, the use of Malay interjection and particles seem to play a role in repair initiation turns. For example, the interjection “o” with lengthening of sound is used to accompany request for confirmation in addition to provide other speaker on the state of understanding.

Conclusion
The present study has attempted to look at the strategies in constructing repair initiation turns in everyday interaction between parents and their children. Guided by CA in its methodological approach, this study has shown that not all OIR strategies are employed by both parents and children. However, parents’ OIR strategies are found to be slightly varied
than the children’s. In addition, this study has added one new strategy which is non-verbal to the existing Philip’s Clarification Request (2008).

This study is found to be significant because it reports information that is derived from interaction in Malay language that has yet to be studied within the context of OIR. Most studies have consistently reported data originated from English (Kendrick, 2015). Future intended study is recommended to identify role of cultural background in the strategy to initiate repair. In addition, future study can also look at the interconnection with variables that are disregarded in this study such as gender and socioeconomic background of the speakers.

REFERENCES


THE ROLE OF SOCIAL MEDIA AND COMPUTATIONAL PROPAGANDA IN POLITICAL CAMPAIGN COMMUNICATION

Oberiri Destiny Apuke
Department of Mass Communication, Taraba State University, Jalingo, PMB 1167, Nigeria
e-mail: apukedestiny@gmail.com

ABSTRACT
Despite the increasing interest on the impact of social media use for political campaign communication, it has been observed that the propaganda in the digital campaign processes, have been less well studied. This paper documents the role of social media in political campaign communication. This research is based on the review of past studies, conducted between November 2017 and April 2018 using Clarivate Analytics, Scopus database, Google and Google scholar. A total of 129 studies were identified and used in this study. Of the 129 papers reviewed, (n=75) 58.1% focused mainly on the use of social media (Facebook, Twitter and YouTube) in political campaigns; the others (n=54) 41.9% focused on either the language of political campaigns, propaganda in e-electioneering campaigning, social bots and computational propaganda in electioneering campaigns as well as other related matters that shaped this review. A large proportion (n=33) of the studies reviewed that focused on social media (Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube) in electioneering campaigns predominantly used a questionnaire survey. In terms of country coverage, results from the reviewed papers show a focus on the US, Finnish, UK, Norway, Poland, Dutch, South Africa, Nigeria, Germany, India, Sweden, Denmark, Finland, and Indonesia, with only a few studies on Africa and Asia. Overall, results suggest that across the world, social media is now being used as a platform for broadcasting political opinions as well as a means of involvement and influencing of electorates to like a particular political party and to vote for a particular candidate. However, computational propaganda is now a threat to online political campaign and democracy across the world, because it can be used to fake grassroots political support and likes on Facebook and Twitter, thereby increasing the chances of manipulating public opinion and spreading political misinformation.

Keywords: Social bots; computational propaganda; political campaigns; propaganda; social media.

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND
Social media are webbed-based instruments that allow users to build a profile and create a network attached to that profile as well as interact with others applying this application (Xenos, Vromen, & Loader, 2014; Himelboim, Golan, Moon, & Suto, 2014; Enli & Skogerbo, 2013; Yousif & Alsamydai, 2012; Jackson & Lilleker, 2011). This means that through social media people create their online profile which enables them to interact more easily with others, as well as disseminate opinions and information. These social media include Facebook, Twitter, YouTube, Google+ and MySpace (Boulianne, 2015). Recently, evidence has shown a research focus on the utilization of social media in political campaigns and advertising (Fountaine, 2017; Borah, 2016; Chadha & Guha, 2016), which is referred to as the online political campaigning/digital political campaign (Kruijke, Van Noort,
Vliegenthart, & De Vreese, 2016; Boulianne 2009, 2015; Saxton & Waters, 2014; Schultz, Bendick, Holm, & Hertel, 2011; Wang, Li, & Luo, 2016). Online political campaigning has been described as a type of campaign that requires political candidates getting acquainted with a social media strategy to keep them in the minds of voters, so as to influence both individuals’ lives and society as a whole (Khang, Ki, & Ye, 2012). Through online political campaigning, political aspirants and electorates publicise their political ambitions and agenda, as well as induce voters support. This suggests that to reach voters, political candidates and parties increasingly use social media because it offers the opportunity to communicate directly to citizens, as well as permits them to disclose personal information, i.e. personal campaigning (Kruikemeier et al., 2016, Vergeer, Hermans, & Sams, 2013; Bor, 2014; Briones, Kuch, Liu, & Jin, 2011; Diga & Kelleher, 2009; Lovejoy, Waters & Saxton, 2012).

Indeed, online political campaigning via social media has received increased academic attention (Boulianne 2009, 2015). Nonetheless, evidence has shown that the majority of the studies that have documented the role that social networks have played in political campaign have predominantly focussed on the benefits of social media in enhancing political campaigns, civic engagement and political participation (Kalsnes, 2016; Ajayi & Adesote 2015; Conway, Kenski, & Wang, 2015; Oelsner & Heimrich, 2015; Himelboim et al., 2014; Ross & Bürger, 2014; Coleman, 2013; Kreiss, 2014; Jackson & Lilleker, 2011; Gutman & Dalton, 2009; Nagourney, 2008). Other researchers have established that the internet use has positive effects on citizens’ involvement in politics and thus, consequently, contributes to the quality of democracy (Tolbert & McNeal, 2003; Shah, Cho, Eveland Jr, & Kwak, 2005). Recently, studies have likewise demonstrated that the use of social media for political purposes during election campaigns have an important political impact (e.g. vote intention, Bond et al., 2012; Spierings & Jacobs 2014). On the other hand, researchers have also documented the language and propaganda utilized in conventional political campaigns (Udende, 2011; Omozuwa & Ezejideaku, 2008; Ngoa, 2011), with a less focus on online and computational propaganda. This calls for more research to look into the negative impact and propaganda techniques in online political campaigning via social media (Anggraini, Mustofa, & Sadewo. 2014; Olabamiji, 2014), so as to increase the understanding of social media utilization in political campaigns.

Thus, despite the increase in interest on the impact of social media use in political campaigns, it has been observed that the propaganda in the digital campaign processes, as well as the negative role and impact of social media in contemporary political campaigns, have been less well studied, although the literature is growing. In this view, this present study will first report literature that concerns social media and political campaigns, thereby offering the opportunity to demonstrate the collective intellect that has been accumulated from the extensive body of research that has utilised various participants, samples, and methods. It will then extend beyond reporting the prior literature on the use of social media in political campaigns and demonstrate the current negative role of social media in political campaigns as well as document the modern propaganda techniques (i.e. the use of social bots) prevalent in the digital campaign. To achieve this, the current paper is divided into two main parts, the first part will review past studies on the use of Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube in electioneering campaigns. The second part will demonstrate the language of propaganda and the use of computational propaganda (i.e. social bots) in political campaigns, adopted predominantly to manipulate and mar the integrity of political opponents. Thus, this study
increases the understanding of social media use in political campaigns through analysing the existing body of knowledge as well as unifies, corroborate and synthesize streams of inquiry into a more coherent body of knowledge that provides insight to further investigations. The outcome of this study is hence beneficial for future researchers and practitioners in this area of investigation.

Aim and article structure
This paper documents the role of social media in political campaigns. It also extends beyond documenting the beneficial role of utilizing social media in political campaigns and highlights the propaganda prevalent in e-political campaigns. As set out in (Fig. 1), this paper is divided into five main sections describing the introduction and background; methods; results and discussion; conclusion; and limitation and proposition for further research.

![Figure 1. Article structure.](image)

**LITERATURE REVIEW SEARCH STRATEGY**

**Search strategy and keywords**
This study is based on the review of past studies (i.e content analysis of previous studies) conducted between November 2017 to April 2018 using the Clarivate Analytics (formerly known as Thomson-ISI Web of Knowledge) and Scopus database. These selection criteria are consistent with a recent study that evaluated Africa-focused blog-related research from 2006 to 2016 (Elega & Özad, 2017). Therefore, the search for articles was carried out using the following search terms, as well as their derivatives: social media, propaganda, political
campaign, electioneering, social bots, US politics, election, language of propaganda, history of propaganda, social media influence on politics, impact of social media in modern politics, democracy, political communication, types of propaganda, Facebook, Twitter, YouTube, abusive speech, attack, political opponent, political aspirant, voters, supporters, electorate, politicians, electioneering campaigns, elements of propaganda, digital campaign processes, campaign messages, media, communication, but are not exclusive to the aforementioned. It was not entirely possible to depend on empirical studies on the aforementioned database, therefore other relevant findings from Google and Google Scholar were consulted to identify other studies (i.e. Proceedings, Directory of Open Access Journals, Books/book chapters, printed journal, and published thesis) of related interest that shape this current review. There was no restriction to article publication date, which means that earlier studies were also included in this review to help contribute to the understanding of the subject matter.

Inclusion and exclusion criteria
Studies were included if they basically address the concept of social media, use of Facebook, Twitter and YouTube in electioneering campaigns, political propaganda, and use of social bots in electioneering campaigns. While studies that cover the use of other social media in political campaigns were not included. The rationale for focusing on only Facebook, Twitter and YouTube use in electioneering campaigns is that recent evidence has shown that YouTube, Facebook, and Twitter have become a more prominent communication channel for campaigning across the world due to its popularity and large users. (Pew Report, 2016; Larsson & Kalsnes, 2014). Hence, the number of potential voters a candidate is able to interact with and access has become global with just a click (Davis, 2017; Bode, 2012). A total of 129 studies were identified and used in this study. These included literature (n=129 studies) were read thoroughly, synthesised, grouped and analysed according to the following issues concerning ‘Facebook and political campaigns;’ ‘Twitter and political campaigns;’ ‘YouTube and political campaigns;’ ‘the propaganda in political campaigns via social media.’ This categorisation yielded additional items such as the language of political campaigns, propaganda in e-electioneering campaigning and an emerging form of online political campaign propaganda which is computational propaganda also known as social bots.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION
As of November 2017, the initial literature search yielded 1200 references, which was related to the research on a closer look. However, after a thorough speed-reading of each article’s abstract, introduction, methodology, and conclusion, 129 references were found more related and usable. The main inclusion criterion was that the references contained significant content concerning the utilization of Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube in electioneering campaigns. Additionally, studies that highlight the language of political campaigns, propaganda in e-electioneering campaigning, social bots and computational propaganda in electioneering campaigns were included. Of the 129 papers reviewed, (n=75) 58.1% focused mainly on the use of social media (Facebook, Twitter and YouTube) in political campaigns; the others (n=54) 41.9% focused on either the language of political campaigns, propaganda in e-electioneering campaigning, social bots and computational propaganda in electioneering campaigns as well as other related matters that shaped this review (See Fig. 2 for literature flow chart). It was observed that the entire papers that centred on social media in political
campaigns demonstrate a more focus on the use of Facebook in electioneering campaigns. Nevertheless, other notable social media that have attracted studies are Twitter and YouTube.

In addition, a large proportion of the papers reviewed that focused on social media (Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube) in electioneering campaigns predominantly used a survey [questionnaire], (n=33); case study (n=15); and content analysis (n=25), with little attention given to another form of research such as systematic review, narrative review, literature review and meta-analysis (see Fig. 3). Only two (n=2) studies were found to have conducted a systematic review. In terms of country coverage, results from the reviewed papers show a focus on the US, Finnish, UK, Norway, Poland, Dutch, South Africa, Nigeria, Germany, India, Sweden, Denmark, Finland, and Indonesia. There were only a few studies that were found on Africa and Asia. Therefore, investigation on these regions is necessary because when this is done it will extend the body of literature that covers Africa and Asia, as well as provide a wider picture with regards to the adoption of social media in Africa and Asian electioneering campaigns. Hence, future researchers should make it a priority to study such area. Another notable observation is that these studies focus more on the beneficial aspect of using social media in political campaigns. Therefore, it reports mostly the impact of social media as a tool for effective electioneering campaigns. Conversely, this present paper will work differently by reviewing prior studies on the utilization of Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube in political campaigns and extend to highlight the negative use of social media in political campaigns such as propaganda and the use of computational propaganda to manipulate and mar the integrity of opponents. Therefore, this current paper is divided into two parts, the first part will review past studies on the use of Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube in electioneering campaigns. The second part will demonstrate the propaganda and the use of computational propaganda such as social bots adopted in political campaigns to manipulate and mar the integrity of opponents. Table 1 highlights the themes covered and summarised general findings of this review. These findings are discussed in detail as the paper progresses.
Figure 2. The literature review flowchart.
Table 1. Themes covered and summarised findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes covered</th>
<th>General findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Social media and political campaigning** | • Across the world, social media is now a platform for broadcasting political opinions as well as a means of involvement and influencing of electorates to like a particular political party by voting a particular candidate.  
  • The two main groups of people that adopt social media in political campaigns are political aspirants and electorates.  
  • The orientation of a party is the main factor that influences a politician to choose a particular social media campaigning.  
  • In addition, other factors are the cultural background of the candidate, the size of the candidate's party and the educational level of the candidate and incumbency.  
  • Social media such as Facebook, Twitter and YouTube have been found to possess the power to act upon public sentiment and a powerful tool in the formatting of individual’s cognition.  
  • Politicians adopt social media primarily for a political campaign, electioneering crusades, ideological trumpeting exercises, and mobilization of voters.  
  • Politicians used social media such as Facebook to broadcast their opinions and distribute information in a one-way fashion and the limited chance is prevalent for participatory communication with the citizens.  
  • Supporters and voters adopt social media to relate with candidates, engage in political dialogue, pursue activist causes, and share information.  
  • Social media has been established to influence and induce voting behaviour. It is used for rallying political support, which in turn sustains a substantial result of the electorate’s decision making and participation in elections.  
  • Facebook and Twitter are the most utilized for electioneering campaign due to its popularity and large users. In other words, the number of potential voters a candidate is able to interact with and access has become global with just the click.  
  • YouTube creates more participatory politics and more substantial links between citizens and candidates, particularly at the grass root level.  
  • The more people engage in political on-line interaction on Facebook such as viewing campaign messages, commenting and liking political messages and engaging in political debate the more they will participate in off-line politics.  
  • The manner, timing, and content of candidates posting influenced electorates’ likeness, comments and voting decision.  
  • Candidates frequent ‘Facebook posting attracted a significant support and had an outcome on the final vote shares. |
### Understanding the propaganda in political campaigns via social media

- The language of political campaigns
- Describing the propaganda in e-electioneering campaigning
- An emerging form of online political campaign propaganda
- The greatest amount of propaganda is embedded in politics which is mostly associated with deceit, distortion of truth in order to influence and gain peoples’ approval.
- Political campaigns are entangled with features like grandiloquence, fustians, hyperbole, lies, and verbalized violence.
- A political campaign speech is characterized by propaganda through an attack on party, ferocity, equivocalness and denunciations.
- Political campaigns are geared towards either representing political aspirants in an impressive manner or portraying political opponents in ridicule and discrediting manner, with the ultimate end of winning the election.
- Political campaigns on social media, are based on two main themes “vote for me or don't vote for my opponent.
- Computational propaganda is now one of the major forms of propaganda in social media political campaigns across the world. This entails employing both people and bots in order to artificially shape public life.
- Computational propaganda involves the utilization of algorithms, automation, and human to deliberately disseminate misleading information over social media networks through the generation of the post, tweet, which automatically interact with other users.
- Social bots mislead and exploit social media discourse with rumours, spam, malware, misinformation, defamation, or even just noise, and likewise artificially amplifying support for a political wannabe.
- Social bots are utilized to generate followers and supporters thereby creating the illusion of popularity so that a political candidate can have viability where they might not hold as well as engender a heavy bulk of social media posts to substantiate, or attack candidates resulting to a high degree of political propaganda.
- Disseminating of propaganda and manipulation of opinion in e-electioneering campaigns have moved beyond the conventional techniques and progressed to the hi-tech conversation between devices and people, devices and other devices, and over the internet of things which is detrimental to modern democracy.
- Modern politics are more of propaganda, manipulation and winning votes than political public relations.
Facebook and political campaigns
It has been shown that the use of Facebook in a political campaign has attracted a good number of studies. For example, a research has revealed that in the Nigerian 2015 general elections, Facebook was massively employed due to its participatory nature. It was utilized as a platform for political campaign, electioneering crusades, ideological trumpeting exercises, and mobilization of voters (Chinedu-Okeke & Obi, 2016). This means that Facebook adoption in political campaigns helps political aspirants to disseminate information easily as well as mobilise voters. This notion is consistent with Anggraini et al. (2014) study that examined political campaigns through Facebook on Indonesian 2014 presidential election. The study found that Facebook has the ability to influence public opinion and a powerful tool in the formatting of one’s cognition. However, a survey carried out on the 2011 Finnish parliamentary election campaign established that although candidates frequently utilized Facebook for campaigning, nevertheless, there was a very low degree of Facebook utilization among citizens and this affected their voting decision (Strandberg, 2013). Whereas, another study that investigated the 2014 elections of the European Parliament show that the lead candidates and their published debate on television and Facebook had a high influence on the electorate support (Nulty, Theocharis, Popa, Parnet, Benoit, 2016). This suggests that the use of Facebook in the electioneering campaign induces electorate participation and support for a particular candidate, and this increases the chances of a candidate winning an election.

On the other hand, a survey has reported a low level of Facebook utilization by the elected Swedish and Norwegian politicians. As demonstrated in the same survey, most of the elected politicians posted messages only once in a day after winning various political positions. Even the few active politicians among them were labelled as underdogs because they are younger in age (Larsson & Kalsnes, 2014). This indicates that the majority of politicians today use social media such as Facebook to broadcast their opinions and distribute information in a one-way fashion and limited chances are provided for participatory communication with the citizens (Ross & Bürger, 2014). As such, social media was only a tool to disseminate information about politicians and not a medium for citizens to give feedback, and this negates the actual essence of utilizing social media in political campaigns.
The manner, timing, and content of candidates posting have been found to influence electorates’ likeness, comments and voting decision (Xenos, Macafee, & Pole, 2015). A recent survey discovered a substantial relationship between Facebook “Likes” and “election outcomes in the 2015 Finnish parliamentary elections. This suggests that the more a candidate “likes” increases on Facebook the more likely he is to win an election (Vepsäläinen, Li, & Suomi, 2017). Hence, regularly interacting with voters and electorate on Facebook has positive likely outcome. Supporting this notion, Gilmore (2012) found that candidate’s frequent online presence as well duration of politicking, gender, age, party association, and money disbursement in campaign enhanced candidates’ popularity and increase chances of winning. This denotes that the more people engage in political online interaction on Facebook such as viewing campaign messages, commenting and liking political messages and engaging in political debate the more they will participate in offline politics (Vesnic-Alujevic, 2012).

However, this might not be the case in every situation. For example, an investigation that examined the impact of Facebook utilization for political dialogue in South Africa confirmed that the public is using Facebook as a political forum for getting in touch, talking over and sharing political information in a more convenient manner. Yet, the full harnessing of the potential of Facebook adoption and usage for political discourse is still in its embryonic stage (Steenkamp & Hyde-Clarke, 2014). As such, other studies have shown that the utilization of Facebook in political campaigns has not much impact. For instance, Andersen and Medaglia (2009) investigated the 2007 Danish Parliamentary election and found that online interaction with voters did not influence their support since most of the online users are already familiar with the candidates via the conventional channels of party organization. Facebook was just considered as an information channel and as a way of pulling in social prestige. Similarly, Zhang, Johnson, Seltzer, and Bichard (2010) established that the role of social networking sites such as Facebook in political campaigns only increases civic participation and not political participation. However, face to face conversation enhances both civic participation and political activity. This implies that social media use by the political aspirant to interact with voters has no effect on their voting choice but rather interpersonal communication goes a long way in enhancing voters’ decisions towards a particular candidate. This is coherent with a study, carried out on the 2013 Norwegian candidate, which found that candidates who attracted and influenced electorate were those who successfully synergised themselves on conventional and social media (Karlsen & Enjolras, 2016).

The motivation for employing a particular social media in political campaigns varies from individuals and countries. For instance, Macafee (2013) highlights connecting with people socially, sharing information with people, and presenting oneself to others as some of the motivational factors of adopting Facebook. In addition, Larsson and Moe (2012) established that televised debates and offline political rallies promoted the adoption and usage of Twitter in the 2010 Swedish electioneering campaigns. Congruently, Enli and Skogerbø (2013) found that marketing and dialogue with voters was the rationale behind Norwegian politicians’ utilization of social media tool for political communication. The same study further discovered that Facebook was more utilized for marketing purposes which involved private exposure and individual initiatives, while Twitter was used for continuous dialogue with supporters. This implies that political aspirants are unwilling to engage in dialogue with voters on social media and that campaigns are employed basically for political
marketing (Enli & Naper, 2016; Graham, Broersma, Hazelloff, & Van't Haar, 2013; Jackson & Lilleker, 2011; Stromer-Galley, 2004). Moreover, Chada and Guha (2016) reported that in the 2014 Indian political elections and campaigns, there was a one-way communication pattern even though social media was adopted, the effectiveness was limited.

Contrasting this notion, Oelsner and Heimrich (2015) compared the use of Facebook and Twitter, among German politicians in the 2012 campaigns. The result establishes that the entire German politicians who used social media in the electioneering campaigns created interactive voters’ relationship. Facebook was found to be the most adopted and employed in the electioneering campaigns. This conforms to an earlier study which reveals that most German politicians have a predilection and willingness for adopting Facebook for political campaigns. The rationale for their predilection is to stay updated about current political discussions, build a reputation, detect new trends, discover important stakeholders, and influence electorates voting decision (Stieglitz, Brockmann, & Dang-Xuan, 2012). However, the adoption and utilization of Twitter in political campaigns across the globe can never be overemphasized. In this view, it is therefore essential to explore the role of Twitter in political campaigns.

**Twitter and political campaigns**

Indeed, evidence has shown that the continuous experimentation of Twitter for political campaigning across several countries has kept on evolving over the years (Bruns, 2017), and this has prompted some growing body of research. For instance, evidence from an investigation that examined the Nigerian 2015 general elections reported that Twitter was mostly used and this mobilized and influenced people to vote a particular candidate (Bartlett, Krasodomski-Jones, Daniel, Fisher, Jesperson, 2015). This implies that the utilization of Twitter for political campaigns assist political aspirants in mobilizing and influencing the electorate to vote for them. Recapitulating the impact of Twitter in political campaigns, Graham et al. (2016) reported that during the 2010 British and Dutch general election campaigns, Dutch politicians utilized Twitter than UK candidates. The study further demonstrated that the public responded to this by engaging in further dialogue. This implies that the use of Twitter encourages interactivity and dialogue. However, Graham et al. (2013) found that in the 2010 UK electioneering campaign, most politicians used Twitter primarily in a one-way communication pattern. This is consistent with Vergeer et al. (2013) who argue that although European Parliament candidates of 2009 employed Twitter to communicate and associate with citizens, nevertheless, the candidates reluctantly utilized Twitter, and even those who actually used it did so for electioneering campaign purposes only and not subsequently. Yet, the findings of Bimber (2014) suggest that Twitter was highly utilized to sustain citizen enthusiasm and initiative in the 2008 and 2012 U.S. presidential election campaigns.

In a similar study, it was discovered that candidates, providing of personalised representational images as well as frequently being present online influenced voters support in the 2011 Poland online election campaign (Koc-Michalska, Lilleker, Surowiec, & Baranowski, 2014). This implies that the more a candidate appears online, the more the electorates and citizens are influenced to support such a candidate. This is not surprising as Kalsnes (2016) reported that all political candidates in Norway had profiles on Twitter, and this created engagement such as likes, comments, and shares. Hence, Twitter’s current 313 million active users worldwide (Twitter, 2017) has drawn politicians into using it more...
frequently. Moreover, its interactivity and authority in reaching voters and stakeholders (see Ross & Bürger, 2014; Enli & Skogerbø, 2013) can never be overemphasised. Nevertheless, results from other empirical research countervailed the potentialities of Twitter in electioneering campaigns. Some of these studies argue that politicians utilize Twitter for circularisation of messages only, and not dialoguing (e.g. Lukamto & Carson, 2016; Graham et al., 2013; Grant, Moon, & Busby Grant, 2010). Indeed, the grandness, scope, (Vergeer, 2015) and the effectiveness of online discourse and engagement on Twitter are debatable (Jungherr, 2016).

As such, a research has reported that the basic challenge of Twitter for electioneering campaigns is the presence of diverse audiences collected into one-fold, which makes it hard to dissent self-presentation schemes (Marwick & Boyd, 2011). Nonetheless, Karlsen and Enjolras (2016) found that Norwegian politicians utilized Twitter to sustain the focus on political issues as well as show their personal side to enhanced electorate support and likeness for them. Supporting these findings, Bright, Hale, Ganesh, Bulovsky, Margetts, and Howard (2017) reported that voting outcomes of the 2015 and 2017 UK elections were associated with Twitter-based campaigns. By implication, the role of Twitter in elections induced electorate’s decision towards a candidate and as such prompt favourable votes for emerging candidates. Nevertheless, YouTube utilization for the electioneering campaign has likewise been exhibited in some countries, and as such requires consideration.

**YouTube and political campaigns**

In recent decades, there has been a continuous experimentation of YouTube in political campaigns, and this has attracted a considerable number of studies which reported mixed findings. For example, Carlson and Strandberg (2008) establish that the acceptance and utilization of YouTube in the Finnish 2007 National election did not give a positive result because the videos did not attract public interest. In the same study, it was discovered that YouTube played a marginal part in the elections and only a few supporters uploaded and broadcasted videos. Yet, YouTube was used as a platform for minor electoral actors and ordinary citizens. In contrast, Lev-On (2012) found that YouTube creates more participatory politics and more substantial links between citizens and candidates, particularly at the grass root level. This is concurrent with Enli (2017) study who advocated that over the years the utilization and focus of images and videos have grown in electioneering campaign. This was evident in the 2016 US presidential election campaigns where Hillary Clinton regularly posted videos to circulate information in order to attract and influence electorates.

In general, a survey has discovered that YouTube, Facebook and Twitter have become a more prominent communication channel for campaigning across the world (Pew Report, 2016). Larsson and Kalsnes (2014) remarked that of all the social media networking sites Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube are the most utilized for electioneering campaign due to its popularity and large users. In other words, the number of potential voters a candidate is able to interact with and access has become global with just the click (Davis, 2017; Bode, 2012). For instance, a research has shown that Facebook pages allow direct dialogues with citizens while Twitter allows spreading of both general and political opinions publicly (Stieglitz & Dang-Xuan, 2013). Indeed, the rationale behind selecting a particular social media by political aspirants across the globe has been well summarized in this review. This includes orientation of the party (Vergeer et al., 2013), cultural background of the candidate (Lilleker et al., 2011), the size of the candidate's party (Aragon et al., 2013) and the
educational level of the candidate and incumbency (Strandberg, 2013). Hence, the two main groups of people that adopt social media in political campaigns are political aspirants and electorates (Vepsäläinen et al., 2017). Politicians adopt social media, mainly as a campaigning tool (Aragon et al. 2013; Williams and Gulati, 2013; Vergeer et al., 2013; Lilleker et al., 2011) while, the electorates have mainly adopted social media for supporting the desired candidate as well as engaging in political discussions (Vepsäläinen et al., 2017; Bond et al., 2012).

Furthermore, it can be inferred that social media influence and induce voting behaviour (Aldrich et al., 2016; David et al., 2016) as well as enhances political campaigns. However, a notable aspect in this present review suggests that the majority of politicians today use social media such as Facebook to broadcast their opinions and distribute information in a one-way fashion and limited chances are provided for participatory communication with the citizens. This implies that social media are just considered as an information channel and as a way of pulling in social prestige. This is contrary to studies which suggest that the benefits of social media in enhancing political campaigns, civic engagement and political participation is immense (Chadha & Guha, 2016; David et al., 2016; Kalsnes, 2016; Kreiss, 2016; Kreiss, 2012). Nevertheless, candidates frequent ‘posting on social media may attract a significant support and outcome on the final vote shares. This suggests that the manner, timing, and content of candidates posting influence electorates’ likeness, comments and voting decision.

The findings of the presented studies suggest that the benefits of social media in enhancing political campaigns can never be overemphasized. However, there are elements of the modern propaganda prevalent in the digital campaign processes as well as the negative impact of social media in political campaigns which has been less studied. Thus, the subsequent part of this present research will extend to demonstrate the contemporary propaganda prevalent in e-electioneering campaigns across the world.

Understanding the propaganda in political campaigns via social media

The language of political campaigns
In recent decades, research has advocated that the highest amount of propaganda is rooted in politics. Propaganda is mostly associated with deceit, and distortion of truth with the intention of influencing and gaining individual approval (Omozuwa & Ezejideaku, 2008). It is categorised into wartime, political and social/educational propaganda (Ngao, 2011). However, this paper is concerned with the political propaganda, which is paramount in the language of a political campaign. Indeed, there is an increasing amount of evidence which suggests that the use of social media in political campaigns could be for political public relations (Bartlet et al., 2015; Koc-Michalska et al., 2014; Enli & Skogerbo, 2013) or propaganda (Emetumah, 2015; Oyenuga, 2015; Olabamiji, 2014). This means that online political campaign is a two side of the coin, a tool in the hands of political aspirants used to mobilise voters as well as mar the integrity of political aspirants. Supporting this notion, research has also found that political campaign messages are centred on propaganda and persuasive rhetoric’s. This consists of promises, Quran and Biblical reference to God, repetition, and figurative expressions (Omozuwa & Ezejideaku, 2008). Indeed, political campaigns on social media are based on two main root words “vote for me or don't vote for my opponent” (Davis et al., 2009). As highlighted in this present review, the issue of political
propaganda in conventional politics has been documented (O'Shaughnessy, 2004; Horten, 2003; Sneeringer, 2003; Miller, 2003; Quatermaine, 2000; Bosworth, 2002; Welch, 2002), yet, little is known if such propaganda techniques exist in the electronic campaigning. Therefore, it is essential to ascertain the propaganda techniques prevalent in online electioneering campaigns across the globe in order to provide a comprehensive inference of the role of social media in political campaigns.

**Describing the propaganda in e-electioneering campaigning**

A growing recent pool of limited studies that researched into the propaganda in e-electioneering campaigns has disclosed the different propaganda prevalent in online political campaigns. This propaganda is being used to control public opinion around the globe. For instance, Akubor (2015) reported that the Nigerian 2015 general elections, was characterised by character assassination, violence and abusive (hate) speeches on social media. This implies that just as in the case of conventional political campaigns, online political campaigns are also characterised by character assassination, violence and abusive speech. Supporting this view, a similar investigation by Emetumah (2015) reported that in the presidential electioneering campaign, the All Progressive Congress (APC) and Peoples Democratic Party (PDP), disseminated false information on social media. This was accomplished through the posting of hate and abusive speeches by supporters and the electorate, with the sole aim of discrediting opposition parties and opponents. As such, the platform became a new ground for spreading unreliable election messages. This is not surprising as a recent survey by Apuke and Apollos (2017) discovered that there were dysfunctions in the Facebook pages of the 2015 political aspirants in Nigeria, such as deliberate distortions in the information about opponents, abusive speech, distortion of the facts about personal performance, and misinformation as a strategy for influencing the electorate. This signifies that the new media is being used to malign, intimidate and discredit political opponents through misinformed comments and posts, which might trigger conflicts (Anggraini et al., 2014; Olabamiji, 2014).

This situation (i.e. propaganda and hate speech in online political campaigns) is not only prevalent in Nigeria and African region but is actually a worldwide phenomenon. This is not surprising as a survey that research into the propaganda in the US 2016 e-electioneering campaigns discovered that although the principal focal point for both Hilary Clinton and Donald Trump was to mobilise voters, yet, attacking the opponent on Facebook and Twitter was perversely done (Davis, 2017). As shown in (Fig. 4), the Republican candidate, Donald Trump claimed no one had ‘worse judgement’ than his Democratic opponent. Additionally, he proclaimed that her wars 'have unleashed destruction, terrorism and ISIS across the world' (Chambers, 2016). By implication, discrediting words on Twitter to pull down the integrity of opponent characterised by the high level of propaganda was prevalent. For example, Language like ‘crocked Hilary Clinton’ ‘boring speech by Hilary Clinton,’ ‘Hilary Clinton is unfit to govern the US’ (see Fig. 4) were used. These findings support a prior research which revealed that political campaigns languages globally are carried out in a style and manner that provides special effect and force to message so as to attain winning of votes (Ademilokun, 2015). This entails portraying political opponents in ridicule and discrediting manner, with the ultimate goal of winning an election (Aduradola & Ojukwu, 2013; Beard, 2000).
For instance, it has been shown that in the US 2016 e-electioneering campaigns, Donald Trump used words such as “If I’m elected, everybody will have a business, I vouch for it.” and Trump: “Make America Great Again” (Nelson 2016). This implies that propaganda through social media is capable of influencing whole nations in a very little period of time (Kižina, 2015). It is synonymous with lies, aberration, deception, manipulation, mind control, psychological warfare, and persuasion (Kižina, 2015).

Similarly, research work has likewise revealed that the US 2016 online political campaigns were characterised by misinformation distributed online with the purpose of misleading voters. In the same survey, it was divulged that fake, sensational, and other kinds of junk news were prevalent during the same election (Howard et., 2017; Dewey, 2016; Parkinson, 2016; Read, 2016). These findings suggest that the introduction of social media into politics has made it possible for politicians to spread ideas faster, and as well made it easier for propaganda material to reach more people. It allows political aspirant to act upon and manipulate the opinions of a larger audience (GU et al., 2017).

An emerging form of online political campaign propaganda

Studies suggest that another notable recent online political campaign propaganda technique is the computational propaganda. Computational propaganda has been described as the process of employing both people and bots in order to artificially shape public life (Howard et al., 2016; Forelle et al., 2015). Put simply, computational propaganda involves the use of algorithms, automation, and human to deliberately disseminate misleading information over the social media networks (Woolley & Howard, 2016). In other words, it means computer generated programs that post, tweet, and automatically interact with other users (Woolley & Howard, 2017) simply known as bots. These bots are social media accounts that are controlled either completely or in part by software agents (Murthy et al., 2016). They are different from spam because they try to appear and act like a human (Boshmaf et al., 2011), with the sole aim of influencing human behaviour (Wald et al., 2013). This means that the
advent of the bot is now a threat to online political campaign and democracy across the world. This is because it can be used to fake grassroots political support and the likes on Facebook and Twitter (Ratkiewicz et al., 2011a; Ratkiewicz et al., 2011b), as well as to reach millions of individuals by using automated algorithms tuned for optimal interaction (Ferrara, 2015). This has resulted in the possibility of manipulating public opinion and spreading political misinformation through social media (Woolley & Howard, 2016; El-Khalili, 2013; Howard, 2006). This suggests that political aspirants with sufficient resources can obtain the technical capabilities to deploy thousands of social bots and apply them to their advantage to attack a particular political opponent (Bess & Ferrara, 2016). This implies that they set default messages (with anonymous characteristic) that interact with voters online as well as disseminate false information to discredit opponents. This is not surprising as a recent survey also revealed that there was a high degree of computational propaganda that involved the use of bots during the 2016 US Presidential Election (Bessi & Ferrara, 2016; Howard et al., 2016). As demonstrated in (Fig. 5), Bessi and Ferrara (2016) report demonstrate that “over 400,000 scores during the US 2016 political campaigns were likely bots which were responsible for about 3.8 million tweets which were 19 percent of the total conversation”.

A research has shown that through bots, denigrating attacks have been committed to slander and damage political aspirants’ public images during various elections, such as the case of the 2009 Massachusetts Senate special election (Metaxas & Mustafaraj, 2012). A similar survey concludes that these bots mislead and exploit social media discourse with rumours, spam, malware, misinformation, slander, or even just noise. It also artificially amplifies support for a political aspirant (Ratkiewicz et al., 2011a) which could threaten democracy by influencing the outcome of elections (Ferrara et al., 2016). For instance, throughout the 2010 US midterm elections, a study has revealed that social bots were utilized to support some candidates as well as to blot, mar, and tarnish other opponents. This was achieved mainly through the generation of thousands of fake news, tweets, regarded as Twitter bombs (Metaxas & Mustafaraj, 2012). This finding implies that sophisticated bots can be used to generate followers and supporters through creating the illusion of popularity.
so that a political candidate can have viability where they might not have had it before, making it difficult for people to detect (Aiello et al., 2012). For example, the number of followers for a presidential candidate in the United States rose by a higher margin of over 110 thousand within a single day, and this was unlikely to be real people (Metaxas & Mustafaraj, 2012; Petermann, 2012). This is coherent with the result from recent studies that focused on Brazil, Canada, China, Germany, Poland, Ukraine, and the United States which found that there was a high volume of lies, junk, misinformation and traditional propaganda in the political campaigns disseminated online through Facebook or Twitter’s algorithms (Woolley & Howard, 2017; Howard et al., 2016; Woolley & Howard, 2016).

In a similar research, it was found out that Twitter political bots have been utilized by political leaders and aspirants in Venezuela, Mexico, Turkey, China and Saudi Arabia to propagate propagandised messages in order to induce voters’ decision and likeness (Perrin, 2016; Dreier, 2015). This is consistent with the studies from South America (Forelle et al. 2015; Suárez-Serrato et al., 2016), and Italy (Cresci et al., 2017) which demonstrate that political campaign aspirants have adopted the automated (i.e. bots) tools to generate large volume of social media posts to support, or attack candidates resulting in a high level of political propaganda. Overall, the results of these studies indicate that there is an increasing account of bot utilization in the setting of several elections around the world (Ferrara., 2017). Indeed, “political aspirants and candidates make use of these technological proxies in the strain of proprietary algorithms and semi-automated social actors such as political bots with the exclusive purpose of controlling public opinion” (Woolley & Howard, 2016).

**CONCLUSION**

This review is conducted to explore the role of social media in political campaigns. It goes beyond the benefits of employing social media in political campaigns and explores the elements of propaganda prevalent in the e-political campaign. Although, prior studies have examined the language and propaganda utilized in conventional political campaigns, yet, the contemporary propaganda prevalent in the digital campaign milieu has been less well studied. This aspect is often overlooked with a strong focus on the benefits of social media in enhancing political campaigns. It is evident that the findings of past studies reviewed in this present research indicate a more focus on the benefits of social media in political campaigns. The results of the reviewed papers demonstrate a mixed finding with regards to the use of social media in political campaigns and its effectiveness. Results showed that it is effective in some part of the world such as United States, Nigeria, Germany, and United Kingdom etc. Yet, another part of the world such as Sweden, Norway, South Africa, Denmark etc, has not witnessed its effectiveness. Nevertheless, a considerable number of the reviewed studies demonstrated that social media is now a platform for broadcasting political opinions as well as a means of involvement and influencing of electorates to like a particular political party by voting a particular candidate. Additionally, a notable aspect discovered is that the majority of politicians today use social media such as Facebook and Twitter to broadcast their opinions and distribute information in a one-way fashion and limited chances are provided for participatory communication with the citizens. This review further established that the greatest amount of propaganda is rooted in politics. This is mostly associated with deceit, and distortion of truth in order to influence and gain people’s approval.

Generally, it was observed that past studies reviewed in this present research indicate a more focus on the benefits of social media in political campaigns. It was also observed that
the entire papers that centred on social media in political campaigns demonstrate a more focus on the use of Facebook in electioneering campaigns. Yet, Twitter and YouTube have also received a handful of studies. This calls for the continuous attempt for future researchers to examine the role of Twitter and YouTube in electioneering campaigns, so as to increase the growing body of knowledge. In terms of country coverage, results from the reviewed papers show a focus on the US, Finnish, UK, Norway, Poland, Dutch, Nigeria, Germany, India, Sweden, Denmark, South Africa, Finland, and Indonesia. There were only a few studies on Africa and Asia. Therefore, further investigation on these regions is necessary because when this is done, it will extend the body of literature that covers Africa and Asia, as well as provide a wider picture with regards to the adoption of social media in Africa and Asian electioneering campaigns. Hence, future researchers should make it a priority to study such area. More so, most of these studies used content analysis, survey and case study method, with little or no utilization of qualitative research methods. A narrative review, literature review, systematic review and meta-analysis could contribute to the understanding of social media usage in political campaigns as well as suggest a direction for further studies. Furthermore, a focus group could also provide a rich data to build upon. In this view, future research could adopt the highlighted methods, so as to explore in-depth the role of social media in political campaigns as well as the negative aspect of online political campaigns.

The second part of this current paper revealed that a notable propaganda technique prevalent in the online political campaign is the computational propaganda. This entails employing both people and bots in order to artificially shape public life. Intrinsically, these bots generate a post, tweet, and automatically interact with other users, thereby faking grass-roots political support and like. It was observed the studies on the use of computational propaganda in political campaigns predominantly focused on developed nations such as the US. Investigators should therefore make it a priority to research in-depth the issues of computational propaganda prevalent in recent online political campaigns by extending to report its prevalence in other part of the globe such as Africa, and Asian pacific. Doing so will increase the understanding of the role of social media in political campaigns. Moreover, researchers are also encouraged to continuously investigate how computational propaganda has been achieved in online political campaigns as well as ways in which it could be curbed so as to strengthen electioneering campaigns and democracy at large. Conclusively, it can be inferred that the circulating of propaganda and manipulation of opinion in an e-electioneering campaigns in our contemporary society today, has moved beyond the conventional techniques, and progressed to the hi-tech conversation between devices and people, devices and other devices, and over the internet of things. This situation is detrimental to modern democracy and politics, as it affects the objectivity and balance of online political campaigns across the globe.

**Limitation and proposition for further studies**

This study contributes to the limited research that corroborates existing findings on the use of social media in political campaigns across the world. It demonstrates the propaganda prevalent in contemporary political campaigns via social media. Nevertheless, the review mostly focussed on studies found in peer review journals neglecting other important subjects that might come from other authors. Additionally, the study merely focused on Twitter, Facebook and YouTube in electioneering campaigns. Further studies should incorporate other social media in order to get a broader understanding.
Conflict of interest
None declared

REFERENCES


Howard, P. N., & Kollanyi, B. (2016). Bots, # strongerin, and# Brexit: Computational propaganda during the UK-EU referendum. *Browser Download This Paper.*


Larsson, A. O., & Kalsnes, B. (2014). ‘Of course, we are on Facebook’: Use and non-use of social media among Swedish and Norwegian politicians. European Journal of Communication, 29(6), 653-667.
Macafee, T. (2013). Some of these things are not like the others: Examining motivations and political predispositions among political Facebook activity. Computers in Human Behavior, 29(6), 2766-2775.


ABSTRACT
This study aims to identify the ways in which elements of magic realism in Salman Rushdie’s *Luka and the Fire of Life* (2010) are used to subvert notions of reality that are reflected through various mediums, from literary realism through non-literary discourses and, finally, time itself which is often regarded as objective. This paper seeks to show through its application of Hegerfeldt’s (2005) five prototypical features of magic realism that, firstly, words could be used to both represent fantasy as reality through the appropriation of realistic forms of writing to describe fantastical characters and events. Secondly, the use of an “ex-centric” or marginalised focaliser in the novel also enables it to challenge mainstream ideas regarding reality, specifically the conventional notion of Time. Time, as the novel implies, can be subjective as it is affected by the consciousness of the novel’s marginalised characters. Thirdly, words could also be used to subvert non-literary discourses. Fourthly, Time is also supernaturalised or personified in the narrative even though it neither has a physical nor an abstract form. Discussion on the opposition between fatalism and free will appears in this context of time as determining the destiny of the novel’s characters who appears to challenge it through their free will. Finally, a subverted reality is represented through literalisation which is when figurative expressions manifest themselves literally, thus crossing the boundaries between words and reality.

Keywords: magic realism; Salman Rushdie; children’s fiction

INTRODUCTION
Although in its present sense magic realism can be briefly described as a form of writing that adopts and adapts the fictional modes of fantasy and realism to create a recognizable textual representation of the “extra-textual” world, it has had a troubled history. This has primarily been brought about by misconceptions, misunderstandings and misapplications of the term “magic realism”, and, consequently, has resulted in a plethora of studies that has tried to offer definitions and analyses of its features in literary texts. The term *magical realism*, as opposed to *magic realism*, first appeared in the 1955 essay "Magical Realism in Spanish American Fiction" by Angel Flores in reference to writing that combines aspects of magic realism and marvelous realism. From Flores’s obscure definition of magic realism, Amaryl Chanady (1985) tries to point out rather unsuccessfully ways in which it is different from fantasy fiction. Like Chanady, later theorist also had difficulty elucidating clearly on the concept of magic realism. Wendy B. Faris, in her essay “The Question of the Other: Cultural Critique of Magical Realism,”(2002) does not offer to clarify on the issue in question, mentioning only that “the most important criteria for inclusion is the existence of an “irreducible element” that is unexplainable according to the laws of the universe” (p.102). In *Ordinary Enchantments* (2004), Faris goes further by proposing five primary elements that exists in a magic realist text: i) the irreducible element, ii) unsettling doubts, iii) the phenomenal world, iv) merging realms and, v) the distortion of time, space and identity. She then goes on to expand on some
of these aspects by discussing Todorov’s concept of reader’s hesitation as an effect of having irreducible or magical elements in a magic realist text as well as liking the disruption of time, space and identity in magic realism to the ideology of shamanism. Like Chanady, Faris tries to establish a distinction between general fantasy and magical realism. Faris, unfortunately, still leaves the reader in some doubt about how this intrinsically unique, magic realism narrative technique is different from any other narrative strategies. As can be understood from the abovementioned works, attempts at successfully providing a critically rigorous definition for magic realism had so far proved to be futile. It was only in 2005 that Anne Hegerfeldt published her ground breaking book, *Lies That Tell The Truth* (2005), which is now considered by critics as offering the most comprehensive and rigorous treatment of the elements that are present in a magic realist text.

While Salman Rushdie’s (1947- present) status as a renowned magic realist writer makes his works suited to the study of elements in magic realism, his use of it in his children’s novel has remained largely understudied. Hence, this paper sets out to identify magic realist features in his second children’s novel, *Luka and the Fire of Life* (2011), by referring to Hegerfeldt’s five prototypical features of magic realism as outlined in *Lies that Tell the Truth: Magic Realism Seen Through Contemporary Fiction from Britain* (2005). These features are frequently found in many magic realist writings and can be used to differentiate magic realism from other literary modes and genres, such as fantasy, fairy tale, and science fiction. These are namely: the appropriation of realist mode of writing to describe fantastic elements, the use of “ex-centric” or marginalized focalizers, the appropriation and subversion of non-literary discourses, supernaturalization of the real and literalization. All of these elements allow us to critically re-evaluate both non-literary discourses and literary realism and to suggest that other forms of discourses, such as creative writing, can also provide insight into our understanding of the world.

**BACKGROUND OF THE AUTHOR AND SUMMARY OF THE NOVEL**

Twenty years after the publication of his first children’s novel, *Haroun and the Sea of Stories* (1990), Salman Rushdie published a sequel to the novel entitled, *Luka and the Fire of Life* (2010). It was originally written for Rushdie’s youngest son, Milan, who after reading *Haroun and the Sea of Stories* requested a sequel to the book. By the time Rushdie had finished writing his tenth novel, *The Enchantress of Florence* (2008), the timing was right to fulfill Milan’s request as the book should be written while Milan was still young enough to enjoy a children’s story. Thus, *Luka and the Fire of Life* is a companion to *Haroun and the Sea of Stories*. The story centres on Haroun’s younger brother, Luka Khalifa, and his adventure to the World of Magic to break a sleeping curse that had been cast on their father, Rashid Khalifa, by an evil circus master, Captain Aag. As in *Haroun and the Sea of Stories*, the Khalifa family still lives in the city of Kahani. Only the children’s ages have changed as Rashid, Soraya and Haroun have grown older. Luka, according to Soraya, the woman who had appeared in Rushdie’s first children novel, is a time-turner, “a fellow who can turn back Time itself, make it flow again” (p. 10). As Luka grows older, his parents become increasingly active due to the excitement and joy that they feel as they watch their youngest son grow up. One day, on his way home from school with his father, Luka sees members of a circus troupe who call themselves the Great Ring of Fire (GROF) setting up their tents. He feels very sad watching the circus animals being abused and caged by Captain Aag. Out of anger, he casts a spell on the animals and they start to revolt against their master. Later, the

Circus tents burn to the ground. Seeking revenge, Captain Aag casts a spell on Rashid that puts him to sleep. Nobodaddy, Rashid’s transparent phantom-like doppelganger, has been tasked to collect the storyteller’s soul and the more solid it becomes, the closer Rashid is to death. Not ready to lose his father, Luka is determined to break the curse by stealing the Fire of Life that burns at the top of the Mountain of Knowledge located in the World of Magic. At the end of the novel, with the help from his magical friends, Luka successfully steals the Fire of Life and re-awakens his father.

**Magic realism in *Luka and the Fire of Life* (2010)**

The most obvious element of magic realism in *Luka and the Fire of Life* is the way it successfully narrates the magical events and characters in the novel through its use of a realist mode of writing. Magical events and happenings in the novel are represented in a realistic way so as to give the impression that these are normal, everyday occurrences. This is an important aspect of the novel because its realist mode of narrative style demarcates it from other forms of literary writing, such as modern fantasy and science fiction. As Hegerfeldt (2005) claims, “Magic realist fiction characteristically hitches itself to a megastory [realistic landmark] to give itself a realistic veneer” (p. 74). As a result, realism as the primary mode of representation in fiction is subverted because the same idea is used to describe events that cannot be explained by rational science.

Unlike a fantasy or science fiction novel, *Luka and the Fire of Life* is anchored to the real world through familiar references and daily affairs. The most conspicuous realist references to the real world in the novel is Luka’s personal collection of video game consoles, such as “pisp” (PlayStation [PSP]), “wees” (Wii), and “Muu” (Mu Online) (pp. 14-15), which are described by the narrator as “pocket-sized alternate-reality boxes” (p. 14) that allow its players to undergo a virtually-stimulated adventure in another space and time. Any reader who has some knowledge of video games would have been able to locate references to these elements in the novel even though Rashid is discreet about mentioning the word “video game” throughout the novel and uses, instead, the game terminology “consoles” (p. 15) when he refers to Luka’s precious toys. Moreover, the presence of video game devices not only connects the story to the extra-textual world in terms of references to a physical object, but also fixes the timeline of the story to the twenty-first century because the Wii console, which is the latest gaming console among all three video games owned by Luka, was first released in 2006, while the PlayStation and the Mu Online games were initially released in 1994 and 2003 respectively.

Like many children’s books, *Luka and the Fire of Life* also connects the experiences that the child protagonist, Luka, has with that of a normal boy by making numerous references to the daily hustle and bustle that he must face at school. In his daily remembering and forgetting facts at school, Luka leads a normal life. Such a description can help Rushdie’s child readers to identify with the protagonist since he, like them, is less than perfect as a student. Moreover, the connection between fact and fiction becomes more vivid when the narrator alludes to actual references that are derived from the real world, including geographical locations and history tests, names of actual places, like South America and Hawaii, sports, such as hockey, and common attire, like the Panama hat and vermillion bush shirts worn by Rashid Khalifa. The use of these references allow the narrative to appropriate a realistic mode of writing that will manipulate the readers’ sense of familiarity to the real
world. Once the reader recognizes these references, realism is projected into the novel and the real world is duplicated inside the story.

The narrative begins with a fairytale-like opening, “There was once, in the city of Kahani, in the land of Alifbay, a boy named Luka…” (p. 3). Such an opening suggests that the story could be a fairy tale instead of a magic realist fiction because it is similar to the opening signpost commonly found in fairy tales. However, the novel contains all the magic realist qualities outlined by Hegerfeldt that would differentiate it from a fairy tale. The most apparent magical element in the novel is the one encountered by Luka as he visits the World of Magic. Similar to the difference in setting used by Lewis Carroll in his second book on Alice’s magical adventures, *Through the Looking Glass* (1871), *Luka and the Fire of Life* also takes place within a widely different setting from the one in *Haroun and the Sea of Stories*. Known as the World of Magic, this magical world setting is kept hidden for thousands of years by the Aalim, the Guardians of the Fire of Life and the Lords of Time: Jo Hua (the past), Jo Hai (the present) and Jo-Aiga (the future). This was the situation until Rashid exposes the existence of the World of Magic in many of his celebrated tales. Consequently, the World of Magic is recognized as being a part of reality by the inhabitants of Kahani. Just like the non-magical world, the World of Magic takes many forms and was known by many different names in different times and spaces. Its location, geography, laws and history change over the course of time just like in the real world.

Throughout the story, the omniscient third-person narrator offers vivid images of the magical elements that exist in the story using a nonchalant narratorial voice that treats the magical elements with the same seriousness as other ordinary events and places. Such images include a complete description of the typography of the magical world where the River of Time, whose miraculous waters originates from the Ocean of the Streams of Story, tumbles down into the Torrent of Words and into the Lake of Wisdom, which stands in the shadow of the Mountain of Knowledge and from where the Fire of Life burns at its top. While describing these places, the narrator avoids using dismissing phrases, such as “it was said that…” and “according to legend”, since these phrases could raise doubts regarding the authenticity of the magical elements; the phrases would have suggested that the World of Magic and Luka’s adventure were fictional instead of real.

Moreover, the nonchalant attitude of the narrator as he or she mentions magical events in the novel reinforces the idea that the events could have really happened in the real world. This is because the narrator who stands outside the events, has access to all information on the events, including the characters’ secret thoughts. He or she also simply describes the magical elements as “undeniable fact(s)” (Hegerfeldt, 2005, p. 76). Furthermore, the narrator’s nonchalant attitude is also used to eliminate any possibility of interpreting Luka’s adventure as a dream, or an hallucination. Although Rashid claims to have dreamt about Luka’s adventure in his Sleep, the narrator immediately nullifies this claim by narrating to the novel’s readers Rashid’s verbal admission that his son saved his life by feeding him the Fire of Life in a nonchalant tone. This indicates that the narrator fully accepts the adventure as having taken place and, thus, reaffirms the matter-of-factness of the event. Subsequently, the magical events are naturalized as normal events. This clearly violates the most general purpose of the realist mode that, according to Habib (2011), is “to offer a truthful, accurate, and objective representation of the real world, both the external world and the human self” (p. 169). Consequently, realism in the novel is subverted because two of its dominant techniques, which include presenting a vivid image of an event and a

place as well as using a nonchalant narratorial voice to describe believable magical elements, are used to prove that ordinary events can be as magical as magic itself can be regarded as normal.

The second magic realist feature that can be identified in *Luka and the Fire of Life* is the use of ex-centric or marginalized focalizers, a character(s) in a story whose point-of-view is different from that held by the dominant centre. The use of a culturally marginalized focalizer in the story is by no means a representation of the actual point-of-view of a marginalized group. As stated by Hegerfeldt (2005), “the use of culturally marginalized focalizers to project a magical world-view is a literary technique, not a mimetic reproduction of an extra-textual reality” (p. 118). In *Luka and the Fire of Life*, an omniscient third-person narrator provides a “godlike” focalization that reveals an in-depth account of all the events that take place in the story, including Luka’s secret thoughts and feelings.

Throughout the novel, Luka represents the marginalized focalizer whose marginality is made apparent through three visible markers: his young age, his left-handedness and his tendency to express a different point-of-view on the reality of the world. Luka’s young age affiliates him with the world of childhood and its temperaments, as well as a general inclination to believe in magic and a desire to experience adventure. Luka grows up believing in magic after listening to his father’s magical tales, including the story of Haroun’s adventure in the Earth’s second moon. Luka even envies his brother for having experienced a great magical adventure on another planet and wishes to undergo a real adventure of his own in the World of Magic instead of an imaginary one in his school’s playground.

Luka’s marginality is visibly marked by his left-handedness, which used to be considered in many societies as an abnormal personal trait. According to Hegerfeldt, “Physical abnormality is used to make marginality more immediate and concrete” (p. 128). However, it is his tendency to express alternative ideas on the reality of the world, which are different from those held by the centre, that indelibly mark Luka’s marginality. Through him, the novel reconfigures the dominant worldview and destabilizes established dominant scientific discourse. In this sense, *Luka and the Fire of Life* can be considered as a postmodernist writing that applies magic realism to assert differences in perception within the very system it attempts to subvert. Therefore, Luka’s point-of-view becomes a tool through which Rushdie is able to express alternative ideas on the reality of the world. In the novel, the most dominant idea that is being subverted is our conventional notion of Time.

Time in the World of Magic is controlled by the Aalim, whose perceptions of Time conforms both to the conventional belief regarding Physical Time, where it is akin to water that flows like a river into the future leaving past events behind, and to the concept of Absolute Time, as developed by Sir Isaac Newton (1642-1727) in *Mathematical Principles of Natural Philosophy* (1687). In two separate occasions, readers are informed about the Aalim’s Laws of Time in the World of Magic. The first time was through Luka’s memory of one of his father’s bedtime stories:

*The Aalim are set in their ways and dislike people who try to rock the boat,” Rashid Khalifa had told the sleepy Luka one night. “Their view of Time is strict and inflexible: yesterday, then today, then tomorrow, tick, tock, tick. They are like robots marching along to the beat of the disappearing seconds. What Was, Jo-Hua, lives in the Past; What is, Jo-Hai, simply is right now; and What Will Come, Jo-Aiga, belongs*
to a place we cannot go. Their time is a prison, they are the jailers, and the seconds and minutes are its walls. (p. 158) (italics in the original)

And the second time is when the Aalim shares with Luka their knowledge about Time:

The ages go by heartlessly whether people wish them to do so or not. All things must pass. Only Time itself endures. If this World ends, another will continue. Happiness, friendship, love, suffering, pain are fleeting illusions, like shadows on a wall. The seconds march forward into minutes, the minutes into days, the days into years, unfeelingly. There is no ‘care.’... (p. 201) (italics in the original)

The first excerpt describes Time as conforming to the idea of Physical Time, which, according to Dowden (2003), complies with the conventional measurement for time wherein hours are divided into 24 through the use of a clock and days are counted with the help of a calendar. This method of measuring time is thought to be essential to our understanding of human experiences as it allows us to construct a chronology of past events. The natural assumption towards physical time is that our standard clock is made up of twenty-four hours per day with an hour consisting of sixty minutes and a minute has sixty seconds, and that the Past precedes the Present before it settles into the Future. This general temporal order is supported by Flaherty and Fine (2001) who claim that, “If asked to order temporal concepts, most people would feel that it is only natural to list them as past, present, and future. After all, they might say, the past precedes the present, and the present precedes the future” (p. 149). The most common symbol of physical time is a clock and a calendar and both are alluded to in the first excerpt. The phrase “yesterday, then today, then tomorrow,” (p. 158) illustrates the passing of days in a calendar, while the onomatopoeia of a clock ticking, “tick, tock, tick” (p. 158) clearly symbolizes the passage of time where seconds become minutes and minutes turn into hours and hours make up a day that turns into weeks, months and years. Since the movement of the physical time is independent from any forms of biological and psychological phenomenon, such as moods and mental focus, physical time is also called “objective time” as it continuously ticks independently, therefore continuously flowing (Dowden, 2003).

Meanwhile, the speaker of the second excerpt talks about Time being an absolute entity that is independent from everything that exist, making it akin to the Newtonian concept of “Absolute Time”. According to Issac Newton, Absolute Time is different from the common idea of the passage of Time, which Newton perceives as a duration that can be experienced through changes in motion, such as the ticking of the clock, the changes in the season, and the rotations of day and night. Absolute Time, as proposed by Newton, exists independently without being influenced by any physical events or the psychology of the perceiver because it is a separate entity from the universe and all objects that exist in the world. In Newton’s own words:

Absolute, true, and mathematical time, of itself, and from its own nature, flows equably without relation to anything external, and by another name is called duration: relative, apparent, and common time, is some sensible and external (whether accurate or unequable) measure of duration by the means of motion, which

is commonly used instead of true time; such as an hour, a day, a month, a year. (Newton p. 6)

As a result of these mechanics, Absolute Time progresses in a constant pace without any regard to the changes that takes place in the world and it will continue to endure even if the world has come to its end. Essentially, absolute time works like a container that holds all worldly phenomena that occur in a deterministic way. Hence, the Aalim’s description of Time where, “The ages go by heartlessly whether people wish them to do so or not. All things must pass. Only Time itself endures. If this World ends, another will continue. Happiness, friendship, love, suffering, pain are fleeting illusions, like shadows on a wall” (p. 201) (italics in original) adheres to Newton’s idea on absolute time because Time passes independently from being influenced by its surrounding, which includes our experiences of different emotional states such as happiness, love, suffering and pain, and it will continue to exist even if the World of Magic were to be destroyed.

Encouraged by the memory of his father who criticises the Aalim’s view of Time, which they consider to be inflexible, Luka claims that Time is not a prison that traps people in static blocks of yesterday, today, and tomorrow. This is because past events can still be relived in memory while present time hardly exists since it is made up of temporary sequences. As for Future time, it is made up of dreams and anticipations without any clear outcome. This is clearly stated in the curse that Luka directs at the Aalim in order to defeat him:

Then I curse you, just as I cursed Captain Aag!” he yelled at the three Jo’s…You think you have everyone in your cage,…Well, curse you, all three of you!…Jo-Hua, the Past has gone and will never return, and if it lives on, it’s only in our memories…As for you, Jo-Hai, the Present hardly exists,…It vanishes into the past every time I blink an eye, and nothing as, um, temporary as that has much power over me. And Jo-Aiga? The Future?…The future is a dream, and nobody knows how it will turn out. The only sure thing is that we–Bear, Dog, my family, my friends, and us– we will make it whatever it is, good or bad, happy or sad, and we certainly don’t need you to tell us what it is. … (pp. 201-202) (italic in original)

From the above-mentioned excerpt, Luka is suggesting that past events are not entirely lost in oblivion because memory can help relive them. Past events are liable to be forgotten because human memory is weak and, therefore, fails to recollect the events. This is supported by David and Marjorie Haight (1989) who claim that the memory of past events could easily be forgotten because human memory is weak. Therefore, the more obscure one’s memory of a certain event, the easier it is forgotten (p. 4). Though one’s memory could often be incorrect and its authenticity could hardly be proven since it can easily be fabricated, Time is not static as it can flow back and forth between the past and the present depending on the psychological condition of the perceiver. From Luka’s stand point, present time might hardly exist at all because it is made of temporary sequences that vanishes into the past and quickly disappear into the future every second time moves forward.

In the novel, Rashid’s alternative idea on the nature of time, which is expressed in Luka’s memory of Rashid’s bedtime story, subverts physical time. It brings into light the concept of subjective time, which is important in understanding many psychological
experiences. Rashid also advocates the idea of time as being relative since it depends on Movement and Space. Subsequently, this leads to the identification of the third magic realist feature namely, appropriation and subversion of the discourse of science and history.

The value of physical time in the physical sciences is appropriated and subsequently undermined in the novel. Physics, according to Peter Riggs (2015), is considered to be, “the most mature physical science because it is based on quantitative methods of gathering evidence and theory development, its ability to make precise measurements, its rigorous empirical testing regime, and its criteria for eliminating theories that have failed to agree with the experimental data” (p. 49). Any theory that fails to follow the strict requirements of the physical sciences will be discarded from any scientific debate. Thus, in the novel, the process of undermining the value of physical time, which is considered important in physics, is performed using another branch of non-literary discourse, namely, psychology.

The nature of Time is one of the most significant subjects in physics as Riggs (2015) claims that, “Time features significantly in both the conduct of physics and as a characteristic of physical theories themselves” (p. 49). In the novel, the physical sciences take the form of the Aalim who represents the idea of absolute time or physical time, a means to measure duration objectively. However, according to Rashid, the Aalim’s idea on Time is misleading because they neglect the psychological aspects of Time that play an important role in making sense of human experiences. Time, according to Rashid, flows like a river instead of ticking like a clock because it “can flow the wrong way,... can jump sideways, so that everything changes in an instant...the River of Time can loop and twist and carry us back to yesterday or forward to the day after tomorrow” (p. 159) (italics in the original). The River of Time works like streams-of-consciousness that flow continuously in a non-linear fashion. It is volatile as it fluctuates from the present by reminiscing on the past and then anticipating tomorrow in an instant. Time, in Rashid’s view, is subjective because it reflects an individual’s thoughts, memory and perception. As he says:

*The time of our feelings is not the same as the time of the clocks. We know that when we are excited by what we are doing, Time speeds up, and when we are bored, it slows down. We know that at moments of great excitement or anticipation, at wonderful moments, Time can stand still.* (p. 159) (italics in original)

The quotation above implies that time can be viewed differently by different people as it is affected by the emotional states of its observers, a factor that distinguishes subjective time from absolute time or physical time, which operates objectively without being influenced by any external factor. In the excerpt, Rashid provides a common example of subjective time where Time passes according to the mental state of an individual. When an individual engages in a fun and goal-oriented task, time is perceived as passing quickly because the mind focusses on enjoying the activity which the task requires as well as attaining a goal. However, when the task is boring or full of anticipation, time slows down because a person’s mind starts to count the number of physical time that has passed as well as to anticipate the moment that the person is allowed to move on to do an enjoyable task.

Nevertheless, Rashid does not reject entirely all ideas related to Time from the perspective of the physical sciences. He, in fact, agrees with Albert Einstein’s theory of relativity that advocates the idea that Time is relative and is influenced by Movement and Space:
We know that Time is not only Itself, but is an aspect of Movement and Space. Imagine two boys, let’s say you and young Ratshit, who both wear wristwatches that are perfectly synchronized, and that both keep perfect Time. Now imagine that that lazy rascal Ratshit sits in the same place,…for one hundred years, while you run, never resting, all the way to school and back here again, over and over, also for one hundred years. At the end of that century, both your watches would have kept perfect Time, but your watch would be six or seven seconds slower than his. (p. 159) (italics in original)

Retold in the above-mentioned excerpt is a classic example of time dilation in Einstein’s relativity theory, also known as the phenomenon of “moving clock runs slower”. Unlike Newton who describes Time as absolute and independent of any external changes, Einstein believes that Time is relative because it varies according to different reference frames. In other words, Time does not exist in a singular form because it passes differently for different observers depending on the observers’ movement or experience.

According to Einstein’s special relativity theory, two perfectly synchronized clocks, Clock A and Clock B, even if they are located far from each other, would remain synchronized if neither of the clocks move as both remain in a single constant velocity reference frame. However, if Clock A moves and Clock B remains stationary, from the point of view of Clock B, Clock A is ticking slower because the movement changes its reference frame from being in a single constant velocity reference frame into another reference frame that is different from the initial reference frame shared by Clock B. Because both clocks are subjected to different conditions, they develop different reference frames. An incident which is analogous to this happens to Luka and Ratshit. Luka who runs, while Ratshit remains stationary, experiences a different reference frame as his time ticks slower than Ratshit’s time simply because, from their different perspectives, time passes differently according to their personal experiences. Ratshit perceives Luka’s time as being slower than his because Luka’s movements slow him down, while Ratshit, who stays stationary, continues to remain in the same time reference. This theory shows that Time perception is unique to individuals because everyone has different experiences and understanding about incidents that are happening to them. Once again, the strict Laws of Time overseen by the Aalim is undermined by Rashid. However, instead of rejecting physical science entirely, Rashid complements the Aalim’s idea on Time by providing an alternative outlook on the nature of Time from a psychological point-of-view.

The novel also uses a fourth magic realist feature, namely presenting realist elements as fantastic, through the supernaturalization of Time, which is portrayed as threatening by the Aalim. The Aalim, in turn, is feared by everyone in the World of Magic. Rashid provides this description of the Aalim:

“It is not known,” said Rashid Khalifa, “if the Aalim have actual physical form. Perhaps they do have bodies, or perhaps they can simply take on bodily shapes when they need to, and at other times they are disembodied entities, spreading out through space—because Time is everywhere, after all; there’s nowhere that doesn’t have its Yesterdays, that doesn’t live in a Today, that doesn’t hope for a good Tomorrow. Anyway, the Aalim are known for their extreme reluctance to appear in public,
preferring to work in silence and behind the scenes. When they have been glimpsed, they have always been hidden inside hooded cloaks, like monks. Nobody has ever seen their faces, and everyone is afraid of their passing — (pp. 198-199) (italics in original)

As the above excerpt shows, Time and the Aalim are one and the same. Because Time, or the Aalim themselves, are not physical entities but abstract constructions; they do not possess any physical form. Despite representing the most realistic element in the novel, the Aalim is a mysterious group working in silence. Because of this, their presence intimidates everybody around them. The others’ general dislike of the Aalim is intensified by the latter’s own admission regarding their disregard for the welfare of the people in the World of Magic as they say in unison, “It is of no consequence to us whether this world lives or dies...Compassion is not our affair,...The ages go by heartlessly whether people wish them to do so or not. All things must pass. Only Time itself endures. If this World Ends, another will continue...” (p. 201) (italics in original). Thus Time, which is normally considered as part of everyday existence, is supernaturalized and made to appear as threatening to the people because Time is selfish and uncompromising towards the living as they persist to continue without stopping for anybody.

Finally, the last magic realist feature that can be identified in Luka and the Fire of Life is literalization in which verbal expression is manifested as real, thus, violating the boundaries between words and actions. In the novel, this technique follows a common pattern of words transforming into things and it is portrayed through the materialization of Luka’s curses on Captain Aag and the Aalim. The first curse is uttered prior to Luka undergoing his adventure to steal the Fire of Life, where he says to Captain Aag, “May your animals stop obeying your command and your rings of fire eat up your stupid tent,” (p. 6), and the second curse materializes when (pp. 201-202) Luka realizes that the Aalim neither care nor wish to save the World of Magic because they only care about their existence and survival.

By turning simple words into reality, the novel suggests that verbal expressions could become a powerful medium of change because words are not empty utterances but “vessels” of meaning that can produce reactions from both their speakers and listeners. This can clearly be seen through the effects that Luka’s curses have on the circus animals and the “ex-gods” from the World of Magic because after hearing them, they revolt against their cruel masters and regain their freedom. Although Luka’s first curse on Captain Aag materializes, it also backfires on him because it causes Captain Aag to cast a spell on his father so that the latter falls into a Big Sleep. Luka’s second curse also materializes as the Aalim are rendered helpless when the ex-gods rebel against them and replace the authority of the Aalim with a more sensible idea about Time that permits dream-time, lateness, delays, anti-aging and reluctances. Consequently, boundaries between words and actions are blurred as words are shown to be as powerful as actions.

**CONCLUSION**

Luka and the Fire of Life displays all five prototypical magic realist features as outlined by Hegerfeldt in Lies That Tell the Truth (2004). Although the novel is a continuation of the first children’s novel by Rushdie, the protagonist for the novel is not Haroun but his younger brother, Luka, who undergoes an adventure in the World of Magic, a new magical setting
created by Rushdie. By adopting realist strategies, such as a nonchalant manner of narration to describe all events in the story as real, the narrator treats magical elements in the novel as ordinary ones and consequently undermines realism as the privilege mode of representation of the real world because realist strategies are used to describe incongruent subject matters. In order to present an alternative point-of-view on the nature of Time that is different from the dominant ideas about Time that are derived from the physical sciences, magic realism in the novel utilizes a marginalized focalizer to bring into light different ideas about Time. It also appropriates the conventional idea on Time from the perspective of the physical sciences, only to subvert it later in order to show that physical science alone is insufficient to explain the nature of Time. Magic realism in the novel also suggests that both the physical sciences and psychology are needed to understand human experiences because a human being consists of at least two properties, namely physical and mental. The method to deliver an alternative perspective is done using stories and storytelling. This indicates that stories and storytelling offer important ways to understand reality as it contains collective knowledge that records human perception that can be shared and identified by many people, providing them with guidance in making sense of their experiences.

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**


REPRESENTATION OF MEANING IN IDIOMS IN SAN GUA YAN YI AND THEIR TRANSLATION IN THREE KINGDOMS

Yap Ngee Thai* and Khoo Yen Loo
Faculty of Languages and Communication, Universiti Putra Malaysia, 43400 UPM Serdang Selangor
e-mail: ntyap@upm.edu.my; ylookhoo@gmail.com

ABSTRACT
Idioms are fixed expressions, which can be challenging for translators. This paper aims to compare the representation of idioms in the source text, San Gua Yan Yi, a Classic Chinese novel with the representation in the translation enacted in Three Kingdoms. All idioms that were utilized more than six times in the source text were identified and these idioms and their translations were analyzed. The paper adopted the transitivity system in Systemic Functional Linguistics (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014) for the analysis. The representation of meaning in idioms in the source and target texts were examined closely, by focusing on the processes and other elements of the idiom and the sentences prior to and following the idiom that forms the context surrounding the idiom to describe the literal lineament in the translated texts. The results provided some insight to fathom the translators word selection and strategies for translation of idioms. The investigation revealed that some of the idioms that were reiterated for numerous times in the novel were sometimes presented differently from its source text to accommodate the need of the contexts. The analysis showed differences in distinct word selection, for the purpose of pertinent context presentation and message delivery. Ultimately, the analysis in this study strives to offer insights on idiom translation strategies by illustrating the silhouette of word concordances that may be influenced by the context of use for each idiom.

Keywords: translation; idioms; Classical Chinese, transitivity system; Systemic Functional Linguistics.

INTRODUCTION
Chéng Yǔ [成语] or Chinese idioms are fixed expressions that are often made up of four characters or two couplets of four characters each, and they often allude to a story or historical quotation, thus rendering the idiomatic expression to be highly culture-bound (Cui, 1997). Some fixed expressions, however, can be easily translated if an equivalent word can be found in the target language. However, this is often not the case with many idioms, and it has been argued that translation of idioms can raise concerns in the field of translation as the work can be equated with translating culturally embedded meanings where equivalence may not exist in the target culture (Dabaghi & Bagheri, 2012). According to Newmark (1988), it is difficult to get idioms with the same meanings and frequencies in both the source and target languages. Sometimes, it is also difficult to transform the cultural meaning embodied in idioms from the source language to the target language. As a result, some translation attempts of idiomatic expressions may result in the target text sounding rather unnatural. Translators need to get the natural equivalence between the source language and target
language in the translation process to ensure that the essence contained in idioms is effectively conveyed.

Specifically, Baker (1992) describes two main problems faced when translating idioms. The first problem is the ability to discover and understand an idiom accurately. The second problem is the difficulty to identify idiomatic phrases with similar meanings to convey in the target language. She further lists the problems faced by translators in translating idioms. First, an idiom may have no equivalent match in the target language. Different languages have different grammar rules which can be hard for non-native speakers to master, let alone idioms with special grammar rules. It is also challenging when there are no idioms with equivalent cultural concepts to match between the source and target languages. Furthermore, idioms used in uncommon sentence structures are also considered as problematic for translators. Second, an idiom may have a similar counterpart in the target language, but it may be used in a different context compared to the context in which its equivalent form is found in the source language. Idioms from different languages can have similar meanings, but may be conveyed differently to suit the culture or context. Third, an idiom may be used in the source text with both its literal and idiomatic meanings at the same time. Idioms in the source language can be easily understood literally but difficult to be interpreted to reveal the idiomatic sense expressed in a context. The last problem in translation is the conventions of using idioms in written discourse. An idiom in a language can have a different convention mode compared to one in another language. Some idioms are suitable to be used in written materials to convey scenes or situations to bring rhetorical effects for the context (Fernando & Flavell, 1981). However, when idioms are overused in public reading materials, readers may feel that the text is unreadable especially when the translated context requires a different stylistic approach where the use of idioms may not be appropriate (Baker, 1992).

Because idioms are in essence the vehicle that contains a lot of cultural meaning, and translation of idioms therefore is a lot more challenging, it was deemed beneficial to trace the work of an experienced translator to examine how the translator has approached the problem of translating Chinese idioms in the work of translating a classical literary text, where idioms are found in abundance. For this purpose, the work of Moss Roberts was chosen as he had translated San Guo Yan Yi, one of the main classics in Chinese Literature into Three Kingdoms using Modern English and made this classical literary work assessable to both Chinese and non-Chinese readers who may not be acquainted with a cultural understanding of Ancient Chinese history and the way of life in ancient times. We hoped that through this study, more insight can be found to inform translators and practitioners about how to translate idioms in literary texts and the influence that context may have on the choices made by the translator.

THREE KINGDOMS OR SAN GUO YAN YI
San Guo Yan Yi, the selected novel for this study, is a Chinese novel written by Luo Guanzhong based on the historical facts and creation of storylines during the mid-14th century. The novel San Guo Yan Yi was produced during the late Yuan (元) and early Ming (明) dynasty around the period of the mid-14th century. This novel described the historical events in three countries, Wei (魏), Shu (蜀), and Wu (吴), during the end of Han (汉) Dynasty (189-220 AD). Wang (2004) argued that the novel which was written using both classical Chinese and colloquial Chinese, used simple structures which could be easily
understood by the laymen. He also described the novel as a simple and unadorned novel, yet sophisticated with a sprightly tone.

According to Cai (2010), *San Guo Yan Yi* is the only classical novel which combines historical facts, for example, military, communion etiquette, daily lifestyle with fiction (Cai, 2010). The result is a novel that depicts closely the ancient Chinese management system and lifestyle of the Chinese ancestors (ibid). Therefore, a literary text that records these facts is one of the ways to transmit cultural and historical knowledge about how the Chinese ancestors governed the country during the wars, and how they socialized with one another and how they survived during that period of time. As the above novel is considered rich in cultural information, this novel and its translation by Moss Roberts was selected for our study.

The study examined the representation of idioms with high instances of repetition were repeated in the novel to compare the representation of these idioms in both the source text and the target text. By investigating the idioms that were repeated numerous times, the researchers were able to examine how the same translator dealt with the translation of the same idiom in different contexts. McCarthy & O’Dell (n.d.) argues that the meanings conveyed by the idioms can be examined more accurately by also looking at the context of use, as “the best way to understand an idiom is to see it in [the] context [where it is used]” (p.6).

As shown in the example given by McCarthy and O’Dell (n.d.), the idiom “drive somebody round the bend” means to make somebody angry. They provided a sentence where the idiom is used in context: “This tin opener’s driving me round the bend! I think I’ll throw it away and get a new one.” (p.6). They explained that the idiom conveys a different meaning from “driving a car round a curve in the road”. In the case of the idiom, it is the common sense derived from the subsequent sentence about replacing the tin opener that provides the information that the tin opener is not working properly. Many idioms have both literal and non-literal meanings and often times, it is the contexts that draw out the idiomatic meaning; in particular some idiomatic expressions with ambiguous definitions may be disambiguated in context (Caroline et al., 2010).

In the case of working out the meaning of idioms in *San Guo Yan Yi*, the challenge may be greater compared to technical translation or translation of contemporary literary works as the translator needs to also attend to the meaning conveyed in Classical Chinese which is different from contemporary Modern Chinese in order to effectively translate the novel to Modern English.

For the purpose of the study, we have adopted Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) as the framework for analysis because SFL views language use in terms of the options available within the constraints of the lexico-grammatical resources in the language. SFL places meaning making as the focus and examines how form and function works together with contextual information to bring out meaning that is conveyed. In this paper, we will show that he analysis using the transitivity system is a useful analytical tool is able to reveal in much more depth the factors influencing the translation of idiomatic expressions from classical Chinese into modern English. By examining the process types employed for each idiom in the context of the source and target text, the researchers can gain insights from past translation works that can help future translators work with the challenges posed by idioms in translation. However, because of constraint of space, this paper will only discuss the analysis of two idioms: 1) The most frequent idiom “不计其数” (buji qi shu) which carries the
meaning of innumerable or countless times and 2) “措手不及” (cuo shou bu ji) which literally mean not moving in time with one’s hands to save something.

**THE TRANSITIVITY SYSTEM IN SYSTEMIC FUNCTIONAL LINGUISTICS**

Halliday’s (1994) systemic functional linguistics (SFL) examines the components found in a clause. This theory has been proven to be an influential theory for studying texts (Adetomokun, 2012). It analyzes the context as a whole by including both literally and embedded ideas expressed in a text. The theory of SFL traces the constituents that contribute to meaning conveyed in a sentence. The function of the components traced in a clause during text analysis can help translators to reveal the function of a specific language element used within a particular context. This approach seeks to frame grammatical description which includes the explanation on the meanings for the whole message instead of just focusing on a single word (Thompson, 2004). Readers can apply this theory when reading the text to gain a better understanding of the grammatical elements and functions of the language found (Adetomokun, 2012).

The transitivity system in SFL provides a useful analytical tool to examine the grammatical patterns in clauses used to represent the experiences in the world. According to Manfredi (2008), translators who analyze the contexts using SFL should study the text by focusing on the precise and specific concepts, but not the general meanings of the text. In other words, every presented text has its specific functions in expressing specific situations, for example, social backgrounds, culture, politic, history, and ideological concepts that the translators need to focus on. The transitivity system construes experiences into six different process types, namely material, mental, relational, behavioral, verbal, and existential processes. Each of the processes has its own typical properties as discussed briefly in the following sections.

**MATERIAL PROCESSES**

Material processes are described as processes of doing; these processes describe physical actions such as eat, drink, and read. The material process is typically made up of two inherent participants. In the view of traditional western linguistics, every process has an actor and sometimes involves a second participant called Goal who is influenced by the process. The actor found in a sentence is known as the “logical subject” who is doing the deed. Examples of such processes are shown in Table 1:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No of participant</th>
<th>Actor</th>
<th>Process</th>
<th>Goal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>One participant</td>
<td>The tiger</td>
<td>roar</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two participants</td>
<td>The tiger</td>
<td>attacked</td>
<td>the cow</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The material process is a process that expresses an action done by a doer who may do it to another participant. This process is grouped under the process of doing-and-happening which needs the input of energy to bring out changes in reality. The two examples show the following: (a) the process involves only the tiger which is the Actor, and (b) it extends to the goal, the cow. The Goal here implies “directed at” or the one who undergoes the process (Halliday, 1994 p.109-110). Some of these sentences contain the second participant known as
a Goal and can be affected by the first participant. Some of them are without a Goal but they are the minority. The Goals are either human or non-human and they are grouped under the material process based on the verbs used in the sentences.

**MENTAL PROCESSES**

Mental processes, also considered as processes of sensing, refer to the activities happening in the participants’ minds, for example, seeing, thinking, loving, feeling, hearing, wishing, and understanding. Mental processes describe the internal reactions of the participants labelled as “senser”. The “senser” is “doing the sensing” (Huang, 2011, p.186) of the real world known as “phenomenon” (Ng, 2009). The “senser” is the non-active participant (Eggins, 1994, as cited in Ng, 2009) and examples of verbs that represent mental processes are verbs like “love”, “feel”, and “perceived”; these verbs encode inner mental activities. The senser experiences the mental activity which can be realized by a nominal group with any kind of entity, for example, human, objects, substances, animals, and abstraction (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014).

The Phenomenon can be stated indirectly using sensory words such as “know”, “see”, and “hear” (Huang, 2011). The phenomenon is a situation that can be felt, wanted, thought, or perceived when a sense is reversed (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014). The phenomenon in a clause is not restricted to any semantic or grammar group as it can be anything, any act, or any fact to reflect the situation (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014).

The mental process describes the inner activity done by someone and the activity cannot be sensed easily by others. The sentences that are grouped under the mental process are normally followed by the Phenomenon which is the reflection of the inner activity done by the sensors and can be easily recognized by others.

**RELATIONAL PROCESSES**

Relational processes are processes that relate two separate entities. Halliday and Matthiessen (2014) list three main relational types and six categories under the relational processes in the transitivity system as shown in Table 2 and Table 3. The clauses shown reveal the differences between the identifying and attribute modes. The identifying mode involves the identified and the identifying participants which are grouped under the reversible category where ‘x’ and ‘a’ can be reversed whereas the attributive mode is irreversible. The attributive mode involves two participants: the Carrier (the ascribed) and the Attribute (the quality). The quality attribute can be realized by using the adjective and the entity of this attribute can be identified as a nominal group (Ng, 2009; Thompson, 2004). The qualitative attribute can also be identified by the use of adverbs of degree and comparative adverbs, for example, “very”, “more”, “than”, “greatly”, and “lesser” (Ng, 2009) to describe the attributes of the Carrier as in Table 2 and Table 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intensive</th>
<th>‘x is a’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Circumstantial</td>
<td>‘x is at a’ (where ‘is at’ stands for ‘is a, in, on for, with, about, along, etc.’)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possessive</td>
<td>‘x has a’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Each of these can further be divided into two dissimilar modes:

| Attributive     | ‘a is an attribute of x’ |
Identifying ‘a is the identity of x’

Table 3: Six principal types of relational process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mode Type</th>
<th>Attributive</th>
<th>Identifying</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intensive</td>
<td>Sarah is wise</td>
<td>Tom is the leader; the leader is Tom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Circumstantial</td>
<td>The fair is on a Tuesday</td>
<td>Tomorrow is the 10th; the 10th is tomorrow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possessive</td>
<td>Peter has a piano</td>
<td>The piano is Peter’s; Peter’s is the piano</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The identifying process is a defining process to identify another, for example, “x is identified by a” (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014). Structurally, the term “x” is the element to be labelled as the Identified and the term “a” is the element that is labelled as the Identifier (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014; Thompson, 2004).

**BEHAVIORAL PROCESSES**

The behavioral process is a subsidiary process that is located at the boundary between material and mental processes. It has both physiological and psychological activities, for example, staring, listening, and testing (Huang, 2011). Halliday defines this process as the one that represents the external expression based on the internal working to act out the consciousness, for example, laughing, sleeping, and crying (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2004). The individual involved in the behavioral process is marked as the Behaver who behaves by reacting to the phenomenon (Huang, 2011). This process is like the mental process by being aware of the human’s inner activities (Ng, 2009). Due to the complexity of the characteristics mentioned by Halliday, behavioral processes can be simplified as the activity done which can be easily seen or heard by the second party.

**VERBAL PROCESSES**

The verbal process is situated at the boundaries between the mental and relational processes, with ideas presented in language forms (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2004). This process is more appropriately named as a symbolic process (Halliday, 1994). It emphasizes the symbolic relationships between humans. The verbal process symbolizes the relationships about human awareness. The relationships are shown in a language as meanings and sayings (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2004).

A saying is a verb that needs to be interpreted in a broader sense as any symbolic exchange of meanings (Halliday, 1994). The entity can be anything as long as it puts out a signal as the Sayer and does not need any conscious participant, unlike the mental process (ibid.). This entity cannot be regarded as the Senser as in the mental process (ibid.).

There are three or more participants in a sentence that are appointed as the receiver and verbiage. These participants provide additional functions to the Sayer. The receiver is the individual who receives the content of saying (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014). For the verbiage, it functions as “to what is said” that may have two meanings: the “content” and...
“the name of the saying” (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014) which provides some information to the receiver. The third participant is the target, a subtype of the verbal process which is “targeted in the saying” (ibid.), referring to a person, an abstraction, or object.

EXISTENTIAL PROCESSES
The existential process is placed at the boundary between relational and material processes to describe the existence of something (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014). This process provides the information that something exists somewhere, or something happens somewhere (Halliday, 1994). This process enables the addressee to introduce the new information for the receiver. The existential process elaborates on the happening or existence of something at a particular moment or place. The existential process has diversified circumstantial components for time or place. The existence can appear in any form, for example, abstraction, object, institution, or person (Halliday & Matthiessen, 2014).

PAST STUDIES DONE ON TRANSLATING IDIOMS
In this section, we present the review of related studies on the translation of Chinese idioms. Some of the studies have argued that researchers should consider translating the idioms based on the contexts to compensate for cultural differences found between the two languages. For example, Feng (2012) mentions that the work in translating Chinese idioms is the greatest challenge because idioms reflect the inherited Chinese culture. Based on Shi and Jiang (2015), previous works on translation of idioms have focused on the relationships between idioms and culture or translation strategies in a very general sense. They argue that there are only a few studies which have discussed the comparison of idioms in terms of cultural connotations. For example, Shi and Jiang’s research compared English and Chinese idioms from the two cultural perspectives. From the comparison done, they discussed the overlapping of cultural elements found between the English language and the Chinese language which simplified the process of understanding in these two languages. They also discussed the conflicts resulting from the differences of cultures involved in the translation works. These conflicts in the cultural connotations derived from the two languages can increase potential misinterpretations made in the translated works involving these two languages.

Yang (2010) focuses on English and Chinese idioms that contain food names and discusses the different idiomatic expressions used in relation to anxiety. To deal with the different words used in the idioms, Yang suggests that translators should first identify the structures in the idioms and then proceed in finding a suitable translation by using two methods. There are three ways to identify the structures in the idioms. These ways are similar to those suggested in Baker (1992): (a) idioms with the same structure but cannot be translated directly; (b) idioms with the same structure and same figurative meaning, and (c) idioms with no similar structures (p.152-153). Yang (2010, p.153) also proposes two methods to translate idioms: (a) to find the same structure and change the improper word(s) in the source text into words or phrases that the target readers are familiar with, and (b) to translate the idioms by adding more explanations after the literal translation. This method is to ensure that the target text not only carries the features of the source text but is also understandable for the target readers. These suggestions, while being useful, can be supported with more specific suggestions which can be obtained from a more detailed analysis of what previous translators have done. To the novice translator, it may be necessary
to provide clearer guidelines on how to implement some of the strategies suggested by Yang (2010). For example, for the second suggestion from Yang (2010) in (b), what additional explanation may be appropriate after providing the literal translation? We hope to be able to supplement these suggestions by examining the context in which these idioms are used to identify specific ways in which the meaning from the source text may be transferred to the target texts by looking at the contextual information that surrounds the use of specific idioms in the source text.

In addition, Wang (2012) compared the similarities and differences between Chinese and English idioms containing colour words. She researched on the idioms containing the name of colours: white, black, and red. According to her, these colours reflect the users’ social perceptions and daily lifestyle. These idioms refer to the same colours and yet express different ideas when they are found in idioms from these two different languages.

From the above discussion, the researchers basically suggested that translators should use appropriate translation strategies to translate idioms based on the contexts and cultural differences found between the two languages. Feng (2012) proposes the idea of applying either domestication or foreignization as the translation strategy to translate idioms from the source language to target language. According to her, there is no translation strategy that is universally workable and applicable in translating any kind of language.

The reviewed studies concentrate more on the cultural issues instead of the contexts as suggested by Snell-Hornby (1988) to find a way to translate these idioms appropriately. Snell-Hornby (1988) also stresses that translators should not study a phenomenon by isolating it but should instead trace the relationships of the phenomenon with their relevance and functions in a text. Therefore, this paper employed the transitivity system to investigate every element that forms the contexts for the selected idioms to examine its utility in translating idioms.

**METHODOLOGY**

The analysis done in this study is qualitative in nature. Creswell’s (2014, p.268-269) procedures for coding the materials were adopted. There are six steps involved: understanding the sense of the whole text, selecting the idioms, and coding the text. Furthermore, Aldebyan’s (2008) procedures which investigated how a literary text was translated from Arabic into English were also adapted in this study. He used three steps for his analysis: descriptive, comparative and evaluative methods. Aldebyan (2008, p.3) named this approach as the *descriptive-comparative- evaluative approach*.

The first step, the descriptive step aims to describe both the idioms in Chinese and idioms in English as discussed in the introduction. The second step, the comparative step, is a step to compare the source and target texts based on what is found in the description in the previous step. Both the texts are compared to know whether the target text matches the source text. The elements of the target text are compared to those in the source text to observe how the translators comprehend and interpret the texts. The definition of words or phrases used in the translated text was checked using the dictionaries to identify the similarities or differences between the source and target texts. This examination could reveal how Roberts conveyed the ideas from the idioms in the source text. For this study, this step was applied to compare the elements in the sentence preceding and following the idiom in both the source text and the target text. The last step is evaluation. The representation of meaning in the translated text is compared with the representation of meaning in the source.
texts and the equivalence of the meaning is evaluated. The evaluation includes examining the fidelity of the target text towards the meaning conveyed in the source text, the suitability and impact made by the target text, and the quality in terms of the stylistics of the translated text.

**Procedures of Analysis**

The research procedures, adapted from the ideas of Cresswell (2014) and Aldebyan (2008), are summarized in Figure 1 which describes the two step approach adopted in the study. The first step involved identification of the idioms in the source text. The second step involved the analysis conducted by examining the representation of the idioms in the source text and its translated equivalent using the transitivity system in SFL.

Step 1: Identification of idioms.

Step 2: Identifying how Chinese Idioms and the translated idiom are represented using SFL

**Procedures Used To Identify Idioms and Repeated Idioms**

To begin the research, Cresswell (2014) suggests reading and understanding the entire novel. He proposes to have the broad themes from the detailed data for the investigation. Therefore, for this paper, the focus was on the idioms as they were the treasure embodied with the knowledge of the ancestors.

The next step involved coding. According to Cresswell (2014), the coding process includes identifying the segments in the text. For this study, contexts with idioms from both languages were extracted. The extracted contexts involved three sentences: the main sentence containing the idioms which was presented in Italics; minimally, a sentence before the sentence containing the idiom and another sentence after the main sentences. More sentences were included when deemed necessary if the preceding or following sentence does not provide enough contexts. This step was manually done to focus on the specific data which were rich with contextual information. The sentences with the idioms in the source text and translated text were underlined.

The repeated idioms were traced using purposeful sampling. There were a total of 706 unique idioms found from a total of 1360 instances of use. For this study, the analysis was done on idioms with at least six repetitions in the novel. The decision was made after the initial frequency of analysis of idioms was made. The initial analysis showed that there were forty-two idioms that were repeated at least six times in the novel (see Appendix 1). As the
analysis was qualitative in nature, the researchers felt that this was sufficient for an in-depth analysis.

Two Chinese idiom dictionaries were consulted to get accurate meanings for the idioms used in the source text: 《中国成语分类大辞典》(Zhongguo Chengyu Fenlei Dacidian) (1987), and “A Dictionary of Chinese Idioms” (2014). The first dictionary was selected as it could provide the meanings of idioms used in the novel and could have been used to guide Roberts in his translation. The second dictionary was selected as it provided English translation and Chinese definitions that allowed comparison with the translated novel. An English dictionary was also used to get the definitions of words or phrases employed in the target text. The dictionary used was: *Cambridge International Dictionary of English* (1997).

The study described in this paper was part of a larger study which also examined the strategies used for translating the idioms in the same novel. The initial findings of the analysis done can be found in Khoo and Yap (2015). However, in this paper, we will only focus on the representation of meanings in idioms and its surrounding context in both the source and target texts to examine in more detail the process involved in establishing equivalence in the translation process.

**Representation of Meanings in Idioms**

Having identified the idioms and the meaning of the idioms in the source text, the next step involved an in-depth analysis using transitivity system in SFL. Each sentence containing an idiom was divided into a few segments as suggested in SFL to discover the elements contained in the sentence. Aldebyan’s (2008) comparative step was applied here to compare both the source and target texts. The comparison was done after the elements for the idioms and the context was tagged with functional labels. Similarities and differences were noted between the representation used in the source and target texts.

The transitivity system, as explained earlier, contains six processes: material, mental, relational, behavioural, verbal, and existential. Table 4 summarizes the transitivity system by Huang (2011) on Halliday’s SFL to give a clearer picture on who are involved, what has been done, and who have been affected by the processes. It shows that every process contains at least a participant to describe the experiences.

Table 5 presents the coding used in the analysis of each idiom and its context. To show how these codes are used, see the example presented in (1). The sentences with idioms were presented in italics and the idioms were underlined. To illustrate the analysis done using the transitivity system, we explain the codes used for the English version although both versions are shown in example (1). Participants in the clauses were identified and labelled using square brackets such as [Actor] for *stormy wind*. Processes, labelled as ‘pr’ followed by a colon and the specific type of processes, were also identified in each idiom. For example in (1), two material processes were identified. Circumstances identified in the clause are labelled as ‘cir’ followed by a colon and the type of circumstantial element in the clause. For example, [cir: condition] in (1) shows that the word group, *flying with the speed of driving rain*, describes the manner of what happened to the dirt and stone in the scene described.
Table 4: Transitivity System (Halliday, 1994; Halliday & Matthiessen, 2004, 2014 as summarized in Huang, 2011, p.185)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Processes</th>
<th>Element</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Material</td>
<td>Actor + Process ± Goal [transitive/ intransitive], confined to “material” clauses, so leading to a range of other configurations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental</td>
<td>Sensor + Process + Phenomenon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relational</td>
<td>Carrier + Process + Attribute; Token + Process + Value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavioural</td>
<td>Behaver + Process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbal</td>
<td>Sayer + Process (± Receiver)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Existential</td>
<td>Existent + Process</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5: Codes used for elements in the analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Coding</th>
<th>Elements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[ ]</td>
<td>Classification of the elements found or subdivisions found in the main clause.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pr</td>
<td>Process type.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cir</td>
<td>Circumstance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Actor</td>
<td>Participant in material processes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senser</td>
<td>Participant in mental processes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carrier/Identified</td>
<td>Participant in relational processes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behaver</td>
<td>Participant in behavioural processes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sayer/Receiver</td>
<td>Participant in verbal processes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Existent</td>
<td>Participant in existential processes.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(1) 马钧教先拆铜人。多人并力拆下铜人来，只见铜人眼中潸然泪下。众皆大惊。

Ma Jun ordered the statue pulled down first, but when a number of men joined together and accomplished this, lo, the statue’s eyes filled with tears. The men were astonished. Suddenly [cir:manner] one stormy wind [actor] sprang up [pr:material] along the terrace [cir:place], sending [pr:material] dirt and stones [goal] flying with the speed of driving rain [cir:quality]. With a deafening roar, as if the heavens had fallen or the earth opened wide, the terrace and the pillar toppled over, crushing a thousand of the men. (p2625)

**STEPS IN ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSIONS**

The evaluation process suggested by Aldebyan (2008) was applied here to compare and discuss the findings. The discussion focussed on the choice of words or phrases employed by Roberts for the same repeated idioms in his translation based on the transitivity system by Halliday and Matthiessen (2014). First, the idiom was understood in isolation of the contexts...
in which they were used. This was done by examining the words that formed the idioms. As expected, some idioms were more transparent than others. The representation of meaning of the idiom was then examined by looking at the context in the source text, before examining the meaning that was transferred into the target text. With these multi-layers of analysis performed, factors influencing Roberts’s choice of words were identified.

**FINDINGS**

This study found 706 unique idioms in the novel with a total of 1360 instances of use. With the cut-off applied for idioms with at least six repetitions, 42 unique idioms were identified with a total of 395 instances (see Appendix 1). Out of these idioms that were analyzed, the most frequent idiom was 不计其数 (bu ji qi shu) which was repeated twenty eight times, while the second most frequent idiom was 措手不及 (cuo shou bu ji) which was used twenty times in the novel. Table 6 showed the difference in frequency of the processes identified for the idioms and its equivalent translation in the two languages.

Table 6: Results of frequencies and percentages found for every process used in Chinese and English.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Transitivity Processes</th>
<th>Source Text (Chinese), (%)</th>
<th>Target Text (English), (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Material</td>
<td>3 (15%)</td>
<td>2 (10%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1 (5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relational</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1 (5%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavioural</td>
<td>17 (85%)</td>
<td>16 (80%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>20 (100%)</td>
<td>20 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The most frequent idiom mentioned above, “不计其数” carries the meaning of innumerable or countless times. However, from the analysis it was found that the translation of this idiom was less influenced by the context. Table 7 lists the English translations that were elicited for this idiom. As shown in Table 7, the translations were analyzed as circumstances that modify the noun or the situation. The translation was more straightforward as the idiom in the source text was often used to modify noun groups; therefore numerals, adjectives and word groups that indicated quantity such as thousands, countless, many, huge quantities were found to be the translated equivalent of this idiom. Perhaps the meaning of the idiom has a more straightforward equivalence in English and the concept of numbers and quantity or vastness is not foreign in English. Therefore, the first suggestion on how to translate idioms provided by Baker (1992) which is to translate the idiom using an equivalent meaning in the target language seem appropriate for this idiom. Nevertheless, there was also one instance where the meaning was not directly translated but implied in the meaning of the phrase “a tide of men, an avalanche of horses” that was used to describe the scene (Roberts; 1004).
Table 7: Equivalent translations provided for ’不计其数’

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Remarks</th>
<th>Translation 1</th>
<th>Translation 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>More prisoners that could</td>
<td>Incalculable</td>
<td>Huge quantities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>be counted</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Countless (5x)</td>
<td>Innumerable</td>
<td>A bounty of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Many (3x)</td>
<td>Thousands</td>
<td>Numbers more than</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Were hoarded</td>
<td>Untold numbers (2x)</td>
<td>In numbers past reckoning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A vast treasure</td>
<td>An appalling number</td>
<td>Beyond calculating</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beyond reckoning (2x)</td>
<td>Beyond numbering (2x)</td>
<td>Past numbering</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Next, we will discuss the analysis of another idiom, 措手不及 (cuo shou bu ji), where more variation was found. This idiom was selected for this paper as we felt it could better show the different representation that was given in the source text and the target text. This way, we would illustrate better the use of the transitivity system in Systemetic Functional Linguistics as the framework for analysis. We will also show how Roberts translated the same idioms differently according to the contexts.

The idiom “措手不及” (cuo shou bu ji), is an idiom which describes a person who is caught unprepared (Zhongguo Chengyu Fenlei Dacidian 中国成语分类大辞典, 1987). A Dictionary of Chinese Idioms (2014) also defines this idiom as not moving in time with one’s hands to save something. This idiom is normally used to describe somebody who is too late in reacting to defend himself or herself from the enemies and is usually used in war scenes. In isolation, the idiom can be interpreted as a material process if we focus on its literal meaning which is not moving one’s hand in time. However, when placed in context with other descriptions in the source text, the meaning that is emphasized could shift towards a behavioural process as the verb reacting could lean towards the mental preparedness and not the physical action of the person described. We will discuss this shift in representation in the analysis that follow.

In the following examples, we look at the same idiom used in three different contexts to illustrate how the analysis using the transitivity system could provide insights to unravel the process of translation involved in translating idioms. In the first example, the idiom was used to describe the shock experienced by the Riverland troops who were unable to defend themselves upon seeing their enemies advance towards them from two different directions. In the second example, the idiom was introduced after describing how the warrior Zhang Hu was shocked to witness his friend Chen Sheng fall from his horse after being shot by an arrow. As a result, he was also killed by Han Dang before he could defend himself. The analyses of these two idioms are presented below as E1 and E2. In the third example, E3, the idiom was used to describe how Yan Liang was too slow in figuring out a quick moving object that was advancing towards him. Hence, Yan Liang was killed by Lord Guan who was riding the Red Hare, a special breed of horse that could move at great speed.


When almost all had passed, the northerners, drumming and screaming, set upon the transport troops from both sides.  Caught[pr:material] unprepared[cir:contingency],
the Riverlands troops [actor/goal] abandoned [pr:material] several of the mechanical beasts [cir:cause], which Zhang Hu and Yue Chen [actor] eagerly hauled back [pr:material] to their main camp [cir:place]. (p.2553)

E2. 孙策望见，按住手中枪，扯弓搭箭，正射中陈生面门，应弦落马。张虎 [senser] 见 [pr:mental] 陈生坠地 [phenomenon], 吃了一惊 [pr:mental], 措手不及 [pr:material], 被韩当 [actor] 一刀 [pr:material], 削去 [pr:material] 半个脑袋 [goal]。程普纵马直来阵前捉黄祖。 (p.166)

The arrow hit Sheng squarely in the forehead, and he collapsed. Zhang Hu [senser] was distracted [pr:mental] by the sight of Chen Sheng on the ground [phenomenon:place], and in that moment Han Dang [actor] cleaved [pr:material] his skull [goal] with a stroke of his sword [cir:means]. Cheng Pu galloped to the front, hunting for Huang Zu, who got rid of his helmet and his horse and saved himself by mingling with the foot soldiers. (p.167)

E3.

方欲问时，关公赤兔马快，早已跑到面前，颜良 [behaver] 措手不及 [behavioral], 被云长 [actor] 手起一刀 [pr:material], 刺于马下 [goal]。忽地下马，割了颜良首级，拴于马项之下，飞身上马，提刀出阵，如入无人之境。 (p.630)

Before Liang could identify the figure crashing toward him, the speed of Red Hare had already brought them face-to-face. Yan Liang [carrier] was too slow [attribute], and with a stroke of the blade [cir:means] Lord Guan [actor] pierced him [goal]. (p.631)

The first example (E1) clearly showed that the idiom in the source text was represented as an attribute to modify the actors, the Riverland troops, who abandoned their war paraphernalia as a response to seeing the enemies advance from two different directions. In the target text, the meaning of the idiom was also represented as a circumstance as it was presented as an adverbial phrase which can be analyzed further as composed of a material process (caught) followed by a circumstance (unprepared) to describe the mental states of the Riverland Troops. From the translated text by Moss Roberts, it is clearly shown that he analysed the source text first to find out the intended ideas that need to be conveyed by the author. Then he transformed the ideas into the target texts by choosing an equivalent sense that can best describe the situation as well as the idea of the idiom. Therefore, in this example, we can see how the meaning for the idiom in the source text is preserved using the lexico-grammatical resources available to the translator. The translator translated the idiom by retaining the original meaning of the idiom to ensure that the ideas in the source text can be fully understood.

However, in the second example, E2, the idiom was introduced in the source text following an expression that describes the shock experienced by Zhang Hu. Here we have analysed the expression of shock as a mental process, and because the scene described Zhang Hu doing battle with Han Dang, the meaning of the idiom that surfaces was considered to lean more towards being a material process rather than a behavioural process. Nevertheless, the idiom in the source text was essentially not translated as the target text focused only on describing the context which caused Zhang Hu to be distracted resulting in him being killed with a stroke of the sword. The idiom itself does not point out the meaning of distraction.
However, the context in which the idiom was used in E2 does indicate that he was distracted but in a rather indirect manner.

The word distracted was not used in the source text but the meaning can be implied from the context. The verb phrase “was distracted” in the target text could be taken as an attempt to convey the meaning of the Chinese idiom to explain why Zhang Hu was not able to react in time and was killed by Han Dang with a stroke of his sword, but there was no direct reference to the meaning of not reacting in time unlike in the first example where the expression “caught unprepared” does indeed indicate the lack of timeliness. The translated word in this example had change the original meaning of the idiom by describing the mental activity of being distracted. However, the translation is appropriate. It would not be appropriate to describe Zhang Hu as being caught unprepared as the scene depicts him doing battle with Han Dang.

In the third example, the idiom was represented as an attribute for a relational process in the target text. However, the idiom in the source text could also be analysed as a material process or a behavioural process as the meaning of the verb leans towards his confusion from not being able to figure out the fast moving object advancing towards him. The translator however changed the usual interpretation of unpreparedness by presenting the meaning in the idiom as “too slow”. The word “slow” is an adjective and it can be assigned as an attribute to describe Yan Liang, the carrier in a relational process. This example also shows how the idiom in the target text is represented differently compared to how the idiom is represented in the source text. Similar to the second example described above, there is also modification in the meaning of the idiom as it is for the purpose to accord with the context.

In this example also, the translator did not stay loyal to the original meaning of the idiom. Instead he focussed on the contextual information which was in essence the speed of a special breed of horse that Lord Guan rode to battle. Western readers may not be familiar with this special breed of horses, but they will be able to appreciate the fact that some horses are faster than others. The meaning of the idiom was indirectly conveyed; Yang Liang was caught unprepared because he did not expect his enemy to advance in such speed.

As the above examples show, the context seems to play an important role in influencing how the translator presents the meaning of some idioms from the source text. The final two examples clearly showed that the idiom in the source text was represented differently compared to the process used in the target text. The same idiom that was used in different contexts cannot be translated using the same strategy as the resulting translation may be inappropriate. Idioms are idiomatic expressions which are fixed in their structures with the majority of them derived from the histories or experiences in daily life. Hence, the translators can translate the idioms used in the novel by using different words or phrases after dividing the sentences in the source text into smaller components.

As there are no idiomatic expressions in English that conveys the same meaning as the idiom in Chinese, the strategy used in the above examples was to focus on the meaning of the idiom in E1 while the focus was on the context in examples E2 and E3. Yang (2010) and Baker (1992) have discussed the strategy of finding the equivalence in translating the meaning of the idiom, but not much attention has been given to the role played by the context in translating idioms. The above analysis showed that the meaning of the idiom can be explicitly conveyed as done in E1 or implicitly conveyed as shown in E2 and E3.
CONCLUSION

Idioms are the idiomatic expressions with fixed and special grammatical rules containing ancient knowledge regarding weather, culture, and daily practices which can be difficult to be interpreted. As suggested by Baker (1992), translators have to first understand the ideas expressed in the novel containing the idioms and then comprehend the meanings by connecting the meanings with the contents of the novel in their minds. Therefore, translators usually need to present the idioms from the source text into the target text with a more conversant tone as often times, as also shown in our analysis; it is difficult to find an equivalent idiom in the target language that may be appropriate for the translation. This way they can help in narrowing the knowledge gap between the source and the target texts to allow the readers to understand the target text. By presenting the target text in a more conversant tone or language, the translator can also attract the readers’ attention to continue reading the translation work. The target readers can try to understand Chinese culture through the translated idioms. Hence, they are able to comprehend the conveyed ideas more easily by reading the target text that is presented in the style that is more familiar to them.

The next strategy suggested by Yang (2010) is to translate the idiom and supplement with additional explanation following the translation. However, it is not often clear what type of explanation would be appropriate. This strategy was not adopted in the examples presented above in this paper as explanation may disrupt the stylistic flow of a literary text. Instead, what we found was the use of context in influencing the word choice and in deciding on whether or not to translate the meaning presented in the idiom. In some cases, the meaning of the idiom is only conveyed implicitly in the target text. It is lost in translation as the context takes precedence to ensure that the storyline is maintained and the flow of the story and the style of narration is sustained.

This paper presented the results of a study to examine how idioms are translated from a Classic Chinese novel into English. The investigation revealed that idioms may be presented differently to accommodate the need of the contexts. The analyses also show how the meaning represented in the idiom can be different when analysed in isolation and when viewed within the context in which the idiom is used. Some of the repeated idioms in the entire novel were translated differently by changing the words or phrases because the translator translated them according to the contexts. The readers may have difficulty in understanding the conveyed messages when the words or phrases used remain the same to translate these idioms that are presented in different contexts. The varied words or phrases used in the translated text are to ease the burden of the readers while reading this long novel. Otherwise, the presented idioms may not make sense as they may not be able to link the meanings of the words with the intended ideas to be expressed. The analysis showed differences in distinct word selection, for the purpose of pertinent context presentation and message delivery. The results also show that the transitivity system in Systemic Functional Linguistics can be a useful framework that can be adopted to examine how meanings in idioms and the surrounding context are represented in the source and target texts.

REFERENCES

Adetomokun, I. J. (2012). A Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) Analysis of Yoruba Students’ Narratives of Identity at Three Western Cape Universities. (Master’s Thesis). University of Western Cape, Cape Town, South Africa.

Representation Of Meaning In Idioms In San Gua Yan Yi And Their Translation In Three Kingdoms

Bhd.


**Appendix 1: Frequencies and percentages for idioms.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Chengyu</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>鼎足之势 ding zu zhi shi</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>默然无语 mo ran wu yu</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>寡不敌众 gua bu di zhong</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>血流成河 xue liu cheng he</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>如虎添翼 ru hu tian yi</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>抖擞精神 dou shu jing shen</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>勇而无谋 yong er wu mou</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>咬牙切齿 yao ya qie chi</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>答问如流 da wen ru liu</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>虚张声势 xu zhang sheng shi</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>户横遍野 shi heng bian ye</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.772</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>威风凛凛 wei feng lin lin</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.772</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>里应外合 li ying wai he</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.772</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>出其不意 chu qi bu yi</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.772</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>大惊失色 da jing shi se</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.772</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>三寸不烂之舌 san cun bu lan zhi she</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.772</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>披头跣足 pi tou xian zu</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2.025</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>如入无人之境 ru ru wu ren zhi jing</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2.025</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>拍马舞刀 pai ma wu dao</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2.025</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>人困马乏 ren kun ma fa</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2.025</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>面面相觑 mian mian xiang qu</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2.025</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>万无一失 wan wu yi shi</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2.025</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>势不可当 shi bu ke dang</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2.025</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>万死不辞 wan si bu ci</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2.278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>飞砂走石 fei sha zou shi</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2.278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>足智多谋 zu zhi duo mou</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2.278</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Representation Of Meaning In Idioms In *San Gua Yan Yi* And Their Translation In *Three Kingdoms*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Character</th>
<th>Pinyin</th>
<th>Stroke</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>肝脑涂地</td>
<td>gan nao tu di</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2.278</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>手起刀落</td>
<td>shou qi dao luo</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2.532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>将计就计</td>
<td>jiang ji jiu ji</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2.532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>胆战心惊</td>
<td>dan zhan xin jing</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2.532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>抱头鼠窜</td>
<td>bao tou shu chuan</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2.532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>鼓角喧天</td>
<td>gu jiao xuan tian</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2.785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>狂风大作</td>
<td>kuang feng da zuo</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2.785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>无计可施</td>
<td>wu ji ke shi</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2.785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>犬马之劳</td>
<td>quan ma zhi lao</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3.038</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>按兵不动</td>
<td>an bing bu dong</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3.291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>行坐不安</td>
<td>xing zuo bu an</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3.291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>勃然大怒</td>
<td>bo ran da nu</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3.291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>矢石如雨</td>
<td>shi shi ru yu</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3.291</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>火光冲天</td>
<td>hua guang chong tian</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>4.051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>措手不及</td>
<td>cuo shou bu ji</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>5.063</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>不计其数</td>
<td>bu ji qi shu</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>7.089</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>395</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
AT ODDS WITH EACH OTHER: DEVELOPMENT AND ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY IN CECIL RAJENDRA’S SELECTED POEMS

Suhada Fadzil and Zainor Izat Zainal*
Faculty of Languages and Communication, Universiti Putra Malaysia, 43400 UPM Serdang Selangor
e-mail: wadafadzil.sf@gmail.com ; zainor@upm.edu.my

ABSTRACT

Development has always been Malaysia’s priority since independence in 1957. This enthusiasm is reflected in many of the country’s past and existing policies and plans. Being one of the countries endowed with plenty of natural resources, Malaysia’s rapid capitalist-driven development has, however, taken its tolls on nature, causing concern that environmental sustainability is taken for granted. The antagonistic relations between development and environmental sustainability have also preoccupied local writers writing in English, such as Muhammad Haji Salleh, KS Maniam and Cecil Rajendra, to name a few. Among these writers, Rajendra is the most consistent in writing about environmental issues. This study analyses Cecil Rajendra’s selected poems, ranging from 1978 to 2004. It deals with the questions of how Rajendra characterises development in Malaysia and what this conveys about Rajendra’s view on environmental sustainability. Marxist concepts of treadmill of production and metabolic rift are applied to examine the antagonistic relations between development and environmental sustainabilit. This paper extends the literary critical practice of Malaysian poetry in English by focusing on the environmental perspective, adding to the debate on development in Malaysia.

KEYWORDS: Cecil Rajendra, development, environmental sustainability, metabolic rift, treadmill of production.

INTRODUCTION

Malaysia is known as one of the most rapidly developing countries in Southeast Asia. Its quest in nation-building started right after independence in 1957. In pursuing nation building, Malaysia has come up with ambitious plans, mostly focused on economic development. Being a multiracial country, development in the Malaysian context aims at promoting growth with a strong emphasis on the equal share of the economic cake to the Malays and the non-Malays. In 1970, Malaysia implemented the New Economic Policy (NEP) to ensure that wealth is equally distributed among the ethnic groups (Mokhtar et al., 2013).

In achieving economic growth, Malaysia, however, has experienced huge ecological loss due to its capitalist economic system that have employed maximum exploitation of natural resources for the accumulation of wealth. Although environmental resource exploitation is an important generator of Malaysia’s economic growth, too much of it has caused Malaysia a serious environmental degradation (Mokthsim & Salleh, 2014). But why do we blame capitalism? How does the capitalist economic system lead to environmental degradation? “Capitalism”, according to Klein and McMillan (2015, p. 7), is “a global mode of production that is inherently, structurally, inescapably, ever-expanding. Its sole aim is constant capital accumulation”. Klein and McMillan (2015, p. 7) assert:
Capital dominates everything; it enchains humanity to the task of its continuance. It reproduces and accumulates through the exploitation of labour in the production of surplus value, crystallized in commodities. And thus it is voracious in its intake of raw materials (forests, wildlife, soil), burns fuel insatiably (coal, oil, natural gas), and then spits its foul wastes into the air and waters, in a cycle of production that is unrelenting. It also happens to be suffocating and cooking us.

Klein and McMillan (2015) also conclude that capitalism and a healthy planet are incompatible. Foster (2002) in his book *Ecology Against Capitalism*, capitalism is essentially profit-driven. Parson (1977) in his book *Marx and Engels on Ecology* argues that in the capitalist system, the monopoly of power, or ruling control, rest with big capitalist and the monopolist are allied with the government and the military that the central motive force of this system is profit-maximization, and one consequence of this force is environmental pollution. White (2004, p. 389) in “The Beginnings of Crony Capitalism: Business, Politics and Economic Development in Malaysia, c.1955–70” defines the people behind the capitalist system as “the private-sector businessmen who benefit(ed) enormously from close relations with leading officials and politicians, obtaining not only protection from foreign competitions but also licences, monopoly rights and government subsidies”. In Malaysia, the New Economic Policy (NEP) introduced in the 1970’s has been said to inevitably produce such close links between the state and the capitalist (White, 2004).

Among the people concerned with environmental issues are Malaysian writers. This is evident from the environmental themes that are prevalent in their writings. Changes in Malaysia’s environmental scene have led them to scrutinize and criticize environmental issues. Among these concerned writers is Cecil Rajendra, who has consistently written on environmental issues. The lawyer-poet who champions ecological justice has written since 1965 and has been persistent in criticizing Malaysia’s development and the way it has drastically affected the ecosystem and the livelihood of the people. In this paper, Rajendra’s characterisation of Malaysia’s development and its effects towards environmental sustainability will be identified and examined through his poems. On top of that, this paper also aims to look at Rajendra’s ideas on environmental sustainability in the Malaysian context.

In this paper, environment is taken to mean the surrounding or condition in which a person, animal or plants lives, grows, develops and operates. Sustainability on the other hand, refers to and focuses on human responsibility towards the welfare of future generations (Thiele, 2013). Other than social and political sustainability, environmental sustainability was proposed in the Brundtland Report 1978 as one of the goals of sustainable development, which aims to ensure the development of a country is able to fulfil the need of the present and future generations. According to Goodland (1995, p. 10), environmental sustainability means “the maintenance of “natural capital” or in other words “natural environment” such as soil, atmosphere, forest and water”. Environmental sustainability seeks to improve the human welfare by protecting the sources of raw materials for human needs and ensuring that the sinks for human wastes are not exceeded, in order to prevent harm to human (Goodland, 1995). Environmental sustainability in this paper is defined as the ability to maintain the environment in order to meet the needs of the present and future generations.

It has become a concern that Malaysia has overlooked aspects of its environmental sustainability due to its rapid economic growth and exploitation of natural resources.
According to Mokhtsim and Salleh (2014, p. 306), Malaysia’s environment confronts “development [that is] never concerned about the cause and consequences”. Malaysia’s rapid industrialization has led to pollution problems, caused by industrial wastewater and other wastes, which became very apparent since 1970 onwards (Noh, 2010). The manufacturing industries in Malaysia have become the economy’s main source of growth in recent years and such rapid industrialisation however, has had detrimental effects on the environment, due to the increase in the quantity and diversity of toxic and hazardous wastes generated by the various industries (Abdullah, 1995). It can be inferred that it is very challenging for a developing country like Malaysia to balance both economic development and environmental sustainability because exploitation of natural resources play as an important generator of the country’s economic growth.

**METHODOLOGY**

In order to examine how capitalist development leads to environmental degradation and how it affected environmental sustainability, it is important to understand the way the capitalist system operates with the environment. The next two concepts explain capitalist production and the way it affects environmental sustainability.

**Treadmill of Production**

Schnaiberg (1980, p. 231) introduced ‘treadmill of production’ as a “political economic approach for understanding ecological disorganization, destruction and harm”. This theory is a specialized approach that is widely used within environmental sociology and has been incorporated by many Marxist scholars into ecological Marxism (Stretesky, Micheal, & Micheal, 2013). According to Lynch, Long, Stretesky and Barrett (2017), the core idea of treadmill of production in the Marxist context is that capitalism, in its process of producing and consuming goods, is destructive to nature, which leads to ecological disorganization. One of the effects of treadmill of production is the ecological additions, which is the emission of pollutants into the ecosystem, the result of the acceleration in the treadmill of production under capitalism (Stretesky et al., 2013). Treadmill of production changes natural processes and at the same time accelerates other ecologically destructive tendencies (Lynch & Barrett, 2013). Karl Marx and Frederick Engels (1988) in the third volume of *Capital*, points out that Thames River in London is an example of how capitalist production has led to pollution. It can be inferred that ecological addition is seen as the product of development within a capitalist country.

Treadmill of production as described by many Marxist scholars is the way the capitalist operates – non-stop and definitely in a major scale. According to Parsons (1977), Marx described capitalism as an omnivorous power, sweeping all before. Parsons (1977) also asserts that Marx and Engels’s idea of capitalist treatment towards nature is marked by exploitation, pollution and the ruination of nature. As Foster (2009, p. 48) in *The Ecological Revolution: Making Peace with the Planet* has highlighted, “capitalism is an unstoppable, accelerating treadmill that constantly increases the scale of the throughput of energy and raw materials as part of its quest for profit and accumulation, thereby pressing on the earth’s absorptive capacity.”

Parsons (1977, p. 26) also argues that “the capitalist sees everything within the framework of his intention to turn a profit”. Treadmill of production in capitalist economic development therefore leads to the ruination of nature. The greed of the capitalist is reflected
in the way it degrades the environment thus affecting the wellbeing of the people and its interdependent relationship with nature. In conclusion, as treadmill of production accelerates, so does the ecological destruction.

**Metabolic Rift**

The term “metabolic rift” was used by Foster (2013) in his article entitled “Marx and The Rift in The Universal Metabolism of Nature” to explain Marx’s concept of capitalist agriculture that produces the crack or rift in the relationship between humans and nature. Nature, according to Marx and Engels (2009, p. 244), is man’s “inorganic body” in which he must remain in continuous intercourse if he is not to die. Marx also argues that humans are part of nature and that a social society is an organism with a metabolism similar to that of humans. Marx and Engels (2009, p. 328) assert that:

Man lives from nature, i.e., nature is his body, and he must maintain a continuing dialogue with it if he is not to die. To say that man’s physical and mental life is linked to nature simply means that nature is linked to itself, for man is a part of nature.

Unfortunately, in capitalist agriculture, the interdependent metabolic relationship between human being and nature is disconnected when profit becomes the main agenda and rural workers are replaced and removed from the land. Maintenance of land’s fertility is neglected, causing the “rob[bing]” of the soil from man’s consumption, as well as isolating and demoralizing the rural worker in terms of his “vitality, freedom and independence” (Parsons, 1977, p. 19). Marx (1986, p. 39) in his critique of capitalist agriculture claims that metabolic rift leads to the ecological crisis within any country that applies capitalist production system.

The main idea of metabolic rift is that capitalist agriculture operates by disrupting and interrupting natural cycles and processes through the use and the manufacturing of fertilizers. Foster (2000) in *Marx’s Ecology* suggests that the emergence of agricultural sciences (by the capitalist) has intensified the exploitation of the soil. Therefore, the soil is no longer in the original form but has been fertilised to increase the productivity. According to Foster (1999) in *The Vulnerable Planet*, in order to increase soil fertility, firms began to manufacture fertilizers, producing extensive industrial waste that caused harm to human being thus created a metabolic rift between nature and man.

Lynch et al. (2017) argue that metabolic rift is also a representation of Marxist scientific and materialist analysis of the split between human use and demand for energy under capitalism and how such demands and use create imbalances in nature. The failure to sustain nature has affected environmental sustainability. Foster (2000) in *Marx’s Ecology*, explains Marx’s concept of metabolism, highlighting that capitalism has constantly produced alienation in the metabolic cycle of the complex, dynamic, interdependence sets of needs and relation between human being and nature. Thus, capitalist development has caused the separation between the two and resulted in environmentally unsustainable human lives. In *Capital Volume I*, Marx (1986) asserts that nature should be managed and governed in a rational way if humanity intends to aim for environmental sustainability. Marx (1986, p. 50) writes:
Freedom in this sphere can consist only in this, that socialized man, associated producers govern the human metabolism with nature in a rational way, bringing it under their own collective control instead of being dominated by it as a blind power; accomplishing it with the least expenditure of energy and in conditions mostly worthy and appropriate for their human nature.

From the excerpt above, Marx argues that in order to achieve environmental sustainability, a wise development system is needed and the absence of it will cause imbalance and rift in the metabolic relation between human and nature. Marx (1986, p. 330) also adds, metabolic rift caused by capitalist production “disturbs the metabolic relation between man and the earth”. Therefore, it can be concluded that the nature of capitalism aspires a maximum exploitation which leads to environmental degradation, thus affecting environmental sustainability.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION
Development and its environmental effects in Rajendra’s Selected Poems
Among the environmental issues in Malaysia is water pollution. Water pollution occurs when pollutants are not treated properly to remove harmful compounds which are then discharged into water bodies. Urban development significantly contributes to the increase in water pollution problems, especially in the form of sedimentation, solid waste, rubbish, and organic pollution (Azwad, 2017). The effects of water pollution have spread to the life of plants and organisms thus affecting the natural biological communities. Rajendra writes numerous poems regarding water pollution in Malaysia and offers various dimensional views on Malaysia’s development that unveil this type of pollution.

One of the poems that centralizes the general idea of water pollution in Malaysia is “No Celebratory Song”. This poem was written in 1978 when the effects of development has started to show its ugly face in Malaysia. This poem therefore, could have been written in regard of the increment of water pollution during the time. Rajendra writes:

As our lives and streams
our beaches, our air
our ocean and trees
our bird, our fish
our butterflies and bees
are strangled, stifled,
polluted, poisoned
crushed, condemned
by lopsided development (1978, pp. 54-55)

Rajendra writes how development in Malaysia causes pollution. The line “by lopsided development” offers readers the reality of Malaysia’s development (Rajendra, 1978, p.54). Rajendra (1978, p. 54) also illustrates the ecological damages caused by development in the use of personification such as “are strangled, stifled/ polluted/ crushed, condemned”. The personifications have two significant meanings. The lines “As our lives and stream/ our beaches and air/ our ocean and trees” show that pollution has ruined the ecosystem chain (Rajendra, 1978, p. 54). Rajendra also uses “our” to instil the awareness to
readers that the ruination of nature has taken place. This is also to warn readers of the urgency to help stop pollution so that nature can still be inherited by future generations.

“Kuala Juru – Death of A Village” (1978) is an example of a poem which Rajendra has written based on an actual place. In this poem, Rajendra highlights the fate of Kuala Juru River in Penang main land which has been polluted because of rapid development. The river was the source of living for traditional fishermen who later became the victim of development plans. According to Hilton (2009), the first phase of the pollution that happened in Kuala Juru was in 1970 when an industrial estate with its first 50 factories began to discharge its waste to the river. Kuala Juru River was a crucial source of living for the people who lived in the surrounding villages. Industrialization that has taken place has polluted the river. In the poem, Rajendra (1978) writes:

The river
as strangled by
exigencies
of industrialization
is dying…
and nobody cares (p. 90-91)

From the stanza above, Kuala Juru River is sacrificed for the purpose of economic development. The use of “strangled” signifies the uneven development that has threatened the river. The industrialization that has taken place near the river has caused injustice and inconvenience to the people. The verb “strangle” is also used to mock the authority who is responsible of the death of the river. In the stanza, Rajendra portrays the condition of the river that is dying and at the same time highlights the effects of development.

Following rapid development and industrial expansion over the last 15 years, the number of pollution sources in Malaysia has correspondingly increased (Sani & Jahi, 1990). This has resulted in the pollution of air. Air pollution or the atmospheric pollution refers to the contaminated air or atmosphere by harmful substances caused by human activities. Air pollution occurs when there is an introduction of chemicals, smoke and decayed particles into the atmosphere which make it impure thus causing potential disease to living organisms. As the country developed, various activities that contribute to air pollution are identified such as the emission of smoke from automobiles, emission of smoke from open burning and the biggest contributor is the emission of gasses and dust from industrial activities.

The poem that portrays the issue of air pollution is “Ecological Suicide” which was written in 1986. The following year of 1987, Malaysian Department of Environment estimated about 1.9 million tonnes of air pollutants were released in to the atmosphere as a result of fuel combustion in peninsular Malaysia (Sani & Jahi, 1990). During the ‘80s, the issue of air pollution was already in a worrying state. Rajendra (1986) highlights the haze issue in one of the stanzas from the poem:

The village deserted.
The river choked and polluted.
And a red haze hovers
Over devastated hills. (p. 6)
The use of ‘red haze’ in the third line above shows Rajendra’s use of symbolism. Instead of grey, Rajendra portrays the haze as the colour red to represent the menacing threats that are faced by the people. The poet’s strident vocal boosts awareness to awaken readers on the alarming reality. Words such as “choked” and “polluted” added a sense of awakening and portrays the horrible state of the river due to unscrupulous plans of development (Rajendra, 1986, p. 6).

The next poem entitled “ME-A-SAT”, is taken from By Trial ‘N Terror (2004), Rajendra’s most recent compilation of poems. “ME-A-SAT” is known as the first Malaysian privately own satellite operated by Measat Satellite System Sdn Bhd or formerly known as Binariang Sdn Bhd. The communication satellite transmits radio frequency signal containing information that can be retrieved anywhere in the world. However, in the poem, Rajendra does not aim to analyse the grandeur of it, but rather as another satirical alternative to voice out the message that lies under uneven development in Malaysia. In the poem, the poet sees development as profit-bias thus neglecting the wellbeing of the environment. In the poem, Rajendra highlights air pollution as one of the existing problems that has not yet been cured. The excerpt from the poem is as follows:

To what end
A hi-tech
Multi-
Super corridor,
In the absence
Of simple
No-frills H2O
Satellite in the sky
Satellite in the sky
What’s the bloody point
When taps run dry
And forests are on fire?
Bugger MEASAT
No more haze,
Gimme, gimme water!’ (p. 64)

Rajendra sees Malaysia’s development and its degrading environmental condition as an irony. The country has grand and high technology facilities but no fresh air. The repetition of “satellite in the sky” highlights the irony of being technologically-advanced and environmentally-unconscious. Rajendra argues that in the name of development, forests were set on fire for the clearing of lands, causing serious haze issues.

Besides water and air pollution, land degradation is also one of the biggest contributors of Malaysia’s environmental issues. Land degradation is known as the destruction and misuse of lands, mainly through human activities such as bad mining practices, sand wining, deforestation, poor farming methods, bad irrigation methods, increased settlements and dumping of non-biodegradable refuse. Land degradation can also be caused by harsh weather conditions like drought or excessive rain which can cause erosion. Basically, land degradation leads to the loss of quality in land. In Malaysia, the issue of land degradation always goes back to its number one contributor which is deforestation or
land-clearing. Malaysia’s heavenly rainforest covers about more than half of its total land area but unfortunately, as the country grows, the lands have been recklessly sacrificed for development purposes (Ong, 2017). Manufacturing and building sectors have been the main catalysts for deforestation as spaces were needed on a big scale for the construction of new buildings and factories.

Among the causes of deforestation in Malaysia are palm oil plantation, logging, forest fires and tourism. The rapid expansion of palm oil plantations has led deforestation to skyrocket in Malaysia simply because it is an ingredient in numerous products from foods to cosmetics. Planting palm oil has cut massive swaths of natural forest to make rooms for plantation and this has replaced the diverse natural ecosystem thus making Malaysia as one of the world’s top producers of palm oil, at the expense of its forests.

Rajendra analyses the effects of Malaysia’s economic development towards land degradation. Rajendra asserts that the problem of land degradation as the simultaneous effects of development process and has caused drawbacks to both mankind and nature. In the following poems, Rajendra’s critic on development that has caused land degradation is highlighted. The poet has wisely chosen words and literary devices to help raise awareness among readers. One of the poems that portrays the issue of deforestation is “The Endau-Rompin Aftermath?” (1978). Endau-Rompin is one of the last-remaining extensive tracts of largely undisturbed rain-forest in the south of Pahang and the northeast of Johor. A controversy erupted in 1977 when the state government of Pahang approved a logging concession in the core area of Endau-Rompin. This is believed to be the reason why Rajendra writes this poem in 1978, a year after the approval of the logging concession. In the poem, Rajendra uses personification to voice out his dissatisfaction:

I hear tall trees crashing
Wild birds screeching
The buffalo stampeding
But no words will come
I hear sawmills buzzing
Cash register clicking
Entrepreneurs yam-seng-ing
But no words will come’ (p. 92)

From the stanzas above, we are exposed to Rajendra’s thoughts towards the environment. The authority, through Rajendra’s eyes, seems to be neglecting their responsibility towards the environment. The development-bias attitude that has influenced capitalism has caused the environment a great deal of destruction. Rajendra questions how some people make profit out of illegal logging activities and get away with it. The choice of literary devices used by the poet add a sense of awakening to the readers. The lines “I hear tall trees crashing/ Wild birds screeching/ The buffalo stampeding/ I hear sawmills buzzing/ Cash register clicking/ Entrepreneurs yam-seng-ing” (Rajendra, 1978, p.92) prove that no matter how huge the illegal logging issue is, the influence of the capitalist is always bigger in decision making. The use of personifications within the lines portray the effects of careless development plans towards the ecosystem. The lines also showcase the greed of Malaysia’s capitalist development which always champion wealth over the wellness of the environment.
The lines illustrate massive forest depletion that happens to fulfil the profit-driven needs of the capitalist.

“By Waters of Tembeling” (1983) illustrates another major effect of deforestation in Malaysia. The Tembeling River, which is situated in the north-east of Pahang, is the main tributary of Pahang River known for its plenteous natural resources such as fish and shrimps. The river became one of the sources of income for the people from neighbouring villages such as Kampung Mat Daling, Kampung Kuala Sat and Kampung Bantal. The river was also known as one of the tourism spots in Malaysia that offers water activities such as water rafting and boat rides. It was also a mode of transportation that was used even until 2013 and was used to bring tourists to reach the National Park of Kuala Tahan. Unfortunately, deforestation that happened at the head of Sungai Tembeling has effected the ecosystem and the livelihood of the people. Rajendra uses the first person point of view to describe what he sees in the forest of Sungai Tembeling and to amplify his dissent. He uses personification in pointing out the fate of the forest. Lines such as “I saw once a virgin/jungle in dishabille/torn, ravished, bruised” (Rajendra, 1983, p. 50) highlights the pressure of deforestation in Sungai Tembeling area:

Clack and cackle of bulldozers  
Crack the song of bulbul  
And cricket  
I saw juggernauts in everywhere  
Set about dismantling our forest (p. 50)

The poet is aware of the injustice that has been done to the forest. The lines ironically offer even more melancholic and subtle utterance of his disappointment. The use of “our” highlights the sense of belonging to the forest that Rajendra wants to instil. This simple yet deep subtlety gives us the idea that deforestation has taken something that belongs to us. In the poem, Rajendra shares his disillusionment within the lines: “And by waters/ of the Tembeling/ I sat down & wept” (Rajendra, 1983, p. 50) The poet sets a mournful tone to the poem to represent the unfortunate event of the forest. He is hopeful that the forest should be sustained for continuous progression of the ecosystem chain for now and the future. The use of ‘I’ in the poem shows the reality that normal people without any power, can only watch as destruction takes place. In the poem, Rajendra highlights the use of ‘I’ within the lines:

From her lacerated  
side I watched  
a stream of laterite  
trickle to bloody  
the waters of Tembeling  
As the mist lifted off  
Bukit Teresek  
I heard the witches’  
whine  
of chain-saw cutter  
. . .  
I saw juggernauts in every corner” (p.49).
These also show that people witness the massive deforestation yet no action is taken to stop it.

In conclusion, Rajendra characterises development in Malaysia as environmentally-destructive. The treadmill of production that has been ruthlessly practiced in Malaysia has caused massive exploitation of natural resources that deteriorate the environment. Through the selected poems, Rajendra proves that the depletion of natural resources by the capitalist economic system leads to the destruction of the ecosystem such as habitat destructions, the extinction of wildlife and pollution. As Marx (1986, p.41) asserts in *Capital* Volume I, the blind desire for profit (of the capitalist) had exhausted the soil. Treadmill of production within the capitalist economic development in Malaysia marks the capitalist greed over wealth, causing serious environmental issues.

**Environmental Sustainability in Rajendra’s Selected Poems**

The capitalist economic system which is profit-driven has caused an absolute disadvantage to Malaysia’s environment. Looking at all the effects of Malaysia’s development in Rajendra’s poems, the poet has his own views on Malaysia’s environmental sustainability. Through his poems, Rajendra highlights the reality of development in Malaysia by magnifying the effects of development towards the ecosystem and his ideas on what might happen in the future if nature is left unpreserved. The poet is sceptical towards Malaysia’s development based on the way he expresses his feelings in the poems. In most of the poems, Rajendra is seen to be really against the way Malaysia’s economic development system operates and the priority of it that is mistakenly set.

In his poems, Rajendra shows his anger towards the authority for its greed. In “No Celebratory Song” as discussed in the previous section, Rajendra highlights that commercial buildings and factories have now taken over homes for people and paddy fields for their daily sustenance. And in the sixth stanza, the poet underlines that the capital speaks louder than the pleas of fishermen. These allude to Malaysia’s development that does not prioritize its people and the environment, contradicting the real meaning of development. “Paddy fields” (7) and “fishermen” (39) emphasize that capitalist agriculture in Malaysia’s development has distracted the people’s living income.

In “Kuala Juru – Death of a Village”, Rajendra once again criticizes the environmental sustainability aspect that is being neglected in the name of development. The river of Kuala Juru which was known as the source of the lives for the people living around the area is now contaminated and polluted over the pressure of industrialization. Through vivid tone, Rajendra repeats numerous times that “nobody cares” about the reality of the destruction that is happening. Development has caused an overall impact in the ecosystem chain of the place. The river and its aquatic lives are endangered caused by the discarded wastes from factories. The repetition serves the idea that development in Malaysia does not take into account environmental aspects which include not only human but other living things and natural resources. Rajendra throughout his poem-writing career has always highlighted the urgency to preserve nature. He mocks the authority for not taking any action to help prevent damages that are still happening.

In “Ecological Suicide” (1986), Rajendra focuses on the destruction that has been caused by development. The deserted village, the polluted river and the red haze over the hills are all effects of improper planning of development. Not only bringing drawbacks to the country’s physical scenery, haze also causes danger to human health. In this poem, again,
Rajendra stresses that Malaysia is ambitious in its agenda to become a well-developed country yet less ambitious in preserving its natural resources. This proves that capitalist greed of wealth has blinded the authority to care less for nature despite it being the number one source of the country’s income. Though this is the shortest among other selected poems, it delivers the same important message regarding environmental sustainability in Malaysia. The poet reminds the reader that the consequences suffered are not because of the doings of anyone outside the country, but the people in the country including the authorities. The phrases “our own death” and “our own nemesis” (Rajendra, 1986, p. 6) are Rajendra’s technique to warn that if the ruination cycle does not stop, human being and the entire ecosystem could be depleted over time. It is obvious through Rajendra’s criticism that Malaysia’s development is profit-bias.

In “ME-A-SAT”, the poet portrays the contradictory reality in the country by showcasing the technology that the country has and ironically the clean water that the country lacks. He questions the point of the country being so high-tech “when taps run dry/ and forest are on fire” (Rajendra, 2004, p. 64). The clearing of lands for development purpose has ironically taken its tolls on the country’s environmental sustainability thus making development bad instead of improving the people and the ecosystem. Rajendra expresses his irritation through the irate tone set in the poem.

In “Endau-Rompin Aftermath” and “By Waters of Tembeling”, Rajendra highlights the issue of deforestation that happened in Malaysia’s most treasured jungle. The clearing of land has destroyed habitants of many wildlife such as seladang, buffalo, tapir, wild boar and other exotic animals. The endangered species are threatened and this has affected the biodiversity in the ecosystem chain. In these poems, Rajendra describes the uncontrolled logging and the dismantling of forest in a very mournful tone. The repetition of “but no words will come” in “Endau-Rompin Aftermath” and the highlights of sounds made by the bulldozer and chain-saw cutter in “By Waters of Tembeling” represent the menace of deforestation that have taken place in both places. The damages do not end there, deforestation also leads to landslides in many housing areas and this has taken many lives. The poet looks at Malaysia’s development as not only destructive to nature but life-threatening as well. In light of the destruction that has taken place, Rajendra calls upon on the irresponsible authorities to be more vigilant.

Rajendra’s poems assert that capitalism does not only cause environmental degradation but at the same time has threatened environmental sustainability which will result in the long term disruption of the ecosystem chain and the interdependence between human being and nature. The metabolic rift caused by the Malaysia’s capitalist production are threatening both human and nature in terms of extinction, pollutions, displacement and other affecting factors that give development a bad name. In the poems, Rajendra highlights that Malaysia’s development always carries capitalist’s profit-driven agenda thus it can be concluded that Malaysia’s development is seen by Rajendra as lopsided and not environmentally sustainable.

CONCLUSION

In his poems, Rajendra does not only criticise the lopsided development and its effects towards environmental sustainability, but he also highlights how Malaysia’s development has always overlooked environmental sustainability thus affecting humanity and the ecosystem. Malaysia’s capitalist system of treadmill of production which led to maximum exploitation
has caused massive environmental degradation, creating a metabolic rift in the interdependence between human being and nature. Rajendra criticises the country’s development process and effects by looking at its environmental state through his consistent writing from 1978 until 2004. The poet denounces the greed that has led the capitalist and the authority to devastate our natural resources to fulfil its capitalist’ profit driven nature. Rajendra is sceptical towards Malaysia’s development as it does not seem to take into account the factor of environmental sustainability. This will lead to more ruins in the future. A country, according to Rajendra, should champion both the people and the nature surrounding it or else development would be meaningless. Development and environmental sustainability are said to be at odds with each other because it is challenging for a developing country to balance between economic growth and the use of natural resources in order to achieve the kind of development that is ready to fulfil both the needs of the present and future generations. From the selected poems, it can be inferred that Rajendra is suggesting that the authorities should minimise the exploitation of natural resources and give more attention to sustaining the environment in order for future generations to enjoy better, quality lives.

REFERENCES


Appendix 1: List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FMP</td>
<td>First Malaysia Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEP</td>
<td>New Economic Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDP</td>
<td>National Development Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEM</td>
<td>New Economic Model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLIE</td>
<td>Malaysian Literature in English</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
REFEREES FOR THE JOURNAL OF LANGUAGE AND COMMUNICATION
VOL. 5(2) SEPTEMBER 2018

The Editorial Board of the Journal of Language and Communication wishes to thank the following:

Doreen Ng Boon Sim  
*Universiti Putra Malaysia*

Nurul Ikhlas Abdul Hadi  
*Universiti Putra Malaysia*

Lim Choon Bee  
*Universiti Putra Malaysia*

Mohd Muzhafar Idrus  
*Universiti Sains Islam Malaysia*

Ramesh Nair  
*Universiti Teknologi Mara*

Lajiman Janoory  
*Sultan Idris Education University*

Afida Mohd Ali  
*Universiti Putra Malaysia*

Mohd Nizam Osman  
*Universiti Putra Malaysia*

Hazleena Baharun  
*Universiti Sains Islam Malaysia*

Timothy O. Iyendo  
*European University of Lefke*

Muhammad Alif Redzuan Abdullah  
*Universiti Putra Malaysia*

Siti Nurbaya Mohd Noor  
*University of Malaya*

Hasyimah Mohd Amin  
*Universiti Putra Malaysia*

Vahid Nimechisalem  
*Universiti Putra Malaysia*

Goh Sang Seong  
*Universiti Sains Malaysia*

Ida Baizura Bahar  
*Universiti Putra Malaysia*

Mohammad Zohrabi  
*University of Tabriz*

Hardev Kaur A/P Jujar Singh  
*International Islamic University Malaysia*

Yap Ngee Thai  
*Universiti Putra Malaysia*

Carol Leon  
*University of Malaya*

Arbaayah Ali Termizi  
*Universiti Putra Malaysia*

Aimillia Mohd. Ramli  
*International Islamic University Malaysia*